

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-73215-4 - Rejecting Rights
Sonu Bedi
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Rejecting Rights

The language of rights is ubiquitous. It shapes the way we construct our debates over issues such as abortion, affirmative action, and sexual freedom. This provocative new study challenges the very concept of rights, arguing that they jeopardize our liberty and undermine democratic debate. By re-conceptualizing our ideas about limited government, it suggests that we can limit the reasons or rationales on which the polity may act. Whereas we once used the language of rights to thwart democratic majorities, Bedi argues that we should now turn our attention to the democratic state's *reason* for acting. This will permit greater democratic flexibility and discretion while ensuring genuine liberty. Deftly employing political theory and constitutional law to state its case, the study radically rethinks the relationship between liberty and democracy, and will be essential reading for scholars and students of political and legal philosophy.

Sonu Bedi is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Government, Dartmouth College.

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-73215-4 - Rejecting Rights
Sonu Bedi
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Contemporary Political Theory

Series editor
Ian Shapiro

Editorial board
Russell Hardin
John Keane
Phillipe Van Parijs
Stephen Holmes
Elizabeth Kiss
Philip Pettit
Jeffrey Isaac

As the twenty-first century begins, major new political challenges have arisen at the same time as some of the most enduring dilemmas of political association remain unresolved. The collapse of communism and the end of the Cold War reflect a victory for democratic and liberal values, yet in many of the Western countries that nurtured those values there are severe problems of urban decay, class and racial conflict, and failing political legitimacy. Enduring global injustice and inequality seem compounded by environmental problems, disease, the oppression of women, racial, ethnic and religious minorities, and the relentless growth of the world's population. In such circumstances, the need for creative thinking about the fundamentals of human political association is manifest. This new series in contemporary political theory is needed to foster such systematic normative reflection.

The series proceeds in the belief that the time is ripe for a reassertion of the importance of problem-driven political theory. It is concerned, that is, with works that are motivated by the impulse to understand, think critically about, and address the problems in the world, rather than issues that are thrown up primarily in academic debate. Books in the series may be interdisciplinary in character, ranging over issues conventionally dealt with in philosophy, law, history and the human sciences. The range of materials and the methods of proceeding should be dictated by the problem at hand, not the conventional debates or disciplinary divisions of academia.

Other books in the series

Ian Shapiro and Casiano Hacker-Cordón (eds.) *Democracy's Value*
Ian Shapiro and Casiano Hacker-Cordón (eds.) *Democracy's Edges*
Brooke A. Ackerly *Political Theory and Feminist Social Criticism*
Clarissa Rile Hayward *De-Facing Power*
John Kane *The Politics of Moral Capital*
Ayelet Shachar *Multicultural Jurisdictions*

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-73215-4 - Rejecting Rights
Sonu Bedi
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

John Keane *Global Civil Society?*
Rogers M. Smith *Stories of Peoplehood*
Gerry Mackie *Democracy Defended*
John Keane *Violence and Democracy*
Kok-Chor Tan *Justice without Borders*
Peter J. Steinberger *The Idea of the State*
Michael Taylor *Rationality and the Ideology of Disconnection*
Sarah Song *Justice, Gender, and the Politics of Multiculturalism*
Georgia Warnke *After Identity*
Courtney Jung *The Moral Force of Indigenous Politics*

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-73215-4 - Rejecting Rights
Sonu Bedi
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Rejecting Rights

Sonu Bedi



Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-73215-4 - Rejecting Rights
Sonu Bedi
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,
São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press,
New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521732154

© Sonu Bedi 2009

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relative collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2009

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-51828-4 hardback
ISBN 978-0-521-73215-4 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for
the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or
third-party internet websites referred to in this book,
and does not guarantee that any content on such
websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-73215-4 - Rejecting Rights
Sonu Bedi
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

For my Parents

Table of contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page</i> x
<i>Table of cases</i>	xii
Introduction	1
Part I Rights	11
1 The classic conception of rights: the “democratic deficit”	13
2 Reflexive rights: jeopardizing freedom, equality, and democratic debate	24
Part II Justification in theory	39
3 The turn to justification	41
4 A theory of justification: specifying the appropriate legislative purpose	60
5 Rejecting rights	93
Part III Justification in practice	119
6 Rejecting the constitutional rights to property and religion	121
7 Rejecting the constitutional right to privacy	145
8 Equal protection and judicial review	165
Conclusion	189
<i>Bibliography</i>	191
<i>Index</i>	202

Acknowledgements

One of the greatest pleasures in writing this book was engaging its arguments with many friends, colleagues, and mentors. I owe them my gratitude. While any errors or missteps are my own, they have collectively made this book that much better. I take deep satisfaction in thanking them here. I did most of the writing while a student at Yale. Yale proved a fruitful, creative, and stimulating place to work. In particular, I thank Bruce Ackerman, Seyla Benhabib, and Ian Shapiro for their invaluable insights. Each in their own way has led me to craft a sharper, clearer argument. I could not have asked for better mentors. I especially thank Bruce Ackerman for his early enthusiasm and encouragement. His ability to home in on the weakness of an argument offering possible correctives still amazes me. This book would not have been possible without his support.

Dartmouth was an ideal place to finish the manuscript. I am privileged to have such collegial and supportive colleagues in the Department of Government. Additionally, I had the opportunity to participate in a manuscript review organized by the Dickey Center for International Understanding at Dartmouth. Participants included Amy Allen, Walter Sinnott-Armstrong, Michelle T. Clarke, Larry Crocker, Chandran Kukathas, Stephen Macedo, Lucas Swaine, James Murphy, and Christianne Wohlforth. This session proved crucial in clarifying and strengthening my arguments. I thank the Dickey Center, and in particular, Christianne Wohlforth, for organizing it. I owe thanks to Stephen Macedo and Chandran Kukathas who traveled to Hanover just to comment on my manuscript. My many conversations with them were extremely helpful. Walter Sinnott-Armstrong, Michelle T. Clarke, Larry Crocker, James Murphy, and Lucas Swaine provided additional comments and advice that I could not have done without.

I had the benefit of presenting portions of this book at various places including Dartmouth, Depaul Law School, MIT, Swarthmore College, University of Tulsa, and Yale. Receiving feedback as I tested my arguments in these venues proved quite useful. I also benefited from conversations with many dear friends including: Victoria Kennedy, Elvin Lim,

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-73215-4 - Rejecting Rights
Sonu Bedi
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Acknowledgements

xi

and Tim Nguyen. Victoria Kennedy (thankfully) never stopped challenging me on my conclusions. Elvin Lim went above and beyond the call of duty, graciously editing portions of my manuscript while offering insightful criticisms. Tim Nguyen's sense of humor kept me in good spirits as I wrote the book. Through it all, my twin brother, Monu Bedi, was (and still is) my intellectual partner in crime. Without him, I would be lost.

At Cambridge University Press, I graciously thank my editor, John Haslam, for his early support of the project and for turning the manuscript into a book. I also thank Paul Stevens, Elizabeth Davey, and Mary Dalton for their invaluable editorial assistance. I thank the anonymous reviewers for their very constructive comments on an earlier version of the manuscript.

A portion of Chapter 7 appears in the following article: "Repudiating Morals Legislation: Rendering the Constitutional Right to Privacy Obsolete," 52 *Cleveland State Law Review* 447 (2006).

Finally, I thank my dear parents, Bhupinder and Anjali. They were the first to teach me the value of pursuing learning for its own sake. Their love and support know no limits. I am humbled and honored to call them my parents. This book is dedicated to them.

Table of cases

- Adarand Construction, Inc. v. Peña*, 515 U.S. 200 (1995):170
Baehr v. Lewin, 74 Haw. 530 (Hawaii 1993):182
Barnes v. Glen Theatre, Inc., 501 U.S. 560 (1991):147
Bowers v. Hardwick, 478 U.S. 186 (1986):28, 33, 149–152, 153–154, 157, 159, 179, 188
Boy Scouts of America v. Dale, 530 U.S. 640 (2000):142
Brown v. Board of Education of Topeka, 347 U.S. 483 (1954):75, 169, 175, 176, 186
Church of the Lukumi Babalu Aye, Inc. v. City of Hialeah, 508 U.S. 520 (1993):140, 141
City of Boerne v. Flores, 521 U.S. 507 (1997):135
City of Cleburne v. Cleburne, 473 U.S. at 441 (1985):175
City of Richmond v. J. A. Croson Co., 488 U.S. 469 (1989):170
Cutter v. Wilkinson, 544 U.S. (2005):135
Employment Division, Dept. of Human Resources v. Smith, 494 U.S. 872 (1990):133, 134, 137, 138, 139, 141
Frontiero v. Richardson, 411 U.S. 677 (1973):172
Goldman v. Weinberger, 475 U.S. 503 (1986):133, 135
Gonzales v. Carhart, 550 U.S. – (2007): 72–73, 88, 187
Goodridge v. Dep't of Public Health, 440 Mass. 309 (Mass. 2003):183–184
Griswold v. Connecticut, 381 U.S. 479 (1965):32, 146–147, 149, 155, 161
Grutter v. Bollinger, 539 U.S. 306 (2003):167, 170, 176–177
Hopwood v. Texas, 78 F.3d 932 (5th Cir. 1996):167
Kelo v. City of New London, 125 S.Ct. 265 (2005):128–129
Lawrence v. Texas, 539 U.S. 558 (2003):10, 73, 74, 75, 152–160, 162
Lochner v. New York, 198 U.S. 45 (1905):125–126, 127, 129, 130, 147, 149, 188
Locke v. Davey, 540 U.S. 712 (2004):141–142
Loving v. Virginia, 388 U.S. 1 (1967):75, 169, 175
McDaniel v. Paty, 435 U.S. 618 (1978):139
Nebbia v. New York, 291 U.S. 502 (1934):127,

Table of cases

xiii

- Paris Adult Theatre I v. Slaton*, 413 U.S. 49 (1973):159
Parents Involved in Community Schools v. Seattle School District, et al., 551 U.S. – (2007):170
Planned Parenthood v. Casey, 505 U.S. 833 (1992): 154, 160, 162, 163, 187
Plessy v. Ferguson, 163 U.S. 537 (1896):168–169
Railway Express v. New York, 337 U.S. 106 (1949):88–89
Regents of the University of California v. Bakke, 438 U.S. 265 (1978):169–170
Reynolds v. U.S., 98 U.S. 145 (1878):133, 134, 137, 138, 159
Roe v. Wade, 410 U.S. 113 (1973):3, 35, 37, 99, 148, 160–161, 162, 186, 187
Roper v. Simmons, 543 U.S. 551 (2005):103
Sherbert v. Verner, 374 U.S. 398 (1963):138–139, 140, 141,
Strauder v. West Virginia, 100 U.S. 303 (1879):168
Texas Monthly, Inc. v. Bullock, 489 U.S. 1 (1989):135, 136
Thorton v. Caldor, 472 U.S. 703 (1985):135–136
U.S. v. Carolene Products Co., 304 U.S. 144 (1938):122, 127, 128, 172, 186
U.S. v. Seeger, 380 U.S. 163 (1965):135
Walz v. Tax Commissioner of City of New York, 397 U.S. 664 (1970):136
Watkins v. U.S. Army, 837 F.2d 1428 (9th Cir. 1988):179–180
West Coast Hotel Co. v. Parrish, 300 U.S. 379 (1937):127–128,
Wisconsin v. Yoder, 406 U.S. 205 (1972):136–138