This collection of specially commissioned essays by leading scholars presents new research on Isaac Newton and his main philosophical interlocutors and critics. The essays analyze Newton's relation to his contemporaries, especially Barrow, Descartes, Leibniz, and Locke, and discuss the ways in which a broad range of figures, including Hume, MacLaurin, Maupertuis, and Kant, reacted to his thought. The wide range of topics discussed includes the laws of nature, the notion of force, the relation of mathematics to nature, Newton's argument for universal gravitation, his attitude toward philosophical empiricism, his use of "fluxions," his approach toward measurement problems, and his concept of absolute motion, together with new interpretations of Newton's matter theory. The volume concludes with an extended essay that analyzes the changes in physics wrought by Newton's *Principia*. A substantial introduction and bibliography provide essential reference guides.

Andrew Janiak is Creed C. Black Associate Professor of Philosophy at Duke University. He is the editor of *Newton: Philosophical Writings* (Cambridge, 2004) and author of *Newton as Philosopher* (Cambridge, 2008).

Eric Schliesser is BOF Research Professor, Philosophy and Moral Sciences at Ghent University. He has published widely on Newton, Huygens, and their eighteenth-century reception (especially by Hume and Adam Smith) as well as in philosophy of economics.
INTERPRETING NEWTON

Critical Essays

Edited by
ANDREW JANIAK AND ERIC SCHLIESSER
CONTENTS

Notes on contributors page vii
Acknowledgements x

Introduction 1
ANDREW JANIAK AND ERIC SCHLIESSER

PART I  Newton and his contemporaries 11
1 Newton’s law-constitutive approach to bodies: a response to Descartes 13
KATHERINE BRADING

2 Leibniz, Newton and force 33
DANIEL GARBER

3 Locke’s qualified embrace of Newton’s Principia 48
MARY DOMSKI

4 What geometry postulates: Newton and Barrow on the relationship of mathematics to nature 69
KATHERINE DUNLOP

PART II  Philosophical themes in Newton 103
5 Cotes’s queries: Newton’s empiricism and conceptions of matter 105
ZVI BIENER AND CHRIS SMEENK

6 Newton’s scientific method and the universal law of gravitation 138
ORI BELKIND

7 Newton, Huygens, and Euler: empirical support for laws of motion 169
WILLIAM HARPER
vi CONTENTS

8 What did Newton mean by ‘Absolute Motion’? 196
   NICK HUGGETT

9 From velocities to fluxions 219
   MARCO PANZA

PART III The reception of Newton 255

10 Newton, Locke, and Hume 257
   GRACIELA DE PIERRIS

11 Maupertuis on attraction as an inherent property of matter 280
   LISA DOWNING

12 The Newtonian refutation of Spinoza: Newton’s Challenge
   and the Socratic Problem 299
   ERIC SCHLIESSER

13 Dispositional explanations: Boyle’s problem, Newton’s solution,
   Hume’s response 320
   LYNN S. JOY

14 Newton and Kant on absolute space: from theology to
   transcendental philosophy 342
   MICHAEL FRIEDMAN

15 How Newton’s Principia changed physics 360
   GEORGE E. SMITH

References 396
Index 419
NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

ORI BELKIND is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of Richmond. He is the author of *Physical Systems: Conceptual Pathways between Spacetime and Matter* (forthcoming), and has also published on Leibniz and Newton.

ZVI BIENER is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of Cincinnati. He works primarily on early modern conceptions of the unity of science and the large-scale structure of fields of knowledge, and has published on Galileo, Descartes, and Newton.

KATHERINE BRADING is William J. and Dorothy K. O’Neill Collegiate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Notre Dame. In addition to writing on seventeenth-century natural philosophy, she has published on symmetry in modern physics and on the history of early twentieth-century physics.

GRACIELA DE PIERRIS is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Stanford University. She has published widely in historical topics in epistemology, especially Locke, Hume, and Kant. She has also written on Frege, Wittgenstein, and Quine.

MARY DOMSKI is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of New Mexico. She has published widely on early modern natural philosophy and mathematics as well as on Kant. She is the co-editor of *Discourse on a New Method: Reinvigorating the Marriage of History and Philosophy of Science* (2010).

LISA DOWNING is Professor of Philosophy at Ohio State University. She has published widely on Locke, mechanist conceptions of body and their justification, debates surrounding gravity/attraction, and changing views of scientific explanation in the early modern period.

KATHERINE DUNLOP is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Brown University. She is primarily interested in theories of exact science and of perception, especially in Kant. Her research extends to Kant’s early modern predecessors.
and to the reception of his views (and theirs) in twentieth-century analytic philosophy.

Michael Friedman is Frederick P. Rehmus Family Professor of Humanities at Stanford University. He is the author of Foundations of Space-Time Theories: Relativistic Physics and Philosophy of Science (1983), Kant and the Exact Sciences (1992), Reconsidering Logical Positivism (Cambridge, 1999), A Parting of the Ways: Carnap, Cassirer, and Heidegger (2000), and Dynamics of Reason: The 1999 Kant Lectures at Stanford University (2001).

Daniel Garber is Stuart Professor of Philosophy at Princeton University. He is the author of Descartes' Metaphysical Physics (1992), Descartes Embodied (2001), and Leibniz: Body, Substance, Monad (2009).

William Harper is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Western Ontario. He has published widely in philosophy of science, including decision theory, Kant, and Newton. He is the author of Isaac Newton's Scientific Method: Turning Data into Evidence about Gravity and Cosmology (forthcoming).

Nicholas Huggett is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Illinois at Chicago. He has edited Space from Zeno to Einstein (1999) and co-authored Physics Meets Philosophy at the Planck Scale (Cambridge, 2001). His most recent book is Everywhere and Everywhen (2010).

Andrew Janiak is Creed C. Black Associate Professor of Philosophy at Duke University. He is the editor of Newton: Philosophical Writings (Cambridge, 2004) and author of Newton as Philosopher (Cambridge, 2008). His most recent article is “Substance and Action in Descartes and Newton,” The Monist 93 (October 2010). He writes on early modern natural philosophy and on Kant.

Lynn Joy is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Notre Dame and Fellow of the Reilly Center for Science, Technology, and Values. Her publications include Gassendi the Atomist: Advocate of History in an Age of Science and “Scientific Explanation from Formal Causes to Laws of Nature,” in The Cambridge History of Early Modern Science. She is currently working on a study of the concept of dispositions in contemporary philosophy of mind, entitled Dispositions and Intentionality in the Humean Tradition.

Marco Panza is Research Director in History and Philosophy of Sciences, Institut d’Histoire et de Philosophie des Sciences et des Techniques, UMR 8590 of the CNRS and the University of Paris 1. He has published widely in the history and philosophy of mathematics, and is the author of Isaac Newton

**ERIC SCHLIESSER** is BOF Research Professor of Philosophy at Ghent University. He has published widely on Newton, Huygens, and their eighteenth-century reception (especially Hume and Adam Smith) as well as in philosophy of economics. He is the co-editor of the forthcoming *Oxford Handbook on Isaac Newton*.

**CHRIS SMEENK** is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Western Ontario. He has published on the philosophy and history of modern cosmology and has co-authored works on Newton with Zvi Biener, George Smith, and Eric Schliesser.

**GEORGE SMITH** is Professor of Philosophy at Tufts University. His research has focused heavily on the development of evidence in the exact sciences with special emphasis on Newton’s *Principia* and its aftermath. He is the co-editor of the *Cambridge Companion to Newton* (2002) and of the forthcoming *Oxford Handbook on Isaac Newton*. 
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I wish to thank the contributors to this volume for their outstanding work and impressive patience. I would also like to thank Hilary Gaskin for supporting this project from its inception, and for her wise counsel, as always. Finally, and perhaps most importantly, I thank my co-editor, Eric Schliesser, for seeing the manuscript through its many transformations over the past few years. Eric, I still owe you a drink!

Andrew Janiak

This volume would not have been possible without the generosity shown toward me by Syracuse University, Leiden University, Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research (which supported me with a four year grant to study Newton and his impact on philosophy), and Ghent University. Along the way I incurred many debts of gratitude toward flexible Deans and Department Chairs, especially the late Stewart Thau and Cathy Newton at Syracuse, Pauline Kleingeld at Leiden, and Freddy Mortier as well as Erik Weber at Ghent. I am grateful to all the contributors to this volume for sharing such wonderful work with Andrew and me; they are terrific philosophers and scholars as well as an inspiring intellectual community. I thank the folk at Cambridge, especially Hilary Gaskin, for believing in this project. Andrew, you are a swell, selfless editor, and you owe me a drink! Finally, my share of this volume is dedicated in love to Sarit and our Avi.

Eric Schliesser

The idea of a volume was born at a workshop on “Newton and/as Philosophy” hosted at Leiden University in the Summer of 2007. Half the papers collected here were presented there.

Andrew Janiak and Eric Schliesser