Successive Indian governments from a variety of political persuasions have remained committed to market-oriented reform since its introduction in 1991. In a well-argued, accessible and often controversial examination of the political dynamics which underlie that commitment, Rob Jenkins takes issue with existing theories of the relationship between democracy and economic liberalisation, while also engaging with key debates concerning the nature of civil society and the functionality of political institutions. He contends that while democracy and liberalisation are no longer considered incompatible, recent theorising over-emphasises democracy’s more wholesome aspects while underestimating its practitioners’ reliance on obfuscatory tactics to defuse political resistance to policy shifts. By focusing on formal institutions such as party and electoral systems, existing research ignores the value of informal political institutions. In India these institutions have driven economic elites towards adaptation, negotiation and compromise, while allowing governing elites to divide opponents of reform through a range of political machinations. These include shifting blame, surreptitiously compensating selected interests, betraying the trust of political allies, and cloaking policy change in the guise of continuity. Rather than simply denouncing democracy’s dark underside, Jenkins argues that promoting change routinely requires governments to employ the underhanded tactics and impure motivations which all politics breed, but only democracy can tame.

**Rob Jenkins** teaches in the Department of Politics and Sociology at Birkbeck College, University of London.
Contemporary South Asia has been established to publish books on the politics, society and culture of South Asia since 1947. In accessible and comprehensive studies, authors who are already engaged in researching specific aspects of South Asian society explore a wide variety of broad-ranging and topical themes. The series will be of interest to anyone who is concerned with the study of South Asia and with the legacy of its colonial past.

1 Ayesha Jalal, *Democracy and Authoritarianism in South Asia: A Comparative and Historical Perspective* 0 521 478626 (paperback)
2 Jan Breman, *Footloose Labour: Working in India’s Informal Economy* 0 521 560837 (hardback) 0 521 568242 (paperback)
3 Roger Jeffery and Patricia Jeffery, *Population, Gender and Politics: Demographic Change in Rural North India* 0 521 46116 2 (hardback) 0 521 46653 9 (paperback)
4 Oliver Mendelsohn and Marika Vicziany, *The Untouchables: Subordination, Poverty and the State in Modern India* 0 521 55362 8 (hardback) 0 521 55671 6 (paperback)
Democratic Politics and Economic Reform in India

Rob Jenkins

Birkbeck College, University of London
Democratic politics and economic reform in India / Rob Jenkins.

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 0 521 65016 X (hardback) ISBN 0 521 65987 6 (paperback)

1. Democracy -- India. 2. India -- Politics and government -- 1977--
3. Free enterprise -- India. 4. India -- Economic policy -- 1980--
5. Title. II. Series: Contemporary South Asia (Cambridge, England); 5.


ISBN 0 521 65016 X hardback
ISBN 0 521 65987 6 paperback
Contents

Acknowledgements vii
Map States of the Indian federal union x

1 Introduction 1

2 The evolution of economic reform in India 12

3 Theoretical and comparative perspectives on the politics of economic reform 42

4 Political incentives: elite perceptions and the calculus of survival 83

5 Political institutions: federalism, informal networks, and the management of dissent 119

6 Political skills: introducing reform by stealth 172

7 Implications 208

Bibliography 230
Index 245
For M.S.J.
Acknowledgements

Giving due recognition to everyone who has assisted me in the course of completing this book is impossible. Even trying to list them all would be a daunting task. Many, particularly those in government, cannot be named, as they provided information on condition of anonymity. This makes things easier, but only slightly.

I must first thank Jim Manor, who was an outstanding PhD supervisor, going far beyond the call of duty. In the nearly fourteen years since I took my first undergraduate course on Indian politics with him, he has been a great source of information, provocation, and guidance. I could not have wished for a better guru.

I am also grateful to the many people in India who invited me into their homes and offices, shared their thoughts, and parted with papers from their personal collections. Hundreds of people made time for me, but I can name only a few. First, E. Raghavan, who gave me my first on-the-ground introduction to Indian politics, in informal tutorials in his Bangalore office and on the campaign trail during panchayat elections in late 1986. He continued to enlighten me and assist me during the research for this book. Also in Bangalore, I have over the years received stimulating insights, as well as friendship, from Narendar Pani and Jamuna Rao.

In Rajasthan, I received critical guidance and support from the late Professor Iqbal Narain, Professor V. S. Vyas, and Dr P. C. Mathur. My association with the Institute of Development Studies, Jaipur, was invaluable. At IDS-Jaipur, I benefited from discussions with Shail Mayaram, K. L. Kochhar, Ratna Reddy, Sunil Ray, and Pradeep Bhargava. I was also aided greatly by many hours spent in the Indian Coffee House discussing Rajasthan politics with Sunny Sebastian of The Hindu, who, perhaps because he belongs to Kerala, was able to combine insider knowledge with an outsider’s perspective, and convey both with great flair. Sanjiv Srivastava of the Indian Express and the BBC also shared his intimate knowledge of political events and personalities in discussions in Jaipur, New Delhi, and London. I would like to thank S. Ramanathan, Surjit
Singh, and Kavita Srivastava (and her warm and welcoming family) for their ideas, friendship and many kindnesses.

In Maharashtra, my first thanks go to Gopal Guru of the University of Pune, who took time out of his own research to escort me personally around western Maharashtra, introducing me to his many friends in activism, politics, and journalism. Another Maharashtrian, Professor B. S. Baviskar, provided much needed advice. In Bombay, Kumar Ketkar of the Maharashtra Times patiently corrected me on my many misapprehensions on a number of occasions over the past several years. Mayank Bhatt of Business India, Sanjoy Narayan and Niranjan Rajadhyaksha of Business World, and Mahesh Vijapurkar of The Hindu were all extremely helpful. I am also indebted to Ramya Subrahmanian, Vandana Desai, and Dara Mehta for making Bombay seem more like home.

In New Delhi, Om Prakash Rana and his family have been gracious hosts to me over the years. Sanjaya Baru, formerly of the Times of India, has been extremely generous with his time and ideas. I have also benefitted enormously from my ongoing informal relationship with the Centre for the Study of Developing Societies in Delhi. I am particularly grateful to Yogendra Yadav, whose clear-headedness has helped me to re-think important aspects of my research. Others at CSDS who have, at one point or another, provided useful advice include Ashis Banerjee, Harsh Sethi, D. L. Sheth, and Giri Deshingkar. Discussions with E. Sridharan and Pran Chopra of the Centre for Policy Research have enlightened me in many ways.

This book would not have been possible without the help of many libraries and librarians. The first thanks must go to the friendly and efficient staff at the British Library for Development Studies. The staff at Bombay’s Centre for Education and Documentation were extremely helpful, as were librarians at the University of Rajasthan, University of Pune, the Institute of Development Studies in Jaipur, the Times of India offices in Bangalore and Bombay, and the Rajasthan Patrika in Jaipur.

I am grateful to John Toye, Michael Lipton, Mick Moore, Mark Robinson, and Charles Harvey of the Institute of Development Studies, and Ian Duncan and Bruce Graham of the University of Sussex, for their comments on earlier versions of this and related work. Observations by David Potter and Gurharpal Singh also proved very helpful.

Other friends and colleagues from my time at IDS also contributed useful insights and a supportive environment, particularly Samer al-Samarrai, Sally Baden, Ulrich Bartsch, Lyla Mehta, Khalid Nadvi, Paul Shaffer, Arti and Saurabh Sinha, and Shen-Lang Tang. Many thanks also to my colleagues in the Department of Politics and Sociology at Birbeck College, especially Jane Tinkler, who has kept me abreast of events during
my long periods outside of London, and Sunil Khilnani, who listened patiently to my half-formed ideas and also read the entire draft manuscript.

I have benefited from the reactions of seminar participants at the Centre for South Asian Studies, Cambridge; Queen Elizabeth House, Oxford; the Institute of Development Studies (Sussex and Jaipur); the Institute of Commonwealth Studies, London; the US Department of State; and conference programmes of the American Political Science Association, the UK Development Studies Association, and the European Association of South Asian Studies. Members of the Indian Administrative Service participating in the annual study courses organised jointly by the Institute of Development Studies and India’s National Academy of Administration (Mussoorie) have been a source of constructive commentary. I also received useful feedback from Pranab Bardhan, Geoffrey Hawthorn, Loraine Kennedy, and Ashutosh Varshney – each of whom read all or most of the draft manuscript.

I gratefully acknowledge the generous financial support of the UK Department for International Development, the Nuffield Foundation, the Birkbeck College Small Grants Scheme, and the British Council. A grant from the Ford Foundation, related to a separate research project, also assisted this study by getting me to India for two final field visits in 1997 and 1998–99.

Elizabeth Heichler, Andrew Spooner, Bliss Austin, Patrick Barton, Jason Burns, Brian Schaffield, Claire Taylor, and Menno Ravenhorst all deserve hearty thanks for the sustenance their friendship has provided.

My brothers Ron and Joseph and my sister Tamara have done me a great service by setting high intellectual standards. They have also given me great love and encouragement. I have the best siblings there are. I am also indebted to Lillian and Douglas Annett for the many times they have gone out of their way to be supportive.

Anne Marie Goetz has helped me in more ways than I can say. Her proofreading services were the least of her contributions. She has been patient, loving, thoughtful, and kind. Though these things come naturally to her, they must have required great effort as this project dragged on. She deserves more gratitude than I can offer.

Finally, my thanks go to Max, just for showing up.
Map States of the Indian federal union.