How do Christians reconcile their belief in one God with the concept of three divine “persons”? This Companion provides an overview of how the Christian doctrine of the Trinity has been understood and articulated in the last two thousand years. The trinitarian theologies of key theologians, from the New Testament to the twenty-first century, are carefully examined, and the doctrine of the Trinity is brought into dialogue with non-Christian religions as well as with other Christian beliefs. Authors from a range of denominational backgrounds explore the importance of trinitarian thought, locating the Trinity within the wider context of systematic theology. Contemporary theology has seen a widespread revival of the doctrine of the Trinity, and this book incorporates the most recent developments in the scholarship.

Peter C. Phan holds the Ignacio Ellacuría Chair of Catholic Social Thought in the Department of Theology at Georgetown University. He is the author of numerous books including Christianity with an Asian Face (2003), In Our Own Tongues: Asian Perspectives on Mission and Inculturation (2004), and Being Religious Interreligiously (2004).
CAMBRIDGE COMPANIONS TO RELIGION
A series of companions to major topics and key figures in theology and religious studies. Each volume contains specially commissioned chapters by international scholars which provide an accessible and stimulating introduction to the subject for new readers and non-specialists.

Other titles in the series
THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO CHRISTIAN DOCTRINE
edited by Colin Gunton (1997)
isbn 0 521 47118 4 hardback isbn 0 521 47695 x paperback
THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO BIBLICAL INTERPRETATION
edited by John Barton (1998)
isbn 0 521 48144 9 hardback isbn 0 521 48593 2 paperback
THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO DIETRICH BONHOEFFER
edited by John de Gruchy (1999)
isbn 0 521 58258 x hardback isbn 0 521 58781 6 paperback
THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO KARL BARTH
edited by John Webster (2000)
isbn 0 521 58476 0 hardback isbn 0 521 58560 0 paperback
THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO CHRISTIAN ETHICS
edited by Robin Gill (2001)
isbn 0 521 77070 x hardback isbn 0 521 77918 9 paperback
THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO JESUS
edited by Markus Bockmuehl (2001)
isbn 0 521 79261 4 hardback isbn 0 521 79678 4 paperback
THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO FEMINIST THEOLOGY
edited by Susan Frank Parsons (2002)
isbn 0 521 66327 x hardback isbn 0 521 66380 6 paperback
THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO MARTIN LUTHER
isbn 0 521 81648 3 hardback isbn 0 521 01673 8 paperback
THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO ST PAUL
isbn 0 521 78155 8 hardback isbn 0 521 78694 0 paperback
THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO POSTMODERN THEOLOGY
isbn 0 521 79062 x hardback isbn 0 521 79395 5 paperback
THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO JOHN CALVIN
isbn 0 521 81647 5 hardback isbn 0 521 01672 x paperback
THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO HANS URS VON BALTHASAR
edited by Edward T. Oakes, SJ and David Moss (2004)
isbn 0 521 81467 7 hardback isbn 0 521 89147 7 paperback
THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO REFORMATION THEOLOGY
edited by David Bagchi and David Steinmetz (2004)
isbn 0 521 77224 9 hardback isbn 0 521 77662 7 paperback
THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO JOHN HENRY NEWMAN
edited by Ian Ker and Terrence Merrigan [2009]
isbn 9780521871860 hardback isbn 9780521692724 paperback

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO JOHN WESLEY
edited by Randy L. Maddox and Jason E. Vickers [2010]
isbn 9780521886536 hardback isbn 9780521714037 paperback

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO CHRISTIAN PHILOSOPHICAL THEOLOGY
edited by Charles Taliaferro and Chad Meister [2010]
isbn 9780521515430 hardback isbn 9780521730137 paperback

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO MUHAMMAD
edited by Jonathan E. Brockopp [2010]
isbn 97805218886079 hardback isbn 9780521713726 paperback

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO SCIENCE AND RELIGION
edited by Peter Harrison [2010]
isbn 9780521885386 hardback isbn 9780521712514 paperback

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO GANDHI
edited by Judith Brown and Anthony Parel [2011]
isbn 9780521116701 hardback isbn 978052113456 paperback

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO THOMAS MORE
edited by George Logan [2011]
isbn 9780521888622 hardback isbn 9780521716871 paperback

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO MIRACLES
edited by Graham H. Twelftree [2011]
isbn 9780521899864 hardback isbn 9780521728515 paperback

Forthcoming

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO FRANCIS OF ASSISI
edited by Michael J. P. Robson

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO NEW RELIGIOUS MOVEMENTS
edited by Olav Hammer and Mikael Rothstein

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO BLACK THEOLOGY
edited by Dwight Hopkins and Edward Antonio
Contents

Notes on contributors page ix
Preface xiii

Part I: Introduction
1 Developments of the doctrine of the Trinity 3
   PETER C. PHAN
2 Systematic issues in trinitarian theology 13
   PETER C. PHAN

Part II: Retrieving the sources
3 Like a finger pointing to the moon: exploring the Trinity in/and the New Testament 33
   ELAINE M. WAINWRIGHT
4 The Trinity in the Greek Fathers 49
   JOHN ANTHONY MCGUCKIN
5 Latin trinitarian theology 70
   MICHEL RENÉ BARNES

Part III: Renewing the tradition
6 God as the mystery of sharing and shared love: Thomas Aquinas on the Trinity 87
   ANSELM KYONGSUK MIN
7 The Trinity in Bonaventure 108
   KENAN B. OSBORNE
8 The Trinity in the Protestant Reformation: continuity within discontinuity 128
   YOUNG-HO CHUN
9 Between history and speculation: Christian trinitarian thinking after the Reformation 149
   CHRISTINE HELMER
### Part IV: Contemporary theologians

10 Karl Barth, reconciliation, and the Triune God 173  
**Peter Goodwin Heltzel and Christian T. Collins Winn**

11 Mystery of grace and salvation: Karl Rahner’s theology of the Trinity 192  
**Peter C. Phan**

12 Hans Urs von Balthasar on the Trinity 208  
**Karen Kilby**

13 The trinitarian doctrines of Jürgen Moltmann and Wolfhart Pannenberg in the context of contemporary discussion 223  
**Veli-Matti Kärkkäinen**

14 Sophia, apophasis, and communion: the Trinity in contemporary Orthodox theology 243  
**Aristotle Papanikolaou**

15 The life-giving reality of God from black, Latin American, and US Hispanic theological perspectives 259  
**Miguel H. Díaz**

16 Feminist theologies and the Trinity 274  
**Patricia A. Fox**

### Part V: In dialogue with other religions

17 The Tao in Confucianism and Taoism: the Trinity in East Asian perspective 293  
**Heup Young Kim**

18 Trinity and Hinduism 309  
**Francis X. Clooney, SJ**

19 Primordial Vow: reflections on the Holy Trinity in light of dialogue with Pure Land Buddhism 325  
**James L. Frederick**

20 Trinity in Judaism and Islam 344  
**David B. Burrell**

### Part VI: Systematic connections

21 Trinity, Christology, and pneumatology 365  
**Anne Hunt**

22 The Trinity in the liturgy, sacraments, and mysticism 381  
**Susan K. Wood**

23 The Trinity and socio-political ethics 398  
**Dale T. Irvin**

**Index** 414
Notes on contributors

Michel René Barnes is Associate Professor of Historical Theology at Marquette University, Milwaukee, Wisconsin, USA. He received his doctorate from the University of St. Michael’s College, Toronto, Ontario, Canada. Dr. Barnes is the author of many articles on Augustine’s trinitarian theology and a monograph on Gregory of Nyssa’s trinitarian theology, *The Power of God: Dunamis in Gregory of Nyssa’s Trinitarian Theology*, and edited, with D. H. Williams, *Arianism after Arius*. He has recently published on Irenaeus’ trinitarian theology, and has written a study of Christian pneumatology in the first two centuries.

Young-Ho Chun, Ph.D., is Professor of Systematic Theology at Saint Paul School of Theology, Kansas City. He was educated in South Korea, the USA, and Germany. He authored *Tillich and Religion: Toward a Theology of World Religions* and contributed numerous chapters to the Lit-Verlag series Tillich-Studien.

Francis X. Clooney, SJ, a Roman Catholic priest and a member of the Society of Jesus, joined Harvard Divinity School in 2005. His primary areas of scholarship are theological commentarial writings in the Sanskrit and Tamil traditions of Hindu India and comparative theology. Professor Clooney is the author of numerous articles and books, including *Hindu God, Christian God, Divine Mother, Blessed Mother: Hindu Goddesses and the Virgin Mary, Jesuit Postmodern: Scholarship, Vocation, and Identity in the 21st Century, Beyond Compare: St. Francis and Sri Vedanta Desika on Loving Surrender to God, and The Truth, the Way, the Life: Christian Commentary on the Three Holy Mantras of the Srivaisnava Hindus.*

Miguel H. Díaz, Ph.D., is currently US Ambassador to the Holy See. He was Professor of Systematic Theology at the College of Saint Benedict and Saint John’s University in Collegeville, Minnesota. He has published a number of articles and is co-editor of the book *From the Heart of our People: Latino/a Explorations in Systematic Theology* and author of *On Being Human: U.S. Hispanic and Rahnerian Perspectives.*

Patricia A. Fox has studied systematic theology at Catholic Theological Union, Chicago, and at Flinders University, South Australia. She has been involved in secondary and tertiary education, as well as in formation, spiritual direction and retreat work. She has held leadership positions within the Institute of the
Sisters of Mercy of Australia and the Archdiocese of Adelaide. She is presently teaching at Flinders University and the Adelaide College of Divinity and is director of a ministry formation program for the Catholic archdiocese based on that campus.

James L. Fredericks, Ph.D., is a faculty member in the Department of Theological Studies at Loyola Marymount University. He is a specialist in interreligious dialogue, especially the dialogue between Buddhism and Christianity. In addition to publishing many articles, he is the author of Faith among Faiths: Christian Theology and the Non-Christian Religions and Buddhists and Christians: Through Comparative Theology to a New Solidarity.

Christine Helmer is Professor of Religious Studies and Adjunct Professor of German at Northwestern University. She is author of The Trinity and Martin Luther and is editor (or co-editor) of numerous volumes in the areas of Schleiermacher studies, philosophy of religion, and biblical theology. Her most recent publications are an edited volume, The Global Luther: A Theologian for Modern Times, an essay on Schleiermacher in The Blackwell Companion to Nineteenth-Century Theology (edited by David Fergusson), and an essay on theology’s contribution to the contemporary study of religion in The Cambridge Companion to Religious Studies (edited by Robert A. Orsi).

Peter Goodwin Heltzel is Assistant Professor of Theology at New York Theological Seminary. An ordained minister in the Christian Church (Disciples of Christ), he is the author of Jesus and Justice: Evangelicals, Race and Politics. His edited volumes include Chalice Introduction to Disciples Theology and Theology in Global Context.

Anne Hunt is Dean of the Faculty of Theology and Philosophy at Australian Catholic University. In addition to her many publications on trinitarian theology, she has an interest in the visual arts as a powerful medium for communicating the mysteries of faith. Her latest book is Trinity: Insights from the Mystics.

Dale T. Irvin is President and Professor of World Christianity at New York Theological Seminary in New York City. A graduate of Princeton Theological Seminary and Union Theological Seminary in New York, he is the author of several books, including History of the World Christian Movement, with Scott W. Sunquist. Over the past several decades his articles have appeared in a number of journals such as Christianity Today, Christian Century, The Ecumenical Review, and The Journal of Pentecostal Studies. He is a founding editor of The Journal of World Christianity and serves on the editorial board of The Living Pulpit.

Veli-Matti Kärkkäinen [Dr. Theol. Habil., University of Helsinki] is Professor of Systematic Theology at Fuller Theological Seminary and Docent of Ecumenics at the University of Helsinki. A native of Finland, he has taught theology in Thailand. The author of a dozen scholarly books, among which are Trinity and Religious Pluralism and The Trinity: Global Perspectives, as well as more than one hundred articles, Dr. Kärkkäinen has participated widely in the theological,
missiological, and interfaith work of the World Council of Churches and Faith and Order as well in several bilateral ecumenical dialogues.

Karen Kilby is an Associate Professor in Systematic Theology in the Department of Theology and Religious Studies in the University of Nottingham, where she also served as head of the department. She has previously written on the thought of Karl Rahner, on the relationship between Rahner and Balthasar, and on the doctrine of the Trinity. Her latest book is *Balthasar: A Very Critical Introduction*.

Heup Young Kim is Professor of Systematic Theology and a former Dean of the College of Humanities and the Graduate School of Theology, Kangnam University, Korea. He has published numerous works in the areas of interfaith dialogue, theology of religions, Asian theology, and theology and science, in both English and Korean, including *Wang Yang-ming and Karl Barth: A Confucian–Christian Dialogue*; *Toward a Theology of the Tao, Christ and the Tao*; and *Contemporary Natural Sciences and Christianity*.

John A. McGuckin is the Nielsen Professor of Patristic and Byzantine Thought at Union Theological Seminary and Columbia University New York. He has written extensively on New Testament and early Christian thought. He is a priest of the Romanian Orthodox Church.

Anselm Kyongsuk Min has been Professor of Philosophy of Religion and Theology at Claremont Graduate University in Southern California since 1992. He is the author of several books including *Paths to the Triune God: An Encounter between Aquinas and Recent Theologies*, *The Solidarity of Others in a Divided World: A Postmodern Theology After Postmodernism*; and *The Dialectic of Salvation: Issues in Theology of Liberation*, as well as of many articles on Hegel, postmodernism, liberation theology, pluralism, and Asian and Korean theologies.

Kenan B. Osborne, a Franciscan, has been a professor of systematic theology at the Franciscan School of Theology, part of the Graduate Theological Union, Berkeley, California, since 1968. He received his D.Theol. degree from Ludwig-Maximilians Universität, Munich, Germany, in 1967. He is a former president of the Catholic Theological Society of America. In 2002 he received the John Courtney Murray Award from this same society. He has written eighteen books and numerous articles on theological subjects. He is now an emeritus professor.

Aristotle Papanikolaou is Associate Professor of Theology in the Department of Theology and Co-Founding Director of the Orthodox Christian Studies Program at Fordham University, New York. He is the author of *Being with God: Trinity, Apophaticism, and Divine–Human Communion*, co-editor [with George Demacopoulos] of *Orthodox Readings of Augustine*, and co-editor [with Elizabeth Prodromou] of *Thinking through Faith: New Perspectives from Orthodox Christian Scholars*.

Peter C. Phan went to the USA as a refugee from Vietnam in 1975. Currently he is the holder of the Ignacio Ellacuria Chair of Catholic Social Thought at...
Notes on contributors

Georgetown University. He has earned three doctorates and received two honorary doctorates. His fields of research include systematic theology, interreligious dialogue, and missiology. He has authored and edited over twenty books and published more than 300 articles. His book on Karl Rahner’s eschatology won the Best Book Award from the College Theology Society in 1989, and his book on Alexandre de Rhodes was given the first place by the Catholic Publishers Association in 1999.

Elaine M. Wainwright is Inaugural Professor of Theology and Head of the School of Theology at the University of Auckland, New Zealand, a post she has held for the last six years. She is a New Testament scholar specializing in the gospel of Matthew, biblical hermeneutics, and feminist, postcolonial, and ecological interpretations of biblical texts. Her current research is an ecological reading of the gospel of Matthew. Among her recent publications are Shall We Look for Another? A Feminist Rereading of the Matthean Jesus and Women Healing/Healing Women: The Genderization of Healing in Early Christianity.

Christian T. Collins Winn is Associate Professor of Historical and Systematic Theology at Bethel University in St. Paul, Minnesota. He is the editor of From the Margins: A Celebration of the Theological Work of Donald W. Dayton; author of “Jesus is Victor!” The Significance of the Blumhardts for the Theology of Karl Barth, and the series editor of The Blumhardts: Texts and Reception.

Susan K. Wood, Ph.D., is professor and chair of the Department of Theology at Marquette University. She is an associate editor of Pro ecclesia and serves on the editorial advisory board of the journal Ecclesiology. Most of her writings explore the connections between ecclesiology and sacramental theology. In addition to numerous articles, she has published Spiritual Exegesis and the Church in the Theology of Henri de Lubac, Sacramental Orders, and One Baptism: Ecumenical Dimensions of the Doctrine of Baptism, and is the editor of Ordering the Baptismal Priesthood.
The subject matter of this book is the Trinity, now widely acknowledged to be a mystery of salvation and the central Christian belief. That the Triune God is so now may be a commonplace, but that has not always been the case. One of the pleasant surprises in contemporary theology is the widespread revival of the doctrine of the Trinity. Long shunted to the wings, the Trinity is now occupying center stage. Karl Rahner’s oft-quoted bon mot that Christians are, theologically speaking, “mere monotheists” (that is, unitarians) may have been true in the 1960s and earlier. Fortunately, it is no longer so. Recently, a spate of books and articles on the Trinity by Catholic, Orthodox, and Protestant theologians has restored this neglected Christian doctrine to its rightful place. These works have not only retrieved the classical teachings on the Trinity through serious historical research, but have also given the lie to the claim that the trinitarian dogma is nothing more than abstruse metaphysics and a conundrum of “higher mathematics” of one-equals-three and vice versa. They have shown how trinitarian theology is necessary for a full understanding of such burning issues as the nature of the human person, suffering, sexism, ecology, social and economic justice, interreligious dialogue, and so on.

The twists and turns through which the Triune God migrated from the center to the periphery of Christian consciousness and back to the center again are recounted in the following pages. These winding paths make a fascinating story in themselves, along which readers now are invited to travel. The only thing to be stressed here is that this volume is intended to be a “companion” to those who wish to understand what Christians mean by the Trinity. It is not a manual, a textbook, a digest, or (the Triune) God forbid, a CliffsNotes of trinitarian theology. Each contributor would like to be a fellow traveler with the reader, or better still, to invoke the etymology of “companion” (com + panis), someone who shares bread, the bread of knowledge and friendship, with the readers, be they students or scholars.
The volume itself has its own twists and turns of sorts. It began when Dr. Kate Brett, the senior editor at Cambridge University Press, approached me with the proposal to edit the Companion. Her thoughtfulness and gentleness persuaded me that it would be a worthwhile task. The book proposal went through the usual blind review process, and I am grateful to the anonymous reviewers for their helpful comments. Brett and I agreed that the contributors should not only represent a wide spectrum of theological views but also be balanced in terms of gender, ethnicity, and geography, to honor the global character of contemporary theology. Unfortunately, not every attempt to achieve these goals was successful, but the failure was not due to lack of will or occasional strong arm-twisting.

A number of administrative changes occurred at Cambridge University Press while the book was being worked on, and the hands overseeing the production of the volume changed several times. I am of course deeply grateful to Kate Brett for her gentle care and guidance. Gillian Dadd and, then, Aline Guillermet took over the editorial process with competence and diligence, and I am thankful to them for bringing the book to port.

Another person I would like to thank is Dr. Fiona Little. She is the copy editor any writer and publishing house can ever hope to have: detailed, sharp-eyed, timely, persistent, patient, kind. Shaping all these diverse essays into a consistent style and format was a colossal labor, and Fiona has achieved it with unparalleled professionalism and skills. However, any errors that may remain are my responsibility. I also thank Dr. Anh Tran for his help with indexing.

Of course, my deepest thanks go to the contributors themselves; without them the book would not have existed at all. In my correspondence with them I have always referred to it as “our Trinity book,” and I meant it literally. Despite their busy writing schedules, they all have responded with generosity and alacrity to my request to write for the volume. No editor could have been more fortunate. May our friendship, and now our communion with our readers, be a sign, however feeble, of the koinônia that unites the Three That Are One.

Peter C. Phan