

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO
THE TRINITY

How do Christians reconcile their belief in one God with the concept of three divine "persons"? This *Companion* provides an overview of how the Christian doctrine of the Trinity has been understood and articulated in the last two thousand years. The trinitarian theologies of key theologians, from the New Testament to the twenty-first century, are carefully examined, and the doctrine of the Trinity is brought into dialogue with non-Christian religions as well as with other Christian beliefs. Authors from a range of denominational backgrounds explore the importance of trinitarian thought, locating the Trinity within the wider context of systematic theology. Contemporary theology has seen a widespread revival of the doctrine of the Trinity, and this book incorporates the most recent developments in the scholarship.

Peter C. Phan holds the Ignacio Ellacuría Chair of Catholic Social Thought in the Department of Theology at Georgetown University. He is the author of numerous books including *Christianity with an Asian Face* (2003), *In Our Own Tongues: Asian Perspectives on Mission and Inculturation* (2004), and *Being Religious Interreligiously* (2004).



#### CAMBRIDGE COMPANIONS TO RELIGION

A series of companions to major topics and key figures in theology and religious studies. Each volume contains specially commissioned chapters by international scholars which provide an accessible and stimulating introduction to the subject for new readers and non-specialists.

Other titles in the series

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO CHRISTIAN DOCTRINE

edited by Colin Gunton (1997)

ISBN 0 521 47118 4 hardback ISBN 0 521 47695 x paperback

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO BIBLICAL INTERPRETATION

edited by John Barton (1998)

ISBN 0 521 48144 9 hardback ISBN 0 521 48593 2 paperback

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO DIETRICH BONHOEFFER

edited by John de Gruchy (1999)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO KARL BARTH

edited by John Webster (2000)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO CHRISTIAN ETHICS

edited by Robin Gill (2001)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO JESUS edited by Markus Bockmuehl (2001)

ISBN 0 521 79261 4 hardback ISBN 0 521 79678 4 paperback

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO FEMINIST THEOLOGY

edited by Susan Frank Parsons (2002)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO MARTIN LUTHER

edited by Donald K. McKim (2003)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO ST PAUL

edited by James D. G. Dunn (2003)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO POSTMODERN THEOLOGY

edited by Kevin J. Vanhoozer (2003)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO JOHN CALVIN

edited by Donald K. McKim (2004)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO HANS URS VON BALTHASAR

edited by Edward T. Oakes, SJ and David Moss (2004)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO REFORMATION THEOLOGY

edited by David Bagchi and David Steinmetz (2004)



THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO AMERICAN JUDAISM

edited by Dana Evan Kaplan (2005)

ISBN 0 521 82204 I hardback ISBN 0 521 52951 4 paperback

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO KARL RAHNER edited by Declan Marmion and Mary E. Hines (2005)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO FRIEDRICH SCHLEIERMACHER

edited by Jacqueline Mariña (2005)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO THE GOSPELS

edited by Stephen C. Barton (2006)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO THE QUR'AN

edited by Jane Dammen McAuliffe (2006)

ISBN 0 521 83160 I hardback ISBN 0 521 53934 x paperback

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO JONATHAN EDWARDS

edited by Stephen J. Stein (2007)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO EVANGELICAL THEOLOGY

edited by Timothy Larsen and Daniel J. Trier (2007)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO MODERN JEWISH PHILOSOPHY

edited by Michael L. Morgan and Peter Eli Gordon (2007)

ISBN 0 521 81312 3 hardback ISBN 0 521 01255 4 paperback

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO THE TALMUD AND RABBINIC LITERATURE

edited by Charlotte E. Fonrobert and Martin S. Jaffee (2007)

ISBN 0 521 84390 I hardback ISBN 0 521 60508 3 paperback

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO LIBERATION THEOLOGY

second edition edited by Christopher Rowland (2007)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO THE JESUITS

edited by Thomas Worcester (2008)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO CLASSICAL ISLAMIC THEOLOGY

edited by Tim Winter (2008)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO PURITANISM

edited by John Coffey and Paul Lim (2008)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO ORTHODOX CHRISTIAN THEOLOGY

edited by Mary Cunningham and Elizabeth Theokritoff (2008)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO PAUL TILLICH

edited by Russell Re Manning (2009)



THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO JOHN HENRY NEWMAN

edited by Ian Ker and Terrence Merrigan (2009)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO JOHN WESLEY

edited by Randy L. Maddox and Jason E. Vickers (2010)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO CHRISTIAN PHILOSOPHICAL THEOLOGY

edited by Charles Taliaferro and Chad Meister (2010)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO MUHAMMAD

edited by Jonathan E. Brockopp (2010)

ISBN 9780521886079 hardback ISBN 9780521713726 paperback

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO SCIENCE AND RELIGION

edited by Peter Harrison (2010)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO GANDHI

edited by Judith Brown and Anthony Parel (2011)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO THOMAS MORE

edited by George Logan (2011)

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO MIRACLES

edited by Graham H. Twelftree (2011)

ISBN 9780521899864 hardback ISBN 9780521728515 paperback

### Forthcoming

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO FRANCIS OF ASSISI edited by Michael J. P. Robson

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO NEW RELIGIOUS MOVEMENTS edited by Olay Hammer and Mikael Rothstein

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO BLACK THEOLOGY edited by Dwight Hopkins and Edward Antonio



THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO

# THE TRINITY

Edited by Peter C. Phan





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521877398

© Cambridge University Press 2011

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2011

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

The Cambridge companion to the Trinity / edited by Peter C. Phan.
p. cm. – (Cambridge companions to religion)
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-0-521-87739-8 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-70113-6 (pbk.)
I. Trinity – History of doctrines. I. Phan, Peter C., 1943–
BTIII.3.C35 2011
231'.044 – dc22 2011015545
ISBN 978-0-521-87739-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

ISBN 978-0-521-70113-6 Paperback



## Contents

Notes on contributors page ix Preface xiii

#### Part I: Introduction

- I Developments of the doctrine of the Trinity 3
  PETER C. PHAN
- 2 Systematic issues in trinitarian theology 13 PETER C. PHAN

# Part II: Retrieving the sources

- 3 Like a finger pointing to the moon: exploring the Trinity in/and the New Testament 33
  ELAINE M. WAINWRIGHT
- 4 The Trinity in the Greek Fathers 49 JOHN ANTHONY McGUCKIN
- 5 Latin trinitarian theology 70 MICHEL RENÉ BARNES

#### Part III: Renewing the tradition

- 6 God as the mystery of sharing and shared love: Thomas Aquinas on the Trinity 87 ANSELM KYONGSUK MIN
- 7 The Trinity in Bonaventure 108 KENAN B. OSBORNE
- 8 The Trinity in the Protestant Reformation: continuity within discontinuity 128
  YOUNG-HO CHUN
- 9 Between history and speculation: Christian trinitarian thinking after the Reformation 149 CHRISTINE HELMER

vii



#### viii Contents

## Part IV: Contemporary theologians

- 10 Karl Barth, reconciliation, and the Triune God 173
  PETER GOODWIN HELTZEL AND CHRISTIAN T.
  COLLINS WINN
- II Mystery of grace and salvation: Karl Rahner's theology of the Trinity 192 PETER C. PHAN
- 12 Hans Urs von Balthasar on the Trinity 208 KAREN KILBY
- The trinitarian doctrines of Jürgen Moltmann and Wolfhart Pannenberg in the context of contemporary discussion 223
- 14 Sophia, apophasis, and communion: the Trinity in contemporary Orthodox theology 243ARISTOTLE PAPANIKOLAOU
- The life-giving reality of God from black, Latin American,
   and US Hispanic theological perspectives 259
   MIGUEL H. DÍAZ
- 16 Feminist theologies and the Trinity 274 PATRICIA A. FOX

## Part V: In dialogue with other religions

- 17 The Tao in Confucianism and Taoism: the Trinity in East Asian perspective 293 HEUP YOUNG KIM
- 18 Trinity and Hinduism 309 FRANCIS X. CLOONEY, SJ
- 19 Primordial Vow: reflections on the Holy Trinity in light of dialogue with Pure Land Buddhism 325 JAMES L. FREDERICKS
- 20 Trinity in Judaism and Islam 344 DAVID B. BURRELL

# Part VI: Systematic connections

- 21 Trinity, Christology, and pneumatology 365
  ANNE HUNT
- 22 The Trinity in the liturgy, sacraments, and mysticism 381 SUSAN K. WOOD
- 23 The Trinity and socio-political ethics 398
  DALE T. IRVIN

Index 414



# Notes on contributors

Michel René Barnes is Associate Professor of Historical Theology at Marquette University, Milwaukee, Wisconsin, USA. He received his doctorate from the University of St. Michael's College, Toronto, Ontario, Canada. Dr. Barnes is the author of many articles on Augustine's trinitarian theology and a monograph on Gregory of Nyssa's trinitarian theology, The Power of God: Dunamis in Gregory of Nyssa's Trinitarian Theology, and edited, with D. H. Williams, Arianism after Arius. He has recently published on Irenaeus' trinitarian theology, and has written a study of Christian pneumatology in the first two centuries.

**Young-Ho Chun**, Ph.D., is Professor of Systematic Theology at Saint Paul School of Theology, Kansas City. He was educated in South Korea, the USA, and Germany. He authored *Tillich and Religion: Toward a Theology of World Religions* and contributed numerous chapters to the Lit-Verlag series Tillich-Studien.

Francis X. Clooney, SJ, a Roman Catholic priest and a member of the Society of Jesus, joined Harvard Divinity School in 2005. His primary areas of scholarship are theological commentarial writings in the Sanskrit and Tamil traditions of Hindu India and comparative theology. Professor Clooney is the author of numerous articles and books, including Hindu God, Christian God; Divine Mother, Blessed Mother: Hindu Goddesses and the Virgin Mary, Jesuit Postmodern: Scholarship, Vocation, and Identity in the 21st Century; Beyond Compare: St. Francis and Sri Vedanta Desika on Loving Surrender to God; and The Truth, the Way, the Life: Christian Commentary on the Three Holy Mantras of the Srivaisnava Hindus.

**Miguel H. Díaz,** Ph.D., is currently US Ambassador to the Holy See. He was Professor of Systematic Theology at the College of Saint Benedict and Saint John's University in Collegeville, Minnesota. He has published a number of articles and is co-editor of the book *From the Heart of our People: Latino/a Explorations in Systematic Theology* and author of *On Being Human: U.S. Hispanic and Rahnerian Perspectives*.

**Patricia A. Fox** has studied systematic theology at Catholic Theological Union, Chicago, and at Flinders University, South Australia. She has been involved in secondary and tertiary education, as well as in formation, spiritual direction and retreat work. She has held leadership positions within the Institute of the



#### x Notes on contributors

Sisters of Mercy of Australia and the Archdiocese of Adelaide. She is presently teaching at Flinders University and the Adelaide College of Divinity and is director of a ministry formation program for the Catholic archdiocese based on that campus.

James L. Fredericks, Ph.D., is a faculty member in the Department of Theological Studies at Loyola Marymount University. He is a specialist in interreligious dialogue, especially the dialogue between Buddhism and Christianity. In addition to publishing many articles, he is the author of *Faith among Faiths: Christian Theology and the Non-Christian Religions* and *Buddhists and Christians: Through Comparative Theology to a New Solidarity*.

Christine Helmer is Professor of Religious Studies and Adjunct Professor of German at Northwestern University. She is author of *The Trinity and Martin Luther* and is editor (or co-editor) of numerous volumes in the areas of Schleiermacher studies, philosophy of religion, and biblical theology. Her most recent publications are an edited volume, *The Global Luther: A Theologian for Modern Times*, an essay on Schleiermacher in *The Blackwell Companion to Nineteenth-Century Theology* (edited by David Fergusson), and an essay on theology's contribution to the contemporary study of religion in *The Cambridge Companion to Religious Studies* (edited by Robert A. Orsi).

**Peter Goodwin Heltzel** is Assistant Professor of Theology at New York Theological Seminary. An ordained minister in the Christian Church (Disciples of Christ), he is the author of *Jesus and Justice: Evangelicals, Race and Politics.* His edited volumes include *Chalice Introduction to Disciples Theology and Theology in Global Context.* 

**Anne Hunt** is Dean of the Faculty of Theology and Philosophy at Australian Catholic University. In addition to her many publications on trinitarian theology, she has an interest in the visual arts as a powerful medium for communicating the mysteries of faith. Her latest book is *Trinity: Insights from the Mystics*.

**Dale T. Irvin** is President and Professor of World Christianity at New York Theological Seminary in New York City. A graduate of Princeton Theological Seminary and Union Theological Seminary in New York, he is the author of several books, including *History of the World Christian Movement*, with Scott W. Sunquist. Over the past several decades his articles have appeared in a number of journals such as *Christianity Today*, *Christian Century*, *The Ecumenical Review*, and *The Journal of Pentecostal Studies*. He is a founding editor of *The Journal of World Christianity* and serves on the editorial board of *The Living Pulpit*.

**Veli-Matti Kärkkäinen** (Dr. Theol. Habil., University of Helsinki) is Professor of Systematic Theology at Fuller Theological Seminary and Docent of Ecumenics at the University of Helsinki. A native of Finland, he has taught theology in Thailand. The author of a dozen scholarly books, among which are *Trinity and Religious Pluralism* and *The Trinity: Global Perspectives*, as well as more than one hundred articles, Dr. Kärkkäinen has participated widely in the theological,



Notes on contributors xi

missiological, and interfaith work of the World Council of Churches and Faith and Order as well in several bilateral ecumenical dialogues.

**Karen Kilby** is an Associate Professor in Systematic Theology in the Department of Theology and Religious Studies in the University of Nottingham, where she also served as head of the department. She has previously written on the thought of Karl Rahner, on the relationship between Rahner and Balthasar, and on the doctrine of the Trinity. Her latest book is *Balthasar: A Very Critical Introduction*.

**Heup Young Kim** is Professor of Systematic Theology and a former Dean of the College of Humanities and the Graduate School of Theology, Kangnam University, Korea. He has published numerous works in the areas of interfaith dialogue, theology of religions, Asian theology, and theology and science, in both English and Korean, including *Wang Yang-ming and Karl Barth: A Confucian—Christian Dialogue; Toward a Theology of the Tao; Christ and the Tao*; and Contemporary Natural Sciences and Christianity.

**John A. McGuckin** is the Nielsen Professor of Patristic and Byzantine Thought at Union Theological Seminary and Columbia University New York. He has written extensively on New Testament and early Christian thought. He is a priest of the Romanian Orthodox Church.

Anselm Kyongsuk Min has been Professor of Philosophy of Religion and Theology at Claremont Graduate University in Southern California since 1992. He is the author of several books including Paths to the Triune God: An Encounter between Aquinas and Recent Theologies; The Solidarity of Others in a Divided World: A Postmodern Theology After Postmodernism; and The Dialectic of Salvation: Issues in Theology of Liberation, as well as of many articles on Hegel, postmodernism, liberation theology, pluralism, and Asian and Korean theologies.

**Kenan B. Osborne**, a Franciscan, has been a professor of systematic theology at the Franciscan School of Theology, part of the Graduate Theological Union, Berkeley, California, since 1968. He received his D.Theol. degree from Ludwig-Maximilians Universität, Munich, Germany, in 1967. He is a former president of the Catholic Theological Society of America. In 2002 he received the John Courtney Murray Award from this same society. He has written eighteen books and numerous articles on theological subjects. He is now an emeritus professor.

**Aristotle Papanikolaou** is Associate Professor of Theology in the Department of Theology and Co-Founding Director of the Orthodox Christian Studies Program at Fordham University, New York. He is the author of *Being with God: Trinity, Apophaticism, and Divine—Human Communion,* co-editor (with George Demacopoulos) of *Orthodox Readings of Augustine,* and co-editor (with Elizabeth Prodromou) of *Thinking through Faith: New Perspectives from Orthodox Christian Scholars.* 

**Peter C. Phan** went to the USA as a refugee from Vietnam in 1975. Currently he is the holder of the Ignacio Ellacuría Chair of Catholic Social Thought at



#### xii Notes on contributors

Georgetown University. He has earned three doctorates and received two honorary doctorates. His fields of research include systematic theology, interreligious dialogue, and missiology. He has authored and edited over twenty books and published more than 300 articles. His book on Karl Rahner's eschatology won the Best Book Award from the College Theology Society in 1989, and his book on Alexandre de Rhodes was given the first place by the Catholic Publishers Association in 1999.

Elaine M. Wainwright is Inaugural Professor of Theology and Head of the School of Theology at the University of Auckland, New Zealand, a post she has held for the last six years. She is a New Testament scholar specializing in the gospel of Matthew, biblical hermeneutics, and feminist, postcolonial, and ecological interpretations of biblical texts. Her current research is an ecological reading of the gospel of Matthew. Among her recent publications are Shall We Look for Another? A Feminist Rereading of the Matthean Jesus and Women Healing/Healing Women: The Genderization of Healing in Early Christianity.

**Christian T. Collins Winn** is Associate Professor of Historical and Systematic Theology at Bethel University in St. Paul, Minnesota. He is the editor of *From the Margins: A Celebration of the Theological Work of Donald W. Dayton*; author of "Jesus is Victor!" The Significance of the Blumhardts for the Theology of Karl Barth; and the series editor of The Blumhardts: Texts and Reception.

**Susan K. Wood,** Ph.D., is professor and chair of the Department of Theology at Marquette University. She is an associate editor of *Pro ecclesia* and serves on the editorial advisory board of the journal *Ecclesiology*. Most of her writings explore the connections between ecclesiology and sacramental theology. In addition to numerous articles, she has published *Spiritual Exegesis and the Church in the Theology of Henri de Lubac; Sacramental Orders*; and *One Baptism: Ecumenical Dimensions of the Doctrine of Baptism*; and is the editor of *Ordering the Baptismal Priesthood*.



## **Preface**

The subject matter of this book is the Trinity, now widely acknowledged to be a mystery of salvation and the central Christian belief. That the Triune God is so now may be a commonplace, but that has not always been the case. One of the pleasant surprises in contemporary theology is the widespread revival of the doctrine of the Trinity. Long shunted to the wings, the Trinity is now occupying center stage. Karl Rahner's oft-quoted bon mot that Christians are, theologically speaking, "mere monotheists" (that is, unitarians) may have been true in the 1960s and earlier. Fortunately, it is no longer so. Recently, a spate of books and articles on the Trinity by Catholic, Orthodox, and Protestant theologians has restored this neglected Christian doctrine to its rightful place. These works have not only retrieved the classical teachings on the Trinity through serious historical research, but have also given the lie to the claim that the trinitarian dogma is nothing more than abstruse metaphysics and a conundrum of "higher mathematics" of one-equals-three and vice versa. They have shown how trinitarian theology is necessary for a full understanding of such burning issues as the nature of the human person, suffering, sexism, ecology, social and economic justice, interreligious dialogue, and so on.

The twists and turns through which the Triune God migrated from the center to the periphery of Christian consciousness and back to the center again are recounted in the following pages. These winding paths make a fascinating story in themselves, along which readers now are invited to travel. The only thing to be stressed here is that this volume is intended to be a "companion" to those who wish to understand what Christians mean by the Trinity. It is not a manual, a textbook, a digest, or (the Triune) God forbid, a CliffsNotes of trinitarian theology. Each contributor would like to be a fellow traveler with the reader, or better still, to invoke the etymology of "companion" (com + panis), someone who shares bread, the bread of knowledge and friendship, with the readers, be they students or scholars.

xiii



xiv Preface

The volume itself has its own twists and turns of sorts. It began when Dr. Kate Brett, the senior editor at Cambridge University Press, approached me with the proposal to edit the *Companion*. Her thoughtfulness and gentleness persuaded me that it would be a worthwhile task. The book proposal went through the usual blind review process, and I am grateful to the anonymous reviewers for their helpful comments. Brett and I agreed that the contributors should not only represent a wide spectrum of theological views but also be balanced in terms of gender, ethnicity, and geography, to honor the global character of contemporary theology. Unfortunately, not every attempt to achieve these goals was successful, but the failure was not due to lack of will or occasional strong arm-twisting.

A number of administrative changes occurred at Cambridge University Press while the book was being worked on, and the hands overseeing the production of the volume changed several times. I am of course deeply grateful to Kate Brett for her gentle care and guidance. Gillian Dadd and, then, Aline Guillermet took over the editorial process with competence and diligence, and I am thankful to them for bringing the book to port.

Another person I would like to thank is Dr. Fiona Little. She is the copy editor any writer and publishing house can ever hope to have: detailed, sharp-eyed, timely, persistent, patient, kind. Shaping all these diverse essays into a consistent style and format was a colossal labor, and Fiona has achieved it with unparalleled professionalism and skills. However, any errors that may remain are my responsibility. I also thank Dr. Anh Tran for his help with indexing.

Of course, my deepest thanks go to the contributors themselves; without them the book would not have existed at all. In my correspondence with them I have always referred to it as "our Trinity book," and I meant it literally. Despite their busy writing schedules, they all have responded with generosity and alacrity to my request to write for the volume. No editor could have been more fortunate. May our friendship, and now our communion with our readers, be a sign, however feeble, of the *koinōnia* that unites the Three That Are One.

Peter C. Phan