

PLEASURE IN ANCIENT GREEK PHILOSOPHY

In this volume Professor Wolfsdorf undertakes the first exploration of ancient Greek philosophical conceptions of pleasure in relation to contemporary conceptions. He provides broad coverage of the ancient material, from pre-Platonic to Old Stoic treatments; and, in the contemporary period, from World War II to the present. Examination of the nature of pleasure in ancient philosophy largely occurred within ethical contexts but in the contemporary period has, to a greater extent, been pursued within philosophy of mind and psychology. This divergence reflects the dominant philosophical preoccupations of the times. But Professor Wolfsdorf argues that the various treatments are complementary. Indeed, the Greeks' examinations of pleasure were incisive and their debates vigorous, and their results have enduring value for contemporary discussion.

The Key Themes in Ancient Philosophy series provides concise books, written by major scholars and accessible to non-specialists, on important themes in ancient philosophy that remain of philosophical interest today.

DAVID WOLFSDORF is an associate professor of philosophy at Temple University, Philadelphia, where he specializes in Greek and Roman philosophy. His previous publications include numerous articles on various ancient philosophical topics as well as *Trials of Reason: Plato and the Crafting of Philosophy* (2008).



KEY THEMES IN ANCIENT PHILOSOPHY

Series Editors

Catherine Osborne Reader in Philosophy, University of East Anglia G. R. F. Ferrari Professor of Classics, University of California, Berkeley

Each book in this new series offers a concise and accessible treatment by a single author of a topic of major philosophical importance in the ancient Greek and Roman world. The emphasis is on a discussion of those debates of real philosophical interest, placed within their historical context. Future volumes will consider topics such as virtue, knowledge, psychology, cosmology, society, love and friendship, cause and explanation, and persuasion and argument. The books are designed for use in a teaching context, where they will bridge a gap between general introductions to individual philosophers or periods and specialist monographs. They will also appeal to anyone interested in the enduring influence and significance of ancient philosophy.



PLEASURE IN ANCIENT GREEK PHILOSOPHY

DAVID WOLFSDORF





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,
Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521149754

© David Wolfsdorf 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed and Bound in the United Kingdom by the MPG Books Group

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Wolfsdorf, David, 1969–
Pleasure in ancient Greek philosophy / David Wolfsdorf.
p. cm. – (Key themes in ancient philosophy)
ISBN 978-0-521-76130-7 (Hardback) –
ISBN 978-0-521-14975-4 (Paperback)
I. Philosophy, Ancient. I. Title.
B171.W65 2013
128".4-dc23
2012025555

ısвn 978-0-521-76130-7 Hardback ısвn 978-0-521-14975-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



But meanwhile – is it not clear that there are several concepts that need investigating simply as a part of the philosophy of psychology and – as I should recommend – *banishing ethics totally* from our minds? Namely – to begin with: "action," "intention," "pleasure," "wanting." More will probably turn up if we start with these. Eventually it might be possible to advance to considering the concept of a virtue; with which, I suppose, we should be beginning some sort of a study of ethics.

G. E. M. Anscombe, "Modern Moral Philosophy"

Muse, tell me the deeds of golden Aphrodite, the Cyprian, who stirs up sweet passion in the gods and subdues the tribes of mortal men, the birds that fly in the air, and all the many creatures that the dry land and sea rear.

Homeric Hymn to Aphrodite 5.1-5





Contents

Αι	Acknowledgments	
Ι	Introduction The relevance of an inquiry into ancient Greek philosophical	I
	conceptions of pleasure	I
	The topic of pleasure in ancient Greek philosophy	3
	The textual evidence	6
	Concluding remark	9
2	Pleasure in early Greek ethics	IO
	Prodicus	IO
	Democritus' On Contentment	13
	Antisthenes	18
	Aristippus	20
	Socrates' "What is F?" question	23
3	Pleasure in the early physical tradition	29
	Empedocles	31
	Diogenes of Apollonia	33
	Pleasure in nutrition	35
	Sexual pleasure	37
4	Plato on pleasure and restoration	40
·	The replenishment theory of pleasure in Plato's Gorgias and Republic	4I
	Sense-perceptual pleasure in <i>Timaeus</i> (Part One)	50
	Base and fine pleasures in Hippias Major	53
	Sense-perceptual pleasure in <i>Timaeus</i> (Part Two)	56
5	Plato on true, untrue, and false pleasures	63
	True and untrue pleasures in Republic 9: The Illusion Argument	63
	More and less true pleasures in <i>Republic</i> 9: The True Filling Argument Olfactory pleasures and the absolute/gradable ontological	70
	truth-value distinction	73
	Introduction to the treatment of pleasure in Philebus	74

vii



V111	Contents	
	The first two kinds of pleasure in <i>Philebus</i> False pleasure in <i>Philebus</i> : Kind 1	70 80
	False pleasure in <i>Philebus</i> : Kind 2	82
	False pleasure in <i>Philebus</i> : Kind 3	88
	False pleasure in <i>Philebus</i> : Kind 4	90
	Pure pleasure in <i>Philebus</i>	97
	Conclusion to the treatment of pleasure in <i>Philebus</i>	99
	Conclusion to Plato's treatment of pleasure	10
6	Aristotle on pleasure and activation	103
	Aristotle's early conception of pleasure	100
	Aristotle's concept of energeia	II
	Sense-perceiving as a kind of psychic activation	110
	Pleasure as activation in Eudemian Ethics	119
	Aristotle's criticism of the restoration theory	12
	Pleasure and the completion of activation in <i>Nicomachean Ethics</i> 10	130
	Aristotle on kinds of pleasure	13
	Appendix: Aristotle and the Peripatetic <i>Problems</i> on sexual pleasure	138
7	Epicurus and the Cyrenaics on katastematic and kinetic	
	pleasures	144
	Introduction to katastematic and kinetic pleasures	147
	Kinetic pleasure	152
	Katastematic pleasure Kinetic pleasure as activation	158 16:
	Torquatus' argument that absence of pain is pleasure	167
	Epicurean wisdom	172
	Epicurus' conception of pleasure	170
	Attention and the problem of mixed pleasure	179
8	The Old Stoics on pleasure as passion	182
	Zeno on passion	18
	Passion as irrational and unnatural change of the soul	180
	Impulse	189
	Excess	194
	Fluttering	20
	The four principal kinds of passion	202
	Pleasure, pain, and fresh belief	20
	The Stoics' conception of pleasure and common sense	208
	Good passions (eupatheiai)	210
	Kinds of pleasure	212
9	Contemporary conceptions of pleasure	214
	Introduction to philosophical examination of pleasure in the	
	contemporary period Gilbert Ryle's account of pleasure	212
	CHOCK TORE & ACCOUNT OF PICASUIC	217



	Contents	ix
	Disposition, episode, sensation	221
	Enjoyment, being-pleased-that, and other hedonic kinds	228
	Enjoyment in the eighties: The Warner–Davis debate	232
	Pleasure and intentionality in the early contemporary period	235
	Pleasure and truth-aptness in the early contemporary period	240
	Pleasure, intentionality, and representation in the recent	
	contemporary period	245
	Pleasure, intentionality, and feeling in the recent contemporary period	253
	Some conclusions and suggestions for future investigation	265
Ю	Ancient and contemporary conceptions of pleasure	269
Sug	gestions for further reading	280
General Index		288
Ind	lex of Greek and Latin Words and Expressions	293
Index of Quotations from Ancient Authors		295
	lex of Ouotations from Contemporary Authors	299



Acknowledgments

Soon after I came to Temple University in 2004, my colleague Charles Dyke invited me to read *Philebus*. He had a hypothesis about the influence of Eudoxus' theory of proportions on the role of the discussion of mixtures of dissimilar kinds. So far as I can tell, the hypothesis never bore the intended fruit; and overall we moved through the text too swiftly. But it was a start.

At about the same time, my colleague and friend Andrew Payne, also new to the area, invited me to read Greek together. I suggested that we include Charles Kahn and proposed that since Charles was working on late Plato, we try *Philebus*. That group, occasionally augmented by graduate students, proceeded with great care and completed the text in about two years. By that time, my appetite for ancient hedonic theory had been thoroughly whetted. Charles, Andrew, and I also attempted to compose a paper on the *dihairesis* of pleasure, but we were more successful as collaborative readers and interlocutors than writers.

Felicitously, the 2007 meeting of the International Plato Society in Dublin was devoted to *Philebus*, further cementing my fascination with this text. Meanwhile, I had also begun teaching seminars on ancient Greek conceptions of pleasure and included some relevant material in courses on ethics. Temple's tradition as a stronghold of aesthetics certainly encouraged my focus on pleasure. But it was principally my growing interests in meta-ethics and philosophy of mind that motivated me. Pleasure stands at a wonderful intersection of these vigorous domains.

About 2008 I began working on a book on Plato's curious coupling of pleasure and truth-value. I was well underway when in the spring of 2010 Michael Sharp contacted me from Cambridge University Press to ask if I would be interested in contributing a book on the topic of pleasure to a series that John Ferrari and Catherine Rowett were editing. My initial reaction was mixed pleasure. I was delighted to be invited but worried that such a book would jeopardize my work on Plato on pleasure and truth-value.



Acknowledgments

хi

In fact, the project has been extremely salutary. I find it easy to get lost in scholarly details and debates, but the conditions, including the intended audience, for this book compelled me to think through problems and write from a different perspective. In the process I came to appreciate its value. From a bird's eye view, one can see connections that are easy to miss when one's nose is too close to the ground. The project also encouraged me to think harder about the relevance of the ancients' contributions to contemporary discussions – and this has proven to be one of the most important consequences of the undertaking.

I would like to believe that ultimately I was ripe for this project and fortunate that the opportunity to execute it came my way. For this and for their editorial investment and advice, I express my gratitude and appreciation to Drs Sharp, Ferrari, and Rowett.

In writing this book, I have also sporadically consulted several experts in the relevant areas of ancient thought. For their willingness to listen, their comments and criticisms, and in some cases for sharing unpublished work, I thank Elizabeth Asmis, Tad Brennan, Victor Caston, David Sansone, Brooke Holmes, Brad Inwood, Jeffrey Purinton, and James Warren. I would also like to thank Diana Lobel for her interest in my manuscript and for a challenging and productive exchange regarding Epicurus' conception of pleasure. Epicurus' view has been particularly difficult to work out.

Finally, I'd like to thank the editorial staff at Cambridge University Press, especially Iveta Adams, for their professionalism and assistance.

