Fatigue can have a major impact on an individual's performance and wellbeing, yet is poorly understood, even within the scientific community. There is no developed theory of its origins or functions, and different types of fatigue (mental, physical, sleepiness) are routinely confused. The widespread interpretation of fatigue as a negative consequence of work may be true only for externally imposed goals; meaningful or self-initiated work is rarely tiring and often invigorating. In the first book dedicated to the systematic treatment of fatigue for over sixty years, Robert Hockey examines its many aspects – social history, neuroscience, energetics, exercise physiology, sleep and clinical implications – and develops a new motivational control theory, in which fatigue is treated as an emotion having a fundamental adaptive role in the management of goals. He then uses this new perspective to explore the role of fatigue in relation to individual motivation, working life and wellbeing.

Robert Hockey is Emeritus Professor of Human Factors and Cognitive Engineering in the Department of Psychology at Sheffield University. His research on human attention and performance, workload, stress and fatigue has emphasized the adaptive nature of human regulatory activity in task performance, and he has acted as a consultant in the maritime, rail, nuclear and space industries. He has published over 170 research articles and edited or written five books, including Stress and Fatigue in Human Performance (1983).
The Psychology of Fatigue

*Work, Effort and Control*

Robert Hockey

*University of Sheffield*
To the memory of my teachers, colleagues and friends:

D. Roy Davies, Donald Broadbent, Peter Hamilton and Bert Mulder
# Contents

| List of figures | xi |
| List of tables | xii |
| Preface | xiii |

## 1 The problem of fatigue

- **Background**
- Rationale and focus of the book: the adaptive role of fatigue
- The failure of classical fatigue theory
- Limitations of the energy account of fatigue
- Fatigue is not (just) a negative state
- A motivational perspective
- Defining the field: what is fatigue?
- A working definition
- Fatigue and related feelings
- The conceptual status of fatigue
- Some questions for a scientific theory of fatigue
- Plan of the book

## 2 Changing experiences of fatigue: the social-historical context

- **Background**
- Roots of the energy metaphor of fatigue
- The pre-modern experience of work and fatigue
- Fatigue, idleness and volition
- Work as a benign experience
- The loss of control over work
- Work and fatigue in the post-industrial period
- The intensification of work
- Changes in leisure and recreation
- A demands-control analysis of changes in the experience of work
- The link between fatigue and energy
- The medicalization of fatigue
- Fatigue as a subject for scientific study
- Summary

## 3 The work–fatigue hypothesis

- **Background**
- The golden age of fatigue research

© in this web service Cambridge University Press  www.cambridge.org
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The early research agenda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The work curve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early research on the work decrement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is fatigue general or specific?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recovery from fatigue: effects of rest and change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After-effects of fatigue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vigilance and sustained attention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What causes the vigilance decrement?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Habituation and executive control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The sensitive task</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work intensity, effort and executive control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workload, capacity and resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effort and executive control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A reappraisal of the work curve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rapid onset of decrement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interruptions of control: blocks, gaps and lapses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three sources of performance decrement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 4 Stress, coping and fatigue

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Background</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stress, homeostasis and allostatic load</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The response to stress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adaptive physiological systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychological stress and coping</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fatigue and the costs of coping</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Task performance under stress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early research on stress and performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The modal stress pattern</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theoretical perspectives on stress and fatigue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distraction and arousal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limitations of general arousal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stress and emotion as distractors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotional states and feelings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specific emotions and general feelings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The adaptive value of feelings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fatigue as an emotion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 5 Effort, strain and fatigue

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Background</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A systems perspective on performance decrement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessing the costs of task management: effectiveness and efficiency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal competition in task performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Varieties of goal: have to, want to and need to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The vulnerability of task goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protection of performance under stress: effort, strain and fatigue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indirect effects of stressors on performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary task decrements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategy changes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents ix

Psychophysiological activation 118
Fatigue after-effects 120
Strain and fatigue at work 123
Work strain 123
Laboratory versus real-life stress 126
Modes of work management 127
Fatigue and recovery from stress 130
Summary 131

6 A motivation control theory of fatigue 132
Background 132
Goals in motivation control 134
Outline of the theory 135
Elements of the fatigue state 135
The interruption function of fatigue 136
A control systems implementation 139
The compensatory control model 140
Revising the model 141
Control model description 143
Where is fatigue located in the control model? 145
Evidence from neuroscience 146
Goal maintenance and monitoring 147
Effort regulation 149
Goal interruption 151
Relation between effort and interruption 152
Summary 154

7 Extensions and limitations: energy, physical work and sleep 155
Background 155
Brain energy 155
Energy use by the brain 156
Energy metabolism in brain and body 157
Does brain energy have a role in mental work and fatigue? 160
Physical work and exercise 164
Peripheral and central fatigue in exercise 165
The central governor hypothesis 167
Effects of physical exercise on cognition 172
Sleep and fatigue 173
Models of sleep and alertness 174
Compensatory control in sleep deprivation 175
The energy hypothesis of sleep 176
Local brain sleep as a basis for fatigue? 177
Elements of an integrated fatigue framework? 178
Summary 179

8 The psychopathology of fatigue 180
Background 180
Prevalence of persistent fatigue 181
Chronic fatigue syndrome (CFS) 183
Contents

The clinical context of chronic fatigue 183
What causes CFS? 184
Effort and motivational control in CFS 185
Fatigue in chronic medical conditions 187
Cancer 188
Multiple sclerosis 188
Parkinson’s disease 189
Persistent fatigue from work stress 190
Work conditions, extended hours and shift work 190
The need for recovery from work 192
Emotional demands and burnout 193
A motivation control analysis of persistent fatigue 195
Carry-over effects of coping failures 196
A proposed model: the effort–fatigue disengagement spiral 197
Physiological implications of CFS 201
Summary 203

9 An agenda for fatigue: research and application 205

Background 205
Tests of the motivation control theory 206
The work–fatigue relationship 207
Cost–benefit analysis 208
Short-term recovery from fatigue 208
Contributions from neuroscience 209
Brain energy 210
Physical and mental fatigue 211
Sleep and fatigue 213
Persistent fatigue and CFS 214
Some practical considerations 216
Summary 218

References 219
Name index 258
Subject index 268
Figures

1.1 Changes in frequency of fatigue publications 1890–2000 page 3
3.1 Arai’s (1912) data, showing time taken for mental arithmetic problems over four 12-hour days 61
3.2 Data of Bills and McTeer (1932), showing the number of three-letter sequences completed during successive odd minutes, separated by sequences with different numbers of letters in common 66
3.3 Data from Morgan (1926), showing rapid decrement in cancellation and addition 79
3.4 Three phases of the work decrement function 84
4.1 The two axes of the stress response 90
6.1 Motivational control model of executive control, effort and fatigue 144
7.1 Main elements of the central governor model: after St Clair Gibson and Noakes (2004) 168
7.2 Effect of exercise load on cognitive vigilance performance (d’). Full lines = increasing phase of the load cycle; broken lines = decreasing phase 171
8.1 The strain disengagement spiral. Unresolved stress from a sustained strain response to excessive demands leads to prolonged fatigue. This increases the need for effort the following day, with resultant further incremental effects on stress, fatigue and effort. For simplicity, only two cycles of the spiral are shown, with increasing strain indicated by the use of + and ++ modifiers. When the compensatory limit is reached, the high effort strategy is abandoned in favour of one of disengagement 198
### Tables

1.1 Possible patterns of the fatigue response to work tasks  
2.1 Summary of changes in working life between 1750 and 1880  
5.1 Modes of work management
When I decided to write this book I became aware of an obvious but previously dormant fact: that, for as long as I can recall, my intellectual life has been dominated by fatigue. My undergraduate dissertation was on vigilance, under the guidance of D. Roy Davies; my PhD was on attention and stress in prolonged tasks, under the supervision of Donald Broadbent; and my later work, while ostensibly on stress, was always ultimately about the causes of work decrement. Even when I did some research on short-term memory (as it was known at the time) I somehow managed to think of memory work as something that could go wrong if you stuck at it for too long. By the mid 1980s, inspired by Danny Kahneman’s wonderful book on attention and effort, it seemed to me that the ideas of fatigue and energy mobilization could provide a way of integrating problems of performance decrement, stress, effort and arousal, and those associated with the core body of work on human information processing, and I developed a cognitive energetic theory with Peter Hamilton that emphasized these interactions.

Then my interest in fatigue took a personal as well as an intellectual direction. On moving to a new job in Sheffield in 1985 I developed a condition related to chronic fatigue, which lasted for six years. In addition to the obvious problems it caused me, I found the state intriguing because, oddly, its main impact was on my motivation and capacity for cognitive work – not simply the demands associated with the reading, writing and serious thinking of academic life, but also reading the newspaper and keeping track of the plot during films and plays – while I was still able to run and cycle, even taking part in marathons and long cycling holidays, and carrying out garden building projects in our new home.

This (admittedly, unscientific sample of one) led me to think that there may be different kinds of fatigue, or at least that feelings of fatigue may have different origins, which may not necessarily lead to the same outcomes. It also made me aware of the implausibility of fatigue being caused by a loss of energy; if that were the case why was it just my
mental life that was impaired, while my body seemed relatively free to get on with its normal activities? My early rambling thoughts on these issues were tried out while cycling through the Yorkshire Dales with my brother, Ken Hockey, and our mutual friend, Harry French. They listened patiently and asked interesting questions while I worked my way through ideas about possible similarities and differences between mental and physical fatigue – though I don’t think they were wholeheartedly convinced that the weariness we all felt on the ride might be in the head and not the legs after all!

My reading of the early work on fatigue, starting with Bartley and Chute’s (1947) comprehensive review, and extending to Bartlett, Bills, Thorndike and others, suggested that my earlier enthusiasm with energy explanations of fatigue and performance decrement needed a rethink. Fatigue appeared to be less about energy than about personal motivation and interest. Specifically, fatigue seemed to reflect conflicts in the control of motivational choices – an unwillingness to continue with an activity that was unrewarding, rather than an inability to complete one that was too demanding – ideas that appear to have got lost as the problem of fatigue drifted from the theoretical landscape (at least as far as experimental psychology was concerned). I talked about these ideas with various colleagues, but most of all with Theo Meijman, with whom I had many discussions. Theo and I even planned to write a review paper and, possibly, a book on the problem, but I suppose we were both too busy at the time, and maybe too tired to take it on! But those who are familiar with Theo’s thinking on fatigue will recognize its contribution to the core ideas underlying the theory presented in this monograph. I also acknowledge the formative influences of my mentors, Roy Davies and Donald Broadbent, and the invaluable experience of working (and playing) with the many wonderful colleagues I have had the privilege to know. Foremost amongst these are Tony Gaillard, Peter Hamilton and Bert Mulder, with all of whom I have spent many stimulating hours over many years. But I am also grateful for the guiding influences and stimulating ideas of John Duncan, Marion Frankenheuser, Peter Hancock, Danny Kahneman, Raja Parasuraman, Mike Posner, Pat Rabbitt and Wolfgang Schönpflug, as well as the thoughts and comments at various stages of numerous colleagues and graduate students, including Torbjörn Åkerstedt, Nik Chmiel, Peter Clough, Kevin Connolly, Gareth Conway, Fiona Earle, Renata Manoussos, Dietrich Manzey, John Maule, Ben Mulder, Peter Nickel, Adam Roberts, Jürgen Sauer, Nick Shryane, Andy Tattersall, Hans Veltman, Dave Wastell and Marion Wiethoff.
Some of the research for this book was carried out with the support of an Emeritus Fellowship award from the Leverhulme Trust. I am grateful to them for this funding, which enabled me to employ Lorna Bleach and Felicity Stout to help with research on historical and etymological material. I thank them both for their valuable contributions, and Lorna for her further help with the compilation of references. The details of the text were influenced by the comments of Lorna and Felicity, and also by Nick Shryane, who also helped me with the technical side of formatting figures and tables so that they stay put, and the mysteries of the outline mode in Word.

Finally, I give special thanks to my wife, Jenny Hockey – seasoned campaigner, author and editor of many books on anthropology and sociology – for her regular monitoring of my efforts, and for advice, pointers, insights and constant encouragement, and for generously making allowances for my occasional inevitable shortcomings in the other activities that constitute shared family life.