

adult-onset diseases	cryopreservation of embryos, 188-9
genetic markers in the embryo, 125	effects on embryo quality, 193, 195-6
'adult' stem cells, 70	reasons for choosing not to, 191-3
Altered Nuclear Transfer embryos, 10, 11	cybrid embryos, 50
Alzheimer's disease, 125	cytoplasmic hybrid embryo research. See
androgenesis, 71–2	humanesque embryo research
aneuploidy in PESCs, 79, 80	,
Aristotle	da Vinci, Leonardo, 3
epigenesis, 3	dedifferentiation mechanisms
the Hypothetical Embryo, 2–3	investigation using SCNT, 62-3
artistic interventions in biotechnology, 108–12	definition of a healthy embryo
artistic litter ventions in biotechnology, 100-12	implications of embryo creation techniques
Bailey, Shawn, 109-10, 111	45-6
bioart (biotech art)	implications of induced pluripotency, 49
interactions of artists and scientists, 108–12	proliferation of embryo types, 45–6
Biological Embryo historical period, 4–6	definition of a human embryo, 71–3
biomedical determinants of embryo health,	breaching the somatic cell/germ cell
117–18	boundary, 49–50
biotechnology	methods of embryo creation, 71–2
	potential embryo state, 73
artistic interventions, 108–12	role of reproductive intent, 73, 80
biotechnology debate	special status, 80
contributions of artists, 108–12	•
BIOTEKNICA virtual laboratory, 109–10	terminology, 42–3
BRCA gene mutation, 125	degenerative diseases
C : F 1 C H & 4.5	use of ESCs in treatment, 70
Carnegie Embryo Collection, 4–5	determinate development, 5, 6
Carrel, Alexis, 6	developmental biology
cellular reprogramming mechanisms	origins of, 7
investigation using SCNT, 62–3	developmental genetics
chimeras, 9, 12	origins of, 7
chromosomes	developmental stage
early theories about role, 6–7	and moral status of human embryos, 22-3
citizen deliberation on PGD	influence on legal status, 41
context and shape of meaningful dialogue,	disability
158–60	attitudes of medical experts and society,
lack of mention of the embryo, 157-8	203-4
perspectives on the 'healthy embryo', 160-6	determinants of embryo health, 125-8
process, 156–7	ICF classification (WHO), 126-8
theatre as a tool for engagement, 154-6	implications of different concepts of health
clone	125–8
definition, 32, 42	See also impairments.
cloning	disability critique
Dolly the sheep, 9, 61, 71, 78	argument from synecdoche, 226-8
early research, 6	discrimination against existing people with
See also somatic cell nuclear transfer	the trait, 224–6
(SCNT).	expressivist argument, 224-6
Constucted Embryo period, 9–11	life worth living argument, 222, 226-8
, <u>,</u> ,	



non-identity argument, 228–31	differentiation between types of embryos, 22-4
person-affecting principle, 228–31 social construction of disease argument,	differentiation by location of the embryo 22–3
222–4	differentiation by stage of development,
disabled people	22-3
altering the message from genetic testing,	distinction between medical and domestic
247-8	domains, 23-4
denial of proper moral status, 234-7	ethical claims about embryos, 24-6
devaluation implied by genetic testing, 242-5,	ethical implications of donation, 27-9
245–7	factors affecting decision to donate, 26-7
expressivist claims about genetic testing,	forgetting about the stored embryos, 26
237-8	moral status of surplus embryos, 17-19
identity messages in genetic testing, 233	ontological claims about embryos, 24-6
implications of genetic testing, 238-40	parameters of study of ethical perspectives
inferiorizing effects of genetic testing, 234-7	21-2
perceived threat from genetic testing, 233-4	studies of donation rates, 21
subordination implied by genetic testing,	
242-5, 245-7	economic factors
DNA methylation in iSCNT embryos, 65-6	influence on embryo health, 120-1
Dolly the sheep	egg in vitro maturation (IVM), 76-7
cloning of, 9, 61, 71, 78	egg sources
donation of fresh embryos	clinically failed IVF tissue, 75-6
coercion of patients, 179-81	eggs of other species, 78
context of decision to donate, 188-90	fertile non-IVF tissue, 76-7
decision not to cryopreserve embryos, 191-3	for potential embryos/ESCs, 73-5
ethical concerns, 191–3	parthenogenetic ESCs, 79-80
exploitation of vulnerable patients, 181-3	pluripotent stem cells, 78
influence of embryo quality assessment,	potential for demand to cause harms to
196-8	women, 89–93
misunderstandings affecting patient choice,	embryo creation methods
176–9	androgenesis, 71-2
need for fresh embryos in stem cell research,	gynogenesis, 71-2
190-1	parthenogenesis, 71–2
other-regarding interests of IVF patients,	SCNT, 71
175-6	embryo definition
physician's protection of patient interests,	range of meanings and contexts, 12-13
173	embryo genome activation
possibility of autonomous donation, 183-4	interspecies SCNT embryos, 66
possible barriers to autonomous donation,	embryo health determinants
176–83	and perceptions of health in children and
potential violation of patients' self-interests,	adults, 122–5
173-5	biomedical determinants, 117-18
pressure of fetal perfectionism, 196-8	criteria for use in stem cell research, 118
requests from stem cell researchers, 173	economic factors, 120-1
response to stereotyping, 180-1	fate of less healthy or unsuitable embryos
response to threat of abandonment,	118
179-80	implications of different concepts of
donors of embryos	disability, 125-8
changes in Swiss law on embryos, 19-21	implications of different concepts of health,
debate over moral status of embryos, 16	125–8
different registers for different domains,	implications of genomics research, 122-5
23–4	influence of effects on third parties, 123-



embryo health determinants ( <i>cont.</i> ) influence of poverty, 118–19	genetic testing. See public participation in policy development
influence of social preferences, 123-4	genetic testing concerns
legal regulation, 121	altering the message about disability, 247-8
markers for adult-onset diseases, 125	devaluation of people with disabilities,
paternal exposure to drugs and toxins, 120	242-5, 234-7, 245-7
preimplantation genetic diagnosis (PGD), 117–18, 122–5	discrimination against existing people with the trait, 224–6
purpose of the determination, 117-18	expressivist argument, 224-6, 237-8
regulation, 121	expressivist claims of symbolic harm, 233-4
responsibility for embryo health, 121	insinuations about disabled people, 238-40
selection as a saviour sibling, 124-5	life worth living argument, 222, 226-8
selection in favour of genetic impairment, 124, 128	meaning and purpose of the practice, 238–40
selection to benefit an ill sibling, 124-5	non-identity argument, 228-31
social determinants, 118-21	person-affecting principle, 228-31
women delaying pregnancy, 119-20	social construction of disease, 222-4
Embryo Project (National Science	subordination of people
Foundation), 12–13	with disabilities, 242-5, 245-7
embryo quality	symbolic harm to people with disabilities,
and chance of successful pregnancy, 193-6	234–7
concept and assessment methods, 193-6	synecdoche argument, 226–8
effects of cryopreservation, 193	genetically predetermined view of the embryo
influence on decision to donate, 196–8	7
morphological and genetic/chromosomal	genohype concept, 233, 236
aspects, 193-6	genomics research
pressure of fetal perfectionism, 196-8	implications for embryo health
embryo screening. See embryo triage	determination, 122–5
embryo triage	See also public participation in policy
ethical issues, 48–9	development.
fate of deselected embryos, 48-9	gynogenesis, 71–2
implications of improved diagnostics, 48-9	81 8 3 3 3
incentives to deselect embryos, 48–9	Harrison, Ross Granville, 6
use of deselected embryos in research, 48-9	healthy embryo concept
embryonic stem cells (ESCs)	embryo selection criteria, 11-12
definition, 70	importance of developmental context, 12
non-reproductive uses, 70	influence of intentional context, 12
pluripotency, 70	influence of intrinsic and extrinsic factors,
See also human embryonic stem cells; stem	12
cells.	manipulation of embryos, 11-12
Encyclopedia Britannica, earliest definition of	perspectives of the public, 160-6
an embryo, 3	problems of definition, 11–12
epigenesis, 3-4, 6	promoting informed debate, 12-13
epigenetic status of iSCNT embryos, 65-6	high-throughput drug screening
ethical claims by embryo donors, 24-6	use of ESCs, 70
expressivist argument against genetic testing,	His, Wilhelm, 4
224-6, 237-8	histone acetylation in iSCNT embryos, 65–6 histone methylation in iSCNT embryos, 65–6
fertilization	history of embryo research
role in production of an embryo, 5	Biological Embryo period, 4–6
production of all ellion, o,	Constructed Embryo period, 9–11
genetic impairment	Hypothetical Embryo period, 2–3
embryo selection in favour of, 124, 128	Inherited Embryo period, 6–7
,	7 - 1



**More Information** 

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-74813-1 — The 'Healthy' Embryo: Social, Biomedical, Legal and Philosophical Perspectives Edited by J. Nisker , F. Baylis , I. Karpin , C. McLeod , R. Mykitiuk Index

Index

Observed Embryo period, 3-4 value of a historical perspective, 1 Visible Human Embryo period, 7-9 human-animal embryos, 32 moral status, 49-50 See also interspecies SCNT (iSCNT) embryos. human eggs for research potential harms to women, 89-93 human embryonic stem cells (hESCs) potential creation by SCNT, 61 human embryos special status conferred on, 70 human ESC derivation clinically failed IVF tissue, 75-6 egg in vitro maturation, 76-7 eggs from other species, 78 interspecies hybrids, 78 parthenogenetic ESCs (PESCs), 79-80 pluripotent stem cells, 78 range of potential sources, 73-5 human ESC research, 9 breaching the somatic cell/germ cell boundary, 49-50 cost of obtaining human eggs, 85-6 difficulty in obtaining human eggs, 85-6 implications of induced pluripotency, 49 shortage of human eggs for research, 84 Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990, 8-9, 16, 252-3 Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 2008, 253-4Human Fertilisation and Embryology Authority (HFEA), 88-9 licensing of humanesque cytoplasmic hybrid research, 84-5 human iPS cell research comparison with humanesque embryo research, 85, 93 human-non-human animal hybrid embryos creation by SCNT, 61 human parthenogenetic ESCs, 79-80 human pluripotent stem cell research issues concerning the use of embryos, 10-11 human tissue donation informed consent issues, 51-2 humanesque embryo research as alternative path to human ESCs, 85-6 comparison with human iPS research, 85 comparison with iPS cell research, 93 concerns about where it might lead, 87-8 cost of obtaining human eggs, 85-6 difficulty in obtaining human eggs, 85-6

HFEA responses to objections, 88-9 moral repugnance to crossing species boundaries, 86 moral status of part-human hybrids, 86-7 potential downstream harms to women, 89-93 proposed benefits, 85-6 scientific developments, 84 shortage of human eggs for research, 84 threat to human dignity, 87 viewed as playing God, 86 Huntington's disease, 125 Hypothetical Embryo historical period, 2-3 images of fetuses influence on the public, 7 images of human embryos. See visual depictions of human embryos immune histocompatible cells for transplantation, 79 impairments analogy with education deficit or poverty, 209-11 and neutral traits, 204-6 as absence of goods, 211-13 lack of capacity and lack of opportunity, non-comparative harm concept, 211-13 parental obligations to intervene prenatally, question of inherent harmfulness or badness, 204-13 social reasons for non-neutrality, 206-9 static impairments, 211-13 when a lack becomes a harm, 204-13 in vitro fertilization. See IVF in vitro maturation of oocytes, 76-7 induced pluripotent stem cells (iPS cells), 10 breaching the somatic cell/germ cell boundary, 49-50 dedifferentiation techniques, 62 investigation of cellular reprogramming mechanisms, 62-3 potential solution to human oocyte shortage, problem of tumour development, 62 use of transcription factors, 62 informed consent alienation, altruism and anonymization model (three As), 53-8

ethical objections, 86-93

HFEA licences, 84-5

harm to nonhuman animals, 87



## Index

informed consent (cont.) risk of ovarian hyperstimulation syndrome challenges associated with embryos, 53 (OHSS), 174 status of different embryos, 8 connection, contact and care model (three Cs), 53-8Swiss law on embryos, 19-21 consent form models, 53-8 use of clinically failed IVF tissue, 75-6 **IVF** participants ethical paradigms, 53-8 human tissue donation issues, 51-2 decision to donate embryos, 26-7 necessity for informed consent, 52 differentiation between types of embryos, on behalf of embryos, 50-1 22 - 4pro-choice perspectives, 51-2 embryo donation rates, 21 pro-life view on status of embryos, 50-1 ethical claims by donors, 24-6 problems and limits, 52-3 ethical implications of donor's views, 27-9 proposed new ethical paradigm, 53-8 forgetting about stored embryos, 26 saviour siblings, 258-60 ontological claims by donors, 24-6 Inherited Embryo historical period, 6-7 study of perspectives on embryo donation, intention of embryo creators 21-2influence on legal status, 41-2 Keller, Evelyn Fox, 110 International Classification of Functioning, Disability and Health (ICF), 126-8 law on embryos interspecies SCNT (iSCNT) cow/chimpanzee embryo studies, 63-7 Switzerland, 19-21 legal issues technique, 63 preconception torts, 144-8 interspecies SCNT (iSCNT) embryos legal status of human embryos developmental blockage, 63 DNA methylation, 65-6 and consequences for others, 39-43 donor cell genome activation, 66 and intention of creators, 41-2 challenge to define a human embryo, 42-3 epigenetic status, 65-6 context of the question of status, 39-43 histone acetylation, 65-6 determining factors, 39-43 histone methylation, 65-6 embryo as part of a woman's privacy, 33-6 mitochondrial function, 64-5 embryo as person, 36-7 intertextuality theory, 107 embryo as property, 37-9 IVF (in vitro fertilization), 8-9 factors which may have influence, 32-3 barriers to autonomous donation of embryos, 176-83 influence of location, 39-41 coercion to donate fresh embryos, 179-81 influence of method of creation, 42-3 influence of motives for creation, 41-2 cryopreservation of embryos, 188-9 stage of development, 41 decision not to cryopreserve embryos, unborn victims legislation, 36-7 191 - 3woman's right to bodily autonomy, 32 disposition of unused embryos, 188-90 embryo health and selection issues, 8 legislation influence on embryo health, 121 exploitation of vulnerable patients, 181-3 life worth living argument against genetic justifications for creating embryos, 10-11 misunderstandings affecting embryo testing, 222, 226-8 location of embryo donation, 176-9 influence on legal status, 39-41 moral status of surplus embryos, 17-19 influence on moral status, 22-3 other-regarding interests of patients, 175-6 Loeb, Jacques, 5 possibility of autonomous donation of fresh embryos, 183-4 potential violation of patients' self-interests, materialism, 3 Mendelian chromosome theory, 6 173 - 5method of embryo creation pressure of fetal perfectionism, 196-8 influence on legal status, 42-3 regulatory and legal issues, 8-9 mitochondrial function requests for fresh embryos for research, 173

280



Index

interspecies SCNT embryos, 64-5 person-affecting principle in genetic testing, moral status of human embryos 228 - 31personhood abandonment of stored embryos, 26 biomedical technology and research context, legal status of human embryos, 36-7 16 - 19PGD. See preimplantation genetic diagnosis changes in Swiss law, 19-21 photographs of fetuses debated issues, 16 influence on the public, 7 differentiation by developmental stage, 22-3 Piccinini, Patricia, 108-9, 110 differentiation by location (site), 22-3 pluripotency distinction between medical and domestic proliferation of potential embryo types, 49 domains, 23-4 pluripotency of ESCs distinctions made by potential donors, 22-4 definition, 70 ethical claims by donors, pluripotent stem cells reproductive potential, 78 24 - 6ethical implications of donors' views, 27-9 policy development. See public participation in human-animal embryos, 49-50 policy development implications of embryo creation techniques, post-implantation embryo stem cells, 70 46 - 8poverty need to re-think traditional criteria, 46-8 influence on embryo health, 118-19 ontological claims by donors, 24-6 preconceived embryo part-human hybrids and chimeras, 87 definition, 136 study of ethical perspectives of donors, 21-2 focus of preconception health initiatives, traditional criteria, 46-8 137 - 44preconception harm. See preconception torts Nilsson, Lennart, 7 preconception health nomenclature of constructed embryos, 10 and the preconceived embryo, 137-44 non-identity argument against genetic testing, CDC Recommendations (US), 137-44 228 - 31risk avoidance pressures on women, 137-44 nuclear transplantation women's health and well-being issues, early work, 6 137 - 44nucleus preconception torts, 144-8 influence on development, 6 case studies, 144-6 genetic torts, 147-8 Observed Embryo historical period, 3-4 parental tort liability, 146-7 ontological claims by embryo donors, 24-6 related to assisted reproductive technologies, oocyte in vitro maturation, 76-7 147 - 8ovarian hyperstimulation syndrome (OHSS), predeterminism, 7 174 preformationism, 3-4, 6 ovasome, 42 pregnancy embryo health in older mothers, 119-20 parental tort liability preimplantation embryo preconception torts, 146-7 source of stem cells, 70 parthenogenesis, 5 preimplantation genetic diagnosis (PGD), definition, 71-2 8, 117-18 parthenogenetic activation embryo health determination, 122-5 clinically failed IVF tissue, 75-6 ethical issues, 48-9 parthenogenetic embryonic stem cells (PESCs), fate of deselected embryos, 49 79 - 80implications of improved diagnostics, 48-9 parthenote See also citizen deliberation on PGD; genetic definition, 32, 42 testing. paternal health prenatal diagnosis influence on embryo health, 120 expressivist claims, 233-4 Pau, Philippe, 99-108 See also genetic testing.



prenatal selection	SCNT. See somatic cell nuclear transfer
conflict with familial welcome and	social construction of disease, 222-4
inclusiveness, 201	social influences on embryo health, 118–21
moral issues, 201–2	different concepts of health and disability,
prenatal therapy	125-8
claims of lesser prenatal duties, 215-16	economic factors, 120-1
ethical issues, 202–3	effects on third parties, 123–4
impairment as an absence or a harm, 204-13	legislation, 121
impairments and neutral traits, 204-6	paternal exposure to drugs and toxins, 120
parental obligations to intervene prenatally,	perceptions of health in children and adults,
213–18	122-5
parental obligations to prevent impairment,	poverty, 118–19
213–18	responsibility for embryo health, 121
priority of avoiding harm, 217-18	selection in favour of genetic impairment,
tradeoffs among the	124
unborn child's interests, 217-18	social preferences, 123-4
tradeoffs within families, 216-17	women delaying pregnancy, 119-20
pro-choice perspectives	somatic cell/germ cell boundary, 49-50
informed consent, 51–2	somatic cell nuclear transfer (SCNT), 10
pro-life perspective	factors affecting embryo development, 71
use of embryos for research, 50–1	human-animal embryos, 49-50
pronuclear reduction	human-non-human animal hybrid
clinically failed IVF tissue, 75–6	embryos, 61
property	investigation of cellular reprogramming
human embryo as, 37–9	mechanisms, 62–3
public participation in policy development,	lack of human oocytes for research, 61
151-4	nomenclature of constructed embryos, 10
theatre as a tool for engagement, 154-6	potential solution to human oocyte shortage,
See also citizen deliberation on PGD.	62
ote was cruzen denocration on 1 GD.	potential to create hESCs, 61
recombinant DNA techniques, 7, 8	process, 61
regeneration	status of constructed embryos, 10
early work, 5	use of embryos for research, 11
regulatory development, 5, 6	use of non-human animal oocytes, 61
research	See also cloning; interspecies SCNT.
issues concerning the use of embryos, 10–11	somatic stem cells
See also stem cell research.	definition, 70
risk avoidance	
	special status conferred on human embryos,
preconception health initiatives, 137–44	70, 80
saviour siblings, 48	Spemann, Hans, 6, 61
concerns over whole organ donation, 255–7,	stem cell research
254, 258–64	autonomous donation of fresh embryos,
	176-83, 183-4
defective consent argument, 258–60	debate over moral status of embryos, 16
embryo selection for, 124–5	ethical concerns about use of fresh embryos,
ethical and legal constraints on child donors,	191–3
255-8	factors affecting decision to donate embryos,
instrumentalization arguments, 261–4	26-7
law on deliberate creation, 252-4	fate of surplus IVF embryos, 17–19
natural donor, 255-8	foundation studies, 6
psychological harm argument, 260–1	need for fresh embryos, 190–1
reasons for opposing selected donation,	requests for donation of fresh embryos, 173
258-64	status of human-animal embryos, 49-50



Index

stem cells definition, 70 surplus embryos moral status, 17-19 Switzerland change in law on embryos, 19-21 symbolic harm of genetic testing altering the harmful message, 247-8 challenges to the illocutionary account of subordination, 245-7 denial of proper moral status, 234-7 devaluation of people with disabilities, 234 - 7devaluation of people with disability, 242-5 expressivist claims, 233-4, 237-8 folic acid challenge to expressivism, 240-2 genohype concept, 233, 236 inferiorizing disability, 234 - 7insinuations about disabled people, 238-40 notions of genetic health and normalcy, 233 subordination of people with disabilities, 242 - 5the meaning and the message, 238-40 synecdoche argument against genetic testing,

taxonomy of embryo types and contexts, 12–13 theatre as a tool for public engagement, 154–6

tissue culture early work, 6 transplantation research early work, 5–6

unborn victims legislation, 36-7

Warnock Committee, 8-9, 16, 28

Visible Human Embryo historical period, 7–9 visual depictions of fetuses influence on the public, 7 visual depictions of human embryos early modern and contemporary views compared, 99–108 maternal body largely absent, 103–4 multiplicity of meanings, 99–108 politics of early modern medicine, 104–5 representation of modern science, 105–7

Willet, Jennifer, 108, 109–10, 111
woman's privacy
legal status of her embryo or fetus, 33–6
women
potential harms from demand for human
eggs, 89–93
right to bodily autonomy, 32
social pressure of fetal perfectionism, 196–8
women's well-being

and preconception health initiatives, 137-44