

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-76623-4 - Kant's Theory of Virtue: The Value of Autocracy
Anne Margaret Baxley
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

KANT'S THEORY OF VIRTUE

In this book Anne Margaret Baxley offers a systematic interpretation of Kant's theory of virtue, whose most distinctive features have not been properly understood. She explores the rich moral psychology in Kant's later and less widely read works on ethics, and argues that the key to understanding his account of virtue is the concept of autocracy, a form of moral self-government in which reason rules over sensibility. Although certain aspects of Kant's theory bear comparison to more familiar Aristotelian claims about virtue, Baxley contends that its most important aspects combine to produce something different – a distinctively modern, egalitarian conception of virtue which is an important and overlooked alternative to the more traditional Greek views which have dominated contemporary virtue ethics.

ANNE MARGARET BAXLEY is Associate Professor and Director of Undergraduate Studies in Philosophy at Washington University in St. Louis and the author of a number of journal articles on Kant.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76623-4 - Kant's Theory of Virtue: The Value of Autocracy

Anne Margaret Baxley

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

MODERN EUROPEAN PHILOSOPHY

General Editor

Robert B. Pippin, *University of Chicago*

Advisory Board

Gary Gutting, *University of Notre Dame*

Rolf-Peter Horstmann, *Humboldt University, Berlin*

Some recent titles

Frederick A. Olafson: *Heidegger and the Ground of Ethics*

Günter Zöller: *Fichte's Transcendental Philosophy*

Warren Breckman: *Marx, the Young Hegelians, and the Origins of
Radical Social Theory*

William Blattner: *Heidegger's Temporal Idealism*

Charles Griswold: *Adam Smith and the Virtues of Enlightenment*

Gary Gutting: *Pragmatic Liberalism and the Critique of Modernity*

Allen Wood: *Kant's Ethical Thought*

Karl Ameriks: *Kant and the Fate of Autonomy*

Alfredo Ferrarin: *Hegel and Aristotle*

Cristina Lafont: *Heidegger, Language, and World-Disclosure*

Nicholas Wolterstorff: *Thomas Reid and the Story of Epistemology*

Daniel Dahlstrom: *Heidegger's Concept of Truth*

Michelle Grier: *Kant's Doctrine of Transcendental Illusion*

Henry Allison: *Kant's Theory of Taste*

Allen Speight: *Hegel, Literature, and the Problem of Agency*

J. M. Bernstein: *Adorno*

Will Dudley: *Hegel, Nietzsche, and Philosophy*

Taylor Carman: *Heidegger's Analytic*

Douglas Moggach: *The Philosophy and Politics of Bruno Bauer*

Rüdiger Bubner: *The Innovations of Idealism*

Jon Stewart: *Kierkegaard's Relations to Hegel Reconsidered*

Michael Quante: *Hegel's Concept of Action*

Wolfgang Detel: *Foucault and Classical Antiquity*

Robert M. Wallace: *Hegel's Philosophy of Reality, Freedom, and God*

Johanna Oksala: *Foucault on Freedom*

Béatrice Longuenesse: *Kant on the Human Standpoint*

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76623-4 - Kant's Theory of Virtue: The Value of Autocracy

Anne Margaret Baxley

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Wayne Martin: *Theories of Judgment*

Heinrich Meier: *Leo Strauss and the Theologico-Political Problem*

Otfried Höffe: *Kant's Cosmopolitan Theory of the Law and Peace*

Béatrice Longuenesse: *Hegel's Critique of Metaphysics*

Rachel Zuckert: *Kant on Beauty and Biology*

Andrew Bowie: *Music, Philosophy and Modernity*

Paul Redding: *Analytic Philosophy and the Return of Hegelian Thought*

Kristin Gjesdal: *Gadamer and the Legacy of German Idealism*

Jean-Christophe Merle: *German Idealism and the Concept of Punishment*

Sharon Krishek: *Kierkegaard on Faith and Love*

Nicolas de Warren: *Husserl and the Promise of Time*

Benjamin Rutter: *Hegel on the Modern Arts*

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76623-4 - Kant's Theory of Virtue: The Value of Autocracy

Anne Margaret Baxley

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

KANT'S THEORY OF VIRTUE

The Value of Autocracy

ANNE MARGARET BAXLEY

Washington University, St. Louis



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-0-521-76623-4 - Kant's Theory of Virtue: The Value of Autocracy
 Anne Margaret Baxley
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
 Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,
 São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press
 The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521766234

© Anne Margaret Baxley 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
 no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
 permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Baxley, Anne Margaret, 1970–
 Kant's theory of virtue : the value of autocracy / Anne Margaret Baxley.

p. cm. – (Modern European philosophy)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-76623-4

1. Kant, Immanuel, 1724–1804. 2. Virtue. 3. Philosophy, Modern. I. Title.

B2799.V5B39 2010

179'.9092 – dc22 2010037287

ISBN 978-0-521-76623-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
 accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to
 in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such
 websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76623-4 - Kant's Theory of Virtue: The Value of Autocracy

Anne Margaret Baxley

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

*To my parents, Charlene and William Baxley,
for their abiding love and support*

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page</i> xi
<i>Abbreviations and translations</i>	xiv
Introduction	1
1 The good will, moral worth, and duty: concerns about Kant's rationalist moral psychology	7
1.1 The good will, moral worth, and duty	8
1.2 Is Kant's practical conception of the self overly moralistic?	17
1.3 Can one have a good will and have morally favorable inclinations in accordance with duty?	30
1.4 Why is inclination not a genuine moral motive for Kant?	34
1.5 Is Kant's account of the good will simply a recipe for continence?	40
2 Kant's conception of virtue and the autocracy of pure practical reason	48
2.1 Kant's conception of virtue: virtue requires autocracy	50
2.2 The main worry about an account of virtue understood in terms of autocracy	61
2.3 A better understanding of Kantian autocracy and the real opponent to morally good character	67
2.4 Kantian virtue involves rational self-governance, not the extirpation, suppression, or silencing of inclination	75

2.5	How Kant can distinguish virtue from continence in his own terms	79
3	Virtue, human nature, and moral health: Kant's dispute with Schiller	85
3.1	Schiller's challenge in "On Grace and Dignity": virtue requires the full psychic harmony of reason and sensibility	87
3.2	Kant's reply to Schiller: virtue requires the sovereignty of reason over sensibility	98
3.3	Competing conceptions of human nature and moral health	115
3.4	Rival political approaches to moral psychology	120
4	The moral psychology of Kantian virtue	124
4.1	Kantian autocracy and its three main functions	125
4.2	Moral pleasure and rational desire in <i>The Metaphysics of Morals</i>	136
4.3	Moral feeling, conscience, love, and respect as conditions of moral agency	145
4.4	Love, respect, beneficence, gratitude, and sympathy as Kantian virtues	155
4.5	How sympathy might function within a Kantian-inspired ethics of virtue	163
	Conclusion: Kant's considered account of moral character and the good will reconsidered	172
	<i>Select bibliography</i>	180
	<i>Index</i>	187

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76623-4 - Kant's Theory of Virtue: The Value of Autocracy

Anne Margaret Baxley

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

A number of friends and colleagues provided me with constructive written comments on various parts of this study. Their generosity and support made this book better than it would have been otherwise, so I begin by thanking Marcia Baron, Jerry Doppelt, Bill FitzPatrick, Marilyn Friedman, Jim Klagge, Steve Palmquist, Mark Piper, Andy Reath, Rachel Singpurwalla, Julie Tannenbaum, Iain Thomson, Susan Wolfe, Allen Wood, and anonymous referees for the *Journal of the History of Philosophy*, *Kant-Studien*, and *Philosophy Compass*.

Sean Greenberg was extremely kind to read the full penultimate manuscript, and I owe him a great debt of gratitude, not only for his extraordinarily helpful suggestions, but also for his steadfast support for this project, even in the face of significant skepticism about a Kantian account of virtue. Anonymous referees for Cambridge University Press and Blackwell gave me critical feedback that proved invaluable for finishing the book, and I sincerely appreciate their expert advice and the care with which they treated my work.

I benefited from many thought-provoking discussions of papers based on earlier versions of Chapters 2 and 3. I wish I could reproduce everyone's names individually, but instead I thank audience members who attended a Symposium session of the 2000 Eastern Division Meetings of the American Philosophical Association, the 2002 Virtue Ethics: Old and New Conference in honor of Rosalind Hursthouse, the 2005 Midwest Study Group of the North American Kant Society, the 2006 Southwest Seminar in Early Modern Philosophy, the 2007 Eastern Study Group of the North American Kant Society, the 2008 Eighteenth Century Salon at Washington University, and the 2009 Faculty Seminar at the Center for Ethics and Public Affairs at the Murphy Institute at Tulane. The Philosophy Departments at Amherst,

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76623-4 - Kant's Theory of Virtue: The Value of Autocracy

Anne Margaret Baxley

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Oxford, the University of Georgia, the University of Massachusetts at Amherst, the University of Montreal, Virginia Tech, and Washington University provided challenging questions that helped advance my understanding of Kant's account of virtue and autocracy over the past years.

Several wonderful institutions generously supported my research for this book. I am profoundly grateful to the National Endowment for the Humanities and the American Association of University Women, for summer research grants, the National Humanities Center, for a year-long residential fellowship during which I began writing, and Washington University, for a pre-tenure sabbatical that enabled me to complete a draft of the chapters appearing in revised form here.

Kant's Theory of Virtue: The Value of Autocracy incorporates material from some of my previous publications. I thank the editors and publishers of the following articles for allowing me to make use of material first published elsewhere: "Autocracy and Autonomy," *Kant-Studien* 94, heft 1 (2003): 1–23. Copyright © 2003 Walter de Gruyter. "The Beautiful Soul and the Autocratic Agent: Schiller's and Kant's 'Children of the House,'" *Journal of the History of Philosophy* 41, 4 (2003): 493–514. Copyright © 2003 Journal of the History of Philosophy, Inc. "Does Kantian Virtue Amount to More than Continence?" *The Review of Metaphysics* 56 (2003): 559–86. Copyright © 2003 The Review of Metaphysics. "Kantian Virtue," *Philosophy Compass* 2, 3 (2007): 396–410. Copyright © 2007 Blackwell Publishing. "Pleasure, Freedom, and Grace: Schiller's 'Completion' of Kant's Ethics," *Inquiry* 51, 1 (2008): 1–15. Copyright © 2008 Taylor and Francis.

Writing a book can be a solitary endeavor, and the company and encouragement of good friends who understand what philosophy is about can make all the difference. For sustaining me throughout this process in ways that are impossible to measure, I thank Michelle Grier, Tom Hill, Chris Hom, Wayne Martin, Linda Palmer, Laura Perini, Ken Rogerson, Oliver Sensen, Rachel Singpurwalla, and Peter Thielke. For his compassion, sage counsel, and unsurpassed good humor, I must single out my dear friend Iain Thomson.

Since my arrival in 2005, I have been fortunate to enjoy the support of a number of extraordinary colleagues at Washington University, especially Carl Craver, Dennis DesChene, John Doris, Claude Evans, Marilyn Friedman, Larry May, Clare Palmer, and Kit Wellman. I thank Mark Rollins especially for his unwavering support and sound guidance, and for the exemplary leadership he has shown in transforming Philosophy

at Washington University into the strong, vibrant department of which I am proud to be a part.

If there is a list of collegial virtues, Eric Brown has them all, and in spades. It is rare indeed to find someone who possesses his dazzling philosophical acumen, impeccable taste, tremendous wit, wisdom, and warmth. I thank him heartily for his incisive feedback, which enabled me to sharpen my arguments, and for his loyalty in championing this project.

Zach Hoskins provided invaluable editorial assistance, but, more importantly, I thank him for his unflinching enthusiasm for my work, which fortified me along the way.

I am immensely grateful to Hilary Gaskin and Robert Pippin for their generosity in being receptive to my original manuscript and for including this book in Cambridge's Modern European Philosophy series, which I consider a tremendous honor.

Three inspirational teachers and mentors ultimately made this project possible. As an undergraduate at Wellesley College, I was incredibly lucky to begin my studies of Kant with Adrian Piper, whose memorable seminars on Kant and metaethics made me want to be a philosopher. I remain indebted to her, both for what she taught me then and for the great generosity of spirit and compassion she continues to display today.

I was a graduate student at University of California, San Diego, where I completed my dissertation (an earlier ancestor of this material) under the supervision of Henry Allison and David Brink. Henry's own groundbreaking research on Kant remains a model of scholarship that the rest of us can only try to emulate, and his exacting standards and thoughtful criticisms over the years have been an endless source of motivation. I am grateful to him for teaching me more than I could possibly recount and for his steadfast commitment to me and to this project. My debt to David Brink is incalculable, and it is with the greatest admiration and affection that I thank him for his constant support and encouragement, and for his apparently limitless capacity to find what is best in his students and their work.

Above all, I thank my amazing partner, Patty Evans, whose enduring good will and boundless patience enabled me to complete this book.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76623-4 - Kant's Theory of Virtue: The Value of Autocracy

Anne Margaret Baxley

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

ABBREVIATIONS AND TRANSLATIONS USED FOR WORKS BY KANT

References to Kant's writings are cited in the body of the text according to the volume and page number, given by arabic numerals separated by a colon, in the standard edition of Kant's works, *Kants gesammelte Schriften* (KGS), edited by the Royal Prussian (later German, then Berlin-Brandenburg) Academy of Sciences, 29 vols. (Berlin: Georg Reimer, later Walter de Gruyter & Co., 1900–). This standard edition of Kant's works is traditionally referred to as the Academy Edition. The Academy Edition pagination is reproduced in most recent English translations of Kant's writings. The abbreviations and English translations of Kant's works cited are listed alphabetically below. In the body of the text, they are referred to immediately following the reference to the volume and page of the Academy Edition. Translations of citations from *Moral Mrongovius II* (KGS 29) in Chapter 1 are my own, as are translations of citations from Powalski's lecture notes from Kant's ethics course, *Praktische Philosophie Powalski* (KGS 27), and citations from Kant's unpublished notes and reflections found in *Vorarbeiten zur Religion* (KGS 23), *Vorarbeiten zur Tugendlehre* (KGS 23), and *Reflexionen zur Moralphilosophie* (KGS 19).

Anthro	<i>Anthropologie in pragmatischer Hinsicht</i> (KGS 7). <i>Anthropology from a Pragmatic Point of View</i> (Cambridge Texts in the History of Philosophy). Ed. and trans. Robert B. Loudon. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006.
Aufklärung	<i>Beantwortung der Frage: Was ist Aufklärung?</i> (KGS 8). <i>An Answer to the Question: What is Enlightenment?</i> in <i>Practical Philosophy</i> (The Cambridge Edition of the Works

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76623-4 - Kant's Theory of Virtue: The Value of Autocracy

Anne Margaret Baxley

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

ABBREVIATIONS AND TRANSLATIONS

xv

- of Immanuel Kant*). Ed. and trans. Mary J. Gregor. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- Collins *Moralphilosophie Collins* (KGS 27). *Moral Philosophy: Collins's lecture notes in Lectures on Ethics (The Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant)*. Ed. Peter Heath and J. B. Schneewind. Trans. Peter Heath. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997.
- Frieden *Zum ewigen Frieden* (KGS 8). *Toward Perpetual Peace in Practical Philosophy (The Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant)*. Ed. and trans. Mary J. Gregor. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- Gr *Grundlegung zur Metaphysik der Sitten* (KGS 4). *Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals in Practical Philosophy (The Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant)*. Ed. and trans. Mary J. Gregor. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- KprV *Kritik der praktischen Vernunft* (KGS 5). *Critique of Practical Reason in Practical Philosophy (The Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant)*. Ed. and trans. Mary J. Gregor. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- KU *Kritik der Urtheilskraft* (KGS 5). *Critique of Judgment*. Trans. Werner S. Pluhar. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Co., 1987.
- Mrongovius II* *Moral Mrongovius II* (KGS 29). *Morality according to Prof. Kant: Mrongovius's second set of lecture notes (selections) in Lectures on Ethics (The Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant)*. Ed. Peter Heath and J. B. Schneewind. Trans. Peter Heath. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997.
- MS *Metaphysik der Sitten* (KGS 6). *Metaphysics of Morals in Practical Philosophy (The Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant)*. Ed. and trans. Mary J. Gregor. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- Rel *Die Religion innerhalb der Grenzen der bloßen Vernunft* (KGS 6). *Religion within the Boundaries of Mere Reason (Cambridge Texts in the History of Philosophy)*. Ed. and trans. Allen Wood and George Di Giovanni. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998.

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-76623-4 - Kant's Theory of Virtue: The Value of Autocracy
Anne Margaret Baxley
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

xvi

ABBREVIATIONS AND TRANSLATIONS

TP

Über den Gemeinspruch: Das mag in der Theorie richtig sein, taugt aber nicht für die Praxis (KGS 8). *On the Common Saying: That May be Correct in Theory, But It Is of No Use in Practice in Practical Philosophy* (*The Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant*). Ed. and trans. Mary J. Gregor. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.

Vigilantius

Metaphysik der Sitten Vigilantius (KGS 27). *Kant on the metaphysics of morals: Vigilantius's lecture notes in Lectures on Ethics* (*The Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant*). Ed. Peter Heath and J. B. Schneewind. Trans. Peter Heath. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997.