Fault Lines of International Legitimacy addresses the following questions: What are the features and functions of legitimacy in the international realm? How does international legitimacy – as exemplified in particular by multilateral norms, organizations, and policies – change over time? What role does the international distribution of power and its evolution have in the establishment and transformation of legitimacy paradigms? To what extent do democratic values account for the growing importance of legitimacy and the increasing difficulty of achieving it at the international and national levels?

One of the central messages of the book is that although the search for international legitimacy is an elusive endeavor, there is no alternative to it if we want to respond to the intertwined demands of justice and security and make them an integral and strategic part of international relations.

Hilary Charlesworth is an Australian Research Council Federation Fellow and Director of the Centre for International Governance and Justice at the Australian National University in Canberra. She has written widely on international law and human-rights law and has held visiting appointments in U.S. and European universities.

Jean-Marc Coicaud is the Director of the United Nations University (UNU) Office at the United Nations in New York. His published books include L’introuvable démocratie autoritaire; Legitimacy and Politics: A Contribution to the Study of Political Right and Political Responsibility; and Beyond the National Interest: The Future of UN Peacekeeping and Multilateralism in an Era of U.S. Primacy. He is now finishing a new book titled Kissing War Good-bye.
Fault Lines of International Legitimacy

Edited by

HILARY CHARLESWORTH
Australian National University

JEAN-MARC COICAUD
United Nations University
Fault lines of international legitimacy / edited by Hilary Charlesworth, Jean-Marc Coicaud.

Includes bibliographical references and index.


1. International law. I. Charlesworth, Hilary. II. Coicaud, Jean-Marc. III. Title.

KZ3410.F38 2009
341–dc22 2009022589

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.
Contents

Acknowledgments vii
Contributors viii

Introduction 1
Jean-Marc Coicaud

PART I: FROM THE HISTORY AND STRUCTURE OF INTERNATIONAL LEGITIMACY TO FAULT LINES IN CONTEMPORARY INTERNATIONAL POLITICS
1. Legitimacy, Across Borders and Over Time 17
   Jean-Marc Coicaud
2. Deconstructing International Legitimacy 29
   Jean-Marc Coicaud
3. The Evolution of International Order and Fault Lines of International Legitimacy 87
   Jean-Marc Coicaud
4. Intervention in a “Divided World”: Axes of Legitimacy 115
   Nathaniel Berman
5. From Berlin to Bonn to Baghdad: A Space for Infinite Justice 146
   Vasuki Nesiah

PART II: THE UN SECURITY COUNCIL: EXPRESSION, VENUE, AND PROMOTER OF INTERNATIONAL LEGITIMACY?
6. Legal Deliberation and Argumentation in International Decision Making 175
   Ian Johnstone
## Contents

7. The UN Security Council, Regional Arrangements, and Peacekeeping Operations  
   Nishkala Suntharalingam  
   204

8. The Security Council’s Alliance of Gender Legitimacy: The Symbolic Capital of Resolution 1325  
   Dianne Otto  
   239

### PART III: LEGITIMACY OF INTERNATIONAL INTERVENTIONS AND HIERARCHY OF INTERNATIONAL RIGHTS

9. Cosmopolitan Militaries and Cosmopolitan Force  
   Lorraine Elliott  
   279

10. Sovereignty, Rights, and Armed Intervention: A Dialectical Perspective  
    B. S. Chimni  
    303

### PART IV: IN SEARCH OF NEW FORMS OF INTERNATIONAL LEGITIMACY: BETWEEN POWER AND PRINCIPLES

11. Determining How the Legitimacy of Intervention Is Discussed: A Case Study of International Territorial Administration  
    Ralph Wilde  
    327

    Jun Matsukuma  
    360

Conclusion: The Legitimations of International Law  
   Hilary Charlesworth  
   389

Index  
   399
Acknowledgments

This book is the product of a research project conducted within the framework of the Peace and Governance Program of the United Nations University (UNU), headquartered in Tokyo. It follows a first volume published a few years ago under the title *Legitimacy of International Organizations*. The editors and contributing authors wish to thank Yoshie Sawada, Programme Administrative Assistant for the UNU Peace and Governance Program, for her support throughout the duration of the project. They also wish to thank the UNU Institute for Advanced Studies, which hosted a workshop in the course of the book preparation. At various stages of the project, a number of UNU colleagues – mainly Junior Professional Fellows from the UNU Office in New York – improved the language of the chapters, for which we wish to thank them: Anna Chrisp, William Brian Clayton, Delphine Hayim, Jibecke Johnson, Durlabh Maharishi, Ranita Ragunathan, Ken Stretch, Ibrahim Tahri, and John Tzanos. Thank you also to Celeste Ecuyer and Susan Harris-Rimmer of the Australian National University. Finally, the editors wish to thank the two anonymous peer reviewers from Cambridge University Press, as well as John Berger, Senior Editor at Cambridge University Press, for his trust and support.
Contributors

Nathaniel Berman is Rahel Varhagen Professor of International Affairs, Law, and Modern Culture at the Institute in Global Governance Research of Brown University. Prior to joining the Institute in 2009, he taught public international law, European Union law, international trade law, and human rights at Brooklyn Law School. Before 2002, he taught at Northeastern University School of Law for twelve years. Professor Berman’s scholarship focuses on the relationships among nationalism, colonialism, and international law.

Hilary Charlesworth is an Australian Research Council Federation Fellow and Director of the Centre for International Governance and Justice at the Australian National University in Canberra. She has written widely on international law and human-rights law and has held visiting appointments in U.S. and European universities.

B. S. Chimni is a legal academic and a key figure in the Third World Approaches to International Law (TWAIL) network of scholars. He is a Professor of International Law at the School of International Studies, Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi. His publications include International Law and World Order: A Critique of Contemporary Approaches (1993) and the co-edited volume The Third World and International Order: Law, Politics, and Globalization (2004).

Jean-Marc Coicaud is Director of the United Nations University (UNU) Office at the United Nations in New York. He also served as a speechwriter in the Executive Office of the UN Secretary General from 1992 to 1996 and taught at the University of Paris I – Sorbonne, Harvard University, and Keio University. Recent books include Beyond the National Interest (U.S. Institute of Peace Press, 2007); in Japanese, Limits of the UN/Future of the UN (Fujiwara
Contributors


**Lorraine Elliott** holds a Senior Fellowship in the Department of International Relations at the Australian National University. Her most recent books are *The Global Politics of the Environment* (Palgrave Macmillan/New York University Press, 2004) and, co-edited with Graeme Cheeseman, *Forces for Good: Cosmopolitan Militaries in the Twenty-first Century* (Manchester University Press, 2004).

**Ian Johnstone** is a Professor of International Law at the Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy, Tufts University. From 1991 to 2000, he held various positions in the United Nations Secretariat, including five years in the Executive Office of the Secretary-General. He also served in the Department of Peacekeeping Operations and the Office of the Legal Counsel. His recent publications include *The United States and Contemporary Peace Operations: A Double-Edged Sword?* (2009), as editor and contributing author; *The Annual Review of Global Peace Operations*, as editor and lead scholar for the 2006 and 2007 volumes; “Legislation and Adjudication in the UN Security Council: Bringing Down the Deliberative Deficit,” *American Journal of International Law* (2008); and “The Secretary-General as Norm Entrepreneur” in *Secretary or General? The Role of the UN SG in World Politics* (2007).

**Jun Matsukuma** has been a Professor of International Law since 2001 at the Faculty of Law of the Seinan Gakuin University. He also held a variety of positions with the Japanese Diplomatic Service in the United Kingdom and the United States.

**Vasuki Nesiah** teaches International Relations and is Director of International Affairs at Brown University. Before joining Brown, Nesiah was Senior Associate and Head of the Gender Program at the International Center for Transitional Justice and Adjunct Associate Professor at the School of International and Public Affairs at Columbia University.

**Dianne Otto** is Director of the International Human Rights Law Program of the Institute for International Law and the Humanities (IILAH) at the Melbourne Law School. Recent publications include “Making Sense of Zero Tolerance Policies in Peacekeeping Sexual Economies,” in Vanessa Munro and
Contributors


Nishkala Suntharalingam is currently Political Affairs Officer in the Office of Operations in the Department of Peacekeeping Operations of the United Nations. She was based in Kinshasa with the UN Organization Mission in the Congo (MONUC) in 2003 and 2004, where she was a Political Officer and later Senior Demobilization Officer. She is the author of “The Cambodian Settlement Agreements,” in Doyle, Johnstone, and Orr, *Keeping the Peace* (Cambridge University Press, 1997), and the co-author with Michael Doyle of “The UN in Cambodia: Lessons for Multidimensional Peacekeeping,” *International Peacekeeping* 1, 2 (Summer 1994).

Ralph Wilde has been a member of the Law Faculty at University College London, University of London, since July 2002; he is currently Associate Dean for Research. He works in the fields of international relations and international law. His current research focuses on the administration of territory by international organizations and the extraterritorial application of human-rights norms.