There is a growing conflict between modern and postmodern social theorists. The latter reject modern approaches as economistic, essentialist and often leading to authoritarian policies. Modernists criticize postmodern approaches for their rejection of holistic conceptual frameworks which facilitate an overall picture of how social wholes (organizations, communities, nation-states, etc.) are constituted, reproduced and transformed. They believe the rejection of holistic methodologies leads to social myopia – a refusal to explore critically the type of broad problems that classical sociology deals with. This book attempts to bridge the divide between these two conflicting perspectives and proposes a novel holistic framework which is neither reductionist/economistic nor essentialist. *Modern and Postmodern Social Theorizing* will appeal to scholars and students of social theory and of social sciences in general.

**Nicos P. Mouzelis** is Emeritus Professor of Sociology at the London School of Economics and Political Science.
Modern and Postmodern Social Theorizing

Bridging the Divide

NICOS P. MOUZELIS
To the memory of Ellen Sutton
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of figures</th>
<th>page xii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Introduction 1

#### Part I  The theoretical background: the development of the agency–structure problematic 7

1. From Parsons’ to Giddens’ synthesis 9
   - Introduction 9
     1. Parsonian functionalism: the emphasis on system/structure 12
     2. Interpretative micro-sociologies: the emphasis on agency 15
     3. The rational-choice paradigm 17
     4. Decentring the subject I: hidden codes 21
     5. Decentring the subject II: subjectless practices 24
     6. Decentring the subject III: texts 27
     7. Transcending the subjectivist–objectivist divide: attempts at a post-Parsonian synthesis 34
     8. The overall abolition of boundaries 38
   - Conclusion 39

#### Part II  Parsonian and post-Parsonian developments 41

2. Parsons and the development of individual rights 43
   - T.H. Marshall: civil, political and social rights 43
   - T. Parsons: rights and revolutions 45
   - Differentiation and the mechanisms of change 49
   - Integration: balanced and unbalanced forms 51
   - Conclusion 54

© Cambridge University Press  www.cambridge.org
### Contents

3 Evolution and democracy: Parsons and the collapse of communism
   1 Evolutionary universals 57
   2 The limits of modernization from above 61
   3 Some critical remarks 62

4 Post-Parsonian theory I: neo-functionalism and beyond
   Introduction 65
   1 The theory of action 67
   2 The theory of culture 68
   3 Action and culture: a critical assessment 70
   4 The theory of civil society 73
   5 The basic dilemma in the conceptualization of civil society 74
   Conclusion 77

   Postscript: Alexander’s cultural sociology
   Introduction 78
   1 On the conceptualization of culture 79
   2 The environments of action 81
   3 Cultural narratives as second-order discourses 84
   Conclusion 85

5 Post-Parsonian theory II: beyond the normative and the utilitarian
   Introduction 86
   1 Three problematic presuppositions 87
   2 Constitutive theories of action and systemic theories of differentiation 89
   3 Some critical remarks 90
   Conclusion 94

Part III Agency and structure: reworking some basic conceptual tools 95

6 Social and system integration: Lockwood, Habermas and Giddens
   1 Lockwood 97
   2 Habermas 101
   3 Giddens 104
   Conclusion 105
## Contents

7 The subjectivist–objectivist divide: against transcendence 107
   1 On the concept of social structure 108
   2 The impasse of transcendence strategies 115
   3 A concrete example: the reproduction of the LSE as a social system 121
   4 Concluding remarks: bridging rather than transcending the divide 127

8 Habitus and reflexivity: restructuring Bourdieu’s theory of practice 131
   Introduction 131
   1 Dispositions, positions and interactions 132
   2 Reflexivity 133
   3 Bourdieu’s conception of the subject 136
   4 Restructuring the SDP scheme 139

Part IV Bridges between modern and late/postmodern theorizing 143

9 Modernity: a non-Eurocentric conceptualization 145
   Introduction 145
   1 Modernity: mobilization/incorporation into the centre 147
   2 Modernity: institutional differentiation 148
   3 Modernity: a non-Eurocentric conceptualization 154
   4 Modernity and the West 156
   5 Variants of modernity 156
   6 Late modernity and globalization 159
   Conclusion 161

10 Ethical relativism: between scientism and cultural relativism 164
   1 The golden rule perspective 164
   2 On the self-evidence of the golden rule 166
   3 Basic assumptions and difficulties of the relativist position 167
   4 Stepping stones towards growing socio-cultural interpenetration 169
   5 Eurocentrism 171
   Conclusion 173
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Cognitive relativism: between positivistic and relativistic thinking in the social sciences</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 Objectivity and the issue of mediation</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 The postmodern critique of representation and empirical evidence</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 The ‘internality’ of a discipline’s subject matter and Conclusion</td>
<td>183/188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Social causation: between social constructionism and critical realism</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 The Harré thesis</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 Giddens’ conflationist strategy</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 Archer’s anti-conflationist strategy</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4 Articulation of agentic and structural properties</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part V</td>
<td>Towards a non-essentialist holism</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Grand narratives: contextless and context-sensitive theories</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 ‘Grand narratives’: context-sensitive and insensitive</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 Holistic conceptual frameworks: open and closed</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 Non-essentialist holism: three types of openness</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>The actor–structure dimension: anti-conflationist holism</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 Structures and actors</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 On the linkages between the causal powers of actors and of structures</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>The micro–macro dimension: anti-essentialist holism</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 Strong and weak types of essentialism</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 Interpretative sociologies: obstacles to micro–macro bridges</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 Three guidelines for bridging micro and macro approaches</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>The inter-institutional dimension: beyond economism and culturalism</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 Economism</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 Culturalism and the priority of the lifeworld: from Marx to Parsons and Habermas</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 Beyond economism and systemic culturalism</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

Instead of Conclusion: Twelve rules for the construction of an open-ended holistic paradigm  274
   The actor–structure dimension: anti-conflationist holism  274
   The micro–macro dimension: anti-essentialist holism  275
   The inter-institutional dimension: anti-economistic holism  276

Appendix. In defence of ‘grand’ historical sociology  279
   1 The conflation of history and sociology  279
   2 The comparison with Spencer  280
   3 On the tenuous linkages between evidence and interpretation  281
   4 On the arbitrary character of grand historical sociology’s interpretations  283

References  285

Index  299
Figures

7.1 A fourfold typology of social structure  page 111
7.2 Variations in the relationship between actors and their environments of action  127
8.1 Restructuring the SDP scheme  140
14.1 Actor–structure linkages  233
Acknowledgements

I want to thank Sally Sutton for her excellent editing.

I also want to express my love and gratitude to Thalia Dragona for her intellectual, practical and moral support – support which made this book possible.