## Contents: summary

*Preface*  
*xvii*  
*Acknowledgments*  
*xxv*  
*Tables of cases and statutes*  
*xxvii*  
*List of abbreviations*  
*xxxii*  

1. Evidence and inference: some food for thought  
1  
2. Fact investigation and the nature of evidence  
46  
3. Principles of proof  
78  
4. Methods of analysis  
112  
5. The chart method  
123  
6. Outlines, chronologies, and narrative  
145  
7. Analyzing the decided case: anatomy of a *cause célèbre*  
159  
8. Evaluating evidence  
224  
9. Probabilities, weight, and probative force  
246  
10. Necessary but dangerous: generalizations and stories in argumentation about facts  
262  
11. The principles of proof and the law of evidence  
289  
12. The trial lawyer's standpoint  
315

*Glossary of terms and symbols*  
379  
*References*  
388  
*Index*  
396
Contents

Preface xvii
Acknowledgments xxv
Tables of cases and statutes xxvii
List of abbreviations xxxii

1 Evidence and inference: some food for thought 1
A. Introduction 1
B. Evidence and inference in non-legal contexts 2
  1. Whose baby I? The judgment of Solomon 2
  2. The intelligence analyst: an intelligence scenario “from
     the top-down” 3
  3. The doctor and the detective: Joseph Bell and Sherlock
     Holmes 8
     a. The doctor 8
     b. The detective 9
  4. Generalizations and stories: Sam’s party 10
C. Evidence and inference in legal contexts 10
  1. Two murders 10
     a. The murder of Y 10
     b. Bywaters and Thompson 10
  2. Imaginative reasoning: The Nine Mile Walk 11
  3. Generalizations, stories, and arguments 18
     a. Brides in the bath: closing speech 18
     b. Huddleston v. United States 19
     c. Miller v. Jackson 20
  4. Evidence from two causes célèbres 21
     a. Commonwealth v. Sacco and Vanzetti 21
     b. People v. Simpson 23
  5. United States v. Richard Able 23
  6. Sargent v. Southern Accident Co. 28
  8. An investigation: basic concepts in analysis and evaluation 40
2 Fact investigation and the nature of evidence 46
   A. Introduction: connecting the dots 46
      Post 9/11 investigation: an exercise 52
   B. Fact investigation: generating dots and explanations for them 55
      1. Types of logical reasoning and justification 55
      2. Abductive reasoning and the generation of a new idea 56
      3. Generating explanations for dots or trifles 58
   C. On the credentials of evidence 60
      1. Evidential foundations of argument 60
      2. On relevance 62
      3. The credibility of evidence and its sources 63
         a. Tangible evidence 64
         b. The credibility of testimonial evidence 65
         c. Ancillary evidence about testimonial credibility attributes 67
         d. Credibility v. competence 70
      4. On the probative force of evidence 71
   D. A substance-blind approach to evidence 71

3 Principles of proof 78
   A. Introduction: evidence in legal contexts 78
   B. The Rationalist Tradition 78
      1. The tradition described 79
   C. Rationale 87
      Notes and questions on rules of evidence concerning relevance 88
   D. Notes on terminology and inferential relationships 90
      A preliminary exercise: State v. Archer (I) 94
   E. Probative processes and logical principles 96
      1. Probative processes 96
      2. The logical principles 98
      3. Application of the principles in legal disputes 103
      The exercise continues: State v. Archer (II) 109
      The Prosecutor’s standpoint 109

4 Methods of analysis 112
   A. Introduction 112
   B. The methods and a protocol for their use 113
1. Methods of analysis and analytic devices 113
2. A seven-step protocol for analysis: a generalized account 114

5 The chart method 123
A. The chart method: an overview 123
B. The seven-step protocol for the chart method: a detailed account 124
C. The symbols and their use 134
   1. The basic Wigmorean palette 134
   2. The chart method illustrated 136
   3. Additional symbols, conventions and their utility 140
   4. Three advantages of symbols and charting 141
The exercise continues: State v. Archer (III) 143
   1. Defense counsel’s standpoint 143
   2. Defense investigation 144

6 Outlines, chronologies, and narrative 145
A. The outline method of analysis 145
B. Analytic devices: chronologies and narratives 147
C. The litigation context 149
   1. The stages of a case and the methods of analysis 149
      a. The pleading stage 150
      b. Before the close of discovery and investigation 151
      c. Final trial preparation 152
D. Theories, themes, stories, and situation-types 153
   State v. Archer (IV): the exercise concludes 158
   1. The prosecution standpoint 158
   2. The defense standpoint 158

7 Analyzing the decided case: anatomy of a cause célèbre 159
A. Introduction 159
B. The trial of Bywaters and Thompson 160
   1. Preliminary matter 160
      a. The indictments 160
      b. Dramatis personae 162
      c. Leading dates in the case 163
   2. The judgment on Thompson’s appeal: Rex v. Thompson (1922) 164
   3. Evidence from the trial: the Prosecution 170
      a. Extracts from testimony (including statements made by the accused) 170
      b. Index to selected exhibits 178
c. A selection of Thompson’s earlier letters 179

d. Thompson’s later letters 189

4. Evidence from the trial: the Defense 203
    a. Extracts from cross-examination of Bywaters 203
    b. Further extracts from the cross-examination of Bywaters 209
    c. Extracts from the examination of Thompson 209
    d. Further extracts from the examination of Thompson 211
    e. Extracts from cross-examination of Thompson 213

C. Comments 219

D. Notes and questions on Rex v. Bywaters and Thompson 220

8 Evaluating evidence 224

A. Introduction 224

B. Evaluating the weight and probative force of evidence 226
    1. No rules of weight 226
    2. Traditional modes of expressing weight and probative force 227

C. Standards for decision 230
    1. Lawyering standards 231
       a. Standards for lawyer-client decisions 232
       b. Standards for lawyers’ decisions 234
    2. Standards for decisions in adjudication 237
       a. Standards for decisions disposing of a case as a matter of law 237
       b. Standards for decisions on admissibility 238
       c. The case as a whole: burdens of proof and the civil and criminal standards 242
       d. Appellate review: standards for limiting discretion 244

9 Probabilities, weight, and probative force 246

A. Introduction 246

B. Flirtations involving law and probability 247

C. Probability and the force or weight of evidence 250
    1. Conventional probability and Bayes’s Rule 251
    2. Evidential support and evidential weight: non-additive probabilistic beliefs 253
    3. Baconian probability and completeness of evidential coverage 257
    4. Wigmore and the fuzzy weight of evidence 260

10 Necessary but dangerous: generalizations and stories in argumentation about facts 262

A. Generalizations 262
    1. Reprise and introduction 262
2. Degrees of certainty 263
3. Types of generalizations 265
   a. Case-specific generalizations 266
   b. Background generalizations 269
   c. Scientific knowledge and expertise 270
   d. General knowledge 270
   e. Experience-based generalizations 271
   f. Synthetic-intuitive generalizations (belief generalizations) 271
4. Judicial notice and cognitive consensus 273
   a. Judicial notice 273
   b. Cognitive consensus 273
5. Dangers of generalizations 276
6. Generalizations: the practitioner’s standpoint 277
   a. Case-specific generalizations 278
   b. Experience-based and synthetic-intuitive generalizations 278
   c. Formulation and appraisal 279

   Protocol for assessing the plausibility and validity of a generalization in the context of an argument 279

B. Stories necessary, but dangerous 280

   Protocol for assessing the plausibility, coherence, and evidentiary support for a story 281

C. The relationship between stories and generalizations 282

D. Generalizations, stories, and themes: questions and exercises 285

11 The principles of proof and the law of evidence 289

   A. Introduction 289
   B. What is the law of evidence? A Thayerite overview 290
   C. One law of evidence? 294
   D. Linking the principles of proof and the law of evidence: relevance as the main bridge 295
   E. Analyzing for admissibility 295
   F. Analysis under the United States Federal Rules of Evidence 299
      1. Rules codifying the principles of proof and regulating their applications in judicial trials 299
      2. Analysis and the rules designed to regulate the probative processes 301
      3. Analysis and mandatory exclusionary rules 304
      4. A Wigmorean protocol for analyzing problems in the use and admissibility of evidence under the Federal Rules and its application 305
         a. The hearsay problem 306
         b. The protocol applied 309
12 The trial lawyer’s standpoint

A. A Wigmorean lawyer prepares for trial
   1. Of charts and other analytic devices
   2. The trial book: an organizational device
   3. The trial book: an art form

B. Two simple cases
   1. Suggested format
   2. Materials for Police v. Weller
   3. Materials for Police v. Twist

C. The art of plausible proof: theory, story, and theme revisited
   1. Introduction
   2. More food for thought
      a. K. Llewellyn: Who are these men?
      b. Bywaters and Thompson: Who is this woman?
      c. Is Ford Motor Company guilty of killing girls with a Pinto?

D. Two more complex trial problems
   1. Introduction
   2. The criminal case: United States v. Wainwright
   3. The civil case: The Estate of James Dale Warren

Glossary of terms and symbols
References
Index