

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76180-2 - Paths to Development in Asia: South Korea, Vietnam, China, and Indonesia

Tuong Vu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Paths to Development in Asia

South Korea, Vietnam, China, and Indonesia

Why have some states in the developing world been more successful at facilitating industrialization than others? Challenging theories that privilege industrial policy and colonial legacies, this book focuses on state structure and the politics of state formation, arguing that a cohesive state structure is as important to developmental success as effective industrial policy. Through a comparison of six Asian cases, including both capitalist and socialist states with varying structural cohesion, Tuong Vu demonstrates that state formation politics rather than colonial legacies have had decisive and lasting impacts on the structures of emerging states. His cross-national comparison of South Korea, Vietnam, Republican and Maoist China, and Sukarno's and Suharto's Indonesia, which is augmented by in-depth analyses of state formation processes in Vietnam and Indonesia, is an important contribution to understanding the dynamics of state formation and economic development in Asia.

Tuong Vu is an Assistant Professor of Comparative Politics in the Department of Political Science at the University of Oregon. He coedited (with Erik Kuhonta and Dan Slater) *Southeast Asia in Political Science: Theory, Region and Qualitative Analysis* (2008) and (with Wasana Wongsurawat) *Dynamics of the Cold War in Asia: Ideology, Identity, and Culture* (2009). His articles have appeared in numerous scholarly journals, including *World Politics*, the *Journal of Southeast Asian Studies*, *Studies in Comparative International Development*, and *Theory and Society*, and he is a co-editor in chief of the *Journal of Vietnamese Studies*.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76180-2 - Paths to Development in Asia: South Korea, Vietnam, China, and Indonesia

Tuong Vu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Paths to Development in Asia

South Korea, Vietnam, China, and Indonesia

TUONG VU

University of Oregon



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76180-2 - Paths to Development in Asia: South Korea, Vietnam, China, and Indonesia
Tuong Vu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,
São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

Cambridge University Press

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521761802

© Tuong Vu 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Vu, Tuong, 1965–

Paths to development in Asia : South Korea, Vietnam, China, and
Indonesia / Tuong Vu.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-76180-2 (hardback)

1. Southeast Asia – Politics and government. 2. East Asia – Politics and
government. I. Title.

JQ750.A58v83 2010

320.95 – dc22 2009033078

ISBN 978-0-521-76180-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in
this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is,
or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76180-2 - Paths to Development in Asia: South Korea, Vietnam, China, and Indonesia

Tuong Vu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

To Ba Má and Lan

Contents

<i>List of Tables and Figure</i>	page x
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xv
1 State Formation Dynamics and Developmental Outcomes	1
<i>Roles, Capacities, and Structures for Development</i>	3
<i>The Argument</i>	8
<i>Case Selection and Research Design</i>	19
<i>Organization of the Book</i>	21
PART ONE. DIVERGENT NATIONAL PATHS OF STATE DEVELOPMENT	
2 South Korea: Confrontation and the Formation of a Cohesive State	27
<i>Traumatic Events and a Theoretical Lacuna</i>	27
<i>Colonial Legacies and Korean Postwar Industrialization</i>	30
<i>Confrontation and the Formation of Korean States, 1945–1948</i>	33
<i>The Consolidation of a Developmental State Structure, 1948–1960</i>	39
<i>The State versus Popular Sectors, 1953–1980</i>	44
<i>Conclusion</i>	48
3 Indonesia: From Accommodation to Confrontation	50
<i>Politics of Economic Swings</i>	50
<i>Colonial Legacies</i>	52
<i>Accommodation and the Birth of a Wobbly Leviathan, 1942–1949</i>	55
	vii

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76180-2 - Paths to Development in Asia: South Korea, Vietnam, China, and Indonesia

Tuong Vu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

Contents

	<i>The Failure of Premature Developmentalism, 1950–1957</i>	61
	<i>Confrontation and the Construction of a Developmental Structure, 1960–1975</i>	63
	<i>Conclusion</i>	69
4	Rival State Formations in China: The Republican and Maoist States	71
	“Bringing the State Back In”: Modern Chinese Historiography	71
	<i>Traditional Legacies and Modern Chinese States</i>	73
	<i>The Republican State, 1911–1937</i>	74
	<i>The Formation of the Maoist State, 1927–1949</i>	85
	<i>Ongoing Socialist Revolution on Mainland China, 1949–1960</i>	91
	<i>The Cult of Mao and the Decline of the Maoist State</i>	96
	<i>Conclusion</i>	98
5	Vietnam: Accommodation and Arrested Revolution	100
	<i>Vietnam and China in Contrast</i>	100
	<i>Colonial Legacies</i>	105
	<i>Accommodation and the Birth of the Viet Minh State, 1945–1946</i>	108
	<i>Legacies of Accommodation and the Road to the Great Purge, 1946–1950</i>	117
	<i>The Failure of a Premature Socialist Revolution, 1950–1960</i>	121
	<i>Conclusion</i>	127
PART TWO. VARIANTS OF ACCOMMODATION: VIETNAM AND INDONESIA COMPARED		
6	Organizing Accommodation in Vietnam: Coalition Government, United Front, and Leninist Party	131
	<i>Early Nationalist Organizations, 1910s–1940s</i>	132
	<i>From Coalition Government to Party Purge, 1941–1956</i>	135
	<i>Conclusion</i>	154
7	Organizing Accommodation in Indonesia: Parliament and Status-Based Parties	157
	<i>Early Nationalist Organizations, 1910s–1930s</i>	158
	<i>From Proliferation to Disintegration, 1942–1955</i>	161
	<i>Conclusion</i>	178
8	Talking Accommodation in Vietnam: Nation, the People, and Class Struggle	180
	<i>Early Nationalist Discourses, 1900–1940</i>	182
	<i>The Struggle between Nation and Class, 1941–1956</i>	186
	<i>Conclusion</i>	206

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76180-2 - Paths to Development in Asia: South Korea, Vietnam, China, and Indonesia
Tuong Vu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

<i>Contents</i>	ix
9 Talking Accommodation in Indonesia: Nation, the People, God, and Karl Marx	208
<i>The Irony of History</i>	208
<i>Early Nationalist Discourses, 1900–1942</i>	209
<i>The Struggle between Capitalism and Anticapitalism, 1942–1955</i>	216
<i>Conclusion</i>	232
10 Rethinking Developmental States	234
<i>Explaining State Structures</i>	235
<i>Assumptions about the Politics of State Formation</i>	238
<i>Colonial Legacies and Developmental Outcomes</i>	241
<i>Ideology and Developmental States</i>	242
<i>Why Governing Elites Choose to Be Developmentalist</i>	243
<i>Development and Authoritarianism</i>	246
<i>Rethinking “Developmental States”</i>	248
<i>References</i>	253
<i>Archival Sources</i>	253
<i>Newspapers Consulted</i>	253
<i>Books, Articles, and Unpublished Theses</i>	254
<i>Index</i>	277

Tables and Figure

TABLES

1	Four components of a developmental state structure	<i>page</i> 14
2	Impact of elite alignment patterns on state structures	18
3	Impact of elite–mass engagement patterns on state structures	18
4	Confrontation, accommodation, and mixed paths of state formation	19
5	Three paths of state formation	22
6	Agricultural stagnation in North Vietnam, 1961–1973	102

FIGURE

1	The polarization of the Koreas	37
---	--------------------------------	----

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76180-2 - Paths to Development in Asia: South Korea, Vietnam, China, and Indonesia
Tuong Vu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

This book grew out of my interest in the revolutions and civil wars that violently shaped the history of postcolonial East Asia. As a survivor of the Vietnamese revolution and civil war, I have realized that analyzing these events is no less challenging than living them. Without the generosity of numerous individuals and institutions, I would not have been able to complete this book. Special thanks are due to Raymond Duvall at the University of Minnesota, who patiently guided me through my first research projects on revolutions and civil wars. At Princeton University, Lynn T. White III taught me much about Chinese politics and continues to be a caring mentor. For the dissertation on which this book is drawn, I benefited especially from the knowledge and advice of my committee at the University of California, Berkeley: Kevin O'Brien, Kenneth Jowitt, Steven Vogel, and Peter Zinoman. This book should show the profound influence they had on my theoretical approach. At the same time, Kiren Chaudhry, David Collier, the late Ernie Haas, Andrew Janos, and David Leonard were inspiring teachers who made Berkeley a truly stimulating intellectual community.

Beyond Berkeley, my work has been supported by colleagues from many institutions. At Smith College, where I was a Mendenhall Fellow during 2003–4, Donald Baumer, Mlada Bukovansky, Howard Gold, Jacques Hymans, and especially Dennis Yasutomo offered exceptional mentorship. Steven Goldstein tutored me on Chinese revolutionary politics and foreign policy over many lunches. At the Naval Postgraduate School, Maria C. Morgan and Kent Eaton helped me revise several chapters and provided generous friendships. Anne Clunan, Dean Robert L. Ord, Jessica Piombo, Zachary Shore, and Chris Twomey were likewise

wonderful colleagues. I am also grateful to the officers I taught who contributed many ideas to my thinking on states and state building. At the Asia Research Institute of the National University of Singapore, where I was a visiting Fellow in 2007–8, Anthony Reid and Geoff Wade offered valuable counsel and collaboration. All my colleagues in the Department of Political Science at the University of Oregon helped me through the final hurdles of publication with enthusiastic encouragement.

During my two years of fieldwork in Indonesia and Vietnam, I accumulated debts to many teachers, colleagues, and friends. Harold Crouch, Eric and Cathy Crystal, Greg Felker, Christopher Goscha, Yong Chul Ha, Russell Heng, Ben and Melinda Tria Kerkvliet, David Koh, Bill Liddle, and Michael Montesano offered keen insight and introduced me to valuable contacts. Bill Liddle was always generous with comments on drafts and contacts in the field. Ben Kerkvliet read the entire manuscript, and his constructive criticisms saved me from numerous errors. William Collins, Don Emmerson, Adam Fforde, Vu Minh Giang, Jeff Hadler, Nguyen Van Huy, Vu The Khoi, Nguyen Van Ku, David Marr, Sarah Maxim, Andrew McIntyre, John Roosa, Arbi Sanit, Amir Santoso, Bach Tan Sinh, Bui Dinh Thanh, and Peter Timmer helped in various ways. I am especially grateful to the late Bui Huy Dap, Vu Dinh Hoe, and the late Doan Trong Truyen, who shared with me their knowledge as participants in historical events. Achmad Tirtosudiro, Sapuan Gafar, M. Hussein Sawit, and Noer Sutrisno were also generous with their time and knowledge of the Indonesian bureaucracy. My Indonesian language teachers, Indriyo Sukmono, Ninik Lunde, Sylvia Tiwon, and Prapto Waluyo, and my tutors at Sam Ratulangi University in Manado, Sulawesi, will be remembered for their kindness and patience.

My research in Indonesia would have been difficult without the help of Do Kim Dung and Aswatini Raharto and their colleagues at the Institute of Population and Manpower Research (PPT-LIPI) in Jakarta. I can never repay my debts to Dung and her family for their kindness. In Hanoi, I am grateful to Vu Minh Giang and Do Kien of the Center for Vietnamese Studies and to Le Dang Doanh and Vu Xuan Nguyet Hong of the Central Institute for Economic Management. In Singapore, the Institute of Southeast Asian Studies provided research space and access to valuable materials at its library. Acknowledgments also are due to the Center for Southeast Asian Studies at the University of California, Berkeley; the Hewlett Foundation; the Boren Fellowship; the Fulbright Fellowship; the FLAS Fellowship; Smith College; the Naval Postgraduate School; the Asia Research Institute at the National University of Singapore; and the

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76180-2 - Paths to Development in Asia: South Korea, Vietnam, China, and Indonesia
Tuong Vu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Acknowledgments*

xiii

University of Oregon for generous financial support at various stages of research and writing.

I am fortunate to have as friends and colleagues Bill Hurst, Erik Kuhonta, Gerard Sasges, Dan Slater, and Kevin Strompf. Thanks are due to other friends who helped with contacts and ideas: Regina Abrami, Martin Beversdorf, Mike Boduszynski, Calvin Chen, Brian Folk and Yumi Iwai, Ken Foster, Myung-koo Kang, Conor O'Dwyer, Victor Peskin, Daromir Rudnyckij, Scott Strauss, and Hung C. Thai.

Kezia Paramita took excellent photographs of the Pancasila Sakti Monument for the cover of this book. Portions of Chapters 1, 2, 3, and 5 have been published in *Studies on Comparative International Development* and *Journal of Southeast Asian Studies*, and I thank these journals for their permission to reproduce them here. I am grateful to Mary Sharon Moore for her help with copyediting, to Mary Harper for creating the index, and to Kelley Littlepage and Travis Waterman for research assistance. Emily Spangler and Brian MacDonald of Cambridge University Press deserve thanks for guiding the manuscript through publication.

Finally, I thank my family for being with me through this entire project. I am blessed to have caring parents, who years ago borrowed money to buy me an English dictionary, and to have a loving spouse who has made many sacrifices for me. I dedicate this book to them with love and gratitude.

Abbreviations

AIP	Annam Independence Party
BBI	Barisan Buruh Indonesia (Indonesian Workers' Front)
BU	Budi Utomo (Pure Endeavor)
CCAKI	Central Council for the Acceleration of Korean Independence
CCP	Chinese Communist Party
CEC	(Guomintang's) Central Executive Committee
CPKI	Committee in Preparation for Korean Independence
DCSVN	Dang Cong San Viet Nam (Vietnamese Communist Party)
DI	Darul Islam
DP	(Vietnamese) Democratic Party
DPR	(Indonesian) Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat (People's Council of Representatives)
DRV	Democratic Republic of Vietnam
EVN	Empire of Vietnam
GLF	Great Leap Forward
GMD	Guomintang (Chinese Nationalist Party)
GNP	gross national product
ICP	Indochinese Communist Party (Dang Cong San Dong Duong)
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IP	Indische Partij (Indies Party)
ISDV	Indische Sociaal-Democratische Vereniging (Indies' Social Democratic Association)
KCP	Korean Communist Party
KDP	Korean Democratic Party

KNIP	(Indonesian) Komite Nasional Indonesia Pusat (Central National Committee)
KPG	Korean Provisional Government
KPR	Korean People's Republic
LRA	(Vietnamese) Land Reform Authority
Masjumi	Partai Majelis Syuro Muslimin Indonesia (Indonesian Muslim Council Party)
MG	(American) Military Government
MIAI	Majelis Islam A'la Indonesia (Great Islamic Council of Indonesia)
MPR	Majelis Perwakilan Rakyat (People's Consultative Assembly)
New PNI	Pendidikan Nasional Indonesia (Indonesian National Education)
NU	Nahdlatul Ulama (Council of Islamic Teachers)
Paras	Partai Rakyat Sosialis (People's Socialist Party)
Parsi	Partai Sosialis Indonesia (Indonesian Socialist Party)
PBI	Partai Buruh Indonesia (Indonesian Workers' Party)
PC	(Korean) People's Committee
Pesindo	Pemuda Sosialis Indonesia (Socialist Youth of Indonesia)
PI	Perhimpunan Indonesia (Indonesian League)
PII	Partai Islam Indonesia (Islamic Party of Indonesia)
PKI	Perserikatan Komunis di India (Communist Party of the Indies, an earlier name of the Indonesian Communist Party)
PKI	Partai Komunis Indonesia (Indonesian Communist Party)
PNI	Partai Nasional Indonesia (Indonesian Nationalist Party)
PRC	People's Republic of China
PS	Partai Sosialis (Socialist Party)
PSI	Partai Sosialis Indonesia (Socialist Party of Indonesia)
PSII	Partai Sarekat Islam Indonesia (Islamic League Party of Indonesia)
RI	Republic of Indonesia
RTA	(Netherlands-Indonesia) Round Table Agreements
SI	Sarekat Islam (Islamic League)
SOBSI	Sentral Organisasi Buruh Seluruh Indonesia (Indonesian Central Workers' Union)
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
VCP	Vietnamese Communist Party (Dang Cong San Viet Nam)

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76180-2 - Paths to Development in Asia: South Korea, Vietnam, China, and Indonesia
Tuong Vu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Abbreviations*

xvii

VNDL	<i>Viet Nam Doc Lap</i> (Independent Vietnam)
VNP	Vietnamese Nationalist Party (Viet Nam Quoc Dan Dang)
VRL	Vietnamese Revolutionary League (Viet Nam Cach Mang Dong Minh Hoi)
VWP	Vietnamese Workers' Party (Dang Lao Dong Viet Nam)