JUDICIAL REVIEW IN AN AGE OF MORAL PLURALISM

Americans cannot live with judicial review, but they cannot live without it. There used to be something characteristically American about turning the most divisive political questions – like freedom of religion, same-sex marriage, affirmative action, and abortion – into legal questions with the hope that courts can answer them. In *Judicial Review in an Age of Moral Pluralism*, Ronald C. Den Otter addresses how judicial review can be improved to strike the appropriate balance between legislative and judicial power under conditions of moral pluralism. His defense of judicial review is predicated on the imperative of ensuring that the reasons that the state offers on behalf of its most important laws are consistent with the freedom and equality of all persons. Den Otter ties this defense to a theory of constitutional adjudication based on John Rawls’s idea of public reason and argues that a law that is not sufficiently publicly justified is unconstitutional. He thus addresses when courts should invalidate laws and when they should uphold them, even in the midst of reasonable disagreement about the correct outcome in the most challenging constitutional cases.

Ronald C. Den Otter is Assistant Professor of Political Science at California Polytechnic State University, San Luis Obispo. He received his J.D. from the University of Pennsylvania Law School and his Ph.D. in political science from UCLA. Professor Den Otter has also taught undergraduate courses in public law and political theory at California State University, Los Angeles; UCLA; and Pepperdine University.
Judicial Review in an Age of Moral Pluralism

Ronald C. Den Otter
California Polytechnic State University, San Luis Obispo
This book is dedicated to my wife, Grace.
I could not have found a better person to spend the rest of my life with.
There is hardly a political question in the United States which does not sooner or later turn into a judicial one.
– Alexis de Tocqueville, *Democracy in America*
## Contents

**Acknowledgments**  
page ix

- Introduction  
  page 1

1 Public Justification and Constitutional Theory  
  page 22

2 Freedom and Equality in Constitutional History  
  page 52

3 The Challenge of Public Justification  
  page 81

4 Competing Conceptions of Public Reason  
  page 109

5 Constitutional Public Reason  
  page 139

6 The Limits of Public Justification  
  page 172

7 Standard Objections to Public Reason  
  page 200

8 Easier Cases  
  page 231

9 Harder Cases  
  page 262

10 The Case for Judicial Review  
  page 291

Conclusion  
  page 316

References  
  page 319

Index  
  page 337
Acknowledgments

This book began as a dissertation project when I was a graduate student at UCLA and has gone through numerous iterations since then. I would like to thank Barbara Herman, Brian Walker, Victor Wolfenstein, Mark Sawyer, Andrew Lister, Dan O’Neill, Michael Goodhart, Adam Winkler, and David Karol. In particular, I would like to express my gratitude to Andy Sabl, who was a wonderful mentor and could not have been more generous with his time when I was his graduate student.

At Cal Poly, Chris Den Hartog, Jean Williams, Alesha Doan, Craig Arнеaux, Anika Leithner, Beth Lowham, Mike Latner, Suzy Black, and Samantha Keller-Thomas have assisted me in various ways with this project. I have been blessed with wonderful colleagues. In particular, I would like to single out Matt Moore and thank him for all of the contributions that he has made to this book and all of the help that he has given me since we have been colleagues at Cal Poly.

Paul Frymer, Ann Davies, Scott Bowman, Mark Swofford, and Sam Ernst also helped me with different parts of this project. I would especially like to thank Pat Neal, Eileen Scallen, and Larry Solum, whose constructive criticism made this book much better than it otherwise would have been. I wish that I could repay the debt.

At Cambridge University Press, I would like to thank my editor, John Berger; my senior production controller, Paul Smolenski; my editorial assistant, Jason Przybylski; my senior project manager, Frank Scott; my copyeditor, Katherine Faydash; and Robert Swanson, who prepared the index. I also would like to thank the anonymous reviewers for their insightful comments on an earlier version of this manuscript.

One’s personal life can never be entirely separated from one’s professional life. With respect to the former, several people deserve special thanks: my brother, Doug Den Otter, and his wife, Debra Pettric. I could not have been given a better brother and a better sister-in-law. Above all, I would like to thank my wife, Grace. Without her, this book would not have been possible.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Over the course of my life, there are so many people to whom I owe the deepest gratitude for stimulating my intellectual development. I hope that I have not left out anyone who deserves to be mentioned, and if I have, then I apologize for the oversight.