The Rise of the Unelected

Unelected bodies, such as independent central banks, economic regulators, risk managers and auditors, have become a worldwide phenomenon. Democracies are increasingly turning to them to demarcate boundaries between the market and the state, to resolve conflicts of interest and to allocate resources, even in sensitive ethical areas such as those involving privacy or biotechnology. This book examines the challenge that unelected bodies present to democracy and argues that, taken together, such bodies should be viewed as a new branch of government with their own sources of legitimacy and held to account through a new separation of powers. Vibert suggests that such bodies help promote a more informed citizenry because they provide a more trustworthy and reliable source of information for decisions. This book will be of interest to specialists and general readers with an interest in modern democracy as well as policy-makers, think tanks and journalists.

Frank Vibert is the co-founder and Director of the European Policy Forum in Pall Mall. He has previously worked as a Senior Adviser at the World Bank and a Senior Fellow at the UNU-WIDER Institute. He writes extensively on regulatory, institutional and constitutional topics and his previous publications include *Europe Simple, Europe Strong: The Future of European Governance* (2001) and *Europe: A Constitution for the Millennium* (1995).
The Rise of the Unelected

Democracy and the New Separation of Powers

Frank Vibert
To My Parents
Contents

List of boxes, tables and figures  page ix
Acknowledgements  x

Introduction  1

1 The world of the unelected  18
   The diversity  19
   Common features  30

2 The driving forces  34
   The shift to a service economy  34
   Managerial explanations  35
   The new separation of powers  38

3 The advantages of the new separation of powers  42
   Independent information gatherers  42
   Confidence in public information  45
   The inseparability of value judgements?  48
   Unbundling institutional responsibility for policy  53

4 The challenge to conventional democratic theory  55
   The erosion of participatory democracy  55
   Gaps in the rule of law  60
   Undermining deliberative democracy  64

5 Adapting traditional approaches  69
   The democratic ‘overhead’  70
   Constitutionalism  77
   Pragmatism  81

6 The new separation of powers and the advent of the informed citizen  86
   Conflicts of interest and the separation of powers  86
   The radicalism of the new separation of powers  92
   Rescuing the conventions of representative democracy  94
Contents

7 Informed citizens and the changing role of traditional institutions
   The changing nature of problem-solving 102
   The arena function 107
   Inquiry 112

8 The legitimacy of the new branch
   The analogy with the judiciary 115
   The principles and procedures of the new branch 121
   The distinctiveness of the new branch’s own standards 126

9 The new separation of powers and the European Union
   The path to power sharing 130
   The shift towards the new separation of powers 135
   Combining different principles of democratic organisation 138

10 International institutions: blurring the boundaries
    Mobilising empirical knowledge 145
    Expertise and the incentives to blur 148
    Procedures 153
    Principles 155
    Legitimising the United Nations 156
    The democratisation of global politics 162

11 Conclusions: the accountability of the new branch
    Accountability and the new checks and balances 169
    The reform agenda 176
    The least dangerous branch? 181

Appendix: List of unelected bodies referred to in the text 183
Bibliography 189
Index 198
Boxes, tables and figures

Box 1: The influence of the unelected  
Page 8
Box 2: Affecting the ‘feel’ of democracy  
10

Table 1: Selected independent service providers  
23
Table 2: Selected independent risk assessors  
24
Table 3: Selected boundary watchers between state and market  
27
Table 4: Selected audit and inspection bodies  
28
Table 5: Selected umpires and whistle-blowers  
29
Table 6: Independent public bodies in the EU  
136
Table 7: A guide to selected international organisations  
147

Figure 1: Unelected bodies: alternative democratic frameworks  
175
I would particularly like to thank Professor Richard Rose, University of Aberdeen, for his encouragement and guidance; Professor Edward Page (Beatrice and Sydney Webb Professor), London School of Economics, for a very helpful set of comments; Professor Claudio Radaelli, University of Exeter, who kindly organised a seminar at the university’s Centre for Regulatory Governance to discuss the themes of the book; and Dr Mark Thatcher, Reader in Public Administration and Public Policy at the London School of Economics, for his comments. Professor Dirk J. Wolfson, Professor Emeritus of Economics, Erasmus University, Rotterdam, also provided a helpful and challenging set of comments.

I would also like to thank the Progress Foundation and its Board Member Dr Gerhard Schwarz who organised a colloquium on Judicial Independence in Schwarzenberg 8–11 July 2004. The colloquium under the guidance of Professor Dr Stefan Voigt was most helpful to me in writing what is said in this book about the rule of law and the basis for an independent judiciary.

I have deliberately sought comments from knowledgeable observers outside the academic community. Those who kindly commented included Martin Summers and Paul Arlman. Cambridge University Press has been most helpful in steering the book through the publication process, and thanks in particular to Jacqueline French for her copy-editing skills. Finally, I would like to thank both Sarah Summers and Diana Munoz for their help and research assistance.