

Ethics and Business

In this lively and accessible book, Kevin Gibson explores the relationship between ethics and the world of business, and how we can serve the interests of both. He builds a philosophical groundwork that can be applied to a wide range of issues in ethics and business, and shows readers how to assess dilemmas critically and work to resolve them on a principled basis. Using case studies drawn from around the world, he examines topics including stakeholder responsibilities, sustainability, corporate social responsibility, and women and business. Because business can no longer be isolated from its effects on communities and the environment, these concerns are brought to the forefront. The book also captures the dynamic nature of business ethics in the era of globalization where jobs can be outsourced, products are made of components from scores of countries, and sweatshops often provide the cheap goods the public demands.

KEVIN GIBSON is Associate Professor, Departments of Philosophy and Management, and Director of the Center for Ethics Studies at Marquette University.



Ethics and Business An Introduction

KEVIN GIBSON

Marquette University





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521682459

© Kevin Gibson 2007

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2007

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library Gibson, Kevin, 1955-

Ethics and business: an introduction | Kevin Gibson.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN-13: 978-0-521-86379-7 (hardback : alk. paper) ISBN-10: 0-521-86379-1 (hardback : alk. paper) ISBN-13: 978-0-521-68245-9 (paperback : alk. paper) ISBN-10: 0-521-68245-2 (paperback : alk. paper)

Business ethics.
 Social responsibility of business.
 Corporate profits - Moral and ethical aspects.
 Business enterprises - Environmental aspects.
 Globalization -

Moral and ethical aspects. I. Title.

HF5387.G515 2007

174'.4 - dc22 2007012360

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

ISBN 978-0-521-86379-7 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-68245-9 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



With love to Anna and Alex



Contents

Acknowledgments	page xii
Preface	xiii
1 An overview of business ethics	1
The Bhopal disaster	1
The philosophical contribution	2
Two meanings of business ethics	6
Instrumental or prudential approaches	7
Rule-based approaches	10
Principle-based approaches	11
Ethical relativism	12
Egoism	15
Machiavelli and Hobbes	16
Game theory	18
Nike	19
Morality and strategy	20
Responses to egoism	21
Summary	23
General issues for discussion	24
Case – pornography	24
Some questions from the case	26
2 Insights from ethical theory	27
Gleaning at the grocery	27
The value of theory	28
Justice	28
Utilitarianism	30
Some issues in utilitarianism	32
Supererogation	34

vii



viii Contents

	Partiality	35
	Utility is not always fair	37
	Duty-based theories	37
	Some issues in Kantian capitalism	38
	Kantian principles	39
	Kantian capitalism and stakeholders	40
	Virtue theory	44
	The virtuous corporation	47
	Summary	48
	General issues for discussion	49
	Case – terminator seeds	50
	Some questions from the case	51
3	The capitalist system and its ethical implications	53
	The Body Shop	53
	Features of capitalism	55
	The invisible hand	59
	Market morality	62
	Market failures	63
	Commons	66
	Regulation of the market	67
	Globalization and its implications	68
	Summary	73
	General issues for discussion	75
	Case – fool's gold	75
	Some questions from the case	77
4	Feminism	78
	Morgan Stanley	78
	Women at work	79
	Feminism in business ethics	81
	Women's nature	82
	The female voice	83
	Ethics of care	84
	Issues of equality in the workplace	86
	Private lives and public work	89
	Disproportionate burdens	90
	Summary	92
	General issues for discussion	92
	Case – time off or time out?	92
	Some questions from the case	93



		Contents	ix
5	Responsibility	95	
	The Herald of Free Enterprise ferry disaster	95	
	Meanings of responsibility	97	
	Role responsibility	99	
	Legal liability and moral responsibility	101	
	Cause	102	
	Corporations as moral agents	106	
	Inalienable responsibility	110	
	Reluctant agency and omission	112	
	The doctrine of double effect	114	
	Codes and compliance	115	
	Moral censure	118	
	Three dimensions of business responsibility	119	
	Summary	121	
	General issues for discussion	122	
	Case – the aging air fleet	122	
	Some questions from the case	124	
6	Rights	125	
	Le Clemençeau	125	
	Rights in the workplace	126	
	Positive and negative rights	128	
	Rights and privileges	129	
	Recent initiatives	131	
	The Niger delta	132	
	Sweatshops	136	
	Rights and accountability	137	
	Communitarian challenges	139	
	Insights from Asian philosophy	140	
	Non-human rights	141	
	Summary	144	
	General issues for discussion	145	
	Case - human guinea pigs	145	
	Some questions from the case	146	
7	Autonomy	148	
	CortiSlim	148	
	Autonomy defined	151	
	Intentionality	151	
	Understanding	152	
	Voluntariness	155	



x Contents

	Limits on autonomy	157
	Let the buyer beware	161
	Advertising and autonomy	162
	Autonomy in the workplace	166
	Autonomy and drug testing	167
	Autonomy and psychological testing	169
	Autonomy and discrimination	170
	Whistleblowing	172
	Summary	173
	General issues for discussion	174
	Case – Jodie Brooks	174
	Some questions from the case	175
8	Beneficence	177
	Wal-Mart	177
	Degrees of beneficence	178
	Corporate beneficence	179
	Motivations for beneficence	180
	Corporate philanthropy	185
	Corporate social intervention overseas	189
	Corporate promotion of diversity	192
	Summary	198
	General issues for discussion	200
	Case – tobacco philanthropy	200
	Some questions from the case	202
9	The environment	203
	Mine tailings	203
	The impact of business on the environment	204
	Approaches to business and the environment	205
	How to value the environment	209
	Measuring ecological value	211
	Environmental accounting methods	213
	Web of being	215
	Pascal's wager	216
	Sustainablility and the triple bottom line	217
	Business and heritage	220
	Summary	222
	General issues for discussion	223
	Case – industrial farming	223
	Some questions from the case	226



Contents	xi
227	
227	
230	
232	
236	
238	
240	
244	
	227 227 230 232 236 238



Acknowledgments

I am grateful to many people for making this book possible. Foremost, I must thank Hilary Gaskin for her support and guidance throughout. Dale Jamieson has been a friend and mentor for over twenty years. Jennifer Gordon helped me realize what I wanted to say but had articulated poorly. James South, my department chair, has enthusiastically backed the project throughout, and I need to thank Dean Michael McKinney of the College of Arts and Sciences at Marquette University for the many things he has done on my behalf. I also need to express my appreciation to Dean David Shrock of the Marquette School of Business Administration, as well as to Dr. John Cotton, Dr. Jeanne Simmons, Sally Doyle, and Deb Reeder. I am indebted on a daily basis to Beth O'Sullivan and Lula Hopkins for keeping my work life on track. My wife, Elizabeth Lentini, has taken the dual role of cheerleader and patient critic, which is more than anyone could decently ask. My children as teenagers still light up my days and I feel very blessed that they are kind, caring, and curious individuals. My parents Ann and John Gibson have consistently encouraged me throughout my life. There are many others who contributed to the project, including my reviewers, who improved the book enormously, and friends and family, who helped in invaluable ways that they probably don't realize, but for which I am hugely indebted.



Preface

Ethics and Business: An Introduction is an accessible, yet philosophically rigorous, book that gives readers the conceptual apparatus necessary to deal with the range of topics that they are likely to encounter. It is aimed at undergraduate students and students new to philosophical language. It reframes the way issues in business ethics are presented in order to give students a more unified, consistent, and conceptually elegant introduction to the field. There are numerous references to contemporary cases and 'real-life' examples, and each chapter comes with a case and discussion points at the end. The cases are designed as a springboard for further thinking, and hence are relatively short and open-ended.

Although it is explicitly philosophical, I believe this book will be appropriate for readers without any prior training in the discipline – for example, graduate or undergraduate business students. Philosophy should never be intimidating – and, in fact, most people engage in it naturally and unself-consciously without realizing what they are doing. So while some of the discussions occasionally involve technical language, as they would in any discipline, the substance is easily within the grasp of students and business professionals.

There are two major features that set this book apart. First, the conceptual framework deliberately sets up a way of approaching issues built on basic moral principles. We cannot hope to cover every possible topic in the field, but if we can develop a clear way of approaching *any* topic then we will have accomplished a lot. The conceptual scheme is not exclusive or exhaustive, of course – for example, we could examine employee privacy from several perspectives. Setting up an analytical framework goes a long way to bridging the awkward gap between theory and practice, and provides introductory students with proper tools to get a good intellectual grasp of complex issues. Once we map it out, though, students are able to apply

xiii



xiv Preface

principles consistently across different topics and consequently construct arguments for a course of action from a reasoned argument rather than from awkwardly articulated intuitions.

Additionally, by situating business in the capitalist system we give a context for many of the forces that shape the way companies behave, and provide a backdrop to further analysis. My experience is that it is always worth laying out the fundamental framework within which the business world functions before moving ahead with discussions about individual or organizational morality. Clearly, in a profit-driven system there will usually be a paramount need for businesses to survive, grow, and make profits. At the same time, however, they are chartered by the public and thus instituted for the common good, and the pull to serve both investors and society is one of the foundational ethical tensions facing companies.

The second distinctive feature of the book is that it engages topics that are not often stressed in the literature, but are vital to any thorough examination of business ethics. They include:

- The impact of the growing "global economy" that may supersede or complicate issues of national sovereignty and business regulation;
- Feminist approaches to ethics in general and workplace concerns in particular;
- The relationship between business and environmental concerns, including discussions of economic sustainability and "triple bottom line" accounting.

In the words of one executive, the next billion computers are not going to be sold in the West. If a company is going to thrive in the global economy, they have to turn to thinking more broadly and in the longer term. Executives are coming to realize that they have a vested interest in developing and sustaining markets over time, that is, business ought not to be looking only at immediate returns, but at the communities that will become their consumers, and products lines that they can sustain for the foreseeable future. From this perspective, it is imperative that companies carefully reexamine what the overall business climate will be in a free international market and the nature of their interactions with all their stakeholders. Put bluntly, a simplistic notion of businesses operating by the ethics of a predatory jungle no longer applies, and companies will be forced to adopt a fresh approach to deal with changing conditions.



Preface 2

I have chosen to mention the law only where necessary, rather than use it as a basis for critical assessment of various topics. There is a temptation in life and business literature to use the law as a moral template, in the sense that following the law is morally sufficient, with the implication that if we have done nothing illegal we have done nothing wrong. While we have to admit that abiding by the law is a good start, it shortchanges the essential dialogue needed to establish appropriate standards and responses. The law cannot cover every case, and lawyers make a good living arguing about what precedent applies. Laws change or may not apply. It is usually easier and more productive to discuss the moral principles and policies involved in business dilemmas than to haggle over the merits of legislation, especially in the international arena. Furthermore, the law is a reactive instrument that often remedies harms that have already taken place, so if we wait around to have a case decided before we stop releasing a new chemical into the groundwater, the damage will have taken place before the case is decided. As we shall see, many cases fall into a legally gray area, where people are called on to use their discretionary judgment. Whatever the legality of giving notice about an impending factory closure, for example, doing so could be the morally decent thing to do. Finally, consider what a world would be like that relied on the law alone - everything would be regulated, and we would have armies of legislators, enforcers, judges and juries, and punishers. This vision alone should propel us into taking virtues of honesty, trust, fair dealing, and personal integrity seriously - in other words, it is well worth while to spend some time talking about the ethics as well as the legality of business.

In chapter 1 we look at the problem of ethical relativism, the notion that what is acceptable moral behavior is dependent on circumstances of time and place, or on each individual decision-maker. This is an important discussion for several reasons. First, if we are unable to defeat relativism in some way, then the whole ethical enterprise will falter, since it will have no leverage to criticize the behavior of others, and ethics will become a question of personal preference. Moreover, in the current global economy, the issue of varying standards across cultural boundaries has become immediate and pressing. For example, should businesses be allowed to use lower standards of worker rights (child labor, few safety measures) in overseas factories than in local factories, even though they may represent an improvement over previous standards?



xvi Preface

This is not to say, of course, that there should be a single absolute standard for everything, a procrustean bed where the occupant is stretched or severed to fit. Rather, it demands we work out what values should be regarded as universal, and the conditions that let us treat others unequally, questions which naturally lead into an overview of ethical theory.

The chapter on feminism brings in an important perspective. Women make up almost half the workforce, and appear to carry disproportionate burdens. They still take on most household duties, and are over-represented in poorly paid employment. The chapter questions whether there is an essential difference in human nature between men and women, and asks whether the model we use for our work and private lives is still fitting for contemporary society or the more flexible workplace of the future.

The heart of the book examines business using the language of responsibility, rights, autonomy, and beneficence. By putting responsibility as a central focus we can group other concepts in a coherent way. When we ask, for example, whether a company is responsible for its actions, then the reader can draw fairly broad conclusions about the relationship between business and society that will apply to new and emergent cases. Responsibility is often elusive, and there may be cases such as the ferry disaster when the *Herald of Free Enterprise* capsized and 200 died. Although there was much blame to go around, no individual was held accountable. The survivors wanted the company to be charged with corporate manslaughter, but their case failed. At this point we critically examine what it means to be morally responsible (in contrast to legally liable) and the various conditions where we might properly morally censure a corporation and its employees.

Chapters 6 and 7 bring together some of the issues that have emerged thus far by introducing the terminology of rights and autonomy. Rights, which are often seen as a counterpoint to responsibilities, give us a way of establishing fixed points of business behavior – for instance, that there should be threshold levels of safety standards or that employers should be able to dismiss unproductive employees. Here we distinguish fundamental rights (sometimes referred to as "human rights") from rights that arise as a function of a legal system (what might be called "privileges"); and positive (claim) rights from negative ones (immunities). These distinctions will enable students to work through some of the arguments about, for example, sweatshops, so they can discuss the issues in a systematic way. Rights claims are often thought to override other considerations, so an employee's right



Preface xvii

to have access to a fire exit is more important than an employer's right to prevent pilfering by chaining the door shut. We will critically assess how these sorts of disputes can be played out. We will also look at recent claims that humans are not the only ones entitled to rights – perhaps animals and the environment should also be part of the discussion.

After rights and responsibilities, the third major concept I use is the notion of autonomy. Capitalism itself is founded on the idea that the consumer is sovereign, and individual free choice is a paramount good. Yet at the same time, we restrict sales and regulate goods in the market, often to protect people from themselves. Therefore if people choose to buy the drug Ephedra or other herbal supplements, perhaps they should accept the associated risks. In a similar vein, if a worker wants to use recreational drugs over the weekend, should that be any concern for an employer if there is no effect on his or her performance on the job?

The discussion in chapter 7 shows that the treatment of individuals as either workers or consumers is essentially two sides of the same coin. This is also an appropriate place to discuss advertising, which, if effective, sways us to buy things we otherwise might not have. The reason sales and marketing are ever morally questionable is because they risk offending personal autonomy. The chapter also covers the morality of discrimination. If an employer never hires obese people because he dislikes them intensely, his choice is an autonomous one, and if we restrict it, we are restricting his freedom, and we are led to issues of when something good for society matters more than individual choice.

Chapter 8 deals with beneficence. Roughly speaking, beneficence means that we have a duty to do good, The concept appears in a lot of contemporary literature under the banner of *corporate social responsibility*, and here we expand the analysis to discuss the general relationship between business and the community at large. The basic tenets of capitalism appear to promote doing only as much as the law requires on behalf of workers, consumers or the community at large. On the other hand, there are many cases where business has acted as an agent for moral good, and we will examine the strategic and intrinsic dimensions of corporate philanthropy. Some people have suggested that the greater power and influence of big corporations means they have correspondingly greater duties to act for the common good. This claim gets tested, though, when we consider whether they should interfere with sovereign states, even ones where the company



xviii Preface

could bring significant social benefits. Finally, our analysis goes to the issue of diversity, and whether firms have any duties to improve domestic societal wrongs, especially when past injustice is reflected in a homogeneous workforce.

The final chapter deals with the relationship between business and the planet. In broad terms, it is becoming increasingly apparent that unless we act properly to preserve and sustain the biosphere there will be a very bleak future for our descendants. The push for economic globalization can be thought of as the spread of free-market economics, which embodies certain assumptions about the desirability of consumption and wealth creation. This is especially pressing since one of the pressures in capitalism is constant growth, which effectively means the consumption of finite resources. We should also sound a note of urgency in that China is now the world's largest car manufacturer, and with India also becoming more reliant on petroleum there will be an exponential draw on our natural resources.

There is some movement toward including corporate impact on the environment as a factor in annual reports (so-called "triple bottom line accounting"), and also highlighting ecological stewardship in corporate mission statements (for example, Volvo). Still, globalization presumes that the market is an adequate mechanism for valuing the environment, which may not always be the case, especially if we are dealing with aesthetic, historical, cultural, or religious values.

As an epilogue, I return to the place of business in our lives and in our world. To make sense of our lives, I believe we need to find meaning in our work. Adding value means more than creating wealth – value is a moral term that speaks to the nature of human experience. Work, then, has a moral as well as economic aspect, and hence it is vital that we constantly remind ourselves that business is not an end in itself but a tool to enhance our lives. To do so, we need to develop institutions that support a virtuous trinity of consumers, employers, and workforce.