Critical Tax Theory: An Introduction

Tax law is political. This book highlights and explains the major themes and methodologies of a group of scholars who challenge the traditional claim that tax law is neutral and unbiased. The contributors to this volume include pioneers in the field of critical tax theory, as well as key thinkers who have sustained and expanded the investigation into why the tax laws are the way they are and what impact tax laws have on historically disempowered groups. This volume, assembled by two law professors who work in the field, is an accessible introduction to this new and growing body of scholarship. It is a resource not only for scholars and students in the fields of taxation and economics, but also for those who engage with critical race theory, feminist legal theory, queer theory, class-based analysis, and social justice generally. Tax is the one area of law that affects everyone in our society, and this book is crucial to understanding its impact.

Anthony C. Infanti is a Professor of Law at the University of Pittsburgh School of Law. His work focuses on sexual orientation and the law, paying particular attention to the application of the tax laws to lesbians and gay men. Widely considered one of the leading critical tax scholars in the United States, Infanti’s scholarly articles have appeared (or will soon appear) in, among others, the Buffalo Law Review, the Santa Clara Law Review, the Harvard BlackLetter Law Journal, Unbound: The Harvard Journal of the Legal Left, the Michigan Journal of Gender and Law, the Virginia Tax Review, the Florida Tax Review, and the Tax Lawyer. He is also the author of Everyday Law for Gays and Lesbians (and Those Who Care About Them) (2007). Infanti is the past recipient of an Excellence in Teaching Award from the graduating students of the University of Pittsburgh School of Law, where he is the chief faculty editor for the Pittsburgh Tax Review. He is an elected member of the American Law Institute.

Bridget J. Crawford is a Professor of Law at Pace University School of Law. Prior to joining the Pace faculty, Crawford practiced law for more than six years at Milbank, Tweed, Hadley & McCloy LLP in New York City. Crawford’s current scholarship focuses on the intersection of gender and tax policy. She has won numerous prizes for teaching, scholarship, and service to the legal community. Crawford is an elected member of the American Law Institute and the American College of Trust and Estate Counsel.
Critical Tax Theory

AN INTRODUCTION

Edited by

Anthony C. Infanti
University of Pittsburgh School of Law

Bridget J. Crawford
Pace University School of Law
For our students, past, present, and future

and

For Hien – ACI
For the Janes – BJC
## Contents

*List of Illustrations*  
*List of Tables*  
*List of Contributors*  
*List of Common Abbreviations*  
*Introduction*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 1. FOUNDATIONS OF CRITICAL TAX THEORY</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sexism in the Code: A Comparative Study of Income Taxation of Working Wives and Mothers</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grace Blumberg</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 2. HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVES ON TAXATION</th>
<th>11</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dollars and Selves: Women’s Tax Criticism and Resistance in the 1870s</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carolyn C. Jones</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 3. THE GOALS OF TAX POLICY</th>
<th>39</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Racial Equality in the Twenty-First Century: What’s Tax Policy Got to Do with It?</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dorothy A. Brown</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© Cambridge University Press  
www.cambridge.org
The Hidden Costs of the Progressivity Debate 53
Nancy C. Staudt

Tax Equity 60
Anthony C. Infanti

Tax Policy and Feminism: Competing Goals and Institutional Choices 65
Anne L. Alstott

CHAPTER 4. CRITICAL TAX THEORY MEETS PRACTICE 73
A Legislator Named Sue: Re-Imagining the Income Tax 75
Marjorie E. Kornhauser

Using the Social Background Model to Explain Who Wins Federal Appellate Tax Decisions: Do Less Traditional Judges Favor the Taxpayer? 82
Daniel M. Schneider

Tax Protest, “A Homosexual,” and Frivolity: A Deconstructionist Meditation 88
Anthony C. Infanti

Sisters in Law: Gender and the Interpretation of Tax Statutes 95
Gwen Thayer Handelman

Deconstructing the Duty to the Tax System: Unfettering Zealous Advocacy on Behalf of Lesbian and Gay Taxpayers 100
Anthony C. Infanti

CHAPTER 5. RACE AND TAXATION 107
Tax Counts: Bringing Money-Law to LatCrit 109
Alice G. Abreu

A Black Critique of the Internal Revenue Code 116
Beverly I. Moran and William Whitford

The Marriage Bonus/Penalty in Black and White 125
Dorothy A. Brown

Tax and Race: The Impact on Asian Americans 130
Mylinh Uy

Race and Equality Across the Law School Curriculum: The Law of Tax Exemption 137
David A. Brennen

Race and Class Matters in Tax Policy 144
Dorothy A. Brown
CHAPTER 6. GENDER AND TAXATION  
Not Color- or Gender-Neutral: New Tax Treatment of Employment Discrimination Damages  
Karen B. Brown  
153

Taxing Housework  
Nancy C. Staudt  
155

The Marital Deduction QTIP Provisions: Illogical and Degrading to Women  
Wendy C. Gerzog  
162

A Taxing Woman: The Relationship of Feminist Scholarship to Tax  
Marjorie E. Kornhauser  
170

CHAPTER 7. SEXUAL ORIENTATION AND TAXATION  
Same-Sex Couples and the Federal Tax Laws  
Patricia A. Cain  
183

The Internal Revenue Code as Sodomy Statute  
Anthony C. Infanti  
185

Heteronormativity and Federal Tax Policy  
Nancy J. Knauer  
192

Death Taxes: A Critique from the Margin  
Patricia A. Cain  
200

Homo Sacer, Homosexual: Some Thoughts on Waging Tax Guerrilla Warfare  
Anthony C. Infanti  
208

CHAPTER 8. THE FAMILY AND TAXATION  
Marjorie E. Kornhauser  
221

Innocent Spouses: A Critique of the New Tax Laws Governing Joint and Several Tax Liability  
Lily Kahng  
224

Taxation and the Family: A Fresh Look at Behavioral Gender Biases in the Code  
Edward J. McCaffery  
231

The Profits and Penalties of Kinship: Conflicting Meanings of Family in Estate Tax Law  
Bridget J. Crawford  
239
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>The Tax Treatment of Children: Separate but Unequal</td>
<td>Dorothy A. Brown</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rocking the Tax Code: A Case Study of Employment-Related Child-Care Expenditures</td>
<td>Mary Louise Fellows</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Women, Poverty, and the Tax Code: A Tale of Theory and Practice</td>
<td>Michael A. Livingston</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Working Poor Are Paying for Government Benefits: Fixing the Hole in the Anti-Poverty Purse</td>
<td>Francine J. Lipman</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Welfare by Any Other Name: Tax Transfers and the EITC</td>
<td>Dennis J. Ventry, Jr.</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Race, Class, and the Internal Revenue Code: A Class-Based Analysis of A Black Critique of the Internal Revenue Code</td>
<td>Wilton B. Hyman</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Tax and Disability: Ability to Pay and the Taxation of Difference</td>
<td>Theodore P. Seto and Sande L. Buhai</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Enabling Work for People with Disabilities: A Post-Integrationist Revision of Underutilized Tax Incentives</td>
<td>Francine J. Lipman</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Disability and the Income Tax</td>
<td>David G. Duff</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 10. DISABILITY AND TAXATION</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Toward a Global Critical Feminist Vision: Domestic Work and the Nanny Tax Debate</td>
<td>Taunya Lovell Banks</td>
<td>326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Taxation of Undocumented Immigrants: Separate, Unequal, and Without Representation</td>
<td>Francine J. Lipman</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Prying Open the Closet Door: The Defense of Marriage Act and Tax Treaties</td>
<td>Anthony C. Infanti</td>
<td>341</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 11. GLOBAL CRITICAL PERSPECTIVES ON TAXATION</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>323</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Global Trajectories of Tax Reform: The Discourse of Tax Reform in Developing and Transition Countries 354
Miranda Stewart

CHAPTER 12. CRITICAL PERSPECTIVES ON CRITICAL TAX THEORY 363

Redistributive Justice and Cultural Feminism 364
William J. Turnier, Pamela Johnston Conover, and David Lowery

Taking Critical Tax Theory Seriously 371
Lawrence Zelenak

A Feminist Perspective on the QTIP Trust and the Unlimited Marital Deduction 381
Joseph M. Dodge

Caring Enough: Sex Roles, Work, and Taxing Women 385
Amy L. Wax

Index 389
List of Illustrations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Illustration</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Percent ineligible because no earned income</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Percent ineligible because earned income was too high</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Race and wealth composition</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Gifts and inheritance by race</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>EITC-eligible population by race</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Contributors

Alice G. Abreu is the James E. Beasley Professor of Law at Temple University’s Beasley College of Law.

Anne L. Alstott is the Manley O. Hudson Professor of Law at Harvard Law School.

Taunya Lovell Banks is the Jacob A. France Professor of Equality Jurisprudence and the Francis & Harriet Iglehart Research Professor of Law at the University of Maryland School of Law.

Grace Blumberg is a Professor at the UCLA School of Law.

David A. Brennen is a Professor at the University of Georgia School of Law.

Dorothy A. Brown is a Professor at Emory University School of Law.

Karen B. Brown is the Donald Phillip Rothschild Research Professor of Law at the George Washington University Law School.

Sande L. Buhai is a Clinical Professor of Law and the Director of the Public Interest Law Department at Loyola Law School–Los Angeles.

Patricia A. Cain is the Inez Mabie Distinguished Professor of Law at Santa Clara University Law School.

Pamela Johnston Conover is the Burton Craige Professor of Political Science at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill.

Bridget J. Crawford is a Professor and Associate Dean for Research and Faculty Development at Pace University School of Law.

Joseph M. Dodge is the Stearns Weaver Miller Weissler Alhadeff & Sitterson Professor of Law at the Florida State University College of Law.
List of Contributors

David G. Duff is an Associate Professor at the University of Toronto Faculty of Law.

Mary Louise Fellows is the Everett Fraser Professor of Law at the University of Minnesota Law School.

Wendy C. Gerzog is a Professor at the University of Baltimore School of Law.

Gwen Thayer Handelman is a Scholar in Residence at Nova Southeastern University’s Shepard Broad Law Center.

Wilton B. Hyman is an Associate Professor at the New England School of Law.

Anthony C. Infanti is a Professor at the University of Pittsburgh School of Law.

Carolyn C. Jones is the Dean and the F. Wendell Miller Professor of Law at the University of Iowa College of Law.

Lily Kahng is an Associate Professor at the Seattle University School of Law.

Nancy J. Knauer is the Peter J. Liacouras Professor of Law at Temple University’s Beasley College of Law.

Marjorie E. Kornhauser is a Professor at the Sandra Day O’Connor College of Law at Arizona State University.

Francine J. Lipman is a Professor at Chapman University School of Law.

Michael A. Livingston is a Professor at Rutgers School of Law–Camden.

David Lowery is a Professor in the Department of Public Administration in the School of Behavioral and Social Sciences at the University of Leiden.

Edward J. McCaffery is the Robert C. Packard Trustee Chair in Law and Professor of Law, Economics, and Political Science at the University of Southern California’s Gould School of Law.

Beverly I. Moran is a Professor of Law and a Professor of Sociology at Vanderbilt University.

Lisa C. Philipp is an Associate Professor at York University’s Osgoode Hall Law School.

Daniel M. Schneider is a Professor at Northern Illinois University Law School.

Theodore P. Seto is a Professor at Loyola Law School–Los Angeles.
List of Contributors

Nancy C. Staudt is the Class of 1940 Research Professor of Law at Northwestern University School of Law.

Miranda Stewart is an Associate Professor and Co-Director of the Taxation Studies Program at the University of Melbourne Law School.

William J. Turnier is the Willie Person Mangum Professor of Law at the University of North Carolina School of Law.

Mylinh Uy received a J.D. in 2004 from the UC Davis School of Law.

Dennis J. Ventry, Jr. is an Acting Professor at the UC Davis School of Law.

Amy L. Wax is the Robert Mundheim Professor of Law at the University of Pennsylvania Law School.

William Whitford is a Professor Emeritus at the University of Wisconsin Law School.

Lawrence Zelenak is the Pamela B. Gann Professor of Law at the Duke University School of Law.
List of Common Abbreviations

ABA American Bar Association
ADA Americans with Disabilities Act
ALI American Law Institute
BWTC Basic World Tax Code
Code Internal Revenue Code
CTC Child tax credit
DOMA Defense of Marriage Act
EITC Earned income tax credit
GAO General Accounting Office
HITC Household income tax credit
IMF International Monetary Fund
IRS Internal Revenue Service
ITA Income Tax Act (Canada)
ITIN Individual taxpayer identification number
NSFH National Survey of Families and Households
OECD Organization for Economic Co-Operation and Development
QTIP Qualified terminable interest property
SIPP Survey of Income and Program Participation
SSA Social Security Administration
SSN Social Security number
TANF Temporary Assistance to Needy Families
TIN Taxpayer identification number (whether ITIN or SSN)
VAT Value added tax
WOC Work opportunity credit
Introduction

Tax law is political. That is a fundamental assumption of critical tax theory. Critical tax scholars ask why the tax laws are the way they are and what impact tax laws have on historically disempowered groups, such as people of color; women of all colors; lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgendered individuals; low-income and poor individuals; the disabled; and nontraditional families. Far from being an organized “movement,” however, critical tax theory is a label that applies loosely to the work presented in this volume.

Though working mostly independently of one another, these scholars have all been influenced by the seismic intellectual shifts in the legal academy that occurred from the 1970s through the 1990s, namely, the critical legal studies movement and its progeny – critical race theory, feminist legal theory, and queer theory. Scholars working in those fields encouraged investigation into the law’s unrevealed biases. They sought to demonstrate how accepted understandings of the law are constructed and contingent. They inspired both their contemporaries and those who work in their wake – including critical tax theorists – to question aspects of the law that might otherwise seem normal, natural, or plainly incontestable.

In the last fifteen years, there has emerged a small but steady stream of scholarship that, taken together, constitutes an incipient body of “critical tax scholarship.” Specialty law reviews and journals have played a key role in bringing this new generation of critical analysis to the marketplace of ideas. This book, however, is the first to present critical tax scholarship as a distinct mode of inquiry. When viewed as a whole, it becomes clear that all critical tax scholarship shares one or more of the following goals: (1) to uncover bias in the tax laws; (2) to explore and expose how the tax laws both reflect and construct social meaning; and (3) to educate nontax scholars and lawyers about the interconnectedness of taxation, social justice, and progressive political movements. Critical tax scholars employ a variety of methods to achieve these goals. Among other methods, the contributions to this book demonstrate how critical tax scholars bring “outsider” perspectives to the study of tax law; use historical material, contemporary case studies, and personal or

Introduction

fictional narratives to illustrate the practical impact of the tax laws on individuals and groups; interpret social science and economic data to show how the tax laws impact groups differently; and explore the interconnectedness of tax laws with economic forces such as the labor market (especially as it impacts women) and international financial and political development.

Students, teachers, researchers, and scholars of tax law and policy can use this book in a variety of ways. It may accompany traditional classroom instruction or serve as an overview for those who want an accessible introduction to this new and growing area of tax scholarship. It can serve as a resource for tax scholars who are curious about, or seek to refute, critical tax scholars’ assertion that the tax laws – whether intentionally or unintentionally – reflect and even reify discrimination based on race, gender, sexual orientation, class, disability, or family structure. Substantively, this book fills a noticeable gap in traditional approaches to the research, study, and teaching of tax law and policy. By organizing and presenting excerpts from critical tax scholarship, this book demonstrates that a complete study of tax law and policy requires an understanding of the historical, social, political, and cultural contexts in which the tax laws operate.

This book will interest students and scholars in the allied fields of critical race theory, feminist legal theory, queer theory, class-based analysis, and social justice generally. Tax is the one area of law that truly affects everyone in our society – at some point in our lives, we all directly or indirectly pay taxes of one sort or another, whether income, payroll, sales, property, excise, or transfer taxes. Yet, those interested in social justice generally overlook tax as an area of inquiry, probably deterred by its reputation as an arcane area of the law. By presenting critical tax scholarship in a format that is accessible to both the novice and the expert, we hope to help those working in allied fields to extend their theoretical inquiry to an area of law that might otherwise seem impenetrable to the nonexpert.

The ideas and arguments presented in this book are general enough for both students in an introductory tax course as well as experts in the field. It is our hope that this book will serve as a primary reference for students, teachers, researchers, and scholars of tax law and policy who want to understand, elaborate on, or respond to existing critical tax scholarship.

This book organizes representative samples of critical tax scholarship by general themes – historical perspectives on taxation, the goals of tax policy, the practical application of critical tax theory, race, gender, sexual orientation, the family, class, and disability. We also include a chapter on global critical perspectives on taxation and a chapter that presents arguments by scholars whose assessments of critical tax theory have not been entirely (or, in some cases, at all) positive. The chapters and the organization of articles within them do not follow a neat, chronological order. This is because critical tax theory has not developed along a linear path. Rather, it is a method of inquiry that scholars have begun to apply, in approximately the last fifteen years, to a broad range of tax laws. No substantive area or line of inquiry has been exhausted yet. Furthermore, articles placed in one chapter might just as well have been included in one or more other chapters because critical tax scholars often address the effects of multiple forms of subordination at the same time. This overlap stems from the fact that different forms of subordination are not
akin to parallel lines moving in the same direction along separate tracks; instead, the different lines of subordination examined by critical tax scholars often cross one another to create an interlocking pattern of subordination. Yet, despite bringing multiple perspectives and methodologies to diverse issues, critical tax scholars are unified by their unwavering commitment to examining the impact of the tax laws on historically subordinated groups.

For the most part, the selections speak for themselves. Brief introductions to each chapter provide any necessary background and draw out the common themes in the selections in that chapter. To make this book accessible to all readers, we have significantly pared down each of the included excerpts. We have chosen not to indicate where cuts have been made to the works, and we have deleted all nonessential footnotes. Except when correcting typographical errors in the original texts and making minor changes to create a uniform style for the book, we have reflected any changes in brackets. None of these changes affect the substance of the contributions; they are all intended merely to preserve the flow of the text.

This book should pleasantly surprise those who assume that tax is a dry and boring field. Even those familiar with tax scholarship may be surprised at the insights that critical tax theory can bring to a familiar subject. For those already writing in the critical tax field, it is our hope that this book will stimulate further research and provide encouragement to continue what can seem – even to a tax scholar – a lonely project.

Critical tax theory enhances our understanding of the substantive tax law as well as its historical, social, political, and cultural contexts and consequences. This book does not claim that critical tax theory is the only way (or even the best way) to approach tax law. It is a lens that one can pick up and put down, but it is a lens that is never far from our own eyes. We invite you to look through that lens and see the tax law differently.

January 2009

Anthony C. Infanti
Bridget J. Crawford