The Forensics of Election Fraud
Russia and Ukraine

This volume offers a number of forensic indicators of election fraud applied to official election returns and tests and illustrates their application in Russia and Ukraine. Included are the methodology's econometric details and theoretical assumptions. The applications to Russia include the analysis of all federal elections between 1996 and 2007 and, for Ukraine, between 2004 and 2007. Generally, we find that fraud has metastasized within the Russian polity during Putin's administration with upwards of 10 million or more suspect votes in both the 2004 and 2007 balloting, whereas in Ukraine, fraud has diminished considerably since the second round of its 2004 presidential election in which between 1.5 million and 3 million votes were falsified. The volume concludes with a consideration of data from the United States to illustrate the dangers of the application of our methods without due consideration of an election's substantive context and the characteristics of the data at hand.

Mikhail Myagkov is a graduate of the Moscow Institute of Physics and Technology and holds a PhD from the California Institute of Technology. A specialist in Russian politics, political methodology, and laboratory experiments in political economy, he has published extensively in Post-Soviet Affairs.

Peter C. Ordeshook is a member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences and has published more than 120 papers in professional journals, including the American Political Science Review, Post-Soviet Affairs, Constitutional Political Economy, and Post-Soviet Geography and Economics. His authored and coauthored books include An Introduction to Positive Political Theory, Game Theory and Political Theory, The Balance of Power, Designing Federalism, A Political Theory Primer, Endogenous Time Preferences in Social Networks, and Lessons for Citizens of a New Democracy (in English, Italian, and Ukrainian).

Dimitri Shakin holds a PhD in mathematics from Moscow State University. He is a specialist in commutative algebra, financial econometrics, and Russian politics.
This volume is dedicated to the late Dr. Alexander Sobyanin, scientist, colleague, and friend, who wanted only one thing for Russia – Democracy.
The Forensics of Election Fraud

Russia and Ukraine

MIKHAIL MYAGKOV
University of Oregon

PETER C. ORDESHOOK
California Institute of Technology

DIMITRI SHAKIN
The Academy of National Economy, Moscow
Contents

List of Tables vii
List of Figures ix

Introduction 1
1 A Forensics Approach to Detecting Election Fraud 12
  1.1 Fraud and Forensics 12
  1.2 The Special Relevance of Russia and Ukraine 25
  1.3 Outline 29
2 The Fingerprints of Fraud 30
  2.1 Indicators 30
  2.2 Turnout and Absolute Vote 32
  2.3 The Distribution of Turnout 42
  2.4 Stuffed Ballot Boxes versus Stolen Votes 44
  2.5 The Flow of Votes 47
  2.6 Evaluating Our Ecological Method 53
  2.7 Simulating Fraud 59
  2.8 Overview 69
3 Russia 71
  3.1 Suspicious Anomalies of Russian Elections 71
  3.2 The Distribution of Turnout 82
  3.3 Who Wins the Extra Votes 90
  3.4 The Flow of Votes 101
  3.5 Republics versus Oblasts 109
  3.6 Trends in Russian “Democracy” and the 2007 Duma Vote 116
  3.7 Players and Motives 135
Contents

4 Ukraine 2004 138
  4.1 Rounds 1 and 2, 2004 138
  4.2 December 26, 2004 162
  4.3 Motives 178
5 Ukraine 2006 and 2007 183
  5.1 The Parliamentary Election of 2006 183
  5.2 The 2007 Contest 197
  5.3 Conclusions 227
6 The United States 233
  6.1 California, North Carolina, and Arizona 233
  6.2 Florida 244
  6.3 Idaho and Texas 247
  6.4 Ohio 2004 253
  6.5 Conclusions 265

References 275
Index 279
List of Tables

2.1 Average Bias for Different Estimators  page 55
2.2 Flow of Votes, 2003–2005, Moscow  57
2.3 Diagnostic Statistics, Moscow  58
2.4 Flow of Votes, 2003–2005, Novosibirsk  60
2.5 Diagnostic Statistics, Novosibirsk  61
2.6 Case 1 Fraud (Votes Transferred from 2 to 1)  64
2.7 Case 1, Relationship between T and V/E  65
2.8 Case 2 Fraud (Votes Transferred from Nonvoters to 1)  66
2.9 Case 2, Relationship between T and V/E  66
2.10 Case 3 Fraud (Votes Transferred from 2 to Nonvoters)  67
2.11 Case 3, Relationship between T and V/E  68
2.12 Case 4, Fraud  69
3.1 Some Peculiar Trends in Russian Elections  72
3.2 Rayons with the Greatest Shift in Vote between Rounds, 1996  75
3.3 Nurlatinski Rayon, Tatarstan, 2004  81
3.4 Maximum Turnout Advantage by Region  98
3.5 Number of Regions in Which a Candidate Is Advantaged by Increased Turnout  99
3.6 The Republics and Turnout Advantage, 1996–2004  100
3.7 Estimated Flow of Votes from 1995 to 1999, 1999 to 2000  102
3.8 Flow of Votes from 1999 to 2003  104
3.9 Flow of Votes from 2000 to 2004  106
3.10 Flow of Votes from 2003 to 2004  108
List of Tables

3.11 Flow of Votes from 1999 to 2003, Republics versus Oblasts 111
3.12 Flow of Votes from 2003 to 2004, Republics versus Oblasts 112
3.13 T versus V/E for United Russia, Moscow, and St. Petersburg 2007 133
4.1 Comparing the Relative Advantage of Increased Turnout, Round 2 150
4.2 Flow of Votes, Ukraine 2004, Round 1 to Round 2 160
4.3 Suspect Votes by Different Methods 161
4.4 Flow of Votes from Round 2 to Round 3 165
4.5 Total Votes for a Candidate versus Total Cast 175
5.1 Flow of Votes from 2002 to 2006 186
5.2 Flow of Votes from 2004 to 2006 188
5.3 Outcomes of 2006 and 2007 Compared 199
5.4 Flow of Votes from 2006 to 2007 200
5.5 Volynsk Oblast, Coefficient on T by Election District (Intercept, R²) 210
6.1 T versus V/E for Idaho, 1992–2004 250
List of Figures

2.1 Turnout versus V/E, Russian Constitutional Referendum 1993
2.2a Example of Potential Aggregation Error
2.2b Four “Regions” Disaggregated
2.3 Distribution of Coefficients for \( T \), Russian Constitutional Referendum 1993
2.4 Impact of Stuffed Ballot Boxes
2.5a \( T \) versus V/E, Artificial Data Absent Fraud
2.5b \( T \) versus V/E, Artificial Data with Stolen Votes
2.6 Case 1 Simulation, Distributions of Turnout
2.7 Case 2 Simulation, Distributions of Turnout
2.8 Case 3 Simulation, Distributions of Turnout
3.1a Turnout in 2004 versus 2000
3.1b Turnout in 2000 versus 1999
3.2a All U.S. Counties, Bush 2004 versus 2000
3.2b Putin’s Vote Compared
3.3a CPRF 1999 versus 1995
3.3b CPRF 2003 versus 1999
3.3c Zyuganov 2000 versus 1996(1)
3.3d Haritonov 2004 versus Zyuganov 2000
3.3e Edinstvo and Otechestvo 1999 versus NDR 1995
3.3f United Russia 2003 versus Edinstvo and Otechestvo 1999
3.4a Distributions of Presidential Turnout, Oblasts
3.4b Distributions of Duma Turnout, Oblasts
3.5a Distribution of Presidential Turnout, Republics
List of Figures

3.5b Distribution of Duma Turnout, Republics 85
3.6 Distribution of Turnout 2004 Compared to 2000 87
3.7a Urban versus Rural Turnout, Presidential, Oblasts 89
3.7b Urban versus Rural Turnout, Presidential, Republics 89
3.8a T versus V/E, Tatarstan 2004 92
3.8b T versus V/E, Bashkortostan 2004 92
3.8c T versus V/E, Tver 2004 92
3.8d T versus V/E, Samara 2004 93
3.9a Presidential Turnout Distribution, Urban Republic Rayons 92
3.9b Duma Turnout Distribution, Urban Republic Rayons 123
3.9c Turnout Distribution, Rural Oblasts 123
3.10a Turnout Distributions, 2007 versus 2003 127
3.10b Turnout Distributions, 2007 versus 2004 127
3.11a Distribution of Precinct Turnout 2007 129
3.11b Distribution of Precinct Turnout, Ukraine Third Round 2004 129
3.12 Turnout Distributions, Presnya Rayon, Moscow 129
3.13a Turnout Distributions, Moscow, St. Petersburg Rayons 2007 132
3.13b Turnout Distributions, Moscow, St. Petersburg Precincts 2007 132
4.1a Turnout, 1999 and 2004 First Round, Ukraine 143
4.1b Turnout of Rounds 1 and 2 Compared, 2004, Ukraine 143
4.2 The “Bump,” Ukraine Round 2 144
4.3a Turnout Change between Rounds, 11:00 A.M. 146
4.3b Turnout Change between Rounds, 3:00 P.M. 146
4.3c Turnout Change between Rounds, 8:00 P.M. 146
4.4a T versus V/E, Yanukovich Rayons, Round 2 149
4.4b T versus V/E, Yushchenko Rayons, Round 2 149
4.5a T versus V/E, Kharkiv Rayons 153
4.5b T versus V/E, Dnipropetrovsk Rayons 153
4.5c T versus V/E, Luhansk Rayons 153
4.5d T versus V/E, Donetsk Rayons 154
4.5e T versus V/E, Lviv Rayons 154
4.5f T versus V/E, Ivano-Frankivs’k Rayons 154
4.6a T versus V/E, Crimea and Sevastopol Rayons 157
4.6b T versus V/E, Khmel’nytskyi Rayons 157
4.6c T versus V/E, Zakarpas’ka Rayons 157
4.6d T versus V/E, Zhytomyr Rayons 158
4.6e T versus V/E, Odessa Rayons 158
4.7a Turnout Distributions, 2004, Rounds 2 and 3 164
List of Figures

4.7b Turnout Distributions, 2004, Third Round Precincts 164
4.8a T versus V/E, Donetsk Rounds 1–3 167
4.8b T versus V/E, Luhansk Rounds 1–3 167
4.8c Distribution of V/E for Yanukovich, Donetsk 2004 167
4.9a T versus V/E, Donetsk Round 3, Precincts 168
4.9b T versus V/E, Luhansk Round 3, Precincts 168
4.10 T versus V/E, Lviv Rounds 1–3 169
4.11 T versus V/E, Lviv Round 3, Precincts 170
4.12 Regression Coefficient on Turnout, Round 3, 2004 170
4.13 Example of Aggregation Error 171
4.14a Distribution of Proportion Urban, Lviv Rayons 172
4.14b T versus V/E, Lviv Round 3, City versus Village Rayons 172
4.15a Turnout Change between Rounds 1 and 3, 11:00 A.M. 177
4.15b Turnout Change between Rounds 1 and 3, 3:00 P.M. 177
4.15c Turnout Change between Rounds 1 and 3, 8:00 P.M. 177
4.16a Against All, First Round, Yushchenko Rayons 180
4.16b Against All, First Round, Yanukovich Rayons 180
4.16c Against All, Second Round 180
5.1 Turnout Distributions, Ukraine 2006 190
5.2a T versus V/E, Party of Regions Rayons, 2006 191
5.2b T versus V/E, BYuT and Our Ukraine Rayons, 2006 191
5.3a T versus V/E, Donetsk Rayons 2006 193
5.3b T versus V/E, Luhansk Rayons 2006 193
5.3c T versus V/E, Lviv Rayons 2006 194
5.3d T versus V/E, Lviv Rayons 2006, BYuT and Our Ukraine 194
5.4a Vote for Regions, 2006 versus 2007 203
5.4b Vote for BYuT, 2006 versus 2007 203
5.4c Vote for SPU, 2006 versus 2007 203
5.5 Turnout Distribution, 2007 204
5.6a Lviv Turnout 2004 versus 2007 Precincts 206
5.6b Lviv Turnout 2006 versus 2007 Precincts 206
5.7a T versus V/E, Lviv Oblast City Precincts 2007 207
5.7b T versus V/E, Lviv Oblast Rural (Village) Precincts 2007 207
5.8a Volynsk and Ivano-Frankivs'k Turnout, 2004 and 2007 208
5.8b Ivano-Frankivs'k Turnout 2007 208
5.9a T versus V/E, Volynsk Oblast Precincts 2007 209
5.9b T versus V/E, Ivano-Frankivs'k Oblast Precincts 2007 209
5.10 Donetsk Oblast Turnout 2007 211
5.11 T versus V/E, Donetsk Oblast 2007, Party of Regions 213
List of Figures

5.12 $T$ versus $V/E$, Donetsk Oblast 2007, SPU 213
5.13 $T$ versus $V/E$, Donetsk Oblast 2007, Regions and SPU 213
5.14 Luhansk Oblast Turnout 2007 versus 2004(3) 215
5.15 $T$ versus $V/E$, Luhansk Oblast 2007 215
5.16a $T$ versus $V/E$, Donetsk 2007 Districts 48, 49, 54, 55, Regions 216
5.16b $T$ versus $V/E$, Donetsk 2007 Districts 48, 49, 54, 55, SPU 216
5.16c $T$ versus $V/E$, Donetsk 2007 Districts 48, 49, 54, 55, Regions and SPU 216
5.16d $T$ versus $V/E$, Donetsk 2007 Districts 39–47, 50–53, Regions 217
5.17 Distribution of SPU’s Share of the Eligible Electorate, Donetsk Precincts 2007 219
5.18a $T$ versus $V/E$, Zaporizhzhia 2007, Party of Regions 221
5.18b $T$ versus $V/E$, Zaporizhzhia 2007, SPU 221
5.19a $T$ versus $V/E$, City of Odessa 2007 222
5.19b $T$ versus $V/E$, Regions, Odessa Oblast, Districts 134–141 222
5.19c $T$ versus $V/E$, SPU, Odessa Oblast, Districts 134–141 222
5.19d $T$ versus $V/E$, Regions and SPU, Odessa Oblast, Districts 134–141 223
5.20 Grading the SPU versus Regions and the CPU, 2007 225
5.21 $T$ versus $V/E$, If Fraud Had Been Done with Skill 226
6.1a Turnout in San Francisco County Precincts 2004 237
6.1b $T$ versus $V/E$, San Francisco County Precincts 2004 237
6.2a $T$ versus $V/E$, North Carolina, 2004, Bush Precincts 239
6.2b $T$ versus $V/E$, North Carolina, 2004, Kerry Precincts 239
6.2c Turnout Distribution, North Carolina, 2004 239
6.3a $T$ versus $V/E$, Mecklenburg County, North Carolina, All Precincts 240
6.3b $T$ versus $V/E$, Mecklenburg County, North Carolina, Bush Precincts 240
6.3c $T$ versus $V/E$, Mecklenburg County, North Carolina, Kerry Precincts 240
6.4a Turnout Distribution, Arizona 2004 243
6.4b $T$ versus $V/E$, Arizona 2004, All Precincts 243
6.4c $T$ versus $V/E$, Arizona 2004, Bush Precincts 243
6.4d $T$ versus $V/E$, Arizona 2004, Kerry Precincts 244
6.5a Turnout Distribution, Dade County, Florida 2000 245
6.5b $T$ versus $V/E$, Dade County, Florida, Gore Precincts 2000 245
List of Figures

6.5c  $T$ versus $V/E$, Dade County, Florida, Bush Precincts 2000 245
6.6  $T$ versus $V/E$, Broward County, Florida, All Precincts 2000 246
6.7a  Turnout Distribution, Idaho 247
6.7b  $T$ versus $V/E$, Idaho, All Precincts 2004 248
6.8a  $T$ versus $V/E$, Idaho, Kerry Precincts 2004 248
6.8b  $T$ versus $V/E$, Idaho, Bush Precincts 2004 248
6.9  Turnout Distribution, Texas Counties 2004 251
6.10a  $T$ versus $V/E$, Texas 2004, All Counties 251
6.10b  $T$ versus $V/E$, Texas 2004, Bush Counties 251
6.11a  Turnout Distribution, Franklin County, Ohio, 2000 253
6.11b  Turnout Distribution, Franklin County, Ohio, 2004 254
6.12  Turnout Distribution, Cuyahoga County, Ohio, 2004 254
6.13a  $T$ versus $V/E$, Franklin County, Ohio, Bush Precincts 2000 255
6.13b  $T$ versus $V/E$, Franklin County, Ohio, Gore Precincts 2000 255
6.14a  $T$ versus $V/E$, Franklin County, Ohio, Bush Precincts 2004 255
6.14b  $T$ versus $V/E$, Franklin County, Ohio, Kerry Precincts 2004 256
6.15a  $T$ versus $V/E$, Cuyahoga County, Ohio, Bush Precincts 2004 256
6.15b  $T$ versus $V/E$, Cuyahoga County, Ohio, Kerry Precincts 2004 256
6.16a  Turnout Distribution, Hamilton County, Ohio, 2004 257
6.16b  $T$ versus $V/E$, Hamilton County, Ohio, Bush Precincts 2004 258
6.16c  $T$ versus $V/E$, Hamilton County, Ohio, Kerry Precincts 2004 258
6.17a  Turnout Distributions, Hamilton County, Ohio, 2000 259
6.17b  Turnout Distributions, Hamilton County, Ohio, 1996 259
6.17c  Turnout Distributions, Hamilton County, Ohio, 1992 259
6.18a  $T$ versus $V/E$, Hamilton County, Ohio, Bush Precincts 2000 260
6.18b  $T$ versus $V/E$, Hamilton County, Ohio, Gore Precincts 2000 260
List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.19a</td>
<td>T versus V/E, Hamilton County, Ohio, Dole Precincts 1996</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.19b</td>
<td>T versus V/E, Hamilton County, Ohio, Clinton Precincts 1996</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.20a</td>
<td>T versus V/E, Hamilton County, Ohio, Bush Precincts 1992</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.20b</td>
<td>T versus V/E, Hamilton County, Ohio, Clinton Precincts 1992</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.20c</td>
<td>T versus V/E, Hamilton County, Ohio, Bush Precincts 1992</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>