

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-71336-8 - The Nature and Authority of Precedent

Neil Duxbury

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX

- absolute discretion as basis for decisions 66
- accessibility of precedents 5–7
- age of precedent as measure of value 63–4
- analogy
 - basis for precedent, as 47–57
 - reason by 2
- Austin, John
 - on judge-made law 18, 38–40
- authority of precedent 24–5 *see also*
 - binding aspect of precedent; *stare decisis* doctrine; value of precedents
 - bases for 12–13, 15–16
 - enactment force 60
 - level of court, influence of 62
 - limits to 16–17
 - shown when not followed, as 111–13
 - statutes, compared with 58–9
 - weakening of, because of lack of full facts 3
- availability heuristics, precedents as 94–9
- Bentham, Jeremy
 - on judge-made law 17, 43–4
- bias correction as reason for following precedent 166
- binding aspect of precedent 12–22, 23–4, 96, 99–108 *see also*
 - authority of precedent
 - historical development 17–18
 - House of Lords' power to overrule *see under* House of Lords
 - limits to 111
 - London Tramways v LCC* 125–6
- Canada, Supreme Court of
 - overruling of own precedents 124
- cascading of precedents, negative effects of 98–9
- case law
 - distinguishing *see* distinguishing interpretation of, compared with statutes 59
 - like treatment of *see* like cases, treatment of
 - overruling *see* overruling
 - unreported cases, use of 6
 - whether Practice Statement restricted to future 147–8
- certainty, precedents as source of 80, 159–63
- certainty test for determining *stare decisis* (Goodhart) 91
- classical positivism *see* positivist jurisprudence in relation to precedent
- clean slate
 - improvement of law compared to following precedent 154
 - inefficiency compared to following precedent 97
- coercive theory of law 14
- commands, precedents as 45–7, 100–2
- common law
 - relation of precedent to 182–3
- Compleat Wrangler, The* (Stone-de Montpensier)
 - binding force of Practice Statement, on 145

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-71336-8 - The Nature and Authority of Precedent

Neil Duxbury

Index

[More information](#)

- Concept of Law* (Hart)
 - constitutional basis of radical judicial action, on 136–9
 - theory of precedent in 19–22
- consensus in decision-making 179–81
- consequentialist justifications for following precedent 97, 153–67
- consistency 159–63
 - need for 177–9
 - R. Stone's 'new theory of law' as to 143–4
- constraint, precedent as 4–5, 10, 59–62, 165–7
- costs of overruling
 - concern for, as reason for following precedent 153
- creative aspect of precedent 10–12
- Cretan Liar paradox in relation to Practice Statement 144–5
- current decisions as basis for precedent 4
- customary aspect of precedent 8–9
- decision-making
 - contribution of precedent according to availability heuristics approach 94–9
 - economy of, enabling by precedent 97
 - future as constraint on 4–5, 10
- decisions
 - absolute discretion as basis for 66
 - House of Lords, discerning *ratio decidendi* in 70–2
 - judicial restraint by precedent, and 165–7
 - meaning of, as distinct from 'decision' in Practice Statement 146
 - 'piggybacking' 93–4
 - rules as guide for 20
 - status as precedents in USA 6
 - value as precedents 95–6
 - whether *ratio decidendi* necessary for 77–8
- declaratory theory of law 39–45
- deontological arguments
 - following precedent, for 167–82
 - treatment of like cases, for 170–82
- dependence on precedent 31
- dissenting opinions
 - authority of 62
- distinguishing 67–76, 113–15
 - compared with overruling 27
 - lower courts, by 167
- doctrine of precedent, development of 31–57
 - historical development
 - eighteenth century 17–18, 35
 - medieval period 32–3, 52
 - nineteenth century 18, 37–48
 - reasons for 35–57
 - seventeenth century 34–5, 48–51
 - Tudor period 25, 33–4, 52
 - reasons for
 - benefits of following precedent 35–7
 - positivist jurisprudence, growth of 37–48
- Dworkin, Ronald
 - on precedential constraint 59–62, 170–1
- economy of decision-making
 - enabling by precedent 97
- efficiency of decision-making
 - clean slate versus following precedent for 97
 - enabling by precedent 97–9
- enactment force of precedents 60
- equality within like cases 176
- erroneous decisions 40–1, 61
 - precedent as means of reducing 95–6
- estoppel
 - as justification for following precedent 163–5
- exclusionary aspect of precedent 100–8
- exclusionary reasons 105–6
- exemplary aspect of precedent 7
- experience as basis for precedent 2–3
- factual basis of precedent 3–4
- fairness
 - in relation to justice 60–1
- first-order reasons 105–6
- following precedent, reasons for 150–3
 - bias-correction 166
 - consequentialist justifications 97, 153–67
 - costs of overruling, concern for 153

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-71336-8 - The Nature and Authority of Precedent

Neil Duxbury

Index

[More information](#)

186

INDEX

- following precedent (cont.)
 - deontological explanations 167–82
 - estoppel 163–5
 - judges' motives *see under* judges
 - traditionalism, according to 168–70
 - value of precedent 157
- formal justice *see* like cases, treatment of
- formulary system 52
- future as constraint on decision
 - making 4–5, 10
- Goodhart, Arthur
 - certainty test for determining *ratio decidendi* 80
 - reasoning as source of *ratio decidendi*, on 80–7
- gravitational force of
 - precedents 60–2
- Hart, H.L.A. *The Concept of Law*
 - constitutional basis of Practice Statement, and 136–9
 - theory of precedent in 19–22
- hierarchical system of appellate
 - courts
 - influence of level of court on
 - authority of precedent 62
 - influence on growth of *stare decisis* 56
 - level of court influencing authority
 - of precedent 62
- Hobbes, Thomas, *Leviathan*
 - theory of precedents as commands
 - in 47–8, 100–2
- House of Lords
 - judgments, discerning *ratio decidendi* in 70–2
 - London Tramways* case, decision on
 - binding precedent in 125–6
 - overruling own precedents 27–8, 40–2, 58, 104, 122–8
 - reasons 135–6
 - usage and constraints 127–8
 - Practice Statement *see* Practice Statement, House of Lords
 - precedents in 103
- hypothetical instances
 - as basis for precedents 3
- ignoring precedent 15–16 *see also*
 - overruling
- improvement of law
 - clean slate compared to following precedent 154
- inferior courts *see* lower courts
- information management, importance
 - of *ratio decidendi* for 90
- internal point of view 20–2
- inversion test for determining *ratio decidendi* 76–7
- joint opinions 79
- judges *see also* judiciary law
 - comity as reason for following precedent 155–6, 157–8
 - concern for justice as reason for overruling 157
- decision-making
 - consensus in 179–81
 - restraint by precedent on 165–7
- independent judgment by
 - precedents as pre-empting 100–8
 - scope for 27
- judiciary law *see* judiciary law
- legislative role *see* judiciary law
- motives for following precedent 29
 - career and promotion
 - prospects 154
 - confidence in value of
 - precedents 157
 - reputation, concern for 154–5, 166–7
- regard for precedent 15–16, 24, 155
- seventeenth century 34
- when not following 111–13
- reputation
 - concern for, as reason for
 - following precedent *see* motives for following precedent *above*
 - contribution of precedents to 95
 - measure of value of precedent,
 - as 62
- use of precedents as shortcuts 26–7, 92–9
- use of social rules as guide for
 - decisions 20
- judicandum est legibus non exemplis* 34

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-71336-8 - The Nature and Authority of Precedent

Neil Duxbury

Index

[More information](#)

- Judicature Acts 1873–75
 - influence on growth of *stare decisis* 56
- judiciary law 38–40
 - judges' decisions as basis for 22
 - judges' scope for making 27–8
- jurisprudence on precedent
 - historical development 14–22
- jurists
 - role of 23
- justice
 - fairness, in relation to 60–1
 - over precedent 157
- Kelsen, Hans
 - Pure Theory of Law 14
- Kronman, Anthony
 - traditionalist argument for following precedent 168–70
- law making by judges *see* judiciary law
- law reporting, development of 53–6
- legal training
 - importance of *ratio decidendi* for 90
- like cases, treatment of 29, 60–1
 - different cases as like, treating 170
 - equality, interaction with 176
 - incommensurability, problem of 172–4
 - like cases alike, treating, deontological arguments for 170–82
 - likeness and difference, criteria for 174–5
 - material differences, importance of decisions on 181–2
 - moral considerations 176–7
 - reasons for not treating alike 171–2
 - relevance as to 175–6
- logic, basis of law in
 - Roy Stone and 142–3
- London Tramways v LCC*
 - House of Lords' decision on binding precedent in 125–6
- lower courts
 - distinguishing by 167
 - precedent-following by 40–1
 - overruling by 130–1
- mistaken decisions *see* erroneous decisions
- Montrose, J. L.
 - notational system for identifying *ratio decidendi* 87–9
- motives for following precedent
 - see* following precedent, reasons for
- New Zealand Court of Appeal
 - overruling of own precedents 124
- notational system for identifying *ratio decidendi* (J. L. Montrose) 87–9
- obiter dicta*
 - ratio decidendi*, distinguished from 26, 67–73, 76–90
- objections to following precedent 98–9
- opinions
 - joint 79
 - relative importance within a decision 57
 - single 62–3
- overruling 27–9, 104–5
 - anticipation of, as reason for not following precedent 159
 - costs of, concern for 153
 - distinguishing, compared with 27
 - ignoring precedent 15–16
 - justice, concern for, as reason for 157
- lower courts, by 130–1
- own precedents 122–8
 - House of Lords, by *see under* House of Lords
 - New Zealand Court of Appeal, by 124
 - Supreme Court of Canada, by 124
- reason as basis for 147
- US Supreme Court, practice in 118
- past actions as basis for precedent 9
- past events as basis for precedent 1–2
- 'piggybacking' decisions 93–4
- political decisions, effect on precedent of 12

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-71336-8 - The Nature and Authority of Precedent

Neil Duxbury

Index

[More information](#)

188

INDEX

- positivist jurisprudence in relation to
 - precedent 14–22
 - declaratory theory of precedent 39–45
 - historical development 37–48
 - influence on judicial thinking 43–5
 - precedents as commands 45–7
 - reason as basis for precedent 47–57
- post-verdict arguments 25, 52, 53, 56–7
- Practice Statement, House of Lords 123, 126–49
 - constitutional basis of 131–9
 - Cretan Liar paradox, analogy with 144–5
 - decision, as 146
 - ‘decision’ and ‘decisions’, difference in meaning between 146
 - extent to which binding 139–49
 - future cases, whether restricted to 147–8
 - logical basis for validity 148–9
 - logical consistency of 144–5
 - ratio decidendi*, as 146
 - source of authority of 145–7
 - whether a precedent 145
- precedential constraint, Ronald Dworkin on 59–62
- predictability
 - precedent as source of 159–63
- protected reasons 105–6
- Pure Theory of Law (Kelsen) 14
- Queen’s Bench Division, overruling own precedents by 124–5
- ratio decidendi* 67–92
 - as basis for precedents 25–6
 - basis for *stare decisis* 91
 - certainty test for determining 80
 - decisions, necessity for 77–8
 - definition 75–90
 - House of Lords decisions, discerning in 70–2
 - importance of earlier 91–2
 - information management, importance for 90
 - inversion test for determining 76–7
 - joint opinions, and 79
 - legal training, importance for 90
 - multiple *rationes* 73–4
 - necessity test for determining 77–8
 - notational system for identifying 87–9
 - obiter dicta*, distinguished from 26, 67–73, 76–90
 - point at which created 74–5
 - Practice Statement as 146
 - reasoning, distinguished from 67–8
 - reasoning as source of 80–7
 - reasons for determining 90–2
- ratiocination
 - distinguished from rationalisation 142
- rational choice
 - following precedent as 155–8
- Raz, Joseph
 - precedents as exclusionary reasons 102–8
- reason as basis for precedents 47–57 *see also ratio decidendi*; reasons, precedents as
 - by analogy 2
 - ‘artificial’ and natural reason distinguished 49–50
 - by experience 2–3
 - overruling on basis of reason 147
 - precedents as reasons *see* reasons, precedents as
 - relative importance of opinions within a decision 25–6, 57
- reasoning
 - measure of value of precedent, as 65–6
 - non-unanimous 62
 - ratio decidendi*, distinguished from 67–8
 - source of *ratio decidendi*, as 80–7
- reasons *see also ratio decidendi*, shortcuts
 - disregarding precedent, for 111–13
 - exclusionary 99–108
 - precedents as 57, 58–110
 - protected (first-order) 105–6
 - second-order exclusionary reasons 105–6
 - use of earlier 93–9

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-71336-8 - The Nature and Authority of Precedent

Neil Duxbury

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX

189

- reasons for following precedent *see*
 - following precedent, reasons for
 - relevant likeness and difference 175–6
 - reliance on following precedent 163–4
 - restraint, Ronald Dworkin on
 - precedent as 165–7
- rules
 - formation of 23
 - as guide to judicial decisions 20
 - jurists' role in clarifying 23
- second-order (exclusionary) reasons
 - 105–6
- self-overruling 122–8
- shortcuts
 - use of precedents as 26–7, 92–9
- single-opinion judgments as
 - precedents 62–3
- social rules
 - as guide to judicial decisions 20
- sources of law
 - effectiveness of precedents as 92–3
- stability
 - contribution of precedents to
 - 96, 158–9
- stare decisis*, doctrine of 12–13, 14–19, 27–8
 - appellate court system, development
 - of, influence on growth of 62
 - basis in *ratio decidendi* 91
 - erroneous decisions 40
 - historical development 34–5, 42
 - Judicature Acts, influence of 56
 - law reporting, influence of
 - development of 53–6
 - post-verdict arguments,
 - development of 25
- statutes
 - authority of precedents compared
 - with 58–9
 - interpretation of case law compared
 - with 59
- Stone, Julius
 - constitutional basis of Practice
 - Statement, on 131–2
- Stone-de Montpensier, Roy L.
 - The Compleat Wrangler*
 - binding force of Practice Statement,
 - on 145
- surprise precedents 5–7
- traditionalist argument for following
 - precedent (Kronman) 168–70
- unanimity of decision as measure of
 - value 62
- unexplained exceptions as precedents
 - 164–5
- unreported cases, use of 6
- USA
 - decisions as precedents,
 - status of 6
 - overruling 118
 - prohibition on use of English
 - authorities 98
- value of precedents 12, 95–6
 - age, based on 63–4
 - judges' reputation 62
 - legal reasoning, quality
 - of 65–6
 - reason for following, as 157
 - traditionalism argument, according
 - to 168–70
 - unanimous or majority
 - view 62
 - whether higher or lower
 - court 62
- Wambaugh, Eugene
 - inversion test for determining *ratio decidendi* 76–7
- weakening of precedents
 - lack of full facts, because of 3