This book examines the ways in which reasonable people can disagree about the requirements of political morality. Christopher McMahon argues that there will be a "zone of reasonable disagreement" surrounding most questions of political morality. Moral notions of right and wrong evolve over time as new zones of reasonable disagreement emerge out of old ones; thus political morality is both different in different societies with varying histories, and different now from what it was in the past. McMahon explores the phenomenon of reasonable disagreement in detail and traces its implications for the possibility of making moral judgments about other polities, past or present. His study sheds light on an important and often overlooked aspect of political life, and will be of interest to a wide range of readers in moral and political philosophy and in political theory.

Christopher McMahon is Professor of Philosophy at the University of California, Santa Barbara. His publications include Collective Rationality and Collective Reasoning (2001).
REASONABLE DISAGREEMENT

A Theory of Political Morality

CHRISTOPHER McMAHON
For Janine
# Contents

## Introduction

*page 1*

1. The structure of reasonable disagreement  
   - The problem 7  
   - Disagreement about matters of empirical fact 9  
   - Disagreement among epistemic peers 13  
   - Reasonable disagreement and political morality 18  
   - Moral realism and reasonable political disagreement 26

2. Moral nominalism 34  
   - Williams’s subjectivism 36  
   - Descriptive judgment 38  
   - Evaluative judgment 44  
   - Moral judgment 51  
   - Meta-ethical details 60

3. Agreement and disagreement 68  
   - The pressure to agree 69  
   - Deliberation and disagreement 70  
   - Conceptual identity 81  
   - Broad fairness 84  
   - The zone of reasonable disagreement 92

4. The resolution of reasonable disagreement 98  
   - Authority and democracy 99  
   - Changing minds 106  
   - Dominance 112  
   - Mill on partial truth 118  
   - The evolution of moral normativity 122

5. Localism 129  
   - Relativism and localism 131  
   - Borders and migration 136
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>viii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Contents**

- Appraisal without contact 141
- Western and non-Western 146
- The future of political morality 153

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Morality and history**

- Historical knowledge 159
- Judging the past 162
- Hierarchy 168
- Rectifying past wrongs 174
- Apology 182
- Conclusion 192

**Works cited**

195

**Index**

200