The Economics of Health Equity

This book is about equity in health and health care. It explores why, despite being seen as an important goal, health equity has not made more progress within countries and globally, what needs to change for there to be greater success in delivering fairness. An international team of eminent expert from primarily the field of health economics describe how equity in health and health care might develop over the next decade. They examine existing and past barriers to promoting equity, citing case examples and covering issues including access to health services and inequalities between and within countries. The analyses are detailed, but the issues are approached in an accessible fashion, highlighting the factors of common international relevance. This book provides a manifesto for achieving health equity for the future. It will be essential reading for health and social policy makers nationally and internationally.

Di McIntyre is Associate Professor of Health Economics, in the Health Economics Unit at the University of Cape Town, South Africa.

Gavin Mooney is Director of the Social and Public Health Economics Research Group (SPHERE), and Professor of Health Economics at Curtin University in Perth, Australia.
The Economics of Health Equity

Edited by

Di McIntyre

Gavin Mooney
To all those who suffer from health inequities
and all those who labour to reduce these inequities.
Contents

Contributors .......................... page ix
Biographies ............................. xi
Acknowledgements .................... xvi

Section 1 Introduction ................. 1
1 Why this book? 
Gavin Mooney and Di McIntyre .......... 3

Section 2 Equity in general ............ 11
2 Health and health inequalities in a neo-liberal global world 
David Coburn and Elaine S. Coburn .... 13
3 Governing the market in health care: the social and political requirements 
Amiya Kumar Bagchi .................... 36
4 Equity in the context of diversity of culture and diversity of economic systems 
Gavin Mooney ............................ 59
5 Beware of the libertarian wolf in the clothing of the egalitarian sheep: an essay on the need to clarify ends and means 
Alan Maynard ............................ 77

Section 3 Health service access ......... 101
6 Exploring the dimensions of access 
Michael Thiede, Patricia Akweongo and Di McIntyre ... 103
7 Acceptability, trust and equity 
Lucy Gilson ............................... 124
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section 4 Equity and health systems</th>
<th>149</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8 International migration and extreme health inequality: robust arguments and institutions for international redistribution in health care</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maureen Mackintosh</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Pay the piper and call the tune: changing health care financing mechanisms to address public–private health sector mix inequities</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Di McIntyre</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section 5 Lessons from individual countries</th>
<th>197</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10 Equity in health financing, resource allocation and health service utilization in Brazil: past, present and future</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silvia Marta Porto, Claudia Travassos, Maria Alicia Domínguez Ugá and Isabela Soares Santos</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Improving health-related information systems to monitor equity in health: lessons from Thailand</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Viroj Tangcharoensathien, Supon Limwattananon and Phusit Prakongsai</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section 6 Future action</th>
<th>247</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12 Where now with equity?</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Di McIntyre and Gavin Mooney</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Index 269
Contributors

Patricia Akweongo
Navrongo Health Research Centre
Ministry of Health
PO Box 114
Navrongo, Upper East Region
Ghana

Amiya Kumar Bagchi
Director, Institute of Development Studies
Kolkata
Calcutta University Alipore Campus
1 Reformatory Street, Fifth Floor
Kolkata 700027
India

David Coburn
3161 Henderson Road
Victoria, B. C.
Canada V8P 5A3

Elaine Coburn
17 rue Nicot
59130 Lambersart
France

Lucy Gilson
Centre for Health Policy
University of the Witwatersrand
PO Box 1038
Johannesburg 2000
South Africa

Supon Limwattananon
39/75 Mooban Land and
House Parks
Soi Chollada 2
Thanon Lieng Muang
Amphoe Muang
Khon Kaen, 40000
Thailand

Maureen Mackintosh
Professor of Economics
Faculty of Social Sciences
The Open University
Walton Hall,
Milton Keynes MK7 6AA, UK

Alan Maynard
University of York
Department of Health Sciences
Area 2, First Floor
Seebohm Rowntree Building
York YO10 5DD, UK

Di McIntyre
School of Public Health and Family
Medicine
University of Cape Town
Anzio Road
Observatory 7925
Cape Town
South Africa
List of contributors

Gavin Mooney  
Director of Social and Public Health Economics Research Group  
Curtin University  
Bentley Campus  
Room 436 Bldg 400  
Perth WA 6845  
Australia

Silvia Marta Porto  
Escola Nacional de Saúde Pública, ENSP/FIOCRUZ  
Rua Leopoldo Bulhões, 1480  
Rio de Janeiro, RJ – 21041-210  
Brazil

Phusit Prakongsai  
77/93 Krittikorn Mansion  
Lad Phrao Soi 3  
Lad Phrao Road  
Chatuchak district  
Bangkok, 10900  
Thailand

Isabela Soares Santos  
Agência Nacional de Saúde Suplementar, ANS  
Av. General Justo, 26 – Rio de Janeiro  
Brazil

Viroj Tangcharoensathien  
376 Mooban Panya  
Patanakan Road  
Suangluang  
Bangkok, 10250  
Thailand

Michael Thiede  
Health Economics Unit  
Department of Public Health and Family Medicine  
University of Cape Town  
Health Sciences Faculty  
Anzio Road  
Observatory 7925  
Cape Town  
South Africa

Claudia Travassos  
Fundação Oswaldo Cruz (Oswaldo Cruz Foundation)  
Avenida Brasil 4365  
Pavilhão Haity Moussatché  
Room 214  
Manguinhos 21045-900  
Rio de Janeiro  
Brazil

Maria Alicia Domínguez Ugá  
Escola Nacional de Saúde Pública, ENSP/FIOCRUZ  
Rua Leopoldo Bulhões, 1480  
Rio de Janeiro, RJ – 21041-210  
Brazil
Biographies

Patricia Akweongo works as a Research Fellow at the Navrongo Health Research Centre/Ghana Health Service in Ghana. Her research focuses on poverty-related diseases and reproductive health. Dr Akweongo has a specific interest in health reform and health equity issues in the context of low- and middle-income countries. She has a Ph.D. in health economics from the University of Cape Town, South Africa.

Amiya Kumar Bagchi is the Director of the Institute of Development Studies, Kolkata. He has taught, researched and guided research in many institutions and universities including Presidency College, Kolkata, University of Cambridge (UK), University of Bristol (UK), Cornell University (USA), Trent University (Canada), Roskilde University (Denmark) and Maison de Sciences de l'Homme, Paris. He was formerly the Reserve Bank of India Professor of Economics and the Director of the Centre for Studies in Social Sciences, Calcutta. He has written several books, the most recent of which include: Maladies, Preventives and Curatives: Debates in Public Health in India (Tulika, New Delhi, 2005) and The Perilous Passage: Mankind and the Global Ascendancy of Capital (Lanham, Maryland, USA: Rowman and Littlefield, 2005). His research interests include finance, human development issues and other aspects of development and the prospects of democracy in a globalizing world.

2001). His current interests lie in the area of globalization, neo-liberalism and health, particularly how these relate to theories of the links between income inequality and health and amongst economies, societies and health in the context of development.

Elaine Coburn (Ph.D. Sociology) is an Assistant Professor at the American University of Paris and Associate Researcher at the Centre d’analyse et d’intervention sociologiques (CADIS) at the Ecole des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales. Her research focuses on neo-liberal globalization, especially its ideological justifications, as well as global protest against it. Among more recent research interests is a concern with the ontological, epistemological and ethical questions associated with qualitative methodology.

Lucy Gilson has a background in health and development economics and works as a health policy and systems researcher, primarily in Southern and Eastern Africa. She has a particular interest in health and health care equity, and her research has focused on issues of health care financing, organization, management and policy change. Her current research interests include concern for the role of trust in health systems, and in relation to equity. She has published a range of papers and book chapters in these areas, and has also been involved in various capacity building activities. She is currently an Associate Professor in the University of Witwatersrand, South Africa and Professor of Health Policy and Systems in the London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, UK.

Lucy Gilson is part funded by the Consortium for Research on Equitable Health Systems (CREHS), which receives financial support from the UK’s Department for International Development. The views expressed here are, however, her own.

Supon Limwattananon (MPHM, Ph.D.), an Associate Professor from Khon Kaen University, earned his Ph.D. in Social and Administrative Pharmacy from the University of Minnesota, USA in 2000. His research areas of interest include pharmaceutical economics and health services research. He joined the International Health Policy Programme (IHPP) in 2005 to participate in two research projects in the health equity area. The EU-funded EQUITAP (Equity in Asia-Pacific) Project demonstrated the equity achievements of universal health care coverage and the World Bank/ASEM Trust Fund’s Monitoring and Evaluation of Health Equity Project explored the readiness of the health information system for equity monitoring and evaluation.

Maureen Mackintosh is Professor of Economics at the Open University, UK. Her research interests are in the economics of markets for ‘social’ goods including health care. She is currently collaborating with Tanzanian, Indian and Finnish colleagues on research on improving access by the poor to good-quality low-cost medicines. Recent publications include: Mackintosh, M. and Koivusalo, M. (eds.) Commercialisation of Health Care: Global and Local Dynamics and Policy Responses
(Palgrave, 2005); and Tibandebage P and Mackintosh M. ‘The market shaping of charges, trust and abuse: health care transactions in Tanzania’ (Social Science and Medicine 61: 2005).

Alan Maynard is Professor of Health Economics at the University of York, England. He is also Adjunct Professor in the Centre for Health Economics and Research Evaluation (CHERE), Technology University of Sydney, Australia. He was Founding Director of the Graduate Health Economics Programme at York (1977–83) and subsequently Founding Director of the Centre for Health Economics at York (1983–95). He is a Founding Editor of Health Economics, a journal now in its 15th year. He has worked as a consultant for national and international agencies in over 20 countries including Bolivia, China, Kyrgyzstan and Malawi. He has been involved in NHS management since 1983 and has been chairman of a NHS hospital, with 700 beds and an annual turnover of £170mn, since 1997. He has published extensively in journals, written and edited a dozen books and remains fascinated by health policy processes and the reluctance of decision-makers to translate evidence into practice.

Di McIntyre (Ph.D.) is an Associate Professor at the University of Cape Town, South Africa. She founded the Health Economics Unit in 1990, and was Director of this Unit for 13 years. She has served on numerous policy committees and has extensive research, technical support and capacity development experience, both within South Africa and other parts of the African region. Her particular research and technical support experience relates to health care financing (especially user fees and social health insurance); health equity issues; resource allocation (including needs-based formulae and fiscal federalism issues); public–private mix issues and pharmaceutical regulation.

Gavin Mooney is Director of the Social and Public Health Economics Research Group (SPHERE), Professor of Health Economics at Curtin University in Perth, Australia, Visiting Professor at the Centre for Health and Humanity at Aarhus University (Denmark) and Honorary Professor at the Health Economics Unit at the University of Cape Town. He was the Founding Director of the Health Economics Research Unit at the University of Aberdeen in Scotland. Gavin has well over 200 publications in health economics, including 20 books, and has lectured in nearly 30 countries. He has a strong interest in equity in health care, particularly with respect to Aboriginal health, and in the economics of the social determinants of health. In recent years he has become particularly interested in communitarianism and using this philosophy in the economics of health, especially with respect to equity.

Silvia Marta Porto (M.Sc. Public Administration, Ph.D. Public Health) is a Senior Researcher at the Brazilian National School of Public Health (Escola Nacional de Saúde Pública, ENSP/FIOCRUZ). She teaches and undertakes research in health
economics, mainly related to health care financing. She has served as the President of the Brazilian Association on Health Economics since 2002.

Phusit Prakongsai (M.D. Mahidol University, Certificate in Preventive Medicine Thai Medical Council) has ten years of field experience in public health and health service management at three district hospitals in rural areas of Thailand. He was the principal investigator of several research projects on health policy, health insurance and health care finance at the International Health Policy Program, Thailand. Currently, he is doing a Ph.D. in Public Health and Policy at the London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine with the thesis topic of ‘Equity in health care finance and benefit incidence analysis before and after universal health care coverage in Thailand’.

Isabela Soares Santos is a technician at the National Agency of Private Health Insurance (ANS/MOH) in Brazil. She is currently undertaking her doctorate in Health Economics and Public Health at the National School of Public Health/Oswaldo Cruz Foundation (MOH/Brazil), where she obtained her master’s degree (dissertation entitled ‘Health insurance for employees’). She has been working on issues relating to the public–private mix in the Brazilian health system and on the analysis of the equity of Brazilian health sector financing. She teaches Administration, Planning and Health Politics on Private Insurance at Getulio Varga’s Foundation’s M.B.A.

Viroj Tangcharoensathien (M.D., Ph.D.) is Director of the International Health Policy Program in the Ministry of Public Health, Thailand. He received the 1991 Woodruff Medal Award for an outstanding Ph.D. thesis of the London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine (entitled ‘Community financing: the urban health card in Chiangmai, Thailand’). Upon his return, he focused on research into health care financing, health insurance development and equity in health. He initiated and updates the National Health Accounts and National AIDS Accounts. He works closely with decision-makers in the Ministry of Public Health and other government departments, while maintaining his independence as a policy researcher, and undertakes consultancies and capacity building activities as well as technical support for countries in the region.

Michael Thiede is an Associate Professor and the Director of the Health Economics Unit at the University of Cape Town, South Africa. He is conducting research on health care inequities, pro-poor strategies in health reform and the economics of pharmaceutical markets. His teaching focus is on microeconomics for the health sector. As a health economist, Dr Thiede has been involved in research-to-policy transfer in both Germany and South Africa, where he has served as a member of different committees providing support to the national Department of Health. His work experience as a consultant for public and private sector clients includes projects in pharmaceutical pricing strategies, hospital
management and issues relating to the public–private mix. He received his Ph.D. in economics from the University of Kiel, Germany.

**Claudia Travassos** (M.D., M.P.H., Ph.D. in Public Administration) is a Senior Researcher at the Center of Scientific and Technological Information (Centro de Informação Científica e Tecnológica, CICT/FIOCRUZ). She teaches and undertakes research in Health Care Service Research. She is currently a member of the Executive Board of the International Society of Equity on Health (ISEqH).

**Maria Alicia Domínguez Ugá** (M.Sc. Economics, Ph.D. in Public Health) is a Senior Researcher at the Brazilian National School of Public Health (Escola Nacional de Saúde Pública, ENSP/FIOCRUZ). She teaches and undertakes research in health economics, mainly in relation to health care financing. She was previously the President of the Brazilian Association on Health Economics. She currently leads the Department on Health Planning and Administration of ENSP/FIOCRUZ.
Acknowledgements

We are grateful to all our contributors not only for their contributions but for sticking so well to the deadlines we set and for accepting so willingly our suggestions on their drafts. What a delightful bunch to work with!

Di thanks the staff of HEU for all their support; Gavin thanks Val Reid for her assistance.

Our thanks to Betty Fulford and Dawn Preston at CUP for their help.

Finally, we are, most of all, grateful to our partners, Louise and Del, for their encouragement, patience and love.

Di McIntyre, Cape Town December 2006
Gavin Mooney, Perth December 2006

All royalties from this book will go towards scholarships to provide some financial assistance for students undertaking the Online Postgraduate Diploma in Health Economics, initially developed by Gavin Mooney at Curtin University and now being run by the Health Economics Unit at the University of Cape Town.