This book is a major new intellectual and cultural history of intolerance and toleration in early modern and ‘early Enlightenment’ Europe. John Marshall offers an extensive study of late seventeenth-century practices of religious intolerance and toleration in England, Ireland, France, Piedmont, and the Netherlands, and of the arguments which John Locke and his associates made in defence of ‘universal religious toleration’ against contemporary justifications of intolerance. He analyses early modern and especially ‘early Enlightenment’ discussions of toleration; debates over toleration for Jews and Muslims as well as for Christians; the limits of toleration for the intolerant, Catholics, atheists, ‘libertines’, and ‘sodomites’, and the complex relationships between intolerance and resistance theories, including Locke’s own Treatises. This study is a significant contribution to the history of the ‘republic of letters’ of the 1680s and the development of ‘early Enlightenment’ culture and will be essential reading for scholars of early modern European history, religion, political science, and philosophy.

JOHN MARSHALL is Professor of History at the Johns Hopkins University. He is also the author of John Locke: Resistance, Religion, and Responsibility (1994).
Cambridge Studies in Early Modern British History

Series editors

ANTHONY FLETCHER
Emeritus Professor of English Social History, University of London

JOHN GUY
Visiting Fellow, Clare College, Cambridge

JOHN MORRILL
Professor of British and Irish History, University of Cambridge, and Vice-Master of Selwyn College

This is a series of monographs and studies covering many aspects of the history of the British Isles between the late fifteenth century and the early eighteenth century. It includes the work of established scholars and pioneering work by a new generation of scholars. It includes both reviews and revisions of major topics and books, which open up new historical terrain or which reveal startling new perspectives on familiar subjects. All the volumes set detailed research into our broader perspectives, and the books are intended for the use of students as well as of their teachers.

For a list of titles in the series, see end of book.
JOHN LOCKE, TOLERATION AND EARLY ENLIGHTENMENT CULTURE

Religious Intolerance and Arguments for Religious Toleration in Early Modern and ‘Early Enlightenment’ Europe

JOHN MARSHALL

Johns Hopkins University
CONTENTS

List of figures page vii
Acknowledgments viii

Introduction 1

PART 1 CATHOLIC AND PROTESTANT INTOLERANCE IN THE LATER SEVENTEENTH CENTURY 15

1 Catholic intolerance, its representations in England, c. 1678–86, and Locke’s Second Treatise 17
2 Catholic intolerance and the significance of its representations in England, Ireland, and the Netherlands, c. 1687–92 55
3 Protestant religious intolerance in England, c. 1660–c. 1700 94
4 Religious toleration and intolerance in the Netherlands and in the Huguenot community in exile 138

PART 2 JUSTIFICATIONS OF INTOLERANCE AND THE EMERGENCE OF ARGUMENTS FOR TOLERATION 195

5 Patristic and medieval sources of early modern intolerance: anathematising heretics and schismatics as seditious, pestilential poisoners, ‘libertines’ and ‘sodomites’ 197
6 Heresy and schism, sedition and treason, and ‘contrarities’ and ‘inversions’ in the ‘Last Days’ 224
7 Catholic and ‘magisterial Reformation’ attacks on Anabaptism, anti-Trinitarianism, and atheism: sedition, ‘libertinism’, and ‘sodomy’ 244
8 Anathematising heretics in sixteenth- and early seventeenth-century French religious polemic 264
Contents

9 Anti-heretical and anti-schismatic literature in England from the late sixteenth to the mid-seventeenth century 281
10 Early tolerationist arguments and their condemnation 312
11 Arguments for and against religious toleration in the Netherlands, c. 1579–c. 1680 335
12 Toleration and intolerance, Jews and Muslims 371
13 Catholic justifications of intolerance in the 1680s and 1690s 396
14 Huguenot justifications of intolerance and debates over resistance in the 1680s and 1690s 418
15 Justifying intolerance in England, c. 1660–c. 1700 440

PART 3 THE 'EARLY ENLIGHTENMENT' DEFENCE OF TOLERATION AND THE 'REPUBLIC OF LETTERS' IN THE 1680S AND 1690S 467

16 Tolerationist associations in the 1680s and 1690s and virtuous service in the cause of toleration in the 'early Enlightenment republic of letters' 469
17 Political and economic arguments for religious toleration in the 1680s and 1690s 536
18 Toleration, 'heretics', and 'schismatics' 568
19 Toleration and Jews, Muslims, and 'pagans' 593
20 The historical argument for toleration and 'early Enlightenment' advocacy of 'humanity' and 'civility' 618
21 Epistemological, philological, theological, and ethical arguments for religious toleration 647
22 Toleration and the intolerant, Catholics, 'atheists', 'libertines', and 'sodomites' 680

Bibliography 720
Index 755
Titles in the series 763
## FIGURES

2.1 *The Dragonnades in Orange 1685*, by Jan Luyken. page 65

2.2 *Persecution of the Protestants in France*, by Romeyn de Hooghe. 66

13.1 *Heresy Unmasked by Truth*. 400

15.1 [Sir J. Berkenhead], *The Four-legg’d Quaker* (n.p. 1659?). 456

15.2 R. L’Estrange, *The Committee; Popery in Masquerade*. 459

16.1 J. Le Clerc, *Bibliothèque universelle et historique*. 512
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Many of the chapters of this book have been improved by their presentation at many conferences and seminars and due to the comments of numerous colleagues over many years. While at the University of Denver, I presented an early version of Chapter 16 on the ‘republic of letters’, and earlier versions of parts of Chapters 1 and 3 on Locke and the law. This book was completed at The Johns Hopkins University, with portions of the research undertaken as a By-Fellow at Churchill College, Cambridge University. To colleagues at all of these institutions I owe my gratitude for many conversations and comments. Various versions of many of these chapters were presented to a large number of conferences and seminars between 1995 and 2001, including: The American Society of Legal Historians; The University of Denver; The Cambridge University Seminar in Early Modern British History; The Institute of Historical Research Seminar on Seventeenth-Century Britain; The Conference on Conspiracies and Conspiracy Theory in Early Modern Europe organised by Michael Hunter; the British Society for the History of Philosophy Conferences on ‘The Furly Circle’ and on ‘Libertinism and Liberty’ organised by Sarah Hutton and Justin Champion; the UCLA/Clark Library Conference ‘Materialist Philosophy, Religious Heresy and Political Radicalism’ organised by Margaret Jacob and Lynn Hunt; the Seventeenth-Century Studies Conference ‘Orthodoxies and Heterodoxy’ at Durham, England, and the National Humanities Centre, North Carolina, seminar on the Enlightenment. I am grateful to all of the members of all of these many audiences for their comments, and to colleagues for invitations to speak in these locations. I have enjoyed conversations with Luisa Simonutti and am grateful to her for supplying me with copies of some of her pieces. Many colleagues have also offered words of encouragement over the years, together with comments which have sharpened the arguments of this book. I am particularly grateful to David Bell, Justin Champion, Jonathan Israel, Mark Goldie, Mary Fissell, Gabrielle Spiegel, and my former PhD supervisor, J.G.A. Pocock. Many of my colleagues, some of these individuals, and some anonymous referees suffered through a very much longer version of this book in 2001 or 2002, and I am grateful to them all for their patience. Most of all I owe my thanks to my family, including my mother, Eileen, my wife, Nina, and my daughter, Sarah.