abortion. See also pre-viability abortion
born/unborn distinction and, 12n6
Catholic Church on, 144n25
constitutional controversies on, 6
illegal, 156
international human rights law and, 140, 140n21
liberal democracies and, 139, 160
privacy right and, 162n47
Thayerian deference and, 176–7
Abortion Argument (Wreen), 153–4, 154nn39–40
Active Liberty: Interpreting Our Democratic Constitution (Breyer), 106n21, 131n5
Afghanistan, 25n29

“After Ten Years: A Letter to the Family and Conspirators” (Bonhoeffer), 19, 19n19
Amar, Akhil Reed, 195n8
Amendments, to U.S. Constitution. See also specific Amendment topics in Bill of Rights, 31–2, 32n40
human rights in, 33
post-Civil War, 33
America (The Book): A Guide to Democracy Inaction (Stewart), 162n47
Amnesty International, 83n53
apartheid, 27. See also racial apartheid
Appleton, Susan Frellich, 155n41
Aquinas, Thomas, 72
atheism, 218n44
Audi, Robert, 217n42, 225n51
Australia, 37n5
Index

barbaric punishment  
capital punishment and, 64, 68, 68n27, 85  
cruel and unusual  
punishment and, 60, 61, 62, 67–8  
Eighth Amendment and, 58  
Beinart, Peter, 129n57  
Berger, Peter, 13n8  
Berkowitz, Peter, 116n39  
Bible. See religion  
Bickel, Alexander, 43, 45, 45n18, 185–6  
Bill of Rights, 54. See also Constitution  
abstractness of, 66n25  
Amendments to Constitution in, 31–2, 32n40  
English Bill of Rights and, 56, 56n7  
federal government and, 134n10  
human rights in, 31–2, 31n39  
the People and, 52–3  
state governments and, 32, 32n41, 32n42, 134n10  
state’s police power and, 134n10  
Bill of Rights of the South  
African Constitution, 29, 29n37  
Black, Charles, 30  
*Bolling v. Sharpe*, 101, 102  
Bonhoeffer, Dietrich, 19, 19n19  
Boonin, David, 146–8, 150, 151n34  
Bork, Robert, 62  
born human being. See also human being; unborn human being  
inherent dignity and, 141–2, 143, 149–50, 153–4  
with moral status, 142–3, 146  
born/unborn distinction  
abortion and, 12n6  
inherent dignity and, 12n6  
Brandeis, Louis, 35n1  
Brennan, William, 55, 70, 196n11, 214  
Breyer, Stephen, 106n21, 131n5  
Brittan, Samuel, 25n29  
*Brown v. Board of Education*, 94n2, 100, 101, 102, 104, 183, 183n19, 183n22, 184  
*Burton v. Wilmington Parking Authority*, 102n17  
Bush, George H. W., 10n3  
Bush, George W., 122n49  
Camus, Albert, 68, 68n28  
Canada, 29, 38, 47n22  
capital punishment. See also Eighth Amendment  
in 1789-91, 65  
abolishment of, 82–3, 83n53, 87–9, 90  
barbaric punishment and, 64, 68, 68n27, 85  
brutalization effect of, 76n44  
Catholic Church on, 74  
Constitution drafters and, 66n25  
constitutional controversies on, 6  
constitutional question no. 1, of interpretation regarding, 5  
constitutionality of, 2, 51, 52, 84–91
Index

cruel and unusual
punishment and, 52, 53, 61,
62, 64, 65, 66n25, 68, 79–80,
81, 82, 84, 85, 87
deterrence and, 74–9, 75n42,
75n43, 78n46, 83, 83n55,
84, 86, 87–9, 90
Eighth Amendment and, 52,
53, 61, 62, 63–4, 64n23, 68,
87, 89n59
Fifth Amendment and, 63,
64n23
Fourteenth Amendment and,
63
as harsher than necessary,
68–9, 78, 79, 80, 82, 85,
85n56, 87, 89
human rights morality and,
69
ICCPR on, 139–40
inherent dignity and, 70–1,
71n34, 72
liberal democracies and, 68–9,
81–4, 82n52, 83nn53–5,
89
life imprisonment vs., 85n56
minor and, 62, 82n52, 87–90,
88n58, 89n59
moratoriums on, 80n49
murder and, 61n18, 73
as not commonly used, 89,
89n59
in the past vs. today, 65
the People and, 63, 65, 65n24,
66
punishment vs., 74
questions about, 51
rape and, 61n18
rehabilitation vs., 72, 72n36,
74
retribution and, 72, 72n36,
73, 88n58
Scalia on, 62–3, 65
state governments and, 80,
80n48, 80n49
Supreme Court and, 51,
61n18, 80n49, 84–5, 87,
88n58, 89n59
in Texas, 86–7, 86n57, 89
Thayerian deference and, 48,
85, 87, 89–90, 176–7
in U.S., 81–9, 81n51, 82n52,
83n54, 89n59
Capitalism, Socialism, and
Democracy (Shumpeter),
23n26
Carter, President Jimmy, 10n3
Catechism of the Catholic
Church (1997), 74
Catholic Church, 197n12. See
also religion
on abortion, 144n25
on capital punishment, 74
on homosexuals, 110, 110n31
on procreation, 121–2, 124n50
on same-sex marriage,
116n39, 117n40
on same-sex sexual conduct,
121–3, 124n50
on same-sex unions, 110, 117,
117n40, 121–2, 122n49
“Catholic Social Teaching: A
Historical and Ethical
Analysis 1891-Present”
(Curran), 13n8
Charter of Rights and Freedoms
of the Canadian
Constitution, 29
Index

children, of same-sex unions, 113–15, 113n37, 115n38, 120
China, 24n27
Christian church, 205–6
Christianity, human rights morality and, 16n16
Christians. See Catholic Church; religion
Church. See also Catholic Church; Christian church;
Church of England; established church; religion
favoring and non-establishment norm, 205–6, 206n25, 207
Church of England, 194–5, 195n8–9
citizens. See also second-class citizens
constitutional questions and, 177–9
Civil Rights Act of 1964, 28, 28n33
civil unions. See also same-sex unions
marriage vs., 108n27
Civil War, U.S., 33, 97, 99
Collins, Edward, 124n50
conception fertilization vs., 142, 142n24
implantation vs., 142, 142n24
Congress, original debate over
Eighth Amendment, 54–5, 56, 56n7
Constitution, U.S. See also Amendments, to Constitution; Bill of Rights;
specific Amendment and constitutional topics
authorship of, 52, 56–7, 57n9
as charter of human rights, 29
drafters of, 52, 56–7
entrenched human rights in,
27, 30
entrenched human rights law in, 27
human rights and original (1789), 31
human rights moral ground and, 30
human rights morality in, 70
as inspiration for other countries, 29, 29n37
the People and, 52, 56–7
power allocation of, 1
Preamble to, 52, 56–7
Supreme Court and, 2
“A Constitutional Beginning:
Making South Africa’s Final Constitution” (Murray), 29n37
The Constitution in the Courts (Perry), 64n23
constitutional adjudication
constitutional question no. 2, of enforcement and, 5–6
judicial review theory and, 7
Thayerian approach to, 5–6
theory of, 1
constitutional bedrock
constitutional doctrine as, 5, 32n41, 107n25
Fifth Amendment as, 107
Fourteenth Amendment as, 107
constitutional cases
on constitutionality of government official’s behavior, 3n4

[232]
Index

on constitutionality of government policy, 3n4
about constitutionality of laws, 3n4
constitutional controversies abortion, 6
capital punishment, 6
same-sex unions, 6
Supreme Court and, 6
constitutional doctrine as constitutional bedrock, 5, 32n41, 107n25
constitutional meaning vs., 6
originalism and overturning, 5
Supreme Court and, 6
constitutional interpretation, originalism and, 5n6, 6, 66
constitutional law American, 7
consitutional politics and, 128
non-establishment norm in, 191, 191n5, 228
religious freedom of practice in, 191, 191n5
constitutional meaning constitutional doctrine vs., 6
Supreme Court and, 6
constitutional politics, constitutional law and, 128
constitutional provision(s) enforcement, 4
entrenched human rights and, 49–50
interpretation, 4
law’s violations of, 49–50
power-allocating, 28
power-limiting, 1–2, 28–9

Supreme Court and power-limiting, 1–2
constitutional question(s), 177n12. See also specific constitutional questions citizens and, 177–9
First Amendment and, 179–80
Supreme Court and, 177, 179, 180
Thayer on, 177
Thayerian deference and, 179, 180
constitutional question no. 1, of interpretation, 4
regarding capital punishment, 5
constitutional question no. 2, of enforcement vs., 5
originalism answers to, 5
regarding pre-viability abortion, 5
regarding same-sex unions, 5
constitutional question no. 2, of enforcement, 4
constitutional adjudication and, 5–6
constitutional question no. 1, of interpretation vs., 5
Thayerian approach and, 5–6
constitutional rights, 4. See also constitutionally entrenched rights; entrenched human rights; human rights judicial review of, 171–4
constitutional scholars, 3
constitutional questions and, 4
constitutional theory, two main questions of, 4

[233]
Index

constitutionality. See also unconstitutionality of capital punishment, 2, 51, 52, 84–91
constitutional cases about law’s, 3n4
of government policy, 3n4
reasonable laws and, 180
of religious basis for lawmaking, 189–90, 190n3, 217, 223
constitutionally entrenched human rights. See constitutionally entrenched rights
constitutionally entrenched rights. See also constitutional rights; entrenched human rights; human rights judicial review of, 172–4
Supreme Court and, 183, 185, 186, 187
Convention on the Rights of the Child, 139
“The Core of the Case Against Judicial Review” (Waldron), 171, 171n4
costs to women of pre-viability abortion bans, 157–8
proportionate public good vs., 159, 161
public good vs., 159, 161, 162
Supreme Court and, 161–2, 162n47
court role, in constitutional provision enforcement, 4
*Criminal Procedures: Cases, Statutes, and Executive Materials* (Miller and Wright), 61n18
cruel and unusual punishment. See also Eighth Amendment; punishment; torture barbaric punishment and, 60, 61, 62, 67–8
capital punishment and, 52, 53, 61, 62, 64, 65, 66n25, 68, 79–80, 81, 82, 84, 85, 87
Constitution drafters on, 66n25
in Eighth Amendment, 49–50, 52, 53, 54–6, 57–65, 59n12, 59n13, 61n18, 65n24, 66n25, 68, 79–80
inherent dignity and, 61
as inhumane, 61
meaning of, 54–60, 59n12, 59n13, 60n14, 60n15, 67–8
murder and, 61n17
the People and, 63
state governments and, 81n50
Supreme Court on, 59n12
torture and, 58, 59n12, 61n17
Curran, Charles E., 13n8
death penalty. See capital punishment
“The Death Penalty Meets Social Science: Deterrence and Jury Behavior Under New Scrutiny” (Weisberg), 75n42
*Decalogue Cases*, 206n25
Declaration of Independence, 203n23
dignity and, 13n8
human rights moral ground and, 30
A Defense of Abortion (Boonin), 146
deference. See Thayerian deference
democracy. See also liberal democracies
definition of, 23–6, 23n26, 24n27, 24n28
faux vs. liberal, 24, 24n27, 24n28
human rights and, 24n28, 26
human rights law and, 26
inherent dignity and, 25–6, 25n29
socialist, 24n27
desire
moral status and, 148
unborn human being and, 148, 149n32
"Despots Masquerading as Democrats" (Roth), 24n28
deterrence
capital punishment and, 74–9, 75n42, 75n43, 78n46, 83, 83n55, 84, 86, 87–9, 90
marginal, 75n42
Supreme Court on, 88n58
“Deterrence versus Brutalization: Capital Punishment’s Differing Impacts Among States” (Shepherd), 76n44
Diamond, 24n28
Dicey, Albert Venn, 36
A Dictionary of the English Language (Johnson), 57–8, 57n10
differential treatment
public good and, 113, 133–4, 136
second-class citizens and, 107, 134
state’s police power and, 105, 133–4
Thayerian deference and, 106, 113, 134
dignity. See also inherent dignity
Declaration of Independence and, 13n8
meaning of, 12, 13n8
religion and, 13n8
Universal Declaration of Human Rights and, 13n8, 139
discrimination
ban in ICCPR, 13n8
homosexual, 108, 110–12
Doe v. Bolton, 131, 135, 136n13
“Does Capital Punishment Have a Deterrent Effect? New Evidence from Post-Moratorium Panel Data” (Shepherd), 75n43
Donohue, John, 76n44, 77
drafters, of Constitution
on capital punishment, 66n25
on cruel and unusual punishment, 66n25
Eighth Amendment and, 54, 56, 57, 66n25
the People and, 52, 56–7, 57n9
principles conveyed by, 67n26
scope beliefs of, 67n26
Dred Scott v. Sandford, 95
due process clause, 63
of Fifth Amendment, 101, 102
of Fourteenth Amendment, 98
the People and, 98
Index

Eberle, Chris, 151n36, 190n3, 218n45, 220n48, 225n51
Eckhart, Meister, 7
Eighth Amendment, 1, 49, 52n1. See also capital punishment; cruel and unusual punishment; torture
ban on harsher than necessary punishment, 85–6, 87
barbaric punishment and, 58
capital punishment and, 52, 53, 61, 62, 63–4, 64n23, 68, 87, 89n59
Congress’s original debate over, 54–5, 56, 56n7
Constitution drafters and, 54, 56, 57, 66n25
cruel and unusual punishment in, 49–50, 52, 53, 54–6, 57–65, 59n12, 59n13, 61n18, 65n24, 66n25, 68, 79–80
human rights and, 2, 29, 29n34
human rights morality and, 69–70
inherent dignity and, 70
interpreting, 4, 57
originalism and, 56
the People and, 54, 56, 57, 65
Scalia on, 62–3, 66n25
Supreme Court on, 59n12, 70, 87, 89
torture and, 58
“Elements of a Theory of Human Rights” (Sen), 18n18
Ely, John, 158

embryo
as human being, 137–8
as human life, 137–8
Engelhardt, H. Tristram, 137
England. See Church of England; United Kingdom
English Bill of Rights of 1689, 55
Bill of Rights and, 56, 56n7
ensoulment
fertilization and, 144
inherent dignity, 143–4
religion and, 143–6
unborn human being and, 146
entrenched human rights, 27–8. See also constitutional rights; constitutionally entrenched rights; human rights
in Constitution, 27, 30
constitutional provisions and, 49–50
enforcing, 36–41, 37n5, 38n6
law violations of, 50, 93–4
liberal democracies and, 36–8, 37n5, 38n6
originalism and, 50
Supreme Court and, 49, 93, 169–70, 174
Thayerian deference and, 174, 183
Thayerian deference and laws violating, 50
unconstitutionality and, 179
equal citizenship
Fourteenth Amendment and, 100, 102, 102n17, 127
pre-viability abortion and, 135
second-class citizens and, 102n17

[236]
Index

state's police power and, 104–5
Supreme Court and, 183, 185
Thayerian deference and, 185
equal protection clause
of Fourteenth Amendment, 98
the People and, 98
equality, in inherent dignity, 13, 14n10
established church, 194–5, 194n7
non-establishment norm and, 196, 196nn10–11, 197, 197nn12–14, 204–5
European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, 139–40
execution. See capital punishment
executive branch of U.S. government, 1

Farber, Daniel, 32n40
Farer, Tom J., 10n1
Farley, Margaret, 124n50

federal government
Bill of Rights and, 134n10
Fifth Amendment and, 101
Fourteenth Amendment and, 101, 102
state governments and, 32, 32n41, 32n42, 34, 52, 52n1
three branches, 1
fertilization
conception vs., 142, 142n24
ensoulment and, 144
inherent dignity and, 143, 146, 150

religion and, 143, 144
viability and, 146, 150
fetus. See embryo
Fifteenth Amendment, 33–4
Fifth Amendment
capital punishment and, 63, 64n23
as constitutional bedrock, 107
due process clause of, 101, 102
federal government and, 101
First Amendment. See also speech cases
constitutional questions and, 179–80
non-establishment norm in, 191n5, 202n22, 207–8
reasonable laws and, 179–80
religion and, 127n56
religious freedom of practice in, 191n5
Fourteenth Amendment, 32, 32n42, 33, 52n1
capital punishment and, 63
as constitutional bedrock, 107
due process clause of, 98
equal citizenship and, 100, 102, 102n17, 127
equal protection clause of, 98
federal government and, 101, 102
homosexual discrimination and, 108
miscegenation and, 66
non-whites and, 100, 101n14, 103
originalism and, 107
the People and, 53, 66, 97
pre-viability abortion and, 131, 132, 132n8, 135–6, 136n13, 157, 161
Index

Fourteenth Amendment (cont.)
pre-viability abortion bans and, 163
privileges or immunities clause of, 98–9, 102
public school segregation and, 66, 94, 100, 102
same-sex unions and, 97, 108n27, 111, 127, 128–9
second-class citizens and, 103–4, 107, 108, 133
Section 1 of, 95–9, 101–2, 107
state governments and, 98–100, 101, 102, 131–3
Supreme Court and, 94, 128–9, 131, 135–6, 136n13, 157, 184
framers, of Constitution. See drafters, of Constitution
France, 191n4
Frankfurter, Felix, 35, 35n1, 42n14
Furman v. Georgia, 52n1
Gabin, Sanford, 42n14, 46, 90–1
Gaer, Felice, 10n1
Gaus, Gerald F., 190n3
gay bashing, 109n28. See also homosexuals
gay marriage. See same-sex marriage
gender regulation, pre-viability abortion and, 155n41
Georgia, pre-viability abortion and, 136n13
Germany, 23
Getting Even: Forgiveness and Its Limits (Murphy), 71n34
Gettysburg Address, 203, 203n23
God. See religion
government official, constitutional cases on behavior of, 3n4
government policy constitutionality of constitutional cases about, 3n4
laws as, 3n4
grand jury clause, 63
Greenawalt, Kent, 127n56, 191n5, 202n22, 217–18, 218n43, 227, 228n55
Habeas Corpus, 31
Habermas, Jürgen, 10n2, 16n16, 190n3
harsher than necessary punishment
capital punishment and, 68–9, 78, 79, 80, 82, 85, 85n56, 87, 89
Eighth Amendment ban on, 85–6, 87
not commonly used punishment and, 85
heterosexual couples. See also marriage, heterosexual
same-sex couples vs., 118n44
Himmler, Heinrich, 109
Holmes, Oliver Wendell, 35n1
homosexuals
Catholic Church on, 110, 110n31
discrimination, 108, 110–12
Fourteenth Amendment and, 108
irrational fear and loathing of, 109–10, 109n28
Jews and, 109

[238]
Index

laws against, 111
Nazis and, 109–10
racism and antigay animus toward, 111
same-sex sexual conduct and, 111
as second-class citizens, 104, 108
suicide by young, 109n28
human being. See also born human being; unborn human being
embryo as human life vs., 137–8
with moral status, 138
human life
embryo as human being vs., 137–8
with moral status, 138
human rights. See also constitutional rights; constitutionally entrenched rights; entrenched human rights; specific human rights topics
in Amendments to Constitution, 33
in Bill of Rights, 31–2, 31n39
Constitution as charter of, 29
contested issues and Thayerian deference, 48
democracy and, 24n28, 26
Eighth Amendment and, 2, 29, 29n34
as human rights-claim, 22
language of, 10, 10n2
in liberal democracies, 25, 26, 26n30
moral ground and Constitution, 30
moral ground and Declaration of Independence, 30
original Constitution (1789) and, 31
problems and incarceration, 74n41
Supreme Court enforcement of, 2
human rights law
abortion and international, 140, 140n21
in Constitution, 27
democracy and, 26
entrenched, 27–8
human inviolability and, 26
human rights morality and, 17–23, 17n17, 21n23
inherent dignity and, 26
in liberal democracies, 27, 28
rights-claim and, 21
suffering and, 19–20
as superior to ordinary laws, 27
in United States, 27, 28, 28n33
human rights morality
capital punishment and, 69
Christianity and, 16n16
in Constitution, 70
Eighth Amendment and, 69–70
explicit violation in, 14, 18
as global morality, 10
human rights law and, 17–23, 17n17, 21n23
implicit violation in, 14–15, 18
inherent dignity and, 12–17, 12n6, 18, 18n18, 20, 69, 69n29, 139, 140, 143
in international law, 10n1, 21n23

[239]
index

human rights morality (cont.)
  inviolability of, 14, 14n11
  liberal democracies and, 12
  as old morality, 10n1
  questions regarding, 9
  religion and, 16, 16n16
  secularism and, 16, 16n16
  twofold claim of, 12–17,
    14n10
  unborn human being and,
    140
  World War II and, 10n1, 19,
    139
  “Human Rights: Problems with
    the Foundationless
    Approach” (Schaefer),
    16n16
  “Human Rights: The Deepening
    Footprint” (Steiner), 21n23
Human Rights Watch, 24n28
human rights-claim
  human rights as, 22
  human rights law and, 21
  legal rights-claim and, 22,
    22n23, 23
  moral rights-claim and, 22,
    22n25, 23
  universal, 23
Hutchinson, Allan C., 45n18
ICCPR. See International
  Covenant on Civil and
  Political Rights
ICESCR. See International
  Covenant on Economic,
  Social, and Cultural Rights
“Illiberal Liberalism”
  (Berkowitz), 116n39
implantation, conception vs.,
  142, 142n24
incarceration, human rights
  problems and, 74n41
inherent dignity, 13n9
  born human being and,
    141–2, 143, 149–50, 153–4
  born/unborn distinction and,
    12n6
  capital punishment and, 70–1,
    71n34, 72
  cruel and unusual
    punishment and, 61
  democracy and, 25–6, 25n29
  Eighth Amendment and, 70
  ensoulment and, 143–4
  equality in, 13, 14n10
  fertilization and, 143, 146, 150
  human rights law and, 26
  human rights morality and,
    12–17, 12n6, 18, 18n18, 20,
    69, 69n29, 139, 140, 143
  in International Bill of Rights,
    12, 12n6, 15–16, 16n14
  inviolability of, 14, 15, 15n13,
    16, 26
  meaning of, 12–13, 13n8
  normative force of, 14
  religion and, 143–4, 146
  secularism and, 16, 16n16
  suffering and, 20
  Supreme Court on, 70, 70n31
  unborn human being and,
    140–2, 143, 146, 149–53,
    151n34–6, 154–5, 159–60
  viability and, 146, 149–53,
    151n34–6
  “Intention Is All There Is: A
    Critical Analysis of Aharon
    Barak’s Purposive
    Interpretation in Law”
  (Fish), 57n9
intentional homicide
pre-viability abortion and, 137, 138–9, 155
public good and, 137, 138–9, 155
International Bill of Rights. See also International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; International Covenant on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights; Universal Declaration of Human Rights
documents of, 10
inherent dignity in, 12, 12n6, 15–16, 16n14
"International Consensus as Persuasive Authority in the Eighth Amendment" (Lee), 16n14, 83n55
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), 10, 11, 11n4, 26n30
on capital punishment, 139–40
discrimination ban in, 13n8
United Nations and, 10n3
United States and, 10n3
International Covenant on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights (ICESCR), 10, 11, 11n4
United Nations and, 10n3
United States and, 10n3
international law
human rights morality in, 10n1, 21n23
An Introduction to the Study of the Law of the Constitution (Dicey), 36
inviolability
human rights law and human, 26
of human rights morality, 14, 14n11
of inherent dignity, 14, 15, 15n13, 16, 26
Irish Constitution, 211, 211n32
irrational fear and loathing of homosexuals, 109–10, 109n28
of same-sex unions, 110
Jews, 14, 15
homosexuals and, 109
John Marshall (Thayer), 44n17
John Paul II, 74, 197n12
Johnson, Samuel, 57–8, 57n10
judicial branch of U.S. government, 1
judicial deference, 40, 41n12.
See also Thayerian deference
Thayer on, 41–4, 42n14, 43n16, 44n17
judicial exclusivity, 39n10
judicial non-deference, 41
judicial penultimacy, 39
judicial ultimacy vs., 38, 174
Thayerian deference and, 47n22, 174n7
judicial review
of constitutional rights, 171–4
of constitutionally entrenched rights, 172–4
partial theory of, 1–7
Souter, Justice, on, 165
Index

judicial review (cont.)
  Thayerian deference and, 175–6, 183, 186–7, 186n26
  theory, 1, 7
  Waldron on, 171–4, 171n4, 172n6
Judicial Review and the Reasonable Doubt Test
  (Gabin), 42n14
  judicial review theory, 1
  constitutional adjudication and, 7
judicial supremacy, 39n10
  judicial ultimacy
    judicial penultimate vs., 38, 174
  Supreme Court and, 39–40, 39n10, 47, 47n23, 171, 174
  Thayerian deference and, 47, 174
  in U.S., 39

Kant, Immanuel, 18n18
Kaveny, M. Cathleen, 132n8
King Jr., Martin Luther, 20
Kolakowski, Leszek, 10n1
Koppelman, Andrew, 23n26, 118n44, 202n22
Kristof, Nicholas D., 125n51

Langan, John, 151n35, 160n46
Larmore, Charles, 25n29
Lash, Kurt T., 5n6

law(s). See also specific law topics
  as government policy, 3n4
  against homosexuals, 111
  public good and, 137
  against same-sex sexual conduct, 111

Thurgood Marshall on stupid, 2
unconstitutionality and morally objectionable, 2

law violations
  of constitutional provisions, 49–50
  of entrenched human rights, 50, 93–4
  Supreme Court and, 93

The Least Dangerous Branch
  (Bickel), 185–6

Lee, Youngjae, 16n14, 83n54

legal rights-claim
  human rights-claim and, 22, 22n23, 23
  universal, 23

legislative branch of U.S. government, 1

Levi, Primo, 20
Lewis v. Harris, 108n27, 112n34, 113n37

liberal democracies
  abortion and, 139, 160
  capital punishment and, 68–9, 81–4, 82n52, 83nn53–5, 89
  definition of, 24–6, 24n28, 25n29
  entrenched human rights and, 36–8, 37n5, 38n6
  faux democracy vs., 24, 24n27, 24n28
  human rights in, 25, 26, 26n30
  human rights morality and, 12
  non-establishment norm in, 191
religious basis for lawmaking in, 189–90, 190n3, 213n33, 223, 225n51, 227–8
religious freedom of practice in, 191
liberalism, 25n29
life imprisonment, capital punishment vs., 85n56
Lincoln, Abraham, 203, 203n23
Loving v. Virginia, 104, 183, 184
miscegenation and, 100

“The Magisterium’s Arguments against ‘Same-Sex Marriage’: An Ethical Analysis and Critique” (Pope), 117n40

“Making Common Cause: How Liberals Differ and What They Ought To Agree On” (Brittan), 25n29
Maritain, Jacques, 16n14
marriage. See also miscegenation; same-sex unions
civil unions vs., 108n27
same-sex unions and, 108n27, 112n34
Supreme Court and racially mixed, 94n2
marriage, heterosexual
same-sex marriage vs., 115–16, 116n39
same-sex unions vs., 117, 118n44, 119–20, 121
marriage, interracial. See also miscegenation
religion and, 125n51
Marshall, Bill, 202n22
Marshall, John, 44
Marshall, Thurgood, 2
McClain, Linda C., 115n38
McConnell, Michael W., 107, 127n56, 131n5, 191n5, 194n7
McCormick, Richard A., 160n46
McMahan, Jeff, 15n13, 149n32
Melville, Herman, 25n29
mental retardation. See retardation
Miller, Mark L., 61n18
minors, capital punishment and, 62, 82n52, 87–90, 88n58, 89n59
miscegenation
Fourteenth Amendment and, 66
Loving v. Virginia and, 100
Moby Dick (Melville), 25n29
Modernity on Endless Trial (Kolakowski), 10n1
“The Moral Basis of Political Liberalism” (Larmore), 25n29
moral rights-claim
human rights-claim and, 22, 22n25, 23
universal, 23
moral status
born human being with, 142–3, 146
controversy over unborn human being, 160, 160n46
desire and, 148
human being with, 138
human life with, 138
OCBA and, 147–8
unborn human being with, 138, 142, 146–8, 154–5, 159–61, 160n46
morality
Plato on, 16n16
of religious basis for
lawmaking, 189–90, 190n3,
223
of same-sex sexual conduct,
120–1, 124n50, 125,
126–7
sexuality and, 112
murder. See also intentional
homicide
capital punishment and, 61n18, 73
cruel and unusual
punishment and, 61n17
punishment and, 73
Murphy, Jeffrie G., 71n34
Murray, Christina, 29n37
Nagel, Thomas, 25n29
Nazis, 14, 15
homosexuals and, 109–10
Nemoianu, Virgil, 190n3
The New Jersey Death Penalty
Study Commission Report,
85n56
New York
same-sex marriage in, 129n57
same-sex unions in, 113–14
New Zealand, 37n5
Nietzsche’s thought, 16
Ninth Amendment, 32n40
“No Airtight Case for Death”
(Birmingham News), 78n46
non-establishment norm
church favoring and, 205–6,
206n25, 207, 207n27
in constitutional law, 191,
191n5, 228
established church and, 196,
196nn10–11, 197,
197nn12–14, 204
in First Amendment, 191n5,
202n22, 207–8
less restrictive/free-exercise,
200–1, 201n21, 202n22,
204–7, 206n25, 207n27,
209, 209n30, 210–13,
211n32
in liberal democracies, 191
more restrictive/central
meaning, 200–2, 202n22,
203–5, 207–8, 208nn28–9,
213–17, 216n38–9, 219,
219nn46–7
religious basis for lawmaking
and, 191–4, 193n6, 217,
217n42, 218, 218nn43–5,
219–28, 224n50, 225n51,
226n53, 228, 228n55
religious premises and,
198–217, 208n29, 219,
219n46
secularism and, 192, 207–8
Supreme Court and, 202n22,
208
two propositions for what is
forbidden by, 200–17
in U.S., 191, 193, 193n6, 197,
197n14, 198, 198n15
non-whites
Fourteenth Amendment and,
100, 101n14, 103
as second-class citizens,
100–1, 101n14, 103
North Korea, 24
Nunberg, Geoffrey, 117n40
Nussbaum, Martha, 118n44
Index

OCBA. *See* organized cortical brain activity

O’Kennedy, Patrick, 61n18

Oldenquist, Andrew, 66n25

“On the Obsolescence of the Concept of Honor” (Berger), 13n8

organized cortical brain activity (OCBA), 147–8

“The Origin and Scope of the American Doctrine of Constitutional Law” (Thayer), 35, 35n1, 41–2, 42n14

originalism

answers to constitutional question no. 1, of interpretation, 5

constitutional interpretation and, 5n6, 6, 66

Eighth Amendment and, 56

entrenched human rights and, 50

Fourteenth Amendment and, 107

meaning of, 56

new, 53n2

overturning constitutional doctrine and, 5

the People and, 53

Scalia and, 53n2

stare decisis and, 5n6

Thayerian approach *vs.*, 6 versions of, 53n2

“Originalism, Popular Sovereignty, and Reverse Stare Decisis” (Lash), 5n6

People, the

in 1789–91, 65

in 1866–88, 66

capital punishment and and, 63, 65, 65n24, 66

Constitution drafters and, 52, 56–7, 57n9

consitutionalizing imperatives and, 67

cruel and unusual punishment and, 63

due process clause and, 98

Eighth Amendment and, 54, 56, 57, 65

equal protection clause and, 98

Fourteenth Amendment and, 53, 66, 97

originalism and, 53

Preamble to Constitution and, 52, 56–7

Perry, Michael J., 5n6, 12n6, 64n23, 134n10

Plato, 16n16, 118n44

Pledge of Allegiance, 199, 203, 203n23, 205, 209, 209n30, 210, 213–16, 215n36, 216nn38–9

*Plessy v. Ferguson*, 94

police power. *See* state’s police power

policy. *See* government policy

*Political Foundations of Judicial Supremacy* (Whittington), 44n17

Pope, Stephen J., 117n40

Posner, Richard A., 47n23, 94n2, 109, 110, 129n57, 157–8, 170, 170n2, 171
pre-viability abortion. See also abortion; costs to women of pre-viability abortion bans; pre-viability abortion bans constitutional question no. 1, of interpretation regarding, 5 equal citizenship and, 135 exemptions from, 135, 136n13 Fourteenth Amendment and, 131, 132, 132n8, 135–6, 136n13, 157, 161 gender regulation and, 155n41 Georgia and, 136n13 intentional homicide and, 137, 138–9, 155 public good and, 137, 138–9, 155–6 second-class citizens and, 135 sex-selective sympathy and indifference, 135 state governments and, 131–2, 136n13, 166 Supreme Court and, 131, 131nn4–5, 135–6, 136n13, 157, 159, 161–2, 162n47, 162n48, 164n49, 166 Thayerian deference and, 48, 136, 177 pre-viability abortion bans Fourteenth Amendment and, 163 proportionate public good and, 156–7, 163–4 public good and, 155–6, 155n41, 159, 163–4 privacy right, abortion and, 162n47 privileges or immunities clause of Fourteenth Amendment, 98–9, 102 second-class citizens and, 99–100 procreation Catholic Church on, 121–2, 124n50 same-sex sexual conduct and, 121–2, 124n50 sexuality and, 121–2 “Progressive but Not Liberal” (Nagel), 25n29 provisions. See constitutional provision(s) public good. See also public good, proportionate costs to women of pre-viability abortion bans vs., 159, 161, 162 differential treatment and, 113, 133–4, 136 intentional homicide and, 137, 138–9, 155 laws and, 137 pre-viability abortion and, 137, 138–9, 155–6 pre-viability abortion bans and, 155–6, 155n41, 159, 163–4 same-sex unions and, 113–15, 113n37, 115n38, 118n44, 119–21 state’s police power and, 133–4 Thayerian deference and, 134 public good, proportionate costs to women of pre-viability abortion bans vs., 159, 161
pre-viability abortion bans and, 156–7, 163–4
punishment. See also barbaric punishment; capital punishment; cruel and unusual punishment; Eighth Amendment; harsher than necessary punishment
capital punishment vs., 74
murder and, 73
not commonly used, 85, 89
rehabilitation and, 74
retribution and, 73
torture and, 73

racial apartheid, 100–1
racial discrimination, Supreme Court and, 102n17
racial segregation. See segregation
racism, anti-gay animus and, 111
rape, capital punishment and, 61n18
Real Ethics: Rethinking the Foundations of Morality (Rist), 16n16
reasonable laws. See also unreasonable laws
constitutionality and, 180
First Amendment and, 179–80
Thayer on, 170, 171
“Reflections on the Guillotine” (Camus), 68, 68n28
rehabilitation
capital punishment vs., 72, 72n36, 74
punishment and, 74
retribution vs., 72
Reilly, Daniel P., 122n49
religion. See also Catholic Church; established church; specific religious topics
dignity and, 13n8
ensoulment and, 143–6
fertilization and, 143, 144
First Amendment and, 127n56
human rights morality and, 16, 16n16
inherent dignity and, 143–4, 146
interracial marriage and, 125n51
same-sex marriage and, 126n52
same-sex sexual conduct and, 125, 126–7, 223
same-sex unions and, 125–6, 125n51, 126n52, 223
Supreme Court and, 125–6, 126n53
unborn human being and, 146
Religion and Rationality: Essays on Reason, God and Modernity (Habermas), 10n2
religion non-establishment. See non-establishment norm
religious basis for lawmaking
constitutionality of, 189–90, 190n3, 217, 223
in liberal democracies, 189–90, 190n3, 213n33, 223, 225n51, 227
morality of, 189–90, 190n3, 223

[247]
religious basis for
lawmaking (cont.)
non-establishment norm and,
191–4, 193n6, 217, 217n42,
218, 218nn43–5, 219–28,
224n50, 225n51, 226n53,
228, 228n55
questions about, 189–90,
190n3, 223
secularism and, 192, 219–23,
220n48
in U.S., 189–90, 190n3, 217,
226, 227–8
religious freedom of practice
in constitutional law, 191,
191n5
in First Amendment, 191n5
in liberal democracies, 191
in U.S., 191
religious premises
non-establishment norm and,
198–217, 208n28, 219,
219n46
state governments and,
199–200
Supreme Court and, 199,
199n18
U.S. and, 198–9, 199n18
“Report Says Democracies
Enable Despots”
(Diamond), 24n28
“Republican and Galilean”
(Williams), 16,
16n16
Retained by the People: The
“Silent” Ninth Amendment
and the Constitutional
Rights Americans Don’t
Know They Have” (Farber),
32n40
retardation, capital punishment
and, 62, 87–90, 88n58,
89n59
retribution
capital punishment and, 72,
72n36, 73, 88n58
punishment and, 73
rehabilitation vs., 72
Supreme Court on, 88n58
“Retribution and the Death
Penalty” (Oldenquist),
66n25
“Review of Jeremy Waldron,
Law and Disagreement”
(Posner), 47n23
rights. See specific rights topics
rights-claim. See human
rights-claim
Rist, John M., 16n16
Roe v. Wade, 131, 131nn4–5,
135, 157, 159, 162n47
critics of, 164n49
Texas and, 136n13, 162n48
Roth, Kenneth, 24n28
Ruether, Rosemary, 124n50
rulings. See unconstitutional
rulings
same-sex couples, heterosexual
couples vs., 118n44
same-sex marriage, 108n27,
112n34
Catholic Church on, 116n39,
117n40
heterosexual marriage vs.,
115–16, 116n39
in New York, 129n57
religion and, 126n52
state governments and,
129n57

[248]
Index

same-sex sexual conduct
  Catholic Church on, 121–3, 124n50
  homosexuals and, 111
  laws against, 111
  morality of, 120–1, 124n50, 125, 126–7
  procreation and, 121–2, 124n50
  religion and, 125, 126–7, 223
  same-sex unions and, 120

same-sex unions
  Catholic Church on, 110, 117, 117n40, 121–2, 122n49
  children of, 113–15, 113n37, 115n38, 120
  constitutional controversies, 6
  constitutional question no. 1, of interpretation regarding, 5
  Fourteenth Amendment and, 97, 108n27, 111, 127, 128–9
  heterosexual marriage vs., 117, 118n44, 119–21
  irrational fear and loathing of, 110
  man/man vs. woman/woman, 118n44
  marriage and, 108n27, 112n34
  in New York, 113–14
  public good and, 113–15, 113n37, 115n38, 118n44, 119–21
  religion and, 125–6, 125n51, 126n52, 223
  same-sex sexual conduct and, 120
  secularism and, 223

  Supreme Court and, 128–9, 129n57
  Thayerian deference and, 48, 176–7, 185
  unconstitutional laws and, 94
  unreasonable laws and, 94
  Saunders, Cheryl, 195n9
  Scalia, Antonin, 206n25, 207n27
    on capital punishment, 62–3, 65
    on Eighth Amendment, 62–3, 66n25
    originalism and, 53n2
  Schaefer, Brian, 16n16
  scholars. See constitutional scholars
  Scruton, Roger, 118n44
  second-class citizens
differential treatment and, 107, 134
equal citizenship and, 102n17
  Fourteenth Amendment and, 103–4, 107, 108, 133
  homosexuals as, 104, 108
  non-whites as, 100–1, 101n14, 103
  pre-viability abortion and, 135
  privileges or immunities clause and, 99–100
  state governments and, 133
  state’s police power and, 133
  women as, 104, 184–5
Index

secularism
human rights morality and, 16, 16n16
inherent dignity and, 16, 16n16
non-establishment norm and, 192, 207–8
religious basis for lawmaking and, 192, 219–23, 220n48
same-sex unions and, 223
segregation
de jure, 101
Fourteenth Amendment and public school, 66, 94, 100, 102
Supreme Court and, 94, 94n2, 102
Sen, Amartya, 18n18
sex-selective sympathy and indifference, 135
sexuality
morality and, 112
procreation and, 121–2
Shelley v. Kraemer, 102n17
Shepherd, Joanna M., 75n43, 76n44
“Should There Be Homosexual Marriage, And If So, Who Should Decide?” (Posner), 94n2, 129n57
Shumpeter, Joseph, 23n26
Singer, Peter, 137
The Slaughter-House Cases, 95–6
slavery, 33, 97
Smith, Steven D., 208n28, 210n31
Souter, David, 165
South Africa, 27, 29, 70n31

speech cases. See also First Amendment
Supreme Court and, 181–2, 181nn15–17
Thayerian deference and, 180–2
stare decisis, originalism and, 5n6
state governments, 1
Bill of Rights and, 32, 32n41, 32n42, 134n10
capital punishment and, 80, 80n48, 80n49
cruel and unusual punishment and, 81n50
federal government and, 32, 32n41, 32n42, 34, 52, 52n1
Fourteenth Amendment and, 98–100, 101, 102, 131–3
pre-viability abortion and, 131–2, 136n13, 166
religious premises and, 199–200
same-sex marriage and, 129n57
second-class citizens and, 133
Supreme Court and, 129, 129n57
state’s police power
Bill of Rights and, 134n10
differential treatment and, 105, 133–4
equal citizenship and, 104–5
public good and, 133–4
second-class citizens and, 133
[250]
Index

Thayerian deference and, 106, 134
three conditions for, 105–6, 106n20, 133–4
Steiner, Henry J., 21n23
Steinfels, Peter, 144n25
Stewart, Jon, 162n47
Stinneford, John, 55–6
suffering
human rights law and, 19–20
inherent dignity and, 20
warranted vs. unwarranted, 20–1
suicide, by young homosexuals, 109n28
Sullivan, Andrew, 118n44
Supreme Court, U.S. See also Roe v. Wade
capital punishment and, 51, 61n18, 80n49, 84–5, 87, 88n58, 89n59
Constitution and, 2
constitutional controversies and, 6
constitutional doctrine and, 6
constitutional meaning and, 6
constitutional questions and, 177, 179, 180
constitutionally entrenched rights and, 183, 185, 186, 187
costs to women of pre-viability abortion bans, 161–2, 162n47
on cruel and unusual punishment, 59n12
on deterrence, 88n58
on Eighth Amendment, 59n12, 70, 87, 89
enforcement of human rights, 2
entrenched human rights and, 49, 93, 169–70, 174
equal citizenship and, 183, 185
Fourteenth Amendment and, 94, 128–9, 131, 135–6, 136n13, 157, 184
on inherent dignity, 70, 70n31
judicial ultimacy and, 39–40, 39n10, 47, 47n23, 171, 174
law violations and, 93
non-establishment norm and, 202n22, 208n28
power-limiting constitutional provisions and, 1–2
pre-viability abortion and, 131, 131nn4–5, 135–6, 136n13, 157, 159, 161–2, 162n47, 162n48, 164n49, 166
proper role of, 2
racial discrimination and, 102n17
racially mixed marriage and, 94n2
religion and, 125–6, 126n53
religious premises and, 199, 199n18
on retribution, 88n58
same-sex unions and, 128–9, 129n57
segregation and, 94, 94n2, 102
speech cases and, 181–2, 181nn15–17
state governments and, 129, 129n57
Supreme Court, U.S. (cont.)
Thayerian deference and, 47, 47n23, 49, 50, 87, 89–90, 93, 128, 136, 166, 170, 174–87, 174n8
unconstitutionality rulings of, 2, 3, 3n4, 93, 94, 180

“Talking to the Boss: On Robert Bennett and the Counter-Majoritarian Difficulty” (Koppelman), 23n26

Tenth Amendment, 32n40
Texas
capital punishment in, 86–7, 86n57, 89
Roe v. Wade and, 136n13, 162n48

Thayer, James Bradley, 35, 35n1, 40, 91, 169. See also Thayerian deference on constitutional questions, 177
on judicial deference, 41–4, 42n14, 43n16, 44n17
on reasonable laws and unconstitutionality, 170, 171

Thayerian approach to constitutional adjudication, 5–6
constitutional question no. 2, of enforcement and, 5–6
originalism vs., 6

Thayerian deference, 45–6, 47n22, 50n24, 91. See also judicial deference; Thayer, James Bradley
abortion and, 176–7

all-things-considered appeal of, 48
capital punishment and, 48, 85, 87, 89–90, 176–7
constitutional questions and, 179, 180
differential treatment and, 106, 113, 134
entrenched human rights and, 174, 183
equal citizenship and, 185
human rights contested issues and, 48
judicial penultimacy and, 47n22, 174n7
judicial review and, 175–6, 183, 186–7, 186n26
judicial ultimacy and, 47, 174
laws violating entrenched human rights and, 50
pre-viability abortion, 48, 136, 177
public good and, 134
same-sex unions and, 48, 176–7, 185
speech cases and, 180–2
state’s police power and, 106, 134

Supreme Court and, 47, 47n23, 49, 50, 87, 89–90, 93, 128, 136, 166, 170, 174–87, 174n8

Thirteenth Amendment, 33
“Three’s a Crowd” (Sullivan), 118n44

Time of Transitions (Habermas), 16n16
torture, 18n18. See also cruel and unusual punishment; Eighth Amendment
Index

cruel and unusual punishment and, 58, 59n12, 61n17
Eighth Amendment and, 58 as information getting, 58n11 punishment and, 73
Toward a Theory of Human Rights: Religion, Law, Courts (Perry), 12n6
treason, 31
Tribe, Laurence, 138
Twenty-fourth Amendment, 34
Twenty-sixth Amendment, 34

“The UN and Human Rights: At the End of the Beginning” (Farer and Gaer), 10n1
unborn human being. See also born human being; human being controversy over moral status of, 160, 160n46
desire and, 148, 149n32
ensoulment and, 146
human rights morality and, 140
inherent dignity and, 140–2, 143, 146, 149–53, 151n34–6, 154–5, 159–60
with moral status, 138, 142, 146–8, 154–5, 159–61, 160n46
pre-viable, 150
religion and, 146
with viability, 150
beyond viability stage, 142
well-being and, 149
unconstitutional laws
same-sex unions and, 94

unconstitutional rulings and, 2, 3, 3n4, 93
unconstitutional rulings of Supreme Court, 2, 3, 3n4, 93, 94, 180
unconstitutional laws and, 2, 3, 3n4, 93
unconstitutionality. See also constitutionality; specific unconstitutionality topics
entrenched human rights and, 179
morally objectionable laws and, 2
reasonable laws and, 170–1, 179
Thayer on, 170, 171
unreasonable laws and, 93–4, 174
UNESCO, Human Rights: Comments and Interpretation (Maritain), 16n14

United Kingdom, 38–9
United Nations
ICCPR and, 10n3
ICESCR and, 10n3
Universal Declaration of Human Rights and, 10n3
United States (U.S.). See also Bill of Rights; Constitution; Supreme Court
capital punishment in, 81–9, 81n51, 82n52, 83n54, 89n59
Church of England and, 194–5, 195n8
human rights law in, 27, 28, 28n33
ICCPR and, 10n3
ICESCR and, 10n3

[253]
Index

United States (U.S.) (cont.)
judicial ultimacy in, 39
non-establishment norm in, 191, 193, 193n6, 197n14, 198, 198n15
religious basis for lawmaking in, 189–90, 190n3, 217, 226, 227–8
religious freedom of practice in, 191
religious premises and, 198–9, 199n18
United States Conference on Catholic Bishops, 69
United States Constitution. See Constitution
United States v. Virginia, 184–5
Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 10–11, 26n30
dignity and, 13n8, 139
United Nations and, 10n3
unreasonable laws. See also reasonable laws
same-sex unions and, 94
unconstitutionality and, 93–4, 174
U.S. See United States
“Uses and Abuses of Empirical Evidence in the Death Penalty Debate” (Donohue and Wolfers), 76n44, 77

Vacek, Edward Collins, 124n50
viability
fertilization and, 146, 150
inherent dignity and, 146, 149–53, 151nn34–6
unborn human being with, 150
vote, right to, 33–4

“Waiting for Coraf (or the Beatification of the Charter)” (Hutchinson), 45n18
Waldron, Jeremy, 171–4, 171n4, 172n6, 177n12
Warren, Earl, 70
We the People. See People, the
We the People: The Fourteenth Amendment and the Supreme Court (Perry), 5n6, 134n10
Weisberg, Robert, 75n42
well-being, unborn human being and, 149
“What is ‘Cruel and Unusual’?” (Wittes), 59n13, 81n50
“When Not to Kill or Be Killed” (McMahan), 15n13
Whittington, Keith E., 44n17, 53n2, 66, 66n25, 67n26
Wild, Oscar, 109
Williams, Bernard, 16, 16n16
Wittes, Benjamin, 59n13, 81n50
World War II, human rights morality and, 10n1, 19, 139
Wreen, Michael J., 153–4, 154nn39–40
Wright, Ronald F., 61n18

© Cambridge University Press
www.cambridge.org