This book examines emancipation after the Emancipation Proclamation of 1863 and during the last years of the American Civil War. Focusing on the making and meaning of the Thirteenth Amendment, Final Freedom looks at the struggle among legal thinkers, politicians, and ordinary Americans in the North and the border states to find a way to abolish slavery that would overcome the inadequacies of the Emancipation Proclamation. The book tells the dramatic story of the creation of a constitutional amendment and reveals an unprecedented transformation in American race relations, politics, and constitutional thought. Using a wide array of archival and published sources, Professor Vorenberg argues that the crucial consideration of emancipation occurred after, not before, the Emancipation Proclamation; that the debate over final freedom was shaped by a level of volatility in society and politics underestimated by prior historians; and that the abolition of slavery by constitutional amendment represented a novel method of reform that transformed attitudes toward the Constitution.

Michael Vorenberg is Assistant Professor of History at Brown University.
For Dan and Tom, my best teachers
Contents

List of Illustrations xi
Acknowledgments xiii
List of Abbreviations xvii

Introduction 1

1 Slavery’s Constitution 8
The Constitution, Slavery, and the Coming of the Civil War 9
The Secession Crisis: Amending the Constitution to Protect Slavery 18
Preserving the Constitution in the War for Emancipation 23

2 Freedom’s Constitution 36
The Popular Origins of Universal Emancipation 36
Emancipation and Reconstruction, Republicans and Democrats 41
Presidential Emancipation: Lincoln’s Reconstruction Proclamation 46
Congress Responds: Proposals for an Abolition Amendment 48
The Drafting of the Thirteenth Amendment 53

3 Facing Freedom 61
Legal Theory and Practical Politics 63
The Democracy Divided 71
African Americans and the Inadequacy of Constitutional Emancipation 79

4 Debating Freedom 89
The Antislavery Amendment and Republican Unity 90
Slavery, Union, and the Meaning of the War 94
Constitutional Freedom and Racial Equality 99
The Unconstitutional Constitutional Amendment 107
Dubious Victory 112

5 The Key Note of Freedom 115
A New Party, a New Amendment: The Radical Democrats 116
# Contents

The “National Union Party” and the Amendment .................................................. 121
Race, Reconstruction, and the Constitution: The Changing Context .................... 127
Party Unity and Presidential Politics ................................................................. 136

6 The War within a War: Emancipation and the Election of 1864 ......................... 141
   The Parties Dividing ................................................................................. 142
   Peace Feelers and Peace Fiascoes .......................................................... 146
   The Retreat from Niagara ...................................................................... 152
   Miscegenation and Abolition .................................................................. 160
   State Politics and Abolition .................................................................... 167

7 A King’s Cure ................................................................................................. 176
   The New Campaign for Constitutional Emancipation .............................. 176
   Lame Ducks, Lobbyists, and Lincoln ......................................................... 180
   Confronting Constitutional Failure .......................................................... 185
   The Final Vote ......................................................................................... 197

8 The Contested Legacy of Constitutional Freedom ............................................. 211
   The Meanings of Freedom: The Union States and Ratification ................. 212
   Securing the Union: The Confederate States and Ratification .................. 222
   Enacting the Amendment: Congress and Civil Rights ............................ 233
   Legacies Denied: The Thirteenth Amendment in the Gilded Age .............. 239
   Legacies Preserved: The Thirteenth Amendment in the Twentieth Century .. 244

Appendix: Votes on Antislavery Amendment ..................................................... 251
Bibliography ................................................................................................. 253
Index ............................................................................................................. 297
Illustrations

1. African Americans reacting to Abraham Lincoln’s annual message of 1862
2. Antislavery petition of the Women’s Loyal National League
3. Pennsylvania petition for National Constitutional Amendments
4. “Miscegenation, Or the Millennium of Abolitionism”
5. The House of Representatives after the final vote on the Thirteenth Amendment
6. Signed copy of the Thirteenth Amendment
Acknowledgments

This book exists in large part because of the generosity of friends, scholars, and institutions. Financial assistance was provided by fellowships from the Julian Park Fund of the State University of New York at Buffalo, the Indiana Historical Society, the Henry E. Huntington Library, the Everett M. Dirksen Congressional Research Center, the Mark DeWolfe Howe Fund of the Harvard Law School, the Graduate Student Council of Harvard University, the Charles Warren Center of Harvard University, and the Department of History of Harvard University. A fellowship from the Mrs. Giles Whiting Foundation enabled me to complete the dissertation on which this book is based. Frank Smith of Cambridge University Press and the anonymous readers who evaluated the book for the Press have been patient and helpful in the transformation of the manuscript into the final product.

I benefited immeasurably from the assistance of research librarians and archivists at roughly thirty-five repositories across the country. Limitations in space prevent me from mentioning all of them, but I would like to note in particular the helpfulness of the staffs of the manuscripts division of the Library of Congress and the special collections division of the Henry E. Huntington Library. Also, at the Illinois State Historical Library, Mr. Thomas F. Schwartz, now the State Historian of Illinois, offered much valuable advice and made available to me unpublished Lincoln material. Mary-Jo Kline at the John Hay Library of Brown University came to my rescue in a last-minute search for photographs.

Many scholars have assisted me in the final preparation of the book. I must thank in particular Jeffrey P. Moran, an immensely talented historian and a devoted friend. Jeff read early drafts of many chapters, and he is more than likely responsible for any well-turned phrase that somehow found its way into the final version. Thomas J. Brown and Heather Cox Richardson were also generous with their time and editorial assistance. Their incisive critiques of the manuscript have saved me from many missteps. Special thanks are also due to Michael Green, who lent me valuable notes and shared with me his own work in progress on the Republican party during the Civil War. Many historians have offered valuable comments on parts of the book or on papers derived from it. These include Guyora Binder, David W. Blight, Frederick J. Blue, Paul Finkelman, Sally Hadden, Laura Kalman, David E. Kyvig, Michael A. Morrison, Donald G.
Acknowledgments

Nieman, James D. Schmidt, Robert J. Steinfeld, Lea S. VanderVelde, Wang Xi, and the members of the SUNY-Buffalo history department. I also appreciate the helpful comments of Richard Newman, Randall Burrett, and other members of the W. E. B. Du Bois Institute, where I enjoyed a year as a postdoctoral fellow. Thomas Cox, Anna Galland, and Carmen Washington provided valuable research assistance. Before the research began, James M. McPherson, Harold M. Hyman, and Herman Belz offered early encouragement and advice. Other historians played a crucial role, even if they did not always realize they were doing so. A telephone conversation with LaWanda Cox helped me through a particularly bleak period in the work. Bernard Bailyn was not directly involved in the making of this book, but without his guidance and inspiration during my first years in graduate school, I would never have begun a book, much less completed one. Sam Bass Warner, an old family friend, welcomed me into the profession with his typical good humor and generosity. Thomas A. Underwood has been a steady role model in ways that extend well beyond the sphere of scholarship.

Three historians deserve special recognition. David Herbert Donald helped transform a confused and ignorant first-year graduate student into a would-be Civil War scholar. By employing me as a research assistant for his biography of Abraham Lincoln, Professor Donald gave me the opportunity to see firsthand how much fresh work still could be done on Civil War subjects. I continue to be inspired by his scholarship and his empathy for his subjects and students alike. I was lucky that Harvard University hired Professor William E. Gienapp just as I began work on my doctoral dissertation. Always patient and helpful, he listened kindly but never uncritically to my ideas and strategies. Working in conjunction with the staff of the Harvard library, he arranged the purchase of many research materials essential to the dissertation. As my dissertation director, he repaired much faulty logic and muddled writing. Michael Les Benedict deserves more credit than I can possibly give. He offered encouragement early on and then valuable advice once the project was underway. He also gave the manuscript its most thorough reading, saving me from numerous errors and forcing me to sharpen my thinking in many places. Many flaws remain, I am sure, and I take full responsibility for them all.

Without the help and hospitality of many friends and family members, the completion of this book would have been a joyless task. Peter Rosenthal lent much support throughout — support here defined as merciless ridicule and ceaseless torment, with an occasional helping of ribs. Other friends and family members took a more active role by offering me a place to stay as well as good company while I was on the research road. These include Eliza Vorenberg and Barnaby Jackson, Joseph Brenner, Eliot
Acknowledgments

Codner, Paul Vittimberga, Melinda and John Byrd, Susan Huhta, Elizabeth and John Neiva, Ira Wool and Barbara Mirecki, and Ann and Robert Jones.

My immediate family has been my steadiest source of support and diversion. My mother has offered unflagging and unconditional assistance throughout. My father, a historian at heart, helped me with the bibliography and was surely the book's biggest fan. I only wish he had lived to see it in print. Throughout my life, my brothers Dan and Tom have reminded me of the need to broaden my perspective while being careful not to take things too seriously. They have been my greatest advocates, my tireless protectors, and, of course, my best teachers. I have much to learn from them still.

My wife Katie and my daughter Emma deserve the final word. Katie has suffered my anxieties and time demands with endless patience. I cannot and need not list all that she has done. We both know the leading role she has played in helping me to complete this book while making sure I had some fun along the way. Emma, now three years old, thinks my time spent with this project instead of with her has been time wasted. In this, as in all things, I defer to her judgment, and so bid farewell to the book.
Abbreviations

BC Special Collections, Bowdoin College, Brunswick, Maine
CG Congressional Globe
CHS Chicago Historical Society
CiHS Cincinnati Historical Society
CoU Butler Library, Columbia University, New York City
EM Eleutherian Mills Historical Library, Wilmington, Delaware
HEH Henry E. Huntington Library, San Marino, California
HL Houghton Library, Harvard University, Cambridge, Massachusetts
HSD Historical Society of Delaware, Wilmington
HSMd Historical Society of Maryland, Baltimore
HSPa Historical Society of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia
IHS Indiana Historical Society, Indianapolis
ISHL Illinois State Historical Library, Springfield
ISL Indiana State Library, Indianapolis
LC Manuscripts Division, Library of Congress, Washington, D.C.
MaA Massachusetts State Archives, Boston
MdA Maryland State Archives, Hall of Records, Annapolis
MHS Massachusetts Historical Society, Boston
MSS Manuscripts
NA National Archives, Washington, D.C.
NJH New Jersey Historical Society, Newark
NYH New York Historical Society, New York City
NYP New York Public Library, New York City
NYS New York State Library, Albany
OHS Ohio Historical Society, Columbus
RG Record Group
RTL Robert Todd Lincoln Collection, Manuscript Division, Library of Congress, Washington, D.C.
Abbreviations

UR  Rush Rhees Library, University of Rochester, Rochester, New York
WRH  Western Reserve Historical Society, Cleveland, Ohio