

# Governing Sustainability

The crisis of unsustainability is, above all else, a crisis of governance. The transition to a more sustainable world will inevitably require radical changes in the actions of all governments, and it will call for significant changes to the lifestyles of individuals everywhere. Bringing together some of the world's most highly regarded experts on governance and sustainable development, this book examines these necessary processes and consequences across a range of sectors, regions, and other important areas of concern. It reveals that the governance of sustainable development is politically contested, and that it will continue to test existing governance systems to their absolute limits. As both a state-of-the-art review of current thinking and an assessment of existing policy practices, it will be of great interest to all those who are preparing themselves – or their organisations – for the sustainability transition.

W. NEIL ADGER is Professor of Environmental Economics at the University of East Anglia.

ANDREW JORDAN is Professor of Environmental Politics at the University of East Anglia.



## Governing Sustainability

Edited by

W. NEIL ADGER AND
ANDREW JORDAN





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521518758

© Cambridge University Press 2009

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2009

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Governing sustainability / edited by W. Neil Adger and Andrew Jordan.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-51875-8 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-73243-7 (pbk.)

- 1. Environmental policy. 2. Sustainable development.
- I. Adger, W. Neil. II. Jordan, Andrew, 1968– III. Title.

GE170.G686 2009

333.7-dc22 2008049117

ISBN 978-0-521-51875-8 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-73243-7 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To Tim O'Riordan – a constant source of inspiration, guidance and bonhomie over the years.



### Contents

List	t of figures	page ix
List	t of tables	X
List	t of contributors	xi
List	t of abbreviations	xiii
For	eword by Jonathon Porritt CBE	XV
Pre	face	xvii
	Part I Overview and Context	1
1	Sustainability: exploring the processes and outcomes of governance W. NEIL ADGER AND ANDREW JORDAN	3
2	Human development and environmental governance: a reality check KATRINA BROWN	32
	Part II Governance and Government	53
3	Governance, government and the pursuit of sustainability ALBERT WEALE	55
4	How do environmental actors make governance systems more sustainable? The role of politics and ideas in policy change PHILIP LOWE AND KATY WILKINSON	76
5	Global governance for sustainable capitalism? The political economy of global environmental governance MATTHEW PATERSON	99
		vii

© Cambridge University Press

www.cambridge.org



viii		Contents
	Part III Governance and Civil Society	123
6	Citizens, citizenship and governance for sustainability ANDY DOBSON	125
7	The governance of science for sustainability JILL JÄGER	142
8	Practitioner evaluations of participatory processes in environmental decision making JACQUELIN BURGESS AND JUDY CLARK	159
	Part IV Governance and Decision Making	191
9	Participation, precaution and reflexive governance for sustainable development ANDY STIRLING	193
10	Precaution and the governance of risk ORTWIN RENN	226
11	Economics and the governance of sustainable development SIMON DIETZ AND ERIC NEUMAYER	259
12	Sustainability, welfare and value over time JOHN O'NEILL	283
	Part V Conclusions	305
13	Reflections on the pathways to sustainability TIM O'RIORDAN	307
Inde	ex	329



## **Figures**

2.1	Traditional ecological knowledge as a practice belief system: local knowledge is embedded within rules	4.2
0.4	and norms and the world view of a particular culture	page 43
8.1	Evaluation issues as input, process and outcome	
	stages of stakeholder participation in environmental	
	decision making	163
8.2	Rank ordering of seven stakeholder processes based on	
	(a) inclusion of greatest uncertainty, (b) taking average	
	ranking for assumptions and (c) excluding concerns	
	of respondents on uncertainty and variability	171
8.3	Rank ordering of seven stakeholder processes	
	disaggregated by professional affiliation of respondents	173
8.4	Rank ordering of seven stakeholder processes	
	disaggregated by underlying perspective of respondents	174
8.5	Relationships between the seven evaluative categories	
	and the appropriate stage of decision making	
	for their use	181
9.1	Methodological responses appropriate under	
	different degrees of incertitude	201
9.2	Ambiguity of ranking in sound scientific assessment	203
10.1	Acceptable, tolerable and intolerable risks:	
	the traffic light model	236
10.2	The risk management escalator and stakeholder	
	involvement from simple via complex and uncertain	
	to ambiguous phenomena	245
10.3	Risk governance framework incorporating classical	
	components and contextual aspects	248
13.1	The Downs issue attention model reset for the	
	sustainability transition	312
13.2	The sustainability transition tipping point	314
13.3	Components of wellbeing	321

ix



## Tables

6.1	Prospects for behavioural and attitude change	
	through building citizenship or promotion of	
	fiscal incentives	page 138
8.1	Nine evaluation criteria for the acceptance	
	and effectiveness of participatory processes	165
8.2	Seven options of stakeholder processes for close	
	and responsive relationships	167
8.3	Categorisation of appraisal criteria by panel	
	member respondents by substantive categories	176
9.1	Key linkages between sustainability, science,	
	precaution and participation and the implications	
	of power in processes of governance	
	and social appraisal	213
11.1	The ranking of environmental and development	
	problems in the Copenhagen Consensus	274
13.1	How businesses perceive the benefits of sustainable	
	development	319

X



#### Contributors

W. Neil Adger is Professor in the School of Environmental Sciences and Programme Leader of the Tyndall Centre for Climate Change Research at the University of East Anglia, Norwich, UK.

Katrina Brown is Professor in the School of Development Studies and Deputy Director of the Tyndall Centre for Climate Change Research at the University of East Anglia, Norwich, UK.

**Jacquelin Burgess** is Professor of Human Geography and Head of the School of Environmental Sciences at the University of East Anglia, Norwich, UK.

**Judy Clark** is retired from a career of teaching and research in the Department of Geography, University College London, UK.

Simon Dietz is a Lecturer in Environmental Policy in the Department of Geography and Environment at the London School of Economics and Political Science, UK.

**Andy Dobson** is Professor of Politics in the School of Politics, International Relations and Philosophy, Keele University, UK.

Jill Jäger is a Senior Researcher at the Sustainable Europe Research Institute, Vienna, Austria.

**Andrew Jordan** is Professor of Environmental Politics in the School of Environmental Sciences at the University of East Anglia, Norwich, UK.

**Philip Lowe** is the Duke of Northumberland Professor of Rural Economy in the School of Agriculture, Food and Rural Development at the University of Newcastle upon Tyne, UK.

хi



xii

List of contributors

Eric Neumayer is Professor in Environment and Development, in the Department of Geography and Environment at the London School of Economics and Political Science, UK.

**John O'Neill** is the Hallsworth Professor of Political Economy in the School of Social Sciences at the University of Manchester, UK.

Tim O'Riordan is an Emeritus Professor in the School of Environmental Sciences, University of East Anglia, Norwich, UK, and a Member of the UK Sustainable Development Commission.

Matthew Paterson is Professor in the School of Political Studies, University of Ottawa, Canada.

**Ortwin Renn** is a Professor in the Interdisciplinary Research Unit on Risk and Sustainable Technology Development at the University of Stuttgart, Germany.

Andy Stirling is a Professorial Fellow in Science and Technology Policy Research, University of Sussex, Brighton, UK.

Albert Weale is a Professor in the Department of Government, University of Essex, Colchester, UK.

**Katy Wilkinson** is a doctoral student in the School of Agriculture, Food and Rural Development at the University of Newcastle upon Tyne, UK.



### **Abbreviations**

AAAS American Association for the Advancement

of Science

ALARA As Low As Reasonably Achievable ALARP As Low As Reasonably Practicable BSE Bovine Spongiform Encephalopathy

('mad cow disease')

CAN Climate Action Network
CAP Common Agricultural Policy
CDM Clean Development Mechanism
CPRE Campaign to Protect Rural England

CSERGE Centre for Social and Economic Research on

the Global Environment

DEFRA Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs ECFESD European Consultative Forum on the Environment

and Sustainable Development

EMA Emissions Marketing Association ESA Environmentally Sensitive Area FSC Forest Stewardship Council

GATS General Agreement on Trade in Services
GATT General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
GM Genetically Modified/Genetic Modification

GNP Gross National Product

IETA International Emissions Trading Association
IHDP International Human Dimensions Programme on

Global Environmental Change

IIASA International Institute of Applied Systems Analysis

IMF International Monetary Fund

IPCC Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
ISO International Organization for Standardization
ISTS Initiative on Science and Technology for

Sustainability

xiii



xiv Abbreviations

JI Joint Implementation

MA Millennium Ecosystem Assessment

MAFF Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food (UK)

MCM Multi-Criteria Mapping

MDGs Millennium Development Goals MP Member of Parliament (UK)

MTBE Methyl Tertiary Butyl Ether (a fuel additive)

NFU National Farmers' Union

NGO Non-Governmental Organisation

OECD Organisation for Economic Co-operation and

Development

PBEL Plastic Bag Environmental Levy PCB Polychlorinated Biphenyls

RAINS Regional Air Pollution INformation and Simulation

RDR Rural Development Regulation

SERI Sustainable Europe Research Institute
TRIMS Trade-Related Investment Measures
TRIPS Trade-Related Intellectual Property Rights

TWAS The Academy of Sciences for the Developing World

UNCTAD United Nations Conference on Trade

and Development

UNDP United Nations Development Programme
UNECE UN Economic Commission for Europe
UNEP United Nations Environment Programme

UNFCCC United Nations Framework Convention on Climate

Change

WCED World Commission on Environment

and Development

WMO World Meteorological Organization

WSSD World Summit on Sustainable Development

WTO World Trade Organization
WWF World Wide Fund for Nature



#### Foreword

Very few people in mainstream politics today have begun to understand the nature of the impending sustainability crunch. They still see sustainability as an environmental issue, requiring measured and (hopefully) timely regulatory or market responses to keep the show on the road.

Only a handful of people, including the redoubtable and inspirational Tim O'Riordan, have resolutely kept on pointing out to them that sustainability is *of course* about the physical and biological systems on which we humans still utterly depend, is *of course* about the economic and social policies nations must deploy (however inadequately) to sustain those systems, but, first and foremost, it is about *governance*: who decides what on behalf of whom to secure which objectives over what period of time?

As Neil Adger and Andrew Jordan point out in their excellent overview, 'there is no mystery about sustainability'. One way or another, the human species will end up living sustainably on planet Earth: the laws of nature and the laws of thermodynamics always have and eventually always will take precedence over our ephemeral and hugely arrogant ambitions to live outside those laws. Anyone can live as an outlaw for a while, as an individual, but at the species level, it is not smart and it's definitely not sustainable.

That much is certain. How we embed that realisation in our political and economic systems, and how quickly we can achieve that, is an altogether less certain question. Mainstream political parties are having massive, currently intractable, problems trying to adapt the business-as-usual model of progress that would appear, in the minds of most people, to have served us so well over the last sixty years. Green parties around the world have little difficulty breaking free of those business-as-usual mindsets, but still find it extraordinarily difficult to bring more than a small percentage of people with them.



xvi Foreword

Hardly surprising, therefore, that there is a growing school of thought that the real innovation and dynamism in governance systems for a sustainable world lies anywhere other than in conventional political parties.

This collection offers some hugely stimulating insights into that particular conundrum – and, in the process, unashamedly puts the emphasis where it now needs to be: we now know, more or less, what we need to do to secure a sustainable world, but how the hell are we going to do it?

JONATHON PORRITT CBE

Founder Director of Forum for the Future, Chairman of the UK Sustainable Development Commission and author of *Capitalism as if the World Matters* (2007, Earthscan)



## Preface

The environment is in crisis. The climate is changing, rivers and lakes are polluted, fisheries are overexploited, and there is no corner of the world where human impact is not apparent. At the same time, millions of the world's poor continue to live in abject poverty, while the richer nations of the world are confronting an epidemic of chronic obesity. These crises of human development are very much of our own making. It is the relationship between humans and their environment and, ultimately, the relationship between us all that is at the root of the sustainability problematique endlessly discussed at, but not resolved by, meetings of the world's governments in Stockholm, Rio and Johannesburg in 1972, 1992 and 2002, respectively. Consequently, it is this relation-ship that has to be a full part of any solutions to the almighty mess that we as a human race now face.

This book starts from the belief that the crisis of unsustainability is, first and foremost, a crisis of *governance*. Governance, however, is a multidimensional and highly contested term within academia. If we zoom out and explore what is or is not being done actually to *govern* societies in ways that facilitate rather than undermine sustainability, it is abundantly clear that the governance of sustainable development is likely to be a hugely complicated and politically contested undertaking.

It is precisely for these reasons that we decided to bring together some of the world's foremost experts on governance and sustainable development and ask them to debate the future direction and governance of human society. This conference took place in Norwich in June 2005 as part of a series of events to mark the 'retirement' of Tim O'Riordan from the internationally renowned School of Environmental Sciences at the University of East Anglia, UK. We believed the subject matter demanded an interdisciplinary approach, so we invited contributors from a diverse range of disciplines ranging from political science, economics and geography, through to development

xvii



xviii Preface

studies, sociology, philosophy and environmental science. When we suggested that they should subsequently re-craft their papers into a series of interlinked book chapters on the theme of governance and sustainable development, they enthusiastically agreed.

We would like to thank all our contributors for their patience and dedication; all of them revised their contributions several times to implement our editorial guidance. We would particularly like to thank Matthew Paterson, Jacquelin Burgess and Judy Clark, who joined the writing team after the conference. Without the hard work of all the authors, this book would have never seen the light of day. Together, they show that in spite of the definitional and terminological confusion surrounding the term governance, what is needed to govern for sustainability is, as Jonathon Porritt argues in his Foreword, surprisingly clear; what we as a human race lack is the political and, ultimately, the *societal* will to establish the necessary governance mechanisms and procedures.

We would also like to thank the UK Economic and Social Research Council (ESRC) for funding the underlying research through the Programme on Environmental Decision (2001–7) at UEA and through funding for the conference as part of Social Sciences Week in 2005. Emily Sheldon and Dawn Turnbull provided excellent logistical support prior to and throughout the conference. Last, but certainly not least, we would like to thank Tim O'Riordan for concluding the conference and this book in his own uniquely incisive way. Tim's thinking – developed and refined over the last four decades – permeates every single chapter of this book. We hope that the conference and this book provide a sufficiently fitting tribute to the enormous contribution that he has made to our collective understanding of the governance of sustainability.

NEIL ADGER ANDREW JORDAN Norwich, March 2008