CIVILISING GLOBALISATION
Human rights and the global economy
CIVILISING GLOBALISATION

Human rights and the global economy

DAVID KINLEY
For
Finn, Jacques and Louis,
whose civilisation we await.
CONTENTS

List of illustrations  x
Preface  xi
Acknowledgements  xiii

1 Economic globalisation and universal human rights  1
   Overview of the relationship  1
      Complexity  3
   Shared histories, separate paths  6
      Modern development of human rights  9
      Modern development of the global economy  14
      Competing state responsibilities and interests  18
   Current conflicts and complementarities  23
      Pro- and anti-globalisation  24
      Conditional dependency  26
      Language and leverage  32

2 Trade and human rights  37
   Introduction  37
      ‘A rising tide lifts all boats’?  43
         Historical analysis of theory and practice  44
         Linking human rights and trade  47
         The political context of law-based linkage  50
   Overlapping jurisdictions?  60
      The limits and possibilities of the WTO protecting human rights  63
      Structural dictates  64
      Human rights in the WTO’s Dispute Settlement Mechanism?  69
   Conditionality, concessions and sanctions  77
      Trade sanctions  77
      Preferential treatment and conditionality  82
   Conclusion  89
3 Aid and human rights 93
   Introduction 93
      Responding to poverty 94
   Poverty alleviation and human rights 104
      Moral and legal arguments 104
      Politics and policies 108
      The shibboleth of the 0.7 per cent GNI target 111
      Increasing aid and forgiving debt 114
      The Millennium Development Goals 116
   A Human Rights Based Approach to development 119
      Good governance and the rule of law 124
      Human rights critiques of governance and rule of law programmes 129
   ‘The Globalisers’ – development agencies and human rights 132
      Engaging with human rights 132
      Fixing the plumbing and other ways forward 141
   Conclusion 143

4 Commerce and human rights 145
   Introduction 145
   Defining the territory 148
      Changing landscapes and mindsets 150
   Transnational corporations and their powers to do good and bad for human rights 157
      The Realpolitik of corporate power 160
      FDI and human rights 169
   Making power responsible: regulating the relationship between corporations and human rights 177
      Corporate social responsibility (CSR) and human rights 179
   Hard law and soft law approaches 187
   Conclusion 201

5 Civilising globalisation ahead 204
   Introduction 204
   Interdependence 206
      Important and intricate 207
      Laws and institutions 213
   Responsibilities 216
      Levels of responsibility 218
      The centrality of the state 222
      Responsibility framework – principle, policy and practice 224
   Freedom, development and security 228
      Security – global, state and individual 229
CONTENTS

The illicit economy 234
The private sector in public wars 235
'It's more than the economy – stupid!' 237

Index 240
ILLUSTRATIONS

1. GDP growth  
2. Where the money is  
3. Average of country Gini Coefficients by region  
4. The morphing of the pyramid into a diamond  
5. Net official development assistance in 2007

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Illustration</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GDP growth</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Where the money is</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average of country Gini Coefficients by region</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The morphing of the pyramid into a diamond</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Net official development assistance in 2007</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A plethora of influences, inspirations, experiences and encounters prompted me to write this book. But if I was to nominate the seminal moment in its evolution, then it would have to be one morning in the middle of September 2003, when I met with a senior economist in his office at the World Bank on H Street in Washington DC to talk about the place of human rights within the work of the Bank. I was doing some preliminary research for a Senior Fulbright Scholarship project that I was to take up in 2004 on that same subject. My host was and is a highly respected economist and strategic thinker both inside and outside the Bank. He was most hospitable, not least for honouring the meeting in the first place given the deluge of work that was pouring into his in-tray following the collapse of the Cancún ministerial trade talks barely twenty-four hours earlier. I enjoyed the encounter and I learnt a lot. During the meeting he said one thing in particular that struck me then and stayed with me thereafter. We were discussing the nature of human rights, and from that building a picture of what impact Bank operations had on them, and they on the Bank. We agreed that the Bank’s impact on matters of people’s economic and social welfare was profound, as indeed one would expect given the Bank’s goals to alleviate poverty and bolster standards of living. However, its impact on people’s and governments’ civil and political circumstances was, at least in terms of direct action, much less significant (though not immaterial). My host believed that only the latter category of issues constituted the proper concern of human rights, and the former did not. Desirable though the advancement of people’s economic and social circumstances clearly may be, these were policy goals, in his view, not enforceable obligations. As such, the answer to the question of the Bank’s impact on human rights was that it was minimal, and did not and should not therefore bear significantly on the strategic thinking and operations of the Bank.

This is not an uncommon line of argument in debates over the ontology of human rights more generally. However, within the context of its
delivery, it crystallised for me the idea that there are today two major, and often competing, globalising forces that strut the global stage. These are the universalisation of human rights on the one hand, and economic globalisation on the other. While it may be said that they occupy the same global space, they often appear to conduct their affairs separately, and when they do intersect it is more usually in collision rather than collusion. This is an impression that has been reiterated for me over the years in dealings with those from both sides of the debate, be they corporations, human rights activists, governments, academics, students, or officials from international organisations. In fact, an early working title for this book was ‘Two Globalisations’. But as my research and thinking developed, I understood that it was in fact too simple a representation of the whole scene. Certainly, it is an important point to make in order to appreciate the history and sentiments of the two fields that persist even today, but as a depiction of the totality of interrelations between the global economy and human rights the title was incomplete. Across the board, the intersections are numerous, subtle and inexorable, and as such I plumped for ‘Civilising Globalisation’ for the book’s title, with its connotations of globalisation being both a civilising force and a force that must be civilised. This double entendre constitutes the book’s abiding theme. It also reflects the positioning of the book within the broader imperative of needing to curb capitalism’s excesses, so graphically illustrated by the monumental interventions being made by governments in the global capital markets at the time I write these words in late 2008, and the mounting calls for the tightening of the regulatory frameworks within which financial institutions operate.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book has been rolling around in my head for nearly ten years. Emanations of its thesis have made appearances in other books, articles, reports, talks, conference papers and seven years of university courses and workshops in Australia, the United States, Europe and South East Asia. The research upon which it is based has been enabled by two grants from the Australian Research Council (one covering corporations and human rights, and the other covering trade and human rights) and one from the US Fulbright Commission (for work on the human rights dimensions of World Bank and IMF operations). My coalface experiences of human rights and the global economy in action have mainly come through work undertaken with AusAID, the United Nation’s Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, the World Bank, and a number of transnational corporations and law firms, as well as state and non-state agencies in and from developing countries, including China, Indonesia, Iraq, Laos, Myanmar, Nepal, South Africa and Vietnam.

I have benefited enormously from many discussions with numerous officials, from national governments, international organisations (such as those institutions mentioned above, as well as the Asian Development Bank, the European Commission, the UN Development Fund, the UN Children’s Fund (UNICEF), the UN Conference on Trade and Development, and various UN human rights treaty bodies, special rapporteurs and special representatives), international non-governmental organisations (especially Amnesty International, Human Rights Watch, Oxfam, World Vision, Human Rights First, the International Commission of Jurists and the Human Rights Council of Australia), and transnational corporations, in both the northern and southern hemispheres. Scores of colleagues, students, friends, family and foes have commented on, criticised or concurred with my ideas, logic and delivery, and to them I owe a debt of which they are as unaware as it is great.

Of particular note are those kind and thoughtful souls who undertook not only to read various drafts, but also to allow me to profit from
their many and various comments – namely, Philip Alston, Chris Avery, Lorand Bartels, Ross Buckley, Karin Buhmann, Tom Campbell, Mac Darrow, Tom Davis, Brice Dickson, David Feldman, Conor Gearty, Catherine Giraud-Kinley, Andrew Lang, Verity Lomax, Siobhan McInerney-Lankford, Sabine Michalowski, Gig Moon, Justine Nolan, John Pace, Annika Rosenblatt, John Ruggie, Hélène Ruiz Fabri, Jeffrey Sachs, Ben Saul, Andrea Shemberg, Chris Sidoti and Sune Thorsen. Though, privately, each of them knows how much I appreciate their contributions, let me here register the fact publicly.

I am also very grateful to the staff at Cambridge University Press for their efforts in bringing the book into existence, and especially Frances Brown, Daniel Dunlavey and Richard Woodham for their careful editorial ministrations, and Finola O’Sullivan for her support of the idea of the book from the outset.

Finally, special thanks are due to Nikki Goldstein, who read the manuscript in full and who was unfailingly supportive in her comments and generous in her counsel; and to Odette Murray, who assisted enormously in tracking down source materials, acting as a sounding-board for ideas, and subjecting the text to an eagle-eyed edit. To both of them I am profoundly grateful.

The writing of the book was almost wholly undertaken between January and September 2008, with emendations and updates made in the five months thereafter. It was a peripatetic affair, starting and ending in Sydney, with significant encampments in between, in England (Cambridge and London), France (Estensan and Paris) and Northern Ireland (Belfast and Island Magee), roughly in that order. The space and opportunity to commit thoughts and deeds to paper was made possible by the Sydney University Law School, which freed me from the delights of teaching and the scourge of administration for the first half of 2008, and by the Law Faculty at Cambridge University, which generously bestowed on me a Herbert Smith Visiting Fellowship, and provided me, through the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law, with a most convivial and intellectually stimulating base during my stay in Cambridge.