Mobilizing for Human Rights

This volume argues that international human rights law has made a positive contribution to the realization of human rights in much of the world. Although governments sometimes ratify human rights treaties, gambling that they will experience little pressure to comply with them, this is not typically the case. Focusing on rights stakeholders rather than the United Nations or state pressure, Beth A. Simmons demonstrates through a combination of statistical analyses and case studies that the ratification of treaties leads to better rights practices on average. By several measures, civil and political rights, women’s rights, the right not to be tortured in government detention, and children’s rights improve, especially in the very large, heterogeneous set of countries that are neither stable autocracies nor stable democracies. Simmons argues that international human rights law should get more practical and rhetorical support from the international community as a supplement to broader efforts to address conflict, development, and democratization.

Beth A. Simmons is Clarence Dillon Professor of International Affairs at Harvard University and has also taught at Duke University and the University of California at Berkeley. Her book Who Adjusts? Domestic Sources of Foreign Economic Policy During the Interwar Years, 1924–1939, was recognized by the American Political Science Association in 1995 as the best book published in 1994 in government, politics, or international relations. Her article “International Law and State Behavior: Commitment and Compliance in International Monetary Affairs” won the Heinz Eulau Award for the best article published in the American Political Science Review in 2000. Her research also regularly appears in such journals as International Organization, World Politics, the Journal of Legal Studies, and the Journal of Conflict Resolution. She was elected to the American Academy of Arts and Sciences in 2009.
Dedicated to Robert O. Keohane – scholar, mentor, friend
Mobilizing for Human Rights

International Law in Domestic Politics

Beth A. Simmons

Harvard University
Contents

List of Figures and Tables                       page vii
Acknowledgments                                  xi
Abbreviations                                    xv

PART I

1    Introduction                                    3
    Why International Law?                          5
    International Law and International Relations: The State of Knowledge 9
    The Argument in Brief                           12
    Organization of the Book                        17

2    Why International Law? The Development of the International Human Rights Regime in the Twentieth Century 23
    The Global Context: The Intensification of State Accountability in the Twentieth Century 24
    The Influence of Wartime on Human Rights        36
    Toward Legalization: Progress and Hesitation    42
    The 1970s and Beyond: The Acceleration of Legal Development 49
    Conclusions                                     55

3    Theories of Commitment                         57
    Why Commit? The Common Wisdom                    59
    A Theory of Rationally Expressive Ratification   64
    False Negatives and False Positives              67
    The Evidence: Empirical Patterns of Treaty Commitment 80
    Conclusions                                     108

4    Theories of Compliance                         112
    International Treaties and International Politics 114
# Contents

A Domestic Politics Theory of Treaty Compliance  
Expectations  
Conclusions  

PART II  

5 Civil Rights  
Civil Rights and International Law  
Religious Freedom  
Fair Trials  
Cruel and Inhumane Punishment: The Death Penalty  
Conclusions  

6 Equality for Women: Education, Work, and Reproductive Rights  
Women’s Rights and International Law  
Educational Opportunity  
Reproductive Health  
Employment  
A Closer Look at Mechanisms  
Conclusions  

7 Humane Treatment: The Prevalence and Prevention of Torture  
Torture and International Law  
Data and Methods  
Statistical Findings  
Chile and Israel: Experiences with the CAT  
Conclusions  

8 The Protection of Innocents: Rights of the Child  
Children’s Rights  
Child Labor  
Basic Health Care: Immunizations  
Child Soldiers  
Conclusions  

9 Conclusion  
Commitment and Compliance: Twin Puzzles for International Human Rights Law  
Human Rights Treaties in Perspective  
Implications for Policy and Practice  
Conclusion  

Appendix 1: Data Appendix  
Appendix 2: Regime Type and Rule of Law Categories  
References  
Index
List of Figures and Tables

Figures

2.1 Proportion of Democracies in the World \hspace{1cm} page 26
2.2 Regional Election Monitoring \hspace{1cm} 27
2.3 Growth in International Judicial, Quasi-judicial, and Dispute Settlement Bodies \hspace{1cm} 31
2.4 Total Conventional NGOs \hspace{1cm} 33
2.5 Number of Internet Users (Millions) \hspace{1cm} 34
2.6 International Human Rights Instruments in Force \hspace{1cm} 37
3.1 Cumulative Human Rights Treaty Ratifications \hspace{1cm} 61
3.2 Average Ratification Rates (2004) by Region \hspace{1cm} 62
3.3 Depth of Commitment to the ICCPR (2004) by Region \hspace{1cm} 63
3.4 Ex Ante Probability of Possible Treaty Interpretations: Civil Compared to Common Law Systems \hspace{1cm} 76
3.5 The Probability of Nondemocratic Ratification \hspace{1cm} 89
3.6 Regional Effects: Socialization or Strategic Behavior? \hspace{1cm} 94
4.1 Influences on Human Rights Mobilization in Stable Autocracies, Stable Democracies, and Partially Democratic or Transitional Regimes \hspace{1cm} 151
4.2 The Expected Value of Human Rights Mobilization in Autocracies, Democracies, and Partially Democratic/Transitional Regimes \hspace{1cm} 153
5.1 ICCPR Ratifications and Religious Freedoms \hspace{1cm} 172
5.2 ICCPR Ratifications and Fair Trials \hspace{1cm} 182
5.3 Number of Countries with the Death Penalty \hspace{1cm} 193
6.1 CEDAW Commitments and Girls’ Education (Global Averages) \hspace{1cm} 214
6.2 Effect of CEDAW and Women’s Organizations on the Ratio of Girls to Boys in Primary and Secondary School \hspace{1cm} 223
List of Figures and Tables

6.3 Government Policies on Contraceptive Access 226
6.4 CEDAW Commitments and Women’s Average Share of Public Employment 233
6.5 Colombia, WINGOs, and the CEDAW 248
7.1 CAT Ratifications and the Torture Scale 269
7.2 Chilean Court Cases on Torture 294
7.3 Torture Litigation in Israel 299
8.1 Growth in International Legal Instruments Relating to Children’s Rights and Protection 313
8.2 Ratification of and Accession to the CRC and Its Optional Protocols 316
8.3 Child Labor by Region, 1970–2001 322
8.4 CRC Ratification and Rates of One- to Two-Year-Old Immunizations Worldwide 330
8.5 Changes in Minimum Age for Military Service, World Averages 339

Tables

3.1 Influences on the Rate of Treaty Ratification 83
3.2 Influences on the Ratification Rate 85
3.3 Nonreservers 99
3.4a Reservations 101
3.4b Types of Reservations 104
3.5 Recognition of International Authority to Rule on Complaints 106
5.1 Effect of ICCPR Commitment on Local Memberships in International NGOs 166
5.2 The ICCPR and Freedom of Religion 175
5.3 Effects of an ICCPR Commitment on Fair Trials 184
5.4 The ICCPR, the OPDP, and the Death Penalty 195
5.5 Death Penalty Abolition 196
6.1 Effect of CEDAW Ratification on Local Memberships in Women’s International NGOs 210
6.2 Effects of a CEDAW Commitment on Girls’ Education 218
6.3 Effects of a CEDAW Commitment on Access to Modern Family Planning 228
6.4 Effects of a CEDAW Commitment on the Share of Women in Public Employment 234
7.1 Torture Prevalence: The Dependent Variable 268
7.2 Effects of a CAT Commitment on the Prevalence of Torture 274
7.3 Effect of Regional Torture Conventions on Torture Prevalence in Transitional Countries 279
List of Figures and Tables

7.4 Effects of a CAT Commitment on the Prevalence of Torture Conditional on the Rule of Law 282
8.1 CRC Commitment and Child Labor 324
8.2 CRC Commitment and Child Immunizations 333
8.3 Countries That Increased the Age of Military Service between 2000 and 2005, by Category of Service 340
8.4 CRC OPCAC Commitment and Increase in the Legal Minimum Age for Military Service 342
8.5 The CRC OPCAC and Improvements in Compliance with the 18-Year Minimum Age for Military Service 344

Note: Appendixes can be viewed online at http://scholar.iq.harvard.edu/bsimmons/mobilizing-for-human-rights.
Acknowledgments

Many colleagues, students, and institutions have helped to make this study possible. It began at the Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences at Stanford University during the academic year 2002–3. The Center provided the intellectual environment in which my ideas for this project first took shape. Casual discussions with individuals and during seminars at the center were essential in sparking my interest in developing a book-length study of international law and human rights. I owe a special debt of gratitude to the Hewlitt Foundation for supporting financially my year at the CASBS.

A number of my friends and colleagues read parts of the draft and offered their critical insights. I am especially grateful to my colleagues and peers who attended a book conference sponsored by the Weatherhead Center for International Affairs at Harvard and offered me invaluable advice in a most comprehensive and constructive manner: William Alford, Bear Braumoeller, Jeff Frieden, Jack Goldsmith, Ryan Goodman, Daniel Ho, Robert Keohane, Lisa Martin, Kathryn Sikkink, and Richard Steinberg. Many other individuals read parts of the manuscript and gave me additional advice, including Philip Alston, Jacqueline Bhabha, Daniel Bodansky, Antonia Chayes, Jeff Checkel, Xinyuan Dai, Allison Danner, Andreas Føllesdal, Andrew Guzman, Emelie Hafner-Burton, Moonhawk Kim, Benedict Kingsbury, Charles Lipson, Paulette Lloyd, Dinah Shelton, Duncan Snidal, Sidney Tarrow, Geir Ulfstein, Jana von Stein, Joseph Weiler, and David Weissbrodt. I have also benefited from methodological discussions with James Alt and Gary King. Several scholars were generous in sharing data with me, including Emelie Hafner-Burton, Oona Hathaway, Kristian Gleditsch, Rachel McCleary, and Christine Min Wotipka. None of these persons are responsible for the mistakes and choices reflected in the final product.

Students have been essential to this project in a number of ways. They asked me the right questions at the right times: Why should we think that international law affects governments’ human rights practices? They provided enthusiastic
research assistance. More than two dozen students – graduates and undergraduates – have been involved to one degree or another in the research. I hope they have learned as much from participating in this project as I gained from their involvement. The University of California Berkeley’s Undergraduate Research Apprentice Program provided me a well-qualified flow of undergraduate students willing to collect and code data, run to the library, and collect literature. It is a model program in which the faculty member mentors students in the ways of scholarly research for course credit. Through this program, I benefited from the research help of Meghana Acharya, Inbal Baum, Ivana Cingel, Nancy Jen, Karina Juarez, Mimi Kong, Olga Kotlyarevskaya, Brad LeVeck, Naz Modirzadeh, Nicole Skibola, Julia Stuart, Monica Swanson, Elena Virgadamo, Kay Vobis, and Debbie Won. I greatly enjoyed teaching students in this way, and my research has been strengthened as a result.

Several Harvard undergraduates assisted with research, often with WCFIA funding, including Tamar Ayrikyan, Jieun Baek, Merve Emre, Ashley Grand, Anika Grubbs, and Matthew Roller. Law students and graduate students at Harvard provided legal research. Asif Efrat researched Israeli Supreme Court cases, and Laura Pedraza did the same for Chile. Yevgeniy Kirpichevsky assisted with some Stata issues and discussed general concepts. I also had excellent summer assistance from a number of students, including Nicholas Fram, Edgar Morales, Koppel Verma, and especially Eugen Lamprecht, who spent three months collecting and coding original data on child soldiers for this project.

I am also exceedingly grateful to the large number of university departments, schools, and research centers around the country and beyond that invited me to present sections of my research in progress. I presented parts of the manuscripts at a number of law schools, including those at New York University, Harvard, the University of California at Berkeley, the University of Georgia, Georgetown, Columbia, and the University of California at Los Angeles. I was also fortunate to get feedback and comments from faculty and students in the social sciences at the University of Pennsylvania, Stanford, the University of Minnesota, Dartmouth, St. Louis University, the State University of New York at Buffalo, the University of Michigan, Oxford University, the University of Chicago, Tufts University, Arizona State University, and Indiana University. International scholars provided useful feedback on early drafts as well. These included scholars associated with the Royal Complutense College at Harvard and the Centro de Investigación y Docencia Económicas (CIDE), Mexico City; participants in the Kandersteg, Switzerland, Conference on Constitutionalism; and especially the Norwegian Center for Human Rights, Oslo, where Andreas Føllesdal arranged a two-day discussion of the manuscript draft. The book was also discussed at the annual meeting of the New England Political Science Association in 2006, where M. J. Peterson was the discussant, and at the International Studies Association meeting in 2007, where I received useful comments from Michael Byers, Charli Carpenter, and Claudia Dahlerus.
Acknowledgments

Harvard University has been an ideal environment in which to develop and complete this project. The Harvard Government Department generously supported my attendance at annual conferences, where I was able to present my research to the broader scholarly community. The Weatherhead Center for International Affairs directly supported my work in several ways: by sponsoring undergraduate research assistance, by providing the opportunity to present my work to Center affiliates and staff, and by organizing and financing the book conference mentioned previously. The WCFIA staff also supported me in innumerable ways and contributed to a setting where it is truly possible to concentrate on research. I received excellent assistance in the final preparation of the manuscript, index, and bibliography from Marina Ivanova. Thanks also to Amanda Pearson, who proofread the final page proofs. The most consistent long-term assistance I had on this project was from Alexander Noonan, who for four years assisted with every phase of the manuscript preparation, from research to editing to general discussion about the ideas. As I have said about five times a day for the past four years, “Thanks, Alex!”

Several people at Cambridge University Press were helpful in producing this book. I am grateful to Lewis Bateman for encouragement and advice on the manuscript. Helen Greenberg, copy editor, and Helen Wheeler, production editor, did excellent work converting the manuscript into the book.

My greatest personal debt, of course, is to my family: Bruce Jackan, Charles, Claire, Sara, and Grandy. They found every possible way to allow me to concentrate on this long-term task. I hope they are pleased with the result.

Finally, for all of his guidance over the past two decades, I am deeply grateful to Robert O. Keohane. His work inspired my interest in international institutions, and his dedication to intellectual rigor, collegiality, and principles of international justice and legitimacy continue to inspire me to this day. For being the best mentor ever, this book is dedicated to him.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACHR</td>
<td>African [Banjul] Charter on Human and Peoples’ Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAT</td>
<td>Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEDAW</td>
<td>Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CERD</td>
<td>Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIA</td>
<td>Central Intelligence Agency (United States)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COPACHI</td>
<td>Cooperative Committee for Peace in Chile (Comite de Cooperacion para la Paz en Chile)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPT</td>
<td>European Convention for the Prevention of Torture and Inhumane or Degrading Treatment or Punishment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRC</td>
<td>Convention on the Rights of the Child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSW</td>
<td>Commission on the Status of Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEDAW</td>
<td>Declaration on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECOSOC</td>
<td>Economic and Social Council (United Nations)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EEOL</td>
<td>Equal Employment Opportunity Law (Japan)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GAVI</td>
<td>Global Alliance for Vaccines and Immunization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IACPPT</td>
<td>Inter-American Convention to Prevent and Punish Torture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IADJ</td>
<td>International Association of Democratic Jurists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICCPR</td>
<td>International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICESCR</td>
<td>International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICJ</td>
<td>International Commission of Jurists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labor Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMF</td>
<td>International Monetary Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIR</td>
<td>Revolutionary Left Movement (Chile; Movimiento de Izquierda Revolucionaria)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Abbreviations

NAACP National Association for the Advancement of Colored People
NCW National Commission for Women (India)
NGO Non-governmental organization
OAU Organization for African Unity
OECD Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development
OP Optional Protocol
OPCAC Optional Protocol Relating to Children in Armed Conflict
PTA Preferential Trade Agreement
UDHR Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN United Nations
UNCHR United Nations Commission on Human Rights
UNGA United Nations General Assembly
UNHCHR United Nations High Commissioner on Human Rights
UNICEF United Nations Children’s Fund
US United States
USAID United States Agency for International Development
USSR Union of Soviet Socialist Republics
WTO World Trade Organization
WWIN Working Women’s International Network