Schubert’s Beethoven Project

Why couldn’t Schubert get his “Great” C-major Symphony performed? Why was he the first composer to consistently write four movements for his piano sonatas? Since neither Schubert’s nor Beethoven’s piano sonatas were ever performed in public, who did hear them? Addressing these questions and many others, John M. Gingerich provides a new understanding of Schubert’s career and his relationship to Beethoven. Placing the genres of string quartet, symphony, and piano sonata within the cultural context of the 1820s, the book examines how Schubert was building on Beethoven’s legacy. Gingerich brings fresh understandings of how Schubert tried to shape his career to bear on new hermeneutic readings of the works from 1824 to 1828 that share musical and extra-musical preoccupations, centering on the “Death and the Maiden” Quartet and the Cello Quintet, as well as on analyses of the A-minor Quartet, the Octet, and the “Great” C-major Symphony.

JOHN M. GINGERICH has published articles on Ignaz Schuppanzigh’s premieres of Beethoven’s late quartets, and on Schubert’s C-major Quintet, his Symphony in B minor (“Unfinished”), and his Latin Masses. He has been awarded ACLS and NEH Fellowships for his work on Schubert.
Schubert’s Beethoven Project

JOHN M. GINGERICH
CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
It furthers the University’s mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521650878

© John M. Gingerich 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Gingerich, John Michael, author.
Schubert’s Beethoven project / by John M. Gingerich.
pages cm
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-0-521-65087-8
ML410.S3G56 2014
780.92–dc23 2013043957


Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.
für Eva
Contents

List of music examples [page ix]
List of tables [xii]
Acknowledgements [xiii]
Abbreviations [xv]

Introduction [1]

1 Preparations [10]
The divide of 1824 [10]
The years of transition [12]
Genres in transition [14]
The works of transition [30]

2 The year of crisis, 1823 [41]
Schubert’s letter [41]
Illness [43]
Absence of friends [47]
Operatic frustrations [51]

3 Schuppanzigh and Schubert’s chamber music [59]
Schuppanzigh as inspiration [59]
Schuppanzigh’s misgivings [73]
Schubert’s concert – without Schuppanzigh [80]

4 Songs of death and the chamber music of 1824 [85]
Miscegenation [85]
Poems of death [88]
Quartet of death [98]

5 Schubert’s first public quartet and sonata form [105]
A conventional movement [105]
A Lied beginning [111]
Cycles and textures [121]
A Proustian narrative [134]

6 Schubert’s Octet and Beethoven’s Septet [139]
One-upping Beethoven [139]
Modeling Beethoven [145]
Contents

The expanded importance of the slow introductions [154]
The ombra scene and its return [164]

7 The Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde, Schubert, and his symphony [177]
No visible means of support [178]
Breakthrough, the Sonnleithners, and the GdMf [180]
Schubert’s public face: the partsong [185]
Schubert and the “society concerts” of the GdMf [190]
The benefits of membership [194]
Symphony frustrated [198]

8 Schubert’s heroic symphony [209]
Contradictions [209]
The way forward [211]
Horns and trombones [216]
The coda wags the movement [227]

9 The piano sonatas of 1825–1826 [236]
A new frontier [236]
The piano sonata in 1825 [240]
Reaching the public [246]

10 Schubert and his publishers [253]
Beethoven’s example [253]
Schubert’s Viennese publishers [258]
Looking to Germany [268]

11 The E-flat Piano Trio, Schubert’s career, and its two last movements [271]
An outsized movement [271]
Schubert’s benefit concert [273]
The two last movements of the E-flat Piano Trio [280]
Competing narratives [295]

12 Schubert’s annus mirabilis and the String Quintet [302]
A cello quintet [302]
Beyond Vienna, Germany, and career to “the highest in art” [304]
Shared preoccupations [308]
Singing [315]
Extremes [318]
Unreconciled [331]

Bibliography [337]
Index [348]
Music examples

4.1 “Die Götter Griechenlands” (D 677, Erste Fassung) [page 93]
4.2 A-minor String Quartet, D 804/III [93]
4.3 Octet, first measures of the slow introduction to the Finale (D 803/VI) [94]
4.4 Quotation of “Mich fassen die bleichen Gestalten der Nacht” [100]
   (a) Overture to Fierabras, first 9 mm., reduction
   (b) Emma’s cry, Fierabras, no. 19 (Quartet, “Bald wird es klar”), mm. 64–70
   (c) D 810/I, mm. 325–341
5.1 D 804/I, mm. 1–4 [112]
5.2 D 804/I, the opening melody, mm. 1–32 [115]
5.3 D 804/I, ranges of the opening melody [119]
5.4 D 804/I, second theme (mm. 57–69) [123]
5.5 D 804/I, retransition (mm. 138–177) [124]
5.6 D 804/I, modulation at the end of the bridge (mm. 49–59) [127]
5.7 D 804, second theme (mm. 57–61) and “polyphonic melody” (mm. 77–100) [128]
   (a) The start of the second theme (mm. 59ff.)
   (b) The return of the second theme (mm. 81ff.)
5.8 D 804/I, patterns of textural reference [132]
5.9 D 804/I, cycles of motivic and textural development and contrast [132]
6.1 Movement layout of the Septet and the Octet [147]
6.2 Slow introductions to the first movements [150]
   (a) Septet, op. 20/I, Adagio introduction
   (b) Octet, D 803/I, Adagio introduction
6.3 Simplified chord progressions of the Adagio introductions [154]
6.4 The introductions to the last movements [156]
   (a) Septet/VI, Andante con moto alla Marcia, mm. 1–16
   (b) Octet/VI, Andante molto, mm. 1–18
6.5 Rhythmic link, Septet/I, Adagio and Allegro con brio [159]
6.6 Rhythmic link, Octet/I, Adagio and Allegro [159]
6.7 Thematic link, Octet/I, Adagio introduction and Allegro second and closing themes [160]
6.8 Octet/I, Allegro, onset of the retransition and the recapitulatory seam, mm. 181–197 [161]
6.9 Octet/I, the bass line in the introduction and the retransition [163]
6.10 Key chart of the Octet/I [164]
6.11 Diagram of the Octet/VI, Andante molto, mm. 1–5 [166]
6.12 Octet/I and VI introductions, proportions in the cyclic return [167]
6.13 Octet/VI, key chart [169]
6.14 Octet/VI, the “modulation” to bIII, mm. 155–163 [170]
6.15 Octet/VI, the first G.P. heralding the second theme, mm. 84–99 [172]
6.16 Octet/VI, the G.P. in the development, heralding the return of the second theme, mm. 193–206 [173]
6.17 Placement of the Septet cadenza and the Octet return of the ombra music [174]
6.18 Octet/VI, the return of the ombra music, mm. 370–375 [175]
8.1 D 944/I, opening horn melody [216]
8.2 D 944/I, bridge passage to closing theme, mm. 199–228 (reduction to trombone and bass lines) [219]
8.3 D 944/I, trombone passage in the development, A-flat minor to A-flat major, mm. 304–318 (reduction to trombone and bass lines, with violin whole-tone cross-brace) [221]
8.4 D 944/I, retransition, mm. 327–357 (reduction to strings) [224]
8.5 D 944/I, first C♯ purple patch in the coda, mm. 589–609 (reduction to strings) [228]
8.6a and 8.6b D 944/I, reduction of both descents from C♯, mm. 602–608, mm. 624–634, showing the “harmonic signal” added to the second descent [229]
8.7 D 944/I, final apotheosis, mm. 662–685 [232]
11.1 Simplified chart of the form of D 929/IV [281]
11.2 Sectional proportions, D 929/IV [283]
11.3 The first suture – D 929/IV, the arrivals in both versions on the 67th chord in m. 408 (crash number five out of six in the original version) [284]
(a) original version, mm. 403–413
(b) published version, mm. 350–357 and suture to m. 408
11.4 Chart of the middle section of D 929/IV [285]
11.5 Crashes one and three (out of six in the original version) [286]
(a) mm. 160–170 in the exposition
(b) mm. 378–387 in the original version
11.6 The ‘l’istesso tempo’ theme and its variations [288]
11.7 Published version of D 929/IV, mm. 454–539, retransition through vi [291]
11.8 D 929/II, mm. 1–22 [293]
11.9 First appearance of the second movement theme (C), D 929/IV, mm. 268–289 [294]
11.10 Second appearance of the C theme, D 929/IV, mm. 470–494, original version [296]
11.11 Appearance of the C theme in the Coda, D 929/IV, mm. 793–832 [297]
11.12 Summary of formal designs [300]

12.1 Slow movement openings and returns [309]
(a) Adagio of Quintet in C major D 956 (mm. 1–4; 64–67)
(b) Andante sostenuto of Piano Sonata in B-flat major D 960 (mm. 1–4; 90–93)
(c) Andantino of Piano Sonata in A major D 959 (mm. 1–4; 159–162)
12.2a Quintet D 956/I, second theme [316]
12.2b Quintet D 956/I, reduction of second theme. Instead of V (G), the play of major chords containing G [317]
12.3 Quintet D 956/II, mm. 1–18. Instead of V (B major), the play of chords with B as a root (solid boxes) and with F as a root (dashed boxes) [321]
12.4 Quintet D 956/II, mm. 37–42 [323]
12.5 Quintet D 956/II, mm. 90–94 [328]
12.6 Scherzo of the Quintet D 956, mm. 1–16 [329]
12.7 Trio of the Quintet D 956, mm. 1–11 [330]
12.8 Quintet D 956/IV, mm. 320–334 [332]
12.9 Quintet D 956/IV, the last ten measures (mm. 420–429) [333]
12.10 “Der Atlas,” last 8 measures [335]
12.11 “Der Doppelgänger,” mm. 29–41, 51–63 [336]
Tables

1 Compositions of Schubert’s Beethoven project  [page 6]
1.1 Instrumental genres by composer  [18]
3.1 Composers of the opening instrumental chamber work in the Abendunterhaltungen  [65]
3.2 Schubert chamber works Schuppanzigh did perform or could have performed  [74]
7.1 Performances of Schubert partsongs in the four largest halls in Vienna, March 1821–March 1824  [187]
7.2 Performances of Schubert works in the GdMf’s “society concerts”  [192]
7.3 Most frequently heard composers in the Abendunterhaltungen, 1820–1828 seasons  [197]
10.1 List of Schubert’s Viennese publishers  [258]
10.2 Comparison of dates of composition and dates of publication for works in Schubert’s Beethoven project  [266]
I wish to express my sincerest and most grateful thanks to the organizations who have deemed this book worthy of financial support. To the Denkmalschmiede Höfgen, its leaders Dr. Uwe Andrich and Katharina Bahr, the Margareten Stiftung, and the Sächsisches Staatsministerium für Wissenschaft und Kunst I owe several idyllic summers on the banks of the Mulde, where work on the early stages of the book was punctuated by walks along the streams and through the fields and forests of deepest Saxony, and by many memorable meals and discussions at the Stregehaus restaurant. To the National Endowment for the Humanities and the American Council of Learned Societies I am grateful for the honor they both showed me in choosing to support my work on this book. I was able to accept only the NEH Research Fellowship since the awards coincided (the rules have since changed), but it allowed me to lead my life as an independent scholar unencumbered by student loan payments, and to invest in the root stock of my own library of Schubert and Beethoven reference books – both benefits easy to take for granted but of inestimable worth.

To the students in the graduate seminars I taught at the Peabody Conservatory who read and discussed chapters of various incarnations of this book I express my thanks for their energy and enthusiasm, and for the priceless opportunity to see my writing through their eyes. They forced me, as students will, to step back from the details of scholarly argument and documentation, and to continually reassess what I was trying to communicate within the larger frame of reference of the knowledgeable musician who is not a Schubert and Beethoven specialist. From them I received the gift of questions both naïve (most useful for emperors sporting new clothes) and sophisticated, which necessitated constant retesting and reformulating of ideas long established in my own mind. I hope they received from me some measure of epistemological awareness of the contingencies that shape knowledge, and some sense of the sheer excitement of going where no one has gone before – neither genuinely available from teachers who have never exposed an original thought to scholarly scrutiny. This exchange of gifts is the symbiosis of scholarship
Acknowledgements

and teaching, a symbiosis impossible unless scholars teach and teachers
do scholarship, and I am grateful for the opportunity to be a part of it.

I also owe many thanks to the librarians at the Peabody Conservatory
for their patient and indulgent assistance, particularly to Betsy Nelson, who
always stood at the ready when I needed help to take full advantage of the
resources of the Peabody library, and who never hesitated to accommodate
me with interlibrary loans when our own resources proved insufficient.

Numerous mentors and colleagues who read drafts of chapters and
provided valuable knowledge, insight, and criticism at crucial stages of
gestation deserve thanks: in the earliest stages Leon Plantinga, Kristina
Muxfeldt, and Kofi Agawu, and more recently Eva Mengelkoch, Lisa
Robinson, and my cousin Robert Beachy, with whom I exchanged chap-
ters over shared lunches of sushi when we were both starting to write final
drafts of our books. I have been touched and sustained by the continuing
belief shown in me and in the worth of this project by Leon Plantinga,
Walter Frisch, Scott Burnham, Susan Youens, and Christopher Gibbs, by
the letters of support they have promptly and faithfully written over the
years, and for how they have continued to ask about the book, to prod,
and to encourage.

During the final months of preparing the manuscript, my twin brother,
James Nelson Gingerich, provided the indispensable service of setting all my
musical examples in Finale, for which he somehow found time alongside
his many duties leading the Maple City Health Care Center. In the early
morning hours which he usually devotes to baking bread, delivering babies,
or spinning and weaving wool, the internet hummed with exchanges of
music examples; I am truly grateful for his indefatigable dedication and
enthusiasm. To my parents, Ray and Wilma Gingerich, I owe an upbringing
that consistently encouraged curiosity and argument, and I remain grateful
for their unflagging loyalty and encouragement. Even closer to home, and
on a daily basis, this book would not have been possible without the emo-
tional and financial support of my wife, Eva Mengelkoch. Her concertizing
as a Lied accompanist and solo pianist combined with her catholic listening
habits, passionate musicianship, and broad teaching interests have made
her a constant inspiration as well my first intellectual sounding board.
She has lived with this book almost as long and intimately as I have – it is
a kind of step-child I brought into our marriage with me, and I thank her
for owning it so fully.
Abbreviations

**AMZÖ**  
Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung mit besonderer Rücksicht auf den österreichischen Kaiserstaat. 1817–1824.

**BAMZ**  
Berliner Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung. 1824–1830.

**BB**  
Ludwig van Beethoven, Briefwechsel Gesamtausgabe, vols. 1–7. 

**BKh**  

**DsL**  

**DV**  

**EsF**  

**GdMf**  
Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde

**Kinsky-Halm**  

**LAMZ**  

**Memoirs**  

**MGG**  

**Modenzeitung**  
Wiener Zeitschrift für Kunst, Literatur, Theater und Mode. 1816–1848.
xvi Abbreviations

NZfM  Neue Zeitschrift für Musik. Leipzig: 1834–.
then Chronologisches Verzeichniß aller auf den fünf Theatern Wien’s gegebenen Vorstellungen; vom ersten November 1825 bis letzten October 1826. Nebst Angabe aller neuen Vorstellungen, Beneficen und Debiuts auf allen fünf Theatern. Sammt einem Anhange, enthaltend: alle in diesem Zeitraume gegebenen Akademien, Concerte und musikalischen Unterhaltungen, nebst vollständiger nahmementlicher Angabe aller dabey mitgewirkt habenden Individuen. Vienna: J. P. Sollinger, 1827. [This title for the next two years]