Reinterpreting Islamic Historiography

Hārūn al-Rashīd and the Narrative of the 'Abbāsid Caliphate

The history of the early 'Abbāsid caliphate in the eighth and ninth centuries has long been studied as a factual or interpretive synthesis of various accounts preserved in the medieval chronicles. Tayeb El-Hibri's book breaks with the traditional approach, applying a literary-critical reading to examine the lives of the caliphs. By focusing on the reigns of Hārūn al-Rashīd and his successors, al-Amīn and al-Ma'mūn, as well as on the early Sāmarran period, the study demonstrates how the various historical accounts were not in fact intended as faithful portraits of the past, but as allusive devices used to shed light on controversial religious, political, and social issues of the period, as well as on more abstract themes such as behaviour, morality, and human destiny. The tragedy of the Barmakids, the great civil war between the brothers, and the mihna of al-Ma'mūn are examined as key historical moments which were debated obliquely and in dialogue with the earlier Islamic past. The analysis also reveals how the exercise of decoding Islamic historiography, through an investigation of the narrative strategies and thematic motifs used in the chronicles, can uncover new layers of meaning and even identify the early narrators. This is an important book which represents a landmark in the field of early Islamic historiography.

TAYEB EL-HIBRI is Assistant Professor of Near Eastern Studies at the University of Massachusetts, Amherst.

Cambridge Studies in Islamic Civilization

Editorial board DAVID MORGAN (general editor) VIRGINIA AKSAN MICHAEL BRETT MICHAEL COOK PETER JACKSON TARIF KHALIDI ROY MOTTAHEDEH BASIM MUSALLAM CHASE ROBINSON

Titles in the series

STEFAN SPERL, Mannerism in Arabic poetry: A Structural Analysis of Selected Texts, 3rd Century AH/9th Century AD-5th Century AH/11th Century AD 0 521 35485 4 BEATRICE FORBES MANZ, The Rise and Rule of Tamerlane 0 521 40614 5 (paperback) PAUL E. WALKER, Early Philosophical Shiism: The Ismaili Neoplatonism of Abū Ya'qūb al-Sijistānī 0 521 44129 3 BOAZ SHOSHAN, Popular Culture in Medieval Cairo 0 521 43209 X STEPHEN FREDERIC DALE, Indian Merchants and Eurasian Trade, 1600–1750 0 521 45460 3 AMY SINGER, Palestinian Peasants and Ottoman Officials: Rural Administration around Sixteenth-century Jerusalem 0 521 45238 4 (hardback) 0 521 47679 8 (paperback) MICHAEL CHAMBERLAIN, Knowledge and Social Practice in Medieval Damascus, 1190-1350 0 521 45406 9 TARIF KHALIDI, Arabic Historical Thought in the Classical Period 0 521 46554 0 (hardback) 0 521 58938 X (paperback) REUVEN AMITAI-PREISS, Mongols and Mamluks: the Mamluk–Īlkhānid War, 1260-1281 0 521 46226 6 LOUISE MARLOW, Hierarchy and Egalitarianism in Islamic Thought 0 521 56430 1 JANE HATHAWAY, The Politics of Households in Ottoman Egypt: The Rise of the Qazdağlis 0 521 571103 THOMAS T. ALLSEN, Commodity and Exchange in the Mongol Empire: A Cultural History of Islamic Textiles 0 521 58301 2 DINA RIZK KHOURY, State and Provincial Society in the Ottoman Empire: Mosul, 1540-1834 0 521 59060 4 THOMAS PHILIPP AND ULRICH HAARMANN (EDS.), The Mamluks in Egyptian Politics and Society 0 521 59115 5 PETER JACKSON, The Delhi Sultanate: A Political and Military History 0 521 40477 0

KATE FLEET, European and Islamic Trade in the Early Ottoman State: The Merchants of Genoa and Turkey 0 521 64221 3

Reinterpreting Islamic Historiography

Hārūn al-Rashīd and the Narrative of the 'Abbāsid Caliphate

TAYEB EL-HIBRI

University of Massachusetts, Amherst



Cambridge University Press
0521650232 - Reinterpreting Islamic Historiography: Harun al-Rashid and the Narrative
of the Abbasid Caliphate
Tayeb El-Hibri
Frontmatter
More information
Frontmatter

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK http://www.cup.cam.ac.uk 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA http://www.cup.org 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

© Tayeb El-Hibri 1999

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1999

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeset in 10/12 Monotype Times New Roman in QuarkXPress[™] [SE]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

El-Hibri, Tayeb. Reinterpreting Islamic historiography: Hārūn al-Rashīd and the narrative of the 'Abbāsid caliphate / Tayeb El-Hibri. p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in Islamic civilization) ISBN 0 521 65023 2 (hb) I. Islamic Empire – History – 750–1258 – Historiography. 2. Hārūn al -Rashīd, Caliph, 763 (ca.)–809. I. Title. II. Series. DS38.6.E5 1999 909'.09767101–dc21 98–41833 CIP

ISBN 0 521 65023 2 hardback

Cambridge University Press	
0521650232 - Reinterpreting Islamic Historiography: Harun al-Rashid and the Narra	tive
of the Abbasid Caliphate	
Tayeb El-Hibri	
Frontmatter	
More information	

Contents

	Acknowledgments	<i>page</i> viii
	List of abbreviations and note on the dates	ix
	Genealogical table: the line of the early 'Abbāsid caliphs	xi
1	Historical background and introduction	1
2	Hārūn al-Rashīd: where it all started or ended	17
3	Al-Amīn: the challenge of regicide in Islamic memory	59
4	Al-Ma'mūn: the heretic Caliph	95
5	The structure of civil war narratives	143
6	Al-Mutawakkil: an encore of the family tragedy	178
	Conclusion	216
	Select bibliography	221
	Index	230

Acknowledgments

This book began as a study of the reign of the 'Abbāsid caliph al-Ma'mūn and the pivotal political and religious transitions that accompanied his rise to power. Since its completion, however, the original objective which centered on biographical and historical goals has gradually changed toward the historiographical, exploring how medieval narrators constructed a particular memory of the early 'Abbāsid caliphate within the broader frame of early Islamic history. I would like to thank various scholars who commented on the project in its initial stage, and showed wholehearted interest in the topic. Professor Peter Awn, Caroline Bynum, Olivia R. Constable, Nina Garsoian, and Mohammad Mbodj provided many useful and diverse comments. The late professor Jeanette Wakin took a special interest in the project, and carefully read a draft of the manuscript, with her customary refinements of style, and was very eager to see it in print. Colleagues at the University of Massachusetts, especially Drs. Jay Berkovitz, Robert Sullivan, and Mary Wilson also provided encouragement and offered thoughtprovoking questions in various seminars. Conservations with Professor Lawrence Conrad on Islamic historiography were always especially enlightening and corroborated several tentative venues for evaluating the 'Abbāsid texts. Equally important were discussions with Professor Elton Daniel on the relation between Arabic and Persian historiography and the state of the field. Dr. Ayman Fu'ad Sayyid saved me enormous time by clarifying from early on the state of publication of hitherto manuscript works, and pointed to different editions. On the frontiers of style, thanks go to Ms. Janet Benton and Mary Starkey for copyediting the manuscript with care and interest. The prime debt, however, goes to professor Richard W. Bulliet who read and critiqued the work in various drafts, and was a source of continuous support. His thoughtful historical questions on a broad range of issues were especially inspiring, and convinced me that early Islamic history is far from being a closed topic.

Abbreviations

EI	Encyclopaedia of Islam (new ed.)
HT	History of al-Tabarī (SUNY translation; in bibliography
	under translators' names)
IJMES	International Journal of Middle East Studies
Jahshiyārī	al-Jahshiyārī, <i>al-Wuzarā` wa'l-Kuttāb</i>
al-Kāmil	Ibn al-Athīr, <i>al-Kāmil fi'l-Ta'rīkh</i>
Khatīb	al-Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī, <i>Taʾrīkh Baghdād</i>
Murūj	al-Masʿūdī, Murūj al-Dhahab wa Maʿādin al-Jawhar
Muwaffaqiyyāt	al-Zubayr b. Bakkār, <i>al-Akhbār al-Muwaffaqiyyāt</i>
RMM	Revue du Monde Musulman
RSO	Rivista degli Studi Orientali
Siyar	al-Dhahabī, <i>Siyar Aʿlām al-Nubalāʾ</i>
<u>Ț</u> abarī	al-Ṭabarī, Ta'rīkh al-Rusul wa'l-Mulūk (de Goeje ed.)

Note on the dates

The dates given in this study are primarily common-era dates. Whenever relevant, $hijr\bar{i}$ dates are also given in brackets and occasionally relied on in light of the context of analysis, as in chapter 5.

The line of the early 'Abbāsid caliphs

