HUMAN RIGHTS AND CLIMATE CHANGE

As the effects of climate change continue to be felt, appreciation of its future transformational impact on numerous areas of public law and policy is set to grow. Among these, human rights concerns are particularly acute. They include forced mass migration, increased disease incidence and strain on healthcare systems, threatened food and water security, the disappearance and degradation of shelter, land, livelihoods and cultures and the threat of conflict.

This inquiry into the human rights dimensions of climate change looks beyond potential impacts to examine the questions raised by climate change policies: accountability for extraterritorial harms; constructing reliable enforcement mechanisms; assessing redistributional outcomes; and allocating burdens, benefits, rights and duties among perpetrators and victims, both public and private. The book examines a range of so-far unexplored theoretical and practical concerns that international law and other scholars and policy-framers will find increasingly difficult to ignore.

STEPHEN HUMPHREYS is Research Director at the International Council on Human Rights Policy (ICHRP), an independent research institution based in Geneva, Switzerland. He holds a Ph.D. from the University of Cambridge and has published widely on human rights.

HUMAN RIGHTS AND CLIMATE CHANGE

Edited by STEPHEN HUMPHREYS

> with a Foreword by MARY ROBINSON



CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-76276-2 - Human Rights and Climate Change Edited by Stephen Humphreys Frontmatter More information

> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

> > Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521762762

© International Council on Human Rights Policy 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-76276-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

	Authors' biographiespage viiAcronymsxiiAcknowledgementsxivForewordxviiMARY ROBINSONIntroduction: human rights and climate change1STEPHEN HUMPHREYS	
PART I	Rights perspectives on global warming35	
1	Competing claims: human rights and climate harms STEPHEN HUMPHREYS	37
2	Climate change, human rights and moral thresholds SIMON CANEY	69
3	Equitable utilization of the atmosphere: a rights-based approach to climate change? 91 DINAH SHELTON	
4	Climate change, human rights and corporate accountability 126 PETER NEWELL	
5	Rethinking human rights: the impact of climate change on the dominant discourse 159 SAM ADELMAN	

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press	
978-0-521-76276-2 - Human Rights and Climate Change	÷
Edited by Stephen Humphreys	
Frontmatter	
More information	

vi	CONTENTS	
PART II	Priorities, risks and inequities in global responses	181
6	The Kyoto Protocol and vulnerability: human rights and equity dimensions 183 PHILIPPE CULLET	
7	Forests, climate change and human rights: managing risks and trade-offs 207 FRANCES SEYMOUR	
8	Climate change and the right to the highest attainable standard of health 238 PAUL HUNT AND RAJAT KHOSLA	
9	Human rights and vulnerability to climate change JON BARNETT	257
10	Climate change, evolution of disasters and inequality JOHN C. MUTTER AND KYE MESA BARNARD	272
	Conclusion 297	
11	Conceiving justice: articulating common causes in distinct regimes 299 STEPHEN HUMPHREYS	
	Appendix: climate change impacts on human rights	320
	Index 332	

AUTHORS' BIOGRAPHIES

SAM ADELMAN teaches in the School of Law at the University of Warwick. Among the courses he teaches are Legal Theory and Comparative Human Rights at undergraduate level and Theories and Histories of Human Rights on the LLM in International Development Law and Human Rights. He has degrees from the University of the Witwatersrand, Harvard University and Warwick University. A South African national, he was banned and exiled by the regime during the struggle against apartheid. A legal theorist, his writings cover globalisation, governance, development, climate change and human rights. He is currently completing a book on sovereignty. He is engaged in development projects in Africa.

JON BARNETT is a Reader and Australian Research Council Fellow at the University of Melbourne. Jon is a human geographer whose research concerns the impacts of environmental change on social systems. This includes research on environmental security, climate change and water. His research draws on and contributes to a range of disciplines. In recent years he has conducted fieldwork in the South Pacific, China and East Timor. His ARC Discovery project aims to identify the risks climate change poses to social systems in the Pacific Islands, including examining their capacity to manage these risks. Jon is a member of the Scientific Steering Committee of the Global Environmental Change and Human Security (GECHS) Project. He is on the editorial boards of *Geography Compass, Global Environmental Change* and the *Journal of Human Security*.

SIMON CANEY is Professor in Political Theory, Oxford University and a Fellow and Tutor in Politics, Magdalen College. His research interests are primarily in contemporary political philosophy, especially the application of political philosophy to problems in global politics. He has published extensively on global justice, climate change, poverty, human rights and international institutions. He is currently an ESRC viii

AUTHORS' BIOGRAPHIES

Climate Change Leadership Research Fellow and engaged in a three-year ESRC-funded project on 'Equity and Climate Change'. He is the author of *Justice Beyond Borders: A Global Political Theory* (2005) and articles in politics, law and philosophy journals. Professor Caney is currently writing two books: *Global Justice and Climate Change* (forthcoming 2009, co-authored with Dr Derek Bell) and *On Cosmopolitanism* (forthcoming 2009). He is also the co-editor (with Stephen Gardiner, Dale Jamieson and Henry Shue) of *Ethics and Climate Change: A Reader* (forthcoming 2009).

PHILIPPE CULLET is a Reader in Law at the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London, where he teaches environmental law and intellectual property. He is also a Founding Director of the International Environmental Law Research Centre, Geneva and the Editor-in-Chief of the *Journal of Law, Environment and Development*, a peer-reviewed online journal available at: www.lead-journal.org. His current research interests include biodiversity law, biosafety, climate change and water, as well as the socio-economic aspects of intellectual property rights. He is the author of *Differential Treatment in International Environmental Law* (2003), *Intellectual Property and Sustainable Development* (2005) and *Water, Law and Development in the Context of Water Sector Reforms in India* (forthcoming 2009). More information about edited books and other contributions can be found at www.ielrc.org/about_cullet.php.

STEPHEN HUMPHREYS is Research Director at the International Council on Human Rights Policy (ICHRP), an independent research institution based in Geneva, Switzerland. He holds a Ph.D. in law from the University of Cambridge and has published widely on human rights, international law and climate change, including in the *European Journal of International Law*, the *Cambridge Review of International Affairs*, the *Modern Law Review*, the *International and Comparative Law Quarterly* and New York University's Hauser Global Law Working Paper series. Prior to joining the ICHRP, he was head of publications at the Open Society Justice Initiative at the Open Society Institute (OSI) in New York, where he was lead author of *Legal Remedies for the Resource Curse* (OSI, 2005) and edited the journal *Justice Initiatives*. Before that, he oversaw a project monitoring minority rights in ten Eastern European countries for OSI's EU Monitoring and Advocacy Programme (EUMAP), based in Budapest, Hungary, and edited *Monitoring the EU Accession Process: Minority Rights* (OSI, 2002).

AUTHORS' BIOGRAPHIES

ix

Between 1997 and 1999 he worked with ENDA Tiers Monde's Programme Energie, in Dakar, Senegal, researching and publishing on climate change and development. In 2005–2006 he was a fellow at New York University's Hauser Global Law program.

PAUL HUNT is Professor in the Department of Law, University of Essex. He was the UN Special Rapporteur on the Right to Health from 2002 to 2008. He was Director of the Human Rights Centre at Essex University from 2001-2003. He served as an independent expert on the UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (1999-2002). In 2005, at the request of the UN Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, he co-authored draft human rights guidelines for poverty reduction strategies. He has practised as a solicitor in London and held the posts of Legal Officer and Acting General Secretary with the National Council for Civil Liberties (Liberty) in the United Kingdom. He has also lived, and undertaken human rights work, in the Middle East, Africa, Europe and the South Pacific. Professor Hunt has published widely on human rights issues, focusing particularly on economic, social and cultural rights. His publications include Reclaiming Social Rights: International and Comparative Perspectives (1996), (co-editor) Culture, Rights and Cultural Rights: Perspectives from the South Pacific (2000) and (co-editor) World Bank, IMF and Human Rights: Including the Tilburg Guiding Principles on World Bank, IMF and Human Rights (2003). He is also an Adjunct Professor at the University of Waikato, Aotearoa/New Zealand and holds an honorary doctorate from the Nordic School of Public Health.

RAJAT KHOSLA is a Senior Research Officer in the Right to Health Unit at the Human Rights Centre, University of Essex. He is a human rights lawyer researching and writing on issues related to economic, social and cultural rights. He has previously worked as a researcher for the Centre for the Study of Developing Societies (CSDS) in India. Mr Khosla has also worked as an advocate in the Supreme Court of India on several public interest cases involving socio-economic rights.

KYE MESA BARNARD is a second year student in the Master of International Affairs program at Columbia University's School of International and Public Affairs concentrating in environmental policy studies. His work focuses on the links between climate-related events, development and social vulnerability. Kye also works at the International Research Institute for Climate and Society on projects that integrate х

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-76276-2 - Human Rights and Climate Change Edited by Stephen Humphreys Frontmatter More information

AUTHORS' BIOGRAPHIES

seasonal climate information with water resources management in developing countries. Previously, Kye served with the International Alliance of Indigenous and Tribal Peoples of the Tropical Forests as the Thailand-based Coordinating Editor of a collection of case studies documenting the impacts of climate change on indigenous peoples across the world.

JOHN MUTTER is Professor at Columbia University in the Departments of Earth and Environmental Sciences and of International and Public Affairs. He is Director of Graduate Studies for the Ph.D. program in Sustainable Development at the School of International and Public Affairs. More recently he has turned his attention to the issue of the role of Earth systems in sustainable development. He is interested in the way in which natural systems interact with human well-being, especially the role of natural extremes, such as earthquakes and hurricanes in reducing development opportunities. At the Earth Institute, where he was Deputy Director until July 2007, he oversees the Fellows program and the establishment of a disasters and development initiative and chairs the committee for the State of the Planet Conference. The Institute is taking a comprehensive approach to understanding the nexus between the Earth's environment and the nature of the human condition.

PETER NEWELL is Professor of Development Studies at the University of East Anglia and James Martin Fellow at the Oxford University Centre for the Environment. He has held positions as Principal Research Fellow at Warwick University's Centre for the Study of Globalisation and Regionalisation, Research Fellow at the Institute of Development Studies, University of Sussex and Associate Professor at FLACSO Argentina and the Instituto de Estudios para la Sustentabilidad Corporativa. He has also worked as a researcher and lobbyist for Climate Network Europe in Brussels and Friends of the Earth London and is a trustee of the NGO, One World Trust. He is author of Climate for Change: Non-State Actors and the Global Politics of the Greenhouse, coauthor of The Effectiveness of EU Environmental Policy, and co-editor of Development and the Challenge of Globalisation, The Business of Global Environmental Governance and Rights, Resources and the Politics of Accountability. He has published widely in journals on issues of environment and development and is currently Associate Editor of the journal Global Environmental Politics and sits on the editorial board of the Journal of Environment and Development.

AUTHORS' BIOGRAPHIES

FRANCES SEYMOUR is Director General of the Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR), Bogor, Indonesia. Previously she founded and directed the Institutions and Governance Program at the World Resources Institute (WRI) in Washington DC where she guided the launch of The Access Initiative, a global civil society coalition promoting citizen involvement in environment-related decisions. She also authored and contributed to WRI publications critically examining the role of public and private international financial institutions in promoting sustainable development. She previously served as Director of Development Assistance Policy at WWF, and spent five years in Indonesia with the Ford Foundation, where her grant-making focused on community forestry and human rights. She has served on numerous boards and advisory committees, including those of World Neighbors, the International NGO Forum on Indonesian Development and the African Centre for Technology Studies. She is a member of the Council on Foreign Relations.

DINAH SHELTON holds the Manatt/Ahn Professorship in International Law at the George Washington University Law School. From 1996–2004 she taught international law and was director of the doctoral program in international human rights law at the University of Notre Dame Law School. From 1987 to 1989, she was the director of the Office of Staff Attorneys at the US Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit. She is the author of three prize-winning books, *Protecting Human Rights in the Americas* (co-authored with Thomas Buergenthal), *Remedies in International Human Rights Law* and the three-volume *Encyclopedia of Genocide and Crimes against Humanity*. She is a member of the board of editors of the *American Journal of International Law* and is a counsellor to the American Society of International Law. Professor Shelton also serves on the boards of many human rights and environmental organisations. She has also served as a legal consultant to UNEP, UNITAR, WHO, the EU, Council of Europe and the OAS.

xi

ACRONYMS

ATCA	Alien Tort Claims Act
CAFOD	Catholic Agency for Overseas Development
CBDR	common but differentiated responsibilities
CDM	clean development mechanism
CERD	Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
CER	certified emission reduction
CESCR	Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CIFOR	Centre for International Forestry Research
COP	Conference of the Parties (to the UNFCCC)
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EPA	Environmental Protection Agency
ETS	emissions trading system
FAO	Food and Agricultural Organisation
FIELD	Foundation for International Environmental Law and Development
GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
GCI	Global Commons Institute
GDR	greenhouse development rights
GEF	global environmental facility
GHG	greenhouse gas
IACHR	Inter-American Commission on Human Rights
IBRD	International Bank for Reconstruction and Development
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICHRP	International Council on Human Rights Policy
ICJ	International Court of Justice
IELRC	International Environmental Law Research Centre
ILC	International Law Commission
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IOM	International Organization for Migration
IPCC	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
IUCN	International Union for the Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources
LDCF	Least Developed Country Fund

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-76276-2 - Human Rights and Climate Change Edited by Stephen Humphreys Frontmatter More information

ACRONYMS

xiii

LDC	least developed country
MDG	millennium development goal
NAPA	National Adaptation Programme of Action
NGO	Non-governmental organisation
NHTSA	National Highway Traffic Safety Administration
OAS	Organization of American States
ODA	official development assistance
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
PRC	People's Republic of China
REDD	reduced emissions from deforestation and degradation
SCCF	Special Climate Change Fund
SPA	special priority on adaption
TVPA	Torture Victims Protection Act
UDHR	Universal Declaration on Human Rights
UNCED	United Nations Conference on Environment and Development
UNCLOS	United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNEP	United Nations Environment Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation
UNFCCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
WHO	World Health Organization
WTO	World Trade Organization

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The present collection of articles on the human rights dimensions of climate change had its genesis at a meeting convened by the International Council on Human Rights Policy, held on 12–13 October 2007, which brought together experts in climate change, human rights and/or their inter-relation. Participants included: Sumudu Atapattu, Simon Caney, Philippe Cullet, Stefanie Grant, Rajat Khosla, M. J. Mace, Benito Müller, John Mutter, Peter Newell, Gonzalo Oviedo, Dimitrina Petrova, Wolfgang Sachs, Frances Seymour, Dinah Shelton, Marco Simons, Youba Sokona, Jorge-Daniel Taillant, Martin Wagner and Michael Windfuhr.

A variant of the Introduction to this book, and of the first chapter and Conclusion, were originally published as parts of a report by the International Council on Human Rights Policy entitled *Climate Change and Human Rights: A Rough Guide* (2008). That report benefited from extensive comments from the participants at the October 2007 meeting, whose significant contribution needs special mention. In addition, the following individuals gave generously of their time in commenting on aspects of the original report, and/or in discussing the project with the editor: Bill Adams, Jon Barnett, Nathalie Bernasconi-Osterwalder, Mohamad El Ashry, Scott Jerbi, Sébastien Jodoin, Yves Lador, Siobhán McInerney-Lankford, Nathalie Mivelaz, Marcus Orellano, John Quigley, Kate Raworth, Jesse Ribot, Margot Salomon, Margaret Young and Mona Younis.

Robert Archer, Executive Director of the International Council on Human Rights Policy, played a pivotal role in guiding the meeting and also for editorial suggestions on much of the text reproduced in the Introduction, Chapter 1 and Conclusion of the present volume. Anna Piekarzewski deserves special thanks for close perusal and copy-editing of the book in its entirety and some excellent suggestions on structure. Thanks must also go to those at Cambridge University Press who

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

XV

shepherded the book through its final stages, particularly Finola O'Sullivan, whose encouragement and advice from the outset were invaluable, and Lyn Flight, whose editing was consistently courteous, clear and competent.

This publication, and the meeting and report from which it partly derives, were made possible in part through the direct support of the German Agency for Technical Cooperation (GTZ) and Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ), as well as funding from the UK Department of International Development, the Ford Foundation, the Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency, the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation and the Catholic Agency for Overseas Development. The views expressed here are not necessarily those of the organisations mentioned here.

FOREWORD

MARY ROBINSON

In summer 2008, natural disasters in China and Myanmar brought tragedy to hundreds of thousands of individuals and families. After centuries of technological and industrial advance, it is sobering to reflect on how poorly equipped we were to manage the devastation wrought by these catastrophes. We still lack early warning systems, efficient response mechanisms, and – as the suffering of the Burmese people in particular cruelly reminds us – the global solidarity and coordination needed to deliver help where and when it is most needed.

We know there will be more catastrophes of this kind in future, we know that their number and intensity is likely to grow and we know that they will increasingly be due to the acts of human beings. But they will not always involve horrific headlines and torrid photographs of hurricanes and tsunamis. More commonly, they will be cumulative and unspectacular. People who are already vulnerable will be disproportionately affected. Slowly and incrementally, land will become too dry to till, crops will wither, rising sea levels will undermine coastal dwellings and spoil freshwater, species will disappear, livelihoods will vanish. Occasional cataclysms will exacerbate these trends. Mass migration and conflicts will result. Only very gradually will these awful consequences reach those whose lifestyles and activities are most to blame. Climate change will, in short, have immense human consequences.

We have known this for a long time. We also know that these events are no longer 'natural' in the ordinary sense of the word: they are in part manmade, a product of the very same technological progress that has improved many lifestyles, but has not so far succeeded in protecting the vulnerable from its own worst consequences. The human impacts of climate change also have a human source – and this causal relationship makes the climate phenomenon peculiarly appropriate for human rights analysis.

The present collection of papers is not by any means the first to draw attention to the urgency of the many human impacts that climate change

xviii

FOREWORD

will entail, nor to broach the difficult justice questions that it raises, nor to inquire into its long-term implications for development. Each of these concerns has been discussed repeatedly since the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) was opened for signature in May 1992, and, indeed, before then. What this collection does for the first time, however, is think through the human rights implications of climate change and ask how the substantial body of international human rights law and experience relates to that phenomenon. Where does international human rights law coincide with or confront obligations under the nascent climate regime? Where must climate change policies contend with human rights imperatives?

Human rights law is relevant because climate change causes human rights violations. But a human rights lens can also be helpful in approaching and managing climate change. The human rights framework reminds us that climate change is about suffering – about the human misery that results directly from the damage we are doing to nature. Many communities already feel the adverse effects of warming temperatures – yet few remedies are so far available to them. While we cannot say precisely who will be affected in future, or how severely, the signs are nevertheless clear. Where information is still lacking, as it often is, we know where and how to gather it. As the present collection progressively clarifies, if we build human rights criteria into our future planning, we will better understand who is at risk and how we should act to protect them.

Attending to human rights also means recognising that as we take steps to address climate change, we must not do so at the cost of the most vulnerable. It is surely possible to repair our environment while still assuring our fellow human beings a path out of poverty and insecurity. Making certain that good information exists – and that it is in the hands of those most affected – can ensure greater participation in efforts to prevent and manage climate change. Beyond that, we must design with care global and regional programmes that substitute fuels, preserve forests, apply new technologies, or redesign markets. At each step we must ask where the heaviest burden will fall and how it should be divided.

Finally, government obligations do not stop at their own borders. As human rights lawyers have long observed, states have a special responsibility to monitor and, where necessary, regulate the behaviour of private entities within their purview, including those operating abroad. This is especially important in the case of climate change, where the immediate causes are generally found in private acts. Yet, as things

FOREWORD

currently stand, large emitters may fall through the net of a global system that imposes different obligations on rich and poor countries. It is surely right that countries with little or no history of emitting greenhouse gases should not have to take on targets that would impact their development. But it would surely be wrong if private actors were permitted to take advantage of this dispensation to produce carbon-intensive goods cheaply and export the benefits back to wealthy countries. Better to harness private ingenuity toward equitable solutions that can target and head off unacceptable human harms.

Climate change already threatens the livelihoods of peoples in distant corners of the world, from North Alaska to the Pacific islands. It is contributing to rising prices for grains and staples that are undermining food security for millions, particularly in countries with unstable weather patterns. It poses a profound threat to development in states that currently lack the resources to fulfil basic human rights.

The scope of these problems – and of the action required to treat them – reaches beyond previous human challenges. Yet in the seventeen years since the UNFCCC was signed, global negotiations have proceeded at a glacial pace. We have collectively failed to grasp the scale and urgency of the problem. Climate change shows up countless weaknesses in our current institutional architecture, including its human rights mechanisms. To address it effectively will require a transformation of global policy capacity – from information-gathering and collective decision-making to law enforcement and resource distribution.

Climate change is a story about desperation and hope. It can kill us or it can save us. Climate change will test us, threaten us and force us to change. And change, the unknown, is daunting. However, it does not have to be. On the contrary, there are reasons to be optimistic. Because, in fact, we have the know-how, the tools, the technology and the economy to mitigate climate change and ensure climate justice.

Why is the human context so important? In 1820, the United Kingdom was the richest country in the world. The average income per person was three times greater than that of people in the poorest region, sub-Saharan Africa. Today the United States is the richest country in the world, with a per capita income that is roughly twenty times larger than that of the poorest region – still sub-Saharan Africa. Most of the expected rise in global population of 2.6 billion persons by 2050 will come from the poorest regions in the world. These are regions which have no convergent economic growth, are the most unstable politically and will be those hardest hit by climate change.

XX

FOREWORD

It is clear that we will not be able to mitigate climate change unless we address poverty and ensure climate justice. Ultimately, achieving sustainability and a low-carbon economy will not only depend on technological innovation, but will require far-ranging social and political innovation. Let us not forget that technology does not have the ability to eliminate poverty, respect human rights, stop climate change and build a sustainable society – people do.

According to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 'everyone is entitled to a social and international order in which [their] rights and freedoms ... can be fully realized'. Climate change disrupts that order. But perhaps it is also an opportunity, if we are willing to grasp it, to create the kind of international and social order of which the framers of the Universal Declaration dreamt.

> Mary Robinson President, Realizing Rights: The Ethical Globalization Initiative