

Argument Realization

The relationship between verbs and their arguments is a widely debated topic in linguistics. This comprehensive survey provides an up-to-date overview of this important area of research, exploring current theories of how a verb's semantics can determine the morphosyntactic realization of its arguments. Assuming a close connection between verb meaning and syntactic structure, it provides a bridge between lexical semantic and syntactic research, synthesizing the results of work from a range of linguistic subdisciplines and in a variety of theoretical frameworks.

The first four chapters survey leading theories about event structure and conceptualization. The fifth and sixth chapters focus on the mapping from lexical semantics to morphosyntax, and include a detailed discussion of the thematic hierarchy. The seventh chapter reviews treatments of multiple argument realization. With useful bibliographic references and clear definitions of relevant terms, this book will be invaluable to students and researchers in syntax and semantics, as well as those in related fields.

Beth Levin is William H. Bonsall Professor in the Humanities at the Department of Linguistics, Stanford University. She has held positions at the MIT Center for Cognitive Science and the Department of Linguistics at Northwestern University. She is the author of *English Verb Classes and Alternations: A Preliminary Investigation* (1993) and co-author of *Unaccusativity: At the Syntax–Lexical Semantics Interface* (with Malka Rappaport Hovay, 1995).

Malka Rappaport Hovav is Professor in the Department of English, the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. She has held positions at the MIT Center for Cognitive Science and Bar Ilan University, Israel. She is the co-author of *Unaccusativity: At the Syntax–Lexical Semantics Interface* (with Beth Levin, 1995).



Research Surveys in Linguistics

In large domains of theoretical and empirical linguistics, scholarly communication needs are directly comparable to those in analytical and natural sciences. Conspicuously lacking in the inventory of publications for linguists, compared to those in the sciences, are concise, single-authored, non-textbook reviews of rapidly evolving areas of inquiry. Research Surveys in Linguistics is intended to fill this gap. It consists of well-indexed volumes that survey topics of significant theoretical interest on which there has been a proliferation of research in the last two decades. The goal is to provide an efficent overview of, and entry into, the primary literature for linguists – both advanced students and researchers – who wish to move into, or stay literate in, the areas covered. Series authors are recognized authorities on the subject matter, as well as clear, highly organized writers. Each book offers the reader relatively tight structuring in sections and subsections and a detailed index for ease of orientation.

Previously published in this series

A Thematic Guide to Optimality Theory, John J. McCarthy ISBN 0 52179194 4 hardback ISBN 0 52179644 X paperback

The Phonology of Tone and Intonation, Carlos Gussenhoven ISBN 0 521 81265 8 hardback ISBN 0 521 01200 7 paperback



Argument Realization

BETH LEVIN

Stanford University

MALKA RAPPAPORT HOVAV

The Hebrew University of Jerusalem





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

http://www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521663311

© Beth Levin and Malka Rappaport Hovav, 2005

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Times 10/12pt. System LΔTEX 2ε

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN-13 978-0-521-66331-1 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-66331-8 hardback ISBN-13 978-0-521-66376-2 paperback ISBN-10 0-521-66376-8 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this book, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

	Acknowledg	ments	Vii
	Introduction		1
1	Challenges for theories of argument realization		7
	1.1 Taking	lexical semantic representations seriously	7
	1.2 Identify	ying grammatically relevant facets of meaning	9
	1.3 The cro	ossclassification of verbs and the status of verb classes	16
	1.4 Verb m	neanings represent construals of events	19
	1.5 Uniform	mity and variation in argument realization	20
	1.6 When s	subjects are not agents and objects are not patients	24
	1.7 Conclu	sion	32
2	Semantic role lists		35
	2.1 The pro	operties common to semantic role list approaches	35
	2.2 Probler	ns for semantic role list approaches	38
	2.3 Attemp	oted solutions	44
	2.4 Conclu	sion	48
3	Current approaches to lexical semantic representation		51
	3.1 Genera	lized semantic roles	51
	3.2 Predica	te decompositions and event structures	68
	3.3 Conclu	sion	75
4	Three conceptualizations of events		78
	4.1 The loc	calist approach	79
	4.2 The as ₁	pectual approach	86
	4.3 The car	usal approach	117
	4.4 The as ₁	pectual and causal approaches compared	125
	4.5 Conclu	sion	127

٧



vi	Contents		
5	The mapping from lexical semantics to syntax		
	5.1 Equivalence class preservation constraints	132	
	5.2 Prominence preservation constraints	140	
	5.3 Types of mapping algorithms	145	
	5.4 Conclusion	152	
6	Thematic hierarchies in argument realization		
	6.1 Thematic hierarchies: appealing, but problematic	155	
	6.2 The primary motivation for hierarchies: context dependence	e 158	
	6.3 Formulations of the thematic hierarchy	162	
	6.4 The grounding of the thematic hierarchy	164	
	6.5 Towards an understanding of differences between thematic		
	hierarchies	175	
	6.6 Conclusion	183	
7	Multiple argument realization		
	7.1 Projectionist and constructional perspectives	189	
	7.2 Alternations involving a "single" set of arguments	194	
	7.3 Information-packaging considerations and more	216	
	7.4 Multiple argument realization involving event composition	219	
	7.5 The distribution of verb classes in multiple argument		
	realization	225	
8	Postscript		
	References	242	
	Index of topics		
	Index of authors		
	Index of languages		



Acknowledgments

This book had its origins in an unpublished manuscript entitled "From Lexical Semantics to Argument Structure." We thank Hagit Borer for providing us with the impetus to write this paper. Christine Bartels suggested that with some work this paper might find a home in the Research Surveys in Linguistics series at Cambridge University Press. We agreed that this seemed like a good match and set about expanding the paper into this book. We did not anticipate that this process would take so long, in part because the rewriting process turned out to be an intellectual odyssey. We hope that we manage to convey the richness of the phenomena we deal with and their centrality to linguistic theory to those who read and use this book.

Four anonymous reviewers provided comments which proved extremely helpful as we turned the paper into a book. Our students forced us to think deeply about the issues here, and we have benefited considerably from their questions and comments. The material on thematic hierarchies was presented at the Stanford Semantics Fest in March 2000, IATL 16 at Tel Aviv University in June 2000, and the Conference on Semantic Role Universals at the Max Planck Institute of Cognitive Neuroscience in December 2002. We thank Christine Bartels, Bill Croft, Mari Olsen, Grace Song, and Carol Tenny for their comments on the original paper. We also thank John Beavers, Liz Coppock, Hana Filip, Kate Kearns, Anita Mittwoch, Masha Polinsky, Ivan Sag, Peter Sells, and Ivy Sichel for helpful comments and for discussions of parts of this book. We are indebted to Shiao Wei Tham for giving the whole manuscript a once over and catching the numerous inconsistencies and infelicities we could no longer see.

This work would not have been possible without the unstinting help of the staff of Northwestern University's Inter-Library Loan service and the librarians at the Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences. We thank them all for their efforts to track down obscure and not so obscure materials. For bibliographic and editorial assistance, we also thank Victoria Gelfand, April Leininger, and especially Olivia Chang and Lena Goretsky.



viii

Acknowledgments

The preparation of this book was supported in part by US National Science Foundation grants DBS-9221993, SBR-9616453, and SBC-0096036 to Levin and by Israel Science Foundation grants 832–00 and 806–03 to Rappaport Hovav. This book was partially prepared while Levin and Rappaport Hovav were Fellows at the Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences. Financial support for Levin's stay at the Center was provided by the Center's general funds and for Rappaport Hovav's stay by the Andrew W. Mellon Foundation Grant 29800639. We are grateful to the Center for providing us with the opportunity to work in this uniquely stimulating and congenial environment.

We dedicate this book to the memory of Ken Hale, who was a major force in bringing the issues discussed in this book to the attention of the generative linguistics community. He was instrumental in formulating the central questions and in defining the major challenges in the area of argument realization.

Finally, our deepest appreciation goes to our families for their love and support during the time we have spent on our latest and longest trans-Atlantic collaboration.

Beth Levin and Malka Rappaport Hovav