

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-76720-0 - Economic Justice and Natural Law  
Gary Chartier  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## ECONOMIC JUSTICE AND NATURAL LAW

Gary Chartier elaborates an account of economic justice rooted in the natural law tradition, explaining how it is relevant to economic issues and developing natural law accounts of property, distribution and work. He examines a range of case studies related to ownership, production, distribution, and consumption, using natural law theory as a basis for staking positions on a number of contested issues related to economic life and highlighting the potentially progressive and emancipatory dimension of natural law theory.

GARY CHARTIER is Associate Professor of Law and Business Ethics and Associate Dean of the School of Business at La Sierra University.

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-76720-0 - Economic Justice and Natural Law  
Gary Chartier  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

# ECONOMIC JUSTICE AND NATURAL LAW

GARY CHARTIER  
*La Sierra University*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-76720-0 - Economic Justice and Natural Law  
Gary Chartier  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi  
Cambridge University Press  
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521767200](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521767200)

© Gary Chartier 2009

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without  
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2009

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data*  
Chartier, Gary.

Economic justice and natural law / Gary Chartier.  
p. cm.

Includes index.

ISBN 978-0-521-76720-0 (hardback) 1. Law and economics.

2. Natural law. I. Title.

K487.E3C474 2009

340'.112-dc22 2009020683

ISBN 978-0-521-76720-0 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or  
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to  
in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such  
websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-76720-0 - Economic Justice and Natural Law  
Gary Chartier  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

*For Elenor*

## CONTENTS

*Acknowledgments* page ix

**Introduction 1**

- I The plan of the book 2
- II The core of natural law theory 6
- III Basic aspects of well being 7
- IV Requirements of practical reasonableness 13
- V The shape of practical reason in the natural law view 23
- VI Natural law and social order 26
- VII Natural law and economic life 31

**1 Foundations: property 32**

- I Property regimes as contingent but constrained social strategies 32
- II Rationales for property rights 33
- III The limits of property 43
- IV Property and justice 46

**2 Foundations: distribution 47**

- I Distribution and practical reasonableness 47
- II Commercial exchange and justice in distribution 55
- III The public trust threshold 60
- IV Justice and distribution 67

**3 Foundations: work 69**

- I Responsibility at work 70
- II Good cause and due process 73
- III Nondiscrimination 83
- IV Natural law and workplace democracy 89
- V Workers and investors in the worker-governed firm 107
- VI Objections to workplace democracy 109
- VII Justice at work 120

<b>4 Remedies: property</b>	<b>123</b>
I Principles for property reform	123
II Alternative bases for peasants' and workers' claims	131
III Property rights for peasants in the land they work	135
IV Property rights for workers in their workplaces	141
V Residential property rights and urban renewal	146
VI Property rights and remediation	154
<b>5 Remedies: distribution</b>	<b>155</b>
I Natural law and redistribution	156
II Natural law and economic norms, rules, and institutions	159
III Health care	161
IV Basic income	164
V Poverty relief outside one's own community	167
VI Boycotts	176
VII Remedies for injustice, disaster, and economic insecurity	182
<b>6 Remedies: work</b>	<b>185</b>
I The value of collective bargaining	186
II Worker participation in the direction of investor-governed firms	199
III Setting workplace standards using collective bargaining	202
IV Collective bargaining and sweatshop labor	211
V Limited justice in unjust workplaces	225
<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>226</b>
<i>Index</i>	229

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

As is surely appropriate for a book about justice, *Economic Justice and Natural Law* reflects the importance in my life of multiple debts of gratitude.

Elenor Webb has offered me many welcome opportunities for dialogue and exchange.

The careful attention four anonymous reviewers gave to my arguments and to the ways in which I express them has substantially improved this book. I have often explicitly noted throughout the text their contributions to the development of my arguments, but they should be confident that I acknowledge, and am grateful for, their assistance even in cases where I have not made direct reference to their suggestions and insights.

Charles Teel, Jr., read an earlier draft of the manuscript and offered many helpful suggestions. I benefited enormously from the editorial assistance of Logan Dirksen, who provided valuable assistance with references.

Fiñola O'Sullivan, Richard Woodham, Dan Dunlavey, Leigh Mueller and Helen Francis of Cambridge University Press all deserve my gratitude as well for their various contributions to the book's development.

Annette Bryson, Jeffrey Cassidy, Aena Prakash, Alexander Lian, Andrew Howe, Anne-Marie Pearson, Bart Willruth, Carole Pateman, Craig R. Kinzer, David B. Hoppe, David R. Larson, Deborah K. Dunn, Donna Carlson, Eva Pascal, Fritz Guy, Jan M. Holden, Jesse Leamon, Joel Sandefur, John Elder, John Thomas, John W. Webster, Julio C. Muñoz, Kenneth A. Dickey, Kimberly Sogioka, Lawrence T. Geraty, Ligia Radoias, Linn Marie Tonstad, Maria Zlateva, Michael Orlando, Miralyn Keske, Nabil Abu-Assal, Patricia Cabrera, Roger E. Rustad, Jr., Ronel Harvey, Ruth E. E. Burke, Sel J. Wahng, W. Kent Rogers, and Wonil Kim have all participated in valued and valuable exchanges for which they deserve continued appreciation.

Other people who participated in discussions with me regarding the material included in this book or who have otherwise contributed to its

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76720-0 - Economic Justice and Natural Law

Gary Chartier

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

x

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

development or refinement include Carter Wolverton, Cruz Reynoso, DonaJayne King, Elina Camarena, Elsa Sanchez, Imil Coker, Jennifer Oshima, Johanna Schiavoni, Jon Wagner, Karen Perez, Lee H. Reynolds, Melissa Mullen, Michael Henshaw, Moira Rai, Moses Chambi, Pei Pei Tan, Rose Mary Rodrigues, Sarah Fandrich, Sharee Smalling, Shaunette Bigby, Shelly Gilroy, Stephanie Lasker, Stephen Munzer, Stephen R. L. Clark, and Theodore Maya.

I am immensely pleased by the opportunities I have had to learn over the last two decades from the work of contemporary natural law theorists; I thank Germain Grisez, John Finnis, Robert P. George, Joseph M. Boyle, Jr., Chris Tollefsen, Mark C. Murphy, Alfonso Gómez-Lobo, and Timothy Chappell for the insights their work has offered me. My understanding of a range of economic and organizational issues has also been substantially enhanced by Kevin Carson's extremely thoughtful and creative work, even if, like the new classical natural law theorists, he is likely to conclude that I have not yet learned enough.

I hope in this book to honor the memories of Stanley E. Chartier and H. Glenn Chartier, whose arguments decades ago may first have exposed me to some of the issues regarding economic life with which I am still wrestling here, and of Helen Chartier, who regarded my political and economic views with skeptical but genial tolerance even as she gave me more love than I could ever have deserved.

Material from JOHN FINNIS, *NATURAL LAW AND NATURAL RIGHTS* (1981) appears here by permission of Oxford University Press. I am also thankful to the editors and publishers who authorized my use here of material taken from several of my previously published articles: *Sweatshops, Labor Rights, and Comparative Advantage*, 10 OREGON REV. INT'L L. 149 (2008); *Consumption, Development Aid, and Natural Law*, 13 WASHINGTON & LEE J.C.R. & SOC. JUST. 205 (2007); *Self-Integration as a Basic Good: A Response to Chris Tollefsen*, 52 AM. J. JURIS, 293 (2007); *Toward a Consistent Natural Law Ethics of False Assertion*, 51 AM. J. JURIS. 43 (2006); *Toward a New Employer–Worker Compact*, 9 EMPLOYEE RTS. & EMPL. POL'Y J. 101 (2005); *Urban Redevelopment and Land Reform: Theorizing Eminent Domain after Kelo*, 11 LEG. THEORY 363 (2005); *Consumers, Boycotts, and Non-Human Animals*, 12 BUFF. ENV. L. J. 123 (2005); *Friendship, Identity, and Solidarity: An Approach to Rights in Plant Closing Cases*, 16 RATIO JURIS 324 (2003); *Natural Law, Same-Sex Marriage, and the Politics of Virtue*, Comment, 48 UCLA L. REV. 1593 (2001); *Civil Rights and Economic Democracy*, 40 WASHBURN L. J. 267 (2001). However, readers of articles on which



Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-76720-0 - Economic Justice and Natural Law  
Gary Chartier  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

xi

I draw here will recognize that the articles have undergone significant changes. Many of these changes reflect a shift in my own thinking from a position exhibiting many affinities with a purified corporate liberalism to a more radical opposition to the power of both the large business organization and the state.