# Crime, War, and Global Trafficking

Globalization creates lucrative opportunities for traffickers of drugs, dirty money, blood diamonds, weapons, and other contraband. Effective countermeasures require international collaboration, but what if some countries suffer while others profit from illicit trade? Only international institutions with strong compliance mechanisms can ensure that profiteers will not dodge their law enforcement responsibilities. However, the effectiveness of these institutions may also depend on their ability to flexibly adjust to fast-changing environments. Combining international legal theory and transaction cost economics, this book develops a novel, comprehensive framework which reveals the factors that determine the optimal balance between institutional credibility and flexibility. The author tests this rational design paradigm on four recent anti-trafficking efforts: narcotics, money laundering, conflict diamonds, and small arms. She sheds light on the reasons why policymakers sometimes adopt sub-optimal design solutions and unearths a nascent trend toward innovative forms of international cooperation which transcend the limitations of national sovereignty.

CHRISTINE JOJARTH is a Social Science Research Associate at the Center on Democracy, Development, and the Rule of Law at Stanford University.

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-71376-4 - Crime, War, and Global Trafficking: Designing International Cooperation Christine Jojarth Frontmatter <u>More information</u>

## Crime, War, and Global Trafficking

Designing International Cooperation

CHRISTINE JOJARTH



Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-71376-4 - Crime, War, and Global Trafficking: Designing International Cooperation
Christine Jojarth
Frontmatter
More information

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521713764

© Christine Jojarth 2009

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2009

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Jojarth, Christine, 1975– Crime, war, and global trafficking : designing international cooperation / Christine Jojarth. p. cm. Includes bibliographical references. ISBN 978-0-521-88611-6 1. Crime. 2. Globalization. 3. Drug traffic. I. Title. HV6001,J65 2009 364.1'336–dc22

2008049141

ISBN 978-0-521-88611-6 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-71376-4 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this book, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

ambridge University Press	
78-0-521-71376-4 - Crime, War, and Global Trafficking: Designing International Cooperation	
christine Jojarth	
rontmatter	
Iore information	

#### Contents

List of figures p		<i>page</i> vii
List of tables		
List of abbreviations		
Pro	eface and acknowledgments	xiii
1	<ul> <li>Introduction</li> <li>1.1 Crime, war, and global trafficking</li> <li>1.2 Explaining institutional design</li> <li>1.3 Methodology</li> <li>1.4 Outline</li> </ul>	1 2 9 15 18
2	<ul><li>The concept of legalization</li><li>2.1 Credibility versus flexibility</li><li>2.2 The three dimensions of the concept of legalization</li><li>2.3 Relationship between design variables</li></ul>	20 22 29 56
3	<ul> <li>Problem constellation</li> <li>3.1 Competing theories of institutional design</li> <li>3.2 Toward a problem-tailored design model</li> <li>3.3 The three dimensions of problem constellations</li> <li>3.4 Interaction between problem constellation variables</li> </ul>	59 60 67 72 89
4	<ul> <li>Narcotic drugs: UN Convention against Illicit Traffic in Narcotic Drugs and Psychotropic Substances</li> <li>4.1 Narcotic drugs as an international policy problem</li> <li>4.2 Problem constellation</li> <li>4.3 Degree of legalization</li> </ul>	92 93 101 119
5	<ul> <li>Money laundering: the Financial Action Task Force and its Forty Recommendations</li> <li>5.1 Money laundering as an international policy problem</li> <li>5.2 Problem constellation</li> <li>5.3 Degree of legalization</li> </ul>	139 n 140 148 165

v

#### CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-71376-4 - Crime, War, and Global Trafficking: Designing International Cooperation
Christine Jojarth
Frontmatter
More information

vi		Contents
6	<ul> <li>Conflict diamonds: the Kimberley Process</li> <li>Certification Scheme</li> <li>6.1 Conflict diamonds as an international policy pro</li> <li>6.2 Problem constellation</li> <li>6.3 Degree of legalization</li> </ul>	181 bblem 182 191 208
7	<ul> <li>Small arms and light weapons: the United Nations</li> <li>Program of Action</li> <li>7.1 Small arms and light weapons as an international policy problem</li> <li>7.2 Problem constellation</li> <li>7.3 Degree of legalization</li> </ul>	221 222 233 255
8	<ul> <li>Conclusion</li> <li>8.1 Summary of results</li> <li>8.2 Rationality</li> <li>8.3 Instrumentality</li> <li>8.4 The step beyond: bounded rationality and multi-purpose instrumentality</li> </ul>	267 268 271 278 285
	ferences dex	287 319

## Figures

1.1	International agreements, institutions, and regimes	page 12
3.1	Potential loss as a function of futile sunk costs and	
	forgone benefits	77
3.2	Propensity to shirk as a function of costs and benefits	79
3.3	Problem constellation with low and high asset specificity	81
4.1	Distribution of costs and benefits resulting from	
	an international anti-drug institution	110
5.1	Distribution of costs and benefits resulting from	
	an international anti-money laundering institution	156
6.1	Distribution of costs and benefits resulting from	
	an international anti-conflict diamond institution	200
7.1	The world's legal small arms producers	
	© Small Arms Survey. Reproduced with permission	236
7.2	Countries affected by armed conflicts, 1991–2000	241
7.3	Distribution of costs and benefits	243

## Tables

2.1	Overview of key institutional design dimensions	page 54
3.1	Overview of key dimensions of policy problem	
	constellations	87
3.2	Design hypotheses under different problem	
	constellations	90
4.1	Output of leading opium and coca producers, 1988	105
4.2	Substance abuse-related death rates in most affected	
	consumer states and in leading producer states	
	in the early 1990s	108
4.3	Selected governance indicators for key drug producer	
	states, 1996	112
4.4	Summary assessment of the problem constellation	
	underlying the trafficking in narcotic drugs	118
4.5	Summary assessment of the level of legalization	
	of the Vienna Convention	135
5.1	Selected anti-money laundering chronology	146
5.2	International and domestic importance of leading	
	banking centers, 2003	151
5.3	Homicide rates in selected countries	153
5.4	Selected governance indicators for leading financial	
	centers, 2003	158
5.5	Summary assessment of the problem constellation	
	underlying money laundering	164
5.6	Summary assessment of the level of legalization	
	of the Forty Recommendations of 2003	178
6.1	Diamond sanctions imposed by the United Nations	
	Security Council	189
6.2	Economic importance of the diamond sector for leading	
	producers in sub-Saharan Africa, 2000	193
6.3	Industry structure in leading diamond producers	
	in sub-Saharan Africa, 2000	194

viii

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-71376-4 - Crime, War, and Global Trafficking: Designing International Cooperation
Christine Jojarth
Frontmatter
Moreinformation

List	of tables	ix
6.4	Occurrence of state failure in leading diamond-producing	
	countries in sub-Saharan Africa, 1990–2000	196
6.5	Output of major diamond producers, 2000	197
6.6	Selected governance indicators for leading diamond	
	mining, trading, and polishing states, 2002	202
6.7	Summary assessment of the problem constellation	
	underlying conflict diamonds	207
6.8	Summary assessment of the level of legalization	
	of the Kimberley Process Certification Scheme	218
7.1	Transfers of conventional arms to developing	
	countries, average 1997-2001	235
7.2	Selected countries with potential surplus stockpiles,	
	2003–2005	238
7.3	Average political terror score of countries with worst	• • •
- 4	human rights record, 1991–2000	240
7.4	Selected governance indicators for leading SALW	246
	producers, 2000	246
7.5	Summary assessment of the problem constellation	
	underlying the trafficking in small arms and	253
7.6	light weapons Summary assessment of the level of legalization of the	233
/.0	UN Program of Action on Small Arms and	
	Light Weapons	264
8.1	Summary of legalization of four international	204
0.1	institutions against global trafficking	270
8.2	Summary assessment of problem constellation	270
J. <b>_</b>	underlying four cases of global trafficking	271

#### Abbreviations

AML	Anti-money laundering
APG	Asia/Pacific Group against Money Laundering
ARS	Alternative remittance systems
AUC	Autodefensas Unidas de Colombia
BIS	Bank for International Settlements
CFATF	Caribbean Financial Action Task Force
CIA	Central Intelligence Agency
CITES	Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species
CND	Commission on Narcotic Drugs
CoE	Council of Europe
CTBTO	Commission for the Comprehensive Nuclear-Test-Ban
	Treaty Organization
CTF	Counter-terrorist finance
DDA	United Nations Department of Disarmament Affairs
DEA	Drug Enforcement Administration of the US Department
	of Justice
EAG	Eurasian Group on Combating Money Laundering and
	Financing of Terrorism
ECOSOC	UN Economic and Social Council
EITI	Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative
ELN	Ejército de Liberacíon Nacional
EMCDDA	European Monitoring Centre for Drugs and Drug
	Addiction
ESAAMLG	Eastern and Southern African Anti-Money Laundering
	Group
FARC	Fuerzas Armadas Revolucionarias de Colombia
FATF	Financial Action Task Force
FinCEN	Financial Crimes Enforcement Network
FSRB	FATF-Style Regional Bodies
GAFISUD	Financial Action Task Force on Money Laundering in
	South America
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GIABA	Inter-Governmental Action Group against Money
	Laundering
	···· ··· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·

x

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-71376-4 - Crime, War, and Global Trafficking: Designing International Cooperation
Christine Jojarth
Frontmatter
More information

#### List of abbreviations

xi

IAEA	International Atomic Energy Agency
IFI	International Financial Institution
IMF	International Monetary Fund
INCB	International Narcotics Control Board
KP	Kimberley Process
KPCS	Kimberley Process Certification Scheme
LTTE	Liberation Tigers of Tamil Eelam
MENAFATF	Middle East and North Africa Financial Action Task
	Force (MENAFATF) against Money Laundering and
	Terrorist
MONEYVAL	Committee of Experts on the Evaluation of Anti-Money
	Laundering Measures and the Financing of Terrorism
NCCT	Non-complying countries and territories
NGO	Non-governmental organization
ONDCP	Office of National Drug Control Policy of the US White
	House
OPEC	Organization of Petroleum Exporting Countries
OSCE	Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe
PoA	UN Program of Action to Prevent, Combat and Eradicate
	the Illicit Trade in Small Arms and light Weapons in All its
	Aspects
SADC	Southern African Development Community
SALW	Small arms and light weapons
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNHCR	Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for
	Refugees
UNODC	United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
WWF	World Wildlife Fund
WTO	World Trade Organization

### Preface and acknowledgments

"But isn't this way too dangerous?" my mother-in-law asked whenever my research topic came up in our conversations. "I don't want you to get killed by these gangsters." Each time I tried to reassure her: "No, it is really not going to be that sort of crime-and-murder book you imagine." No blonde wigs, no sunglasses, no bulletproof vests. The way I set out to explore the shady world stretched between crime and war was not through undercover meetings with Viktor Bout, the legendary "Merchant of Death," or with his client, Manuel Marulanda, the world's oldest guerrilla leader and drug king. Instead, I spent the past five years interviewing policymakers and diplomats of all ranks and nationalities, industry representatives, and NGO leaders. I plowed through every imaginable written source on the subject. This was admittedly non-glamorous and required perseverance and analytic acuity rather than bravado and guile. The result of this endeavor may not be an adrenaline-packed thriller. But I hope to show that the big picture on how drugs, dirty money, diamonds, and arms circulate in the multi-billion dollar illicit global economy and how policymakers have tried to fight these different types of trafficking can be as fascinating as a series of anecdotes from the underworld.

On a more theoretical level, I want to explore how international cooperation on global trafficking can be facilitated through welldesigned institutions. This focus on institutional design has led me to an unexpected puzzle which goes beyond the focus of this study but is too dear to me to go unmentioned.

Over the course of this research, I have become increasingly mystified as to why legally binding agreements are so popular despite the enormous investment in time and diplomatic capital required for their drafting and ratification process. The traditional international law argument suggests that states will comply with obligations created under a legally binding institution because their commitment is more formal and their credibility is to a much greater extent at stake when Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-71376-4 - Crime, War, and Global Trafficking: Designing International Cooperation Christine Jojarth Frontmatter <u>More information</u>

xiv

Preface and acknowledgments

they officially endorse a legally binding rather than a non-binding institution. But this argument fails to take into account the fact that credibility is only at stake if non-compliance with that legally binding institution can indeed be detected and exposed. This is exactly where most legally binding agreements fall short. They often use formulations that are so vague that it is hard to differentiate between compliant and non-compliant behavior. Furthermore, they lack the mandate to monitor states' implementation record and to sanction non-compliance. So what is the point in crafting legally binding institutions that lack other – and probably more powerful – compliance mechanisms (e.g. precisely formulated obligations, monitoring, sanctioning)? Are there no more effective design options to facilitate international cooperation?

My interest in this question was triggered by a number of recently established international institutions that innovatively blend legal nonbindingness with tough compliance mechanisms. In this study, I will present the Financial Action Task Force, the central player in the global anti-money laundering movement, and the Kimberley Process on conflict diamonds as two prototypical examples of this move toward hybrid designs. I have explored these design innovations in more detail elsewhere (Jojarth 2007), but I want to alert the reader upfront to the embryonic new world order lurking in these case studies.

I guess that if this book is ever going to put me in danger, I have less to fear from criminal gangs than from devotees to classic international law and diplomacy who feel their traditional tools-of-trade threatened.

Over this half-decade long research journey, I have benefited from the advice and support of an incredible number of people who have continually stunned me with their intellectual rigor and generosity. These encounters in themselves have already made my efforts more than worthwhile.

From its genesis, this research has been nurtured by William Wallace and Martin Lodge, who proved superb mentors and intellectual sparring partners during my Ph.D. studies at the London School of Economics and well beyond. Stanford University and its Center on Democracy Development and the Rule of Law have offered me an unparalleled environment for taking my intellectual curiosity to the next level. Thomas Heller, Stephen Krasner, David Victor, Stephen Stedman, Kathryn Stoner-Weiss, Michael McFaul, and President Alejandro Toledo have all been instrumental in helping me synthesize my key findings and make them relevant to a wider audience.

#### Preface and acknowledgments

XV

Outside of my old and new academic home, I have also been privileged to receive encouraging feedback from a number of leading scholars in the field. I would like to mention in particular Robert Keohane, Barabara Koremenos, David Lake, Ronald Mitchell, Mats Berdal, and Phil Williams.

I am immensely grateful to my interviewees for sharing with me their insights into the practical world of international institutions and for luring me out of the ivory tower. The encouragement from two anonymous reviewers, John Haslam and Carrie Cheek of Cambridge University Press, was critical for making me go the painful last mile of endless revisions.

This book has been made possible thanks to the generous financial support I received from the Rotary Foundation, the British Chevening scholarship program, the Janggen Poehn Foundation, and from the Microsoft Corporation.

My family and friends have been indispensable for reminding me of the beauty life has to offer beyond my computer desk and for being the source of that beauty. My deepest gratitude goes to my husband Marton Jojarth to whom I dedicate this book and my life.