

INDEX

Act of state doctrine, 233-4	obligations
African Charter on Human and Peoples'	legislative measures to give effect to
Rights (African Charter)	treaty, 336, 345-6
monitoring procedures, 276	reporting obligations. See reporting
Aliens	obligations <i>below</i>
compensation for war damage	reporting obligations, 335-46
HRC view, 264–5	amendment, need for, 341, 344
fingerprinting	article 42 obligation to copy to
ICCPR and, 260-1	IACHR copies of reports to other
Alternative dispute resolution	inter-American Committees,
conciliation, 214	337-9; economic, social and
national human rights institutions, 214,	cultural rights and, 338-9; —,
215	IACHR request for such reports,
American Convention on Human Rights	338; —, ineffectiveness, 337–8
(ACHR)	article 43 power to request reports
See also Inter-American Commission of	on implementation of Convention,
Human Rights (IACHR); Inter-	337
American Court of Human Rights	article 50 confidential report on
breach	failure to reach friendly
failure to cooperate in fact-finding	settlement transmission to
visit, 343	individual, 341
communications and individual petitions	article 51 report on failure to reach
effectiveness, 343, 346	friendly settlement publication,
friendly settlement, 336, 339-41;	341
IACHR reporting obligation,	dependence on request from IACHR,
articles 48-9, 339-40; —, articles	336
50-1, 340-1	division between states parties and
economic, social and cultural rights	IACHR, 344
article 42 reporting obligations and,	effectiveness, 343
338-9	IACHR, friendly settlement of
San Salvador Protocol, 338-9	communications and individual
fact-finding visits, 343	petitions, 339–41
effectiveness, 346	limited role, 342



Amnesty legislation	HRC
legality	special report, 441, 446
Peru, 176–9	NGOs
South Africa, 285	training, 456
Anti-Racism Information Service, 72	technical assistance, 456
Apartheid	Burden of proof
CERD and, 59, 75	transfer as result of NGOs' evidence,
violation of	186–7
international treaty norms, 282	Burundi
rule of law, 282	racial discrimination, 77
Australia	
aborigines in custody	Canada
CAT Committee's lack of interest, 184	legislation, interpretation
Human Rights and Equal Opportunity	aids, non-binding international
Commission (HREOC), 210	instruments, 267–8
economic, social and cultural rights,	strike, right to, 267–8
215 n40	CAT (Convention Against Torture)
limitations on, 210 n22	accessions, 147
mandate, 212, 214 n38	applicability
NGOs, 184	acts of individuals, 386
	complaints
Bangladesh	by individuals, 145
racial discrimination, 77	by states parties, 145
Barbados	optional nature, 145
death penalty, 10 n17	implementation
withdrawal from ICCPR Optional	visiting system, draft Optional
Protocol, 10 n17	Protocol, 146–7
Bayefsky, Anne, 501–22	inquiry on basis of well-founded
Bosnia and Herzegovina	indications of systematic practice of
See also Emergency situations	torture, 145-6, 166-7, 169-72
CEDAW Committee's recommendations,	See also CAT Committee, inquiry
446	procedure
CERD Committee:	jurisdiction
concluding observations, 445-6;	acts committed by non-nationals
decisions, 449-51; special report,	abroad, 325
441–2	extension to acts committed within
compliance with human rights	country, 326
obligations	implementing legislation, need for,
obstacles to, 456-7	325
CRC Committee	non-refoulement, 146, 325
recommendation, 452	reporting obligations, 145
reluctance to act, 458-9	Committee's right to act in absence of
GFA	report, 148-9, 173
compatibility with CERD, 75-6, 450,	effectiveness of periodic reporting,
457	164
human rights obligations, effect on	non-compliance, 147–9
capacity to comply, 457	special reports, 164, 165-6, 185-7
role of UN human rights instruments	reservations
and treaty bodies, 454-7	USA, 324–6



CAT Committee	shortcomings and recommendations
Chair's powers	for reform: easing of request to visit
decisions to promote compliance with	procedures, 172; —, establishment
Convention, 166	of, bureau to work intersessionally,
concluding observations, 153-4, 155-6,	172; —, working group, 172; —,
172	streamlining of procedures, 172,
See also general comments below	173; —, time limits, 171
compliance with, 162–3	visits: difficulty of getting agreement
recommendations for improvement:	to, 169–70; —, NGO information
accuracy in dealing with legal issues,	as alternative, 170, 174; —, value
159–60; —, closer reflection of	of observations in absence of,
discussion, 158–9; —, inclusion of	170 n88; —, visits by Special
counter arguments, 158–9; —,	Rapporteur on Torture compared,
Secretariat involvement in drafting,	170, 174
160–1; —, self-containment, 157–8;	meetings
—, specificity, 156–7, 158	duration and frequency, 149
usefulness, 144	publicity, 182–4
ECHR organs compared, 146	membership
effectiveness	predominance of lawyers, 418–19
in absence of interest in subject-	quality, 151–4
matter, 184	requirements: failure to achieve, 416
expulsion, return and extradition,	n39; —, geographical diversity, 414;
146	—, nationals of nominating states,
follow-up, 172	412; —, recognised competence in
fact-finding visits following discussion	the field of human rights, 21, 28,
of report, 174	
NGOs' role, 163, 182	420; —, 'usefulness of persons having legal experience', 414–15,
	418–19
general comments	
See also concluding observations above	NGOs and, 150–1
publication, 173	alternative reports: Russian
recommendation for greater use, 173	Federation, 181–2
role, 156	follow-up to Committee's concluding
treaty interpretation and, 155–6	observations, 162
Hong Kong (1995), 297	Hong Kong, 297
HRC and	information about potential
action in respect of same situation,	violations, 150–1, 172, 183–4,
165	185-7
practice compared, 135	inquiry procedure and, 170
inquiry procedure	Israel, 185–7
follow-up, 168–9; reporting procedure	Northern Ireland prisoners, 182–4
as, 168–9	reports
limited application, 165–6, 169–72	Committee's ability to act in absence
NGO information as basis, 170	of, 148
optional nature, 146, 166–7	critical and informed approach to
problems relating to, 165–6, 169–72	states parties' reporting, 181–2,
procedure, 166–7; cumbersome	183–4
nature, 170–2	overdue reports, measures to deal
request for special report and, 165–6,	with, 148–9
168–9	periodic reports, Guidelines, 162



Index

shortcomings and recommendations increased resources, need for, 154 for reform, 149-54: greater more active exercise of Committee's consistency and conceptualisation, powers, 172, 173 151-4; —, greater use of special technical assistance, recommendations reports, 173; --, improved for, 220 guidelines for drafting reports, urgent matters, 164-6 153-4; —, improved preparations workload, examination of reports, 149 **CEDAW** (Convention for the Elimination for meetings, 154; —, tailored/ thematic reports, 70-1, 154 of Discrimination against Women) special, 165-6, 185-7: Chair's right to accessions, 79 request between sessions, 166; ---, communications, absence of provision Committee's power to request, 164; for, 74, 80-1: Optional Protocol, -, 'extraordinary circumstances', 80-1, 110need for, 169-70; --, inquiry Optional Protocol, NGOs' contribution to, 105 procedure and, 165-6; —, Israel ratifications, USA, 326-7 (1997), 185-7statistics, 147-8, 149 reporting obligations: Committee's right role to act in absence of report, 110; —, 'comments and suggestions to states cycle, 80; --, NGOs, 80; --, parties', 2 n2 IWRAW guide, 105; --, specialised consideration of reports, 145: agencies, 80 effectiveness, 150-4 reservations, 109, 397-8 examination of complaints from special report, former Yugoslavia, 442 states/individuals, 145 UNHCHR Technical Assistance general comments, 153-4 Programme and, 223-4 inquiry on basis of 'well-founded **CEDAW Committee** indications', 145-6 administrative support. See Secretariat more active exercise, need for, 172, concluding comments Secretariat, enhanced role, need for, 173 realism, 446 shortcomings and recommendations for role of: country rapporteurs, 93-6; ---, reform pre-session working group, 96; —, assimilation of report and inquiry Secretariat, 94-6 structure, 94, 95 procedures, 174 clearer indication of what is expected timing, 95-6from states parties, 173 cooperation and coordination with other concluding observations. See UN bodies, 98-104, 467 concluding observations, Commission on Human Rights, 99 recommendations for improvement Commission on the Status of Women, ahove enhanced role for Secretariat, 173 Committee on the Rights of the Child, follow-up, 161-3, 168-9, 172: fact-99 - 100finding missions, 163; -, role of constraints, 100 NGOs, 163; —, role of Special Glen Cove Roundtable, 100, 475 Rapporteur on Torture, 163; interchange of information, 99 substance and form distinguished, special rapporteurs on relevant issues, 101-2: Special Rapporteur on improvement in quality of debates, Violence against Women, its Causes 172 and Consequences, 101, 102-3



More information

Index

Sub-Commission on the Prevention of Discrimination and Protection of Minorities, 101 general recommendations, 96-8 formulation, 97-8: role of NGOs, 97, 105, 107; -, specialised agencies and other UN bodies, 97 harmonisation with those of other human rights bodies, 97-8 low profile, 79, 192 meetings duration and frequency, 81-3: proposed change, 82-3 location, 82 participation: NGOs, 80, 105-8; --, specialized agencies, 80 membership diversity, 436 n85: gender imbalance, 413 n27, 417, 437 independence and NGOs' role, 106 lawyers, 419 requirements: competence in the field covered by the Convention, 420; ---, 'equitable geographical distribution', 80, 412, 416; ---, specialisation, 91, 92 monitoring of work by International Women's Rights Action Watch (IWRAW), 105 NGOs and, 97, 105-8 enhancement of role, responsibility for, 108 guidelines, need for, 108 inclusion in government delegations, 191 n29 involvement in preparation of states parties' reports, 191 Secretariat role in respect of, 107–8 proceedings: pre-sessional working group, 89-90; NGO participation, 107 private decision on concluding comments, 95 reform. See shortcomings and recommendations for reform below reports. See reports below reports, 84-5 Committee's ability to act in absence of, 110

concluding comments. See concluding comments above country rapporteur, role, 90, 92-6 identification and refinement of issues, 87-8; timing, 88-9 overdue, 84; measures to deal with, 110 procedure: initial reports, 90, 91, 92; —, periodic reports, 91 reform of proceedings. See shortcomings and recommendations for reform below special report on Zaire, 187 updates, 86-7 role, 2 n2 consideration of reports, 80, 84-93 examination of reports, 80 monitoring of integration of gender perspectives into work of other institutions, 100-1, 223 reluctance to remain within, 85, 97 'suggestions and general recommendations', 80, 217 n43 Secretariat, 81-2, 83-4 proposal for change, 467; from Division for the Advancement of Women to the Centre for Human Rights, 83-4, 107-8, 470 shortcomings and recommendations for answers to questions to serve as next report, 87-8 concluding comments. See concluding comments above consolidation of reporting obligations, 84-5, 86-7; updates and, 86-7 continuous need for, 110-11 cooperation and coordination with other treaty bodies, 98-108, 192 facilitation of dialogue, 91-2 general recommendations. See general recommendations above improved guidelines for drafting reports, 93 information technology, 108 NGO involvement. See NGOs and pre-sessional working group, specialisation, 92 Secretariat, See Secretariat above



stock-taking, 109–10	obligations of states parties
tailored/thematic reports, 87-8	reports on discharge of treaty
timing of pre-sessional meetings, 87-9	obligations, 58
working methods: increase in number	reporting obligation
of reports per session, 85; —,	on discharge of treaty obligations, 58
limitation of number of questions,	states parties: capacity to meet, 58; —,
89; —, refinement of issues, 92; —,	misunderstanding of implications,
shorter time-scale for answering	68–9
questions, 89; —, specialisation of	two-yearly cycle, importance, 74
Committee membership, 92; —,	sanctions
time limits on interventions, 92-3	See also CERD Committee
specialised agencies and, 97	absence, 72–3
CEDAW guidelines, need for, 104	CERD Committee, 60
consideration of initial reports, 104	admissibility
oral submissions, 103-4	joinder with merits, 489
written submissions, 103	concluding observations
technical assistance, recommendations	Bosnia and Herzegovina, 445-6
for, 219	collective view, 67
web site, 94	comments by reporting state, 60
workload	drafting, 60
factors likely to lead to increase, 85-6	publication in CERD Annual Report, 51
measures to control, 84–93, 110	refinement of issues, aid to, 67
Centre for Human Rights	decisions
CEDAW and, 83–4	1986–96 record, 65–6
CERD (Convention on the Elimination	Bosnia and Herzegovina, 449–51
of All Forms of Racial	continuity of membership and, 68
Discrimination)	non-CERD business, 67
applicability	procedure, 66
apartheid, 59, 75	rules of procedure amendments, 67
ethnic cleansing, 75–8	difficulties in reaching agreement, 64, 68
General Recommendations: VIII	establishment, 3
(self-identification of racial or	evidence
ethnic group), 77; —, XIX (patterns	evidence NGOs, 59
ethnic group), 77; —, XIX (patterns of residential segregation), 76; —,	evidence NGOs, 59 personal experience, 59
ethnic group), 77; —, XIX (patterns of residential segregation), 76; —, XXI (territorial integrity/political	evidence NGOs, 59 personal experience, 59 general recommendations
ethnic group), 77; —, XIX (patterns of residential segregation), 76; —, XXI (territorial integrity/political unity), 76; —, XXII (refugees), 76;	evidence NGOs, 59 personal experience, 59 general recommendations See also CERD (Convention for
ethnic group), 77; —, XIX (patterns of residential segregation), 76; —, XXI (territorial integrity/political unity), 76; —, XXII (refugees), 76; —, XXIII (indigenous peoples), 76	evidence NGOs, 59 personal experience, 59 general recommendations See also CERD (Convention for the Elimination of Racial
ethnic group), 77; —, XIX (patterns of residential segregation), 76; —, XXI (territorial integrity/political unity), 76; —, XXII (refugees), 76; —, XXIII (indigenous peoples), 76 racial discrimination as defined by	evidence NGOs, 59 personal experience, 59 general recommendations See also CERD (Convention for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination), applicability
ethnic group), 77; —, XIX (patterns of residential segregation), 76; —, XXI (territorial integrity/political unity), 76; —, XXII (refugees), 76; —, XXIII (indigenous peoples), 76 racial discrimination as defined by ILO Convention Concerning	evidence NGOs, 59 personal experience, 59 general recommendations See also CERD (Convention for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination), applicability 1986–96 record, 64
ethnic group), 77; —, XIX (patterns of residential segregation), 76; —, XXI (territorial integrity/political unity), 76; —, XXII (refugees), 76; —, XXIII (indigenous peoples), 76 racial discrimination as defined by ILO Convention Concerning Discrimination in respect of	evidence NGOs, 59 personal experience, 59 general recommendations See also CERD (Convention for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination), applicability 1986–96 record, 64 development of effectiveness of CERD
ethnic group), 77; —, XIX (patterns of residential segregation), 76; —, XXI (territorial integrity/political unity), 76; —, XXII (refugees), 76; —, XXIII (indigenous peoples), 76 racial discrimination as defined by ILO Convention Concerning Discrimination in respect of Employment and Occupation, 76	evidence NGOs, 59 personal experience, 59 general recommendations See also CERD (Convention for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination), applicability 1986–96 record, 64 development of effectiveness of CERD and, 70
ethnic group), 77; —, XIX (patterns of residential segregation), 76; —, XXI (territorial integrity/political unity), 76; —, XXII (refugees), 76; —, XXIII (indigenous peoples), 76 racial discrimination as defined by ILO Convention Concerning Discrimination in respect of Employment and Occupation, 76 dispute settlement provisions	evidence NGOs, 59 personal experience, 59 general recommendations See also CERD (Convention for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination), applicability 1986–96 record, 64 development of effectiveness of CERD and, 70 difficulties in reaching, 64
ethnic group), 77; —, XIX (patterns of residential segregation), 76; —, XXI (territorial integrity/political unity), 76; —, XXII (refugees), 76; —, XXIII (indigenous peoples), 76 racial discrimination as defined by ILO Convention Concerning Discrimination in respect of Employment and Occupation, 76 dispute settlement provisions states parties' failure to deploy, 73	evidence NGOs, 59 personal experience, 59 general recommendations See also CERD (Convention for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination), applicability 1986–96 record, 64 development of effectiveness of CERD and, 70 difficulties in reaching, 64 ethnic cleansing, 75–6
ethnic group), 77; —, XIX (patterns of residential segregation), 76; —, XXI (territorial integrity/political unity), 76; —, XXII (refugees), 76; —, XXIII (indigenous peoples), 76 racial discrimination as defined by ILO Convention Concerning Discrimination in respect of Employment and Occupation, 76 dispute settlement provisions states parties' failure to deploy, 73 implementation	evidence NGOs, 59 personal experience, 59 general recommendations See also CERD (Convention for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination), applicability 1986–96 record, 64 development of effectiveness of CERD and, 70 difficulties in reaching, 64 ethnic cleansing, 75–6 Hong Kong (1996), 297–8
ethnic group), 77; —, XIX (patterns of residential segregation), 76; —, XXI (territorial integrity/political unity), 76; —, XXII (refugees), 76; —, XXIII (indigenous peoples), 76 racial discrimination as defined by ILO Convention Concerning Discrimination in respect of Employment and Occupation, 76 dispute settlement provisions states parties' failure to deploy, 73 implementation national human rights institutions	evidence NGOs, 59 personal experience, 59 general recommendations See also CERD (Convention for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination), applicability 1986–96 record, 64 development of effectiveness of CERD and, 70 difficulties in reaching, 64 ethnic cleansing, 75–6 Hong Kong (1996), 297–8 judicial or quasi-judicial body
ethnic group), 77; —, XIX (patterns of residential segregation), 76; —, XXI (territorial integrity/political unity), 76; —, XXII (refugees), 76; —, XXIII (indigenous peoples), 76 racial discrimination as defined by ILO Convention Concerning Discrimination in respect of Employment and Occupation, 76 dispute settlement provisions states parties' failure to deploy, 73 implementation national human rights institutions and, 209 n17	evidence NGOs, 59 personal experience, 59 general recommendations See also CERD (Convention for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination), applicability 1986–96 record, 64 development of effectiveness of CERD and, 70 difficulties in reaching, 64 ethnic cleansing, 75–6 Hong Kong (1996), 297–8 judicial or quasi-judicial body factors affecting development as:
ethnic group), 77; —, XIX (patterns of residential segregation), 76; —, XXI (territorial integrity/political unity), 76; —, XXII (refugees), 76; —, XXIII (indigenous peoples), 76 racial discrimination as defined by ILO Convention Concerning Discrimination in respect of Employment and Occupation, 76 dispute settlement provisions states parties' failure to deploy, 73 implementation national human rights institutions	evidence NGOs, 59 personal experience, 59 general recommendations See also CERD (Convention for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination), applicability 1986–96 record, 64 development of effectiveness of CERD and, 70 difficulties in reaching, 64 ethnic cleansing, 75–6 Hong Kong (1996), 297–8 judicial or quasi-judicial body



legal approach to consideration of	explanations of vote, 65
communications, 55	private consideration of
jurisdiction	communications, 55
declaration accepting competence, 55	reporting obligation
meetings	alternative reports, 297-8, 301
absences from, 61	reports, 57–60
cancellation, 7	country rapporteur, role, 60
frequency and duration, 60, 74-5	examination: NGOs, 70
management of business:	identification and refinement of issues,
responsibility of Chair, 61-3; —,	58
scope for improvement, 74–5	participation by non-reporting states,
participation: national human rights	73
commission, 216 n42; —, national	reform. See shortcomings and
of reporting state, 67	recommendations for reform below
membership	role
absences from meetings, 61	at political/legal interface, 73
constraints on commitment, 71, 74-5	consideration of reports and
continuity, 68	communications, relative
equality, 57	importance, 63
prevalence of diplomats and foreign	definition of issues, 59; reluctance of
policy specialists, 58–9	states parties to concede, 59
requirements: 'equitable geographical	deployment of preventive procedures,
distribution and representation	73
of the different forms of civilisation	examination of reports, 73
as well as of the principal legal	issue of opinions on communications,
systems', 57; —, 'honourable,	73
faithful, impartial, and	racial discrimination and
conscientious' discharge of duties,	characterisation of conflicts
57; —, independence of	distinguished, 78
government, 57; —, nationals of	reluctance to remain within, 59, 62–3,
nominating state, 412	450
national human rights institutions and	review of implementation in case of
recommendation for establishment,	overdue report, 73
209 n17	'suggestions and general
NGOs and, 69-70, 72, 297-8	recommendations', 2 n2, 217 n43
obligations: report based on	Rules
'examination of the reports and	role of Chair, 63
information received from the	sanctions
States Parties', 59, 66–7; —, ability	exclusion from elections, 72
to act in absence of, 66–7	failure to report, 72
overdue reports, 60	non-payment of dues, 72
frequency of obligation, importance,	states parties' reluctance to support,
71	72–3
measures to deal with, 4, 66-7	shortcomings and recommendations for
proceedings	reform
communications, 57; adversarial	advance notice of questions to
nature, 57; —, legal representation,	reporting states, 70
57; —, privacy, 55	General Assembly support for, 66, 69
consensus, 59	improved publicity, 449-50, 451



increased frequency or length of	NGOs
meetings, 74–5	importance of role, 375-6
information technology, 71	International Union for the
intersessional authority, 451	Conservation of Nature (IUCN),
intersessional meetings, 70	375
lack of resources, 482, 483	involvement in review of states'
tailored/thematic reports, 70–1	reports, 377
transfer of responsibility for	reports, status of, 375–6
preliminary work to professional	non-compliance
staff, 75	sanctions, 371, 373
translation delays, 71	procedural obligations, 369
special reports	reporting obligations
Bosnia and Herzegovina, 441–2	compliance, 361 n3, 373
technical assistance, recommendations	review of reports, performance of
for, 219, 220, 458	
workload	individual states, 371
	varying cycles, 374
effect of emergency situations, 453	Secretariat
examination of reports, 73–4	role, 375–6
measures to control, 64–5	Climate Change Convention
Children. See CRC	financial and technical assistance, 373,
China	376
See also Hong Kong	implementation and compliance, 371
reporting obligations in respect of Hong	reporting obligations, 368 n24, 370,
Kong, 300, 312–13	376
CHR (Commission on Human Rights)	compliance, 376
national human rights institutions	encouragement of dialogue, 377
participation in meetings, 208 n14	in-depth review of reports, 376-7;
recommendations	country visits, 377; —, procedure,
source of international law, 264	376–7
role	resources, 376
1235 and 1503 procedures, 20 n5	Commission on Human Rights see CHR
expansion, 20	Committee on Economic, Social and
Special Rapporteur on the situation in	Cultural Rights see ICESCR
the former Yugoslavia, 443-4	Committee
status, 2 n2	Committee on the Rights of the Child see
willingness to take firm stance, 194	CRC Committee
Ciskei	Communications and individual petitions
international law	See also Communications and
primacy, 282–3	individual petitions (ICCPR
legislation, interpretation, Universal	Optional Protocol)
Declaration of Human Rights and,	absence of provision (ICESCR, CEDAW
283	CRC), 74, 80–1
Universal Declaration of Human Rights	CEDAW Optional Protocol, 80–1
legislation, aid to interpretation, 283	CERD
CITES	declaration recognising Committee's
drafting	competence, 55; statistics, 72
International Union for the	procedure, legal approach, 57
Conservation of Nature (IUCN),	complaints distinguished, 22
375	effectiveness, 343–4



environmental organisations, 362	minority rights and, 26
NAFTA Side Agreement, 362 n5	procedure
ESC, 359	legal approach, 29-30
inter-American system. See American	privacy, 22, 29
Convention on Human Rights	ratification
(ACHR)	southern Africa, 276
Optional Protocol/CERD take-up	statistics, 72
distinguished, 72	reform of procedure. See admissibility,
shortcomings and recommendations for	recommendations for stricter
reform, 8–9, 468	criteria above; HRC, shortcomings
delay between submission and	and recommendations for reform
consideration by committee, 3–5,	regional institutions, preference for, 31
8-9	n32, 38 n42
resource implications, 468	remedies
submission in UN official or working	compensation, 37
language, 490	effect on state behaviour, 36–7
views	legislative change, 37
adjudicatory nature, 257–8	release of prisoner, 37
Communications and individual petitions	sanctions, 37
(ICCPR Optional Protocol), 22–4	self-determination and, 25
See also HRC	states parties' reluctance to provide for,
adjudicative nature of proceedings,	23-4
23–4, 29–30	statistics, 32–3
HRC's interpretation of Covenant and	Complaints procedures
Protocol, 30	See also Communications and
admissibility, 23	individual petitions
examination under another	regional systems, 2–3
international procedure, 23	resources for, 483
exhaustion of domestic remedies, 23, 27	UN system
joinder with merits, 489	decline, 3
recommendation for stricter criteria,	Conciliation, 214
45–8, 492; facts outside HRC's	advantages, 214 n39
reach, 46; significance of case, 46–7;	
ECHD 147. HC	Concluding observations or comments
ECHR compared, 47; —, US	See also under individual committees
Supreme Court compared, 47	See also under individual committees consistency of approach, need for, 389,
Supreme Court compared, 47 right of refusal, 32, 34	See also under individual committees consistency of approach, need for, 389, 452
Supreme Court compared, 47 right of refusal, 32, 34 categories of rights admissible	See also under individual committees consistency of approach, need for, 389, 452 divergent interpretations
Supreme Court compared, 47 right of refusal, 32, 34 categories of rights admissible fairness in judicial proceedings, 25	See also under individual committees consistency of approach, need for, 389, 452 divergent interpretations children's rights, CRC/HRC, 391
Supreme Court compared, 47 right of refusal, 32, 34 categories of rights admissible fairness in judicial proceedings, 25 freedom of belief, advocacy and	See also under individual committees consistency of approach, need for, 389, 452 divergent interpretations children's rights, CRC/HRC, 391 cruel, inhuman or degrading
Supreme Court compared, 47 right of refusal, 32, 34 categories of rights admissible fairness in judicial proceedings, 25 freedom of belief, advocacy and association, 25	See also under individual committees consistency of approach, need for, 389, 452 divergent interpretations children's rights, CRC/HRC, 391 cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment, CAT/CRC, 390
Supreme Court compared, 47 right of refusal, 32, 34 categories of rights admissible fairness in judicial proceedings, 25 freedom of belief, advocacy and association, 25 individual physical integrity, 25	See also under individual committees consistency of approach, need for, 389, 452 divergent interpretations children's rights, CRC/HRC, 391 cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment, CAT/CRC, 390 political rights, ICESCR/HRC, 392
Supreme Court compared, 47 right of refusal, 32, 34 categories of rights admissible fairness in judicial proceedings, 25 freedom of belief, advocacy and association, 25 individual physical integrity, 25 non-discrimination, 25	See also under individual committees consistency of approach, need for, 389, 452 divergent interpretations children's rights, CRC/HRC, 391 cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment, CAT/CRC, 390 political rights, ICESCR/HRC, 392 racial discrimination: CERD/CRC,
Supreme Court compared, 47 right of refusal, 32, 34 categories of rights admissible fairness in judicial proceedings, 25 freedom of belief, advocacy and association, 25 individual physical integrity, 25 non-discrimination, 25 political participation, 25	See also under individual committees consistency of approach, need for, 389, 452 divergent interpretations children's rights, CRC/HRC, 391 cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment, CAT/CRC, 390 political rights, ICESCR/HRC, 392 racial discrimination: CERD/CRC, 393; —, CERD/HRC, 390, 392; —,
Supreme Court compared, 47 right of refusal, 32, 34 categories of rights admissible fairness in judicial proceedings, 25 freedom of belief, advocacy and association, 25 individual physical integrity, 25 non-discrimination, 25 political participation, 25 facts	See also under individual committees consistency of approach, need for, 389, 452 divergent interpretations children's rights, CRC/HRC, 391 cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment, CAT/CRC, 390 political rights, ICESCR/HRC, 392 racial discrimination: CERD/CRC, 393; —, CERD/HRC, 390, 392; —, CERD/ICESCR, 393
Supreme Court compared, 47 right of refusal, 32, 34 categories of rights admissible fairness in judicial proceedings, 25 freedom of belief, advocacy and association, 25 individual physical integrity, 25 non-discrimination, 25 political participation, 25 facts difficulty of determining, 35	See also under individual committees consistency of approach, need for, 389, 452 divergent interpretations children's rights, CRC/HRC, 391 cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment, CAT/CRC, 390 political rights, ICESCR/HRC, 392 racial discrimination: CERD/CRC, 393; —, CERD/HRC, 390, 392; —, CERD/ICESCR, 393 violence against foreigners, CERD/
Supreme Court compared, 47 right of refusal, 32, 34 categories of rights admissible fairness in judicial proceedings, 25 freedom of belief, advocacy and association, 25 individual physical integrity, 25 non-discrimination, 25 political participation, 25 facts difficulty of determining, 35 family related rights, 26	See also under individual committees consistency of approach, need for, 389, 452 divergent interpretations children's rights, CRC/HRC, 391 cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment, CAT/CRC, 390 political rights, ICESCR/HRC, 392 racial discrimination: CERD/CRC, 393; —, CERD/HRC, 390, 392; —, CERD/ICESCR, 393 violence against foreigners, CERD/ HRC, 391
Supreme Court compared, 47 right of refusal, 32, 34 categories of rights admissible fairness in judicial proceedings, 25 freedom of belief, advocacy and association, 25 individual physical integrity, 25 non-discrimination, 25 political participation, 25 facts difficulty of determining, 35 family related rights, 26 liability to increase, 34	See also under individual committees consistency of approach, need for, 389, 452 divergent interpretations children's rights, CRC/HRC, 391 cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment, CAT/CRC, 390 political rights, ICESCR/HRC, 392 racial discrimination: CERD/CRC, 393; —, CERD/HRC, 390, 392; —, CERD/ICESCR, 393 violence against foreigners, CERD/ HRC, 391 women's rights: CEDAW/HRC,
Supreme Court compared, 47 right of refusal, 32, 34 categories of rights admissible fairness in judicial proceedings, 25 freedom of belief, advocacy and association, 25 individual physical integrity, 25 non-discrimination, 25 political participation, 25 facts difficulty of determining, 35 family related rights, 26	See also under individual committees consistency of approach, need for, 389, 452 divergent interpretations children's rights, CRC/HRC, 391 cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment, CAT/CRC, 390 political rights, ICESCR/HRC, 392 racial discrimination: CERD/CRC, 393; —, CERD/HRC, 390, 392; —, CERD/ICESCR, 393 violence against foreigners, CERD/ HRC, 391



shortcomings and recommendations for	national system
reform	partnership with, 114–15
comprehensive approach, 394, 401	obligations
coordination between committees, 394, 400	harmonisation of legislation and policy with Convention, 116
need to keep to mandate, 393-4,	promotion of Convention, 116
445-6	publication and distribution within
publicity, 446–7, 453, 468, 514	own country of country report, 116
realism, 446	ratifications, 113, 481
time constraints and need for	USA, 326–7
consensus, 394	reporting obligations
variation in style and treatment, 393,	See also CRC Committee, reports
400, 401	cycle, 113; importance, 125
Constitutional review	publication of reports in own country,
economic, social and cultural rights and,	113, 114–15
236	rights
exhaustion of domestic remedies and,	integration of civil and political with
230–1	social, economic and cultural rights,
human rights treaties, by reference to,	117–18
239	technical assistance, 218 n44
southern Africa, 276–7	underlying principles
Corporal punishment, 277–8, 279–80	best interests of child, 116
Council of Europe	non-discrimination, 116
reform of human rights machinery, 3 n3,	right to participate in decisions
Courts See Intermetical law demostic	affecting them, 116, 117
Courts. See International law, domestic courts, role	rights to life, survival and development,
CRC (Convention on the Rights of the	US and, 328
Child)	CRC Committee
applicability	Bosnia and Herzegovina, reluctance to
acts of individuals, 386	act, 458–9
communications, absence of provision	concluding observations, follow-up
for, 74	NGOs' role, 121–2
implementation	effectiveness, 116
CRC Committee's role, 115–16,	general comments
recommendations, list, 116	importance, 126
equality of provisions, 126	General Guidelines
general comments and, 126	preparation of reports, 114
increase in funds, 473–4	Hong Kong (1996), 299
national human rights institutions	Meetings, duration and frequency, 113
and, 209 n16	Membership requirements
provisions relating to, 115–16	competence in the field covered by the
structures, importance, 116	Convention, 420
interpretation	diversity of legal systems, limitation
right to refer to more favourable or	to, 414
clearer provisions in other	nationals of nominating state, 412
international instruments, 386	national human rights institutions and
thematic approach, limiting nature,	recommendation for establishment,
117–18	209 n16



NGOs and, 108, 118–22	technical assistance
critical and informed approach	recognition of need for human rights
to states parties' reporting, 119–20	framework, 223
expert advice, 118–19	recommendations for, 220
follow-up to Committee's concluding	UNICEF and, 224
observations, 121–2	workload, measures to reduce, 125
participation in pre-sessional working	'Cruel, inhuman or degrading
group meetings, 190, 299	punishment'
right to request reports from, 118	ICCPR reservation, 320–1
Optional Protocol, shortcomings, 386–7	objections to, 321–2
proceedings	Customary international law
pre-sessional working group, NGO	enforcement, HRC, 25
participation, 119	ILO reports and conventions, 254
recommendations	status, 246–7
Bosnia and Herzegovina, effectiveness, 452	part of domestic law, 265–6, 271, 275–6, 276
reports	successor state's responsibility to
General Guidelines, 114	prosecute human rights violations
guidelines, 114	by predecessor, 285
overdue, 6 n5; measures to deal with,	Universal Declaration of Human Rights,
125	238, 249
periodic guidelines, 118	
procedure: initial reports, 114; —,	Death penalty, 283-4, 328
periodic reports, 114	communications and individual petitions
reform. See shortcomings and	(ICCPR Optional Protocol) in
recommendations for reform below	respect of, 34 n31
thematic: difficulties, 117-18; —,	ICCPR reservation, 10, 320–2
initial/periodic reports, value of	objections to, 10, 321–2
distinction, 118; —, list of themes,	Death row , 278–9
115, 127–8	Delay, 4-6
role, 2 n2	causes
comprehensive understanding of	increase in workload, 5
situation of all children, 113–14	lack of resources, 5, 6–8
facilitation of dialogue, 114	Demographic information, inclusion in
implementation of Convention, efforts	CERD reports, 66–7
to secure, 115–16	Denmark
shortcomings and recommendations for	European Court of Human Rights
reform	Decisions, domestic courts and, 232–3
administrative support, 125	rule of law
continuous need for, 126–7	administrative discretion,
cost, 9	international norms and ('rule
country rapporteurs, reintroduction,	of instruction'), 239
123–4	Deterrence theory
membership numbers, 125	HRC views and, 36–8
pre-sessional meetings: timing, 124;	Dispute settlement
—, working methods, 124	alternative dispute resolution, 214, 215
refinement of issues for discussion	CERD provisions
with reporting state, 123	states parties' failure to deploy, 73
specialised agencies, 118, 119	environmental treaties, 371
1	2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2



Diversity	dissemination: ad hoc basis, 446, 448,
coordination of treaty bodies and, 435-6	459-60; —, general public, 447; —,
criteria	UN bodies, 446; —, warring parties,
guidelines, need for, 424-6, 437	447
of focus, 405	reporting procedures
importance, 406–11	alternatives, CERD Committee
membership of treaty bodies. See	Decisions, 449–51
Institutions (UN system),	effectiveness, 440, 447-8, 459; creation
membership	of documents of record, 447; —,
UNHCHR, role, 405-6, 423-37	legislative impact, 447; —, support
See also UNHCR (UN High	to local groups, 448; —, treaty
Commissioner for Human Rights)	interpretation, 447
Domestic jurisdiction	improvements in, 459-60
See also National law and practice, effect	inconsistency in handling, 442, 459-60
of UN system on	interactions between monitoring
declining relevance of argument, 18	mechanisms, 440-1, 443-4, 448
Due process requirement	interlocuteurs, 440, 442-3
See also Fair trial	reporting cycles, 440, 441–2
hearing within reasonable time	state responsibility and, 442-3
ICCPR, 6 n6	special reports
proceedings before an international	content, relevance, 442
tribunal, 6 n6	time-lag, 441–2
	workload, effect on, 453, 459-60
Economic, social and cultural rights	Eminent Persons Group (EPG), 423-4,
ACHR	426
article 42 reporting provisions and,	Environmental treaties
338–9	See also Montreal Protocol
San Salvador Protocol, 338-9	compromise nature, 364-5
constitutional review and, 236	dispute settlement, 371
definition	human rights treaties, areas of difference,
USA dissent, 327	363-5
integration with civil and political,	compliance machinery, 364
117–18, 223–4, 292–3	expert/political nature, 364-5
legislative provisions, 235-6, 273	legalistic nature of human rights
justiciability, 236–7	treaties, 364
national human rights institutions and,	private conduct as target, 363-4
215	reciprocal nature of obligation, 363
treaties	respect/protect dichotomy, 363-4
effectiveness as 'soft law', 237-8	specificity/general nature of
incorporation, 236–7	obligations, 368 n23
self-executing, 235–7	implementation and compliance
ECOSOC	dispute settlement, 371
Role, expansion, 20	monitoring: country visits, 371, 377;
Emergency situations, 164–6	—, EMEP, 365–6; —, ground-based
administrative support, inadequacy,	or satellite monitoring systems, 369;
453-4	—, international inspections, 366;
concluding observations or comments,	—, NGOs. See NGOs below
441, 445–8	mutual reassurance value, 363, 367



Index

non-compliance, Climate Change Convention, 371 procedures: LRTAP Sulphur Protocol, 371; Montreal Protocol, 371-2; —, state responsibility and, 372; sanctions, CITES, 371, 373 reporting obligations. See below willingness to admit failure to meet 378 commitments, 366 NGOs importance of role, 375-6 involvement in review of states' reports, 377 monitoring, 366, 371 Climate Action Network, 374 Greenpeace, 374-5 TRAFFIC, 371, 375 World Conservation Monitoring Unit, 375 reports: status, 374-6; Basel Convention on the Control of Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes, 374; CITES, 375–6; —, International Whaling Commission, 375 procedural obligations See also reporting obligations below provisions of CITES, 369 Ocean Dumping Convention, 369 reporting obligations See also procedural obligations above 'communication of information', 367 compliance, 361-2; measures to ensure, 372-3 effectiveness and value incompleteness of information, 371 vehicle for examining compliance, NGOs' role, 366 functions collection of information relevant to determination of new norms, 367,370-1encouragement of dialogue, 377 evaluation of compliance, 365-6 policy reform, 366-7 in-depth review of reports, 371-2, 376 - 8

Climate Change Convention, 376 country visits, 377 procedure, 376-7 lessons for the UN system, 372-4 ad hoc teams to relieve pressure on standing committees, 378 comprehensive approach to review, financial and technical assistance. 373,524-5flexibility of review process, 377-8 penalties for non-compliance, 373 political pressure on delinquent states, 373-4 precise deadlines, 372-3 publicity, 378 varying reporting cycles depending on capacity to meet, 374 methodology, 370 provisions, 379-80 Barcelona Convention for the Protection of the Mediterranean Sea Against Pollution, 368 n22 CITES: compliance, 361 n3, 373; -, varying cycles, 374 Climate Change Convention, 368 n24, 370, 376; Convention on Wetlands of International Importance, 369-70; —, International Convention for the Prevention of Pollution from Ships, 369 n26: International Convention for the Regulation of Whaling, 369 n26; —, Kuwait Regional Convention for Cooperation on the Protection of the Marine Environment from Pollution, 368 n22: LRTAP Sulphur Protocol, 368; —, Ocean Dumping Convention, 369; —, Vienna Convention for the Protection of the Ozone Layer, review of reports: focus on aggregate performance, 370-1; ---, performance of individual states, CITES, 371 specificity, value, 368, 369



Equality of states	recommendations for reform,
constraint on monitoring process, 71, 74	421–2, 432 n80
Estonia	gender imbalance, 421–2
human rights	limitations on other simultaneous
constitutional protection, 238	employment, 29 n20
international law	nomination of candidates, 9 n13
domestic courts, role, 231-2	period of office, 29 n20
treaties	requirements, 421; judicial standing,
incorporation, constitutional	29 n20
provision, 238	proceedings
self-executing, requirements, 235	public, 29 n20
Ethnic cleansing	European Court of Justice (ECJ)
CERD and, 75–8	jurisdiction
European Commission on Human Rights	interrelationship with that of member
abolition, 3 n3, 35, 488 n13	states, 28 n15
European Convention on Human Rights	European Social Charter (ESC)
(ECHR)	collective complaints procedure, 358–9
Committee of Ministers	reinforcement of reporting system,
failure to discharge functions, 38 n40	359
support offered by, 26 n13, 37	Committee of Independent Experts
individual petitions, 343–4	(CIE)
just satisfaction, provision for, 29 n20	Governmental Committee and
obligations of states parties	differing standards, 353, 355
compliance with judgments of court,	membership, 351; part time, 356
29 n20	role, interpretation and application o
remedies. See just satisfaction, provision	ESC standards to national reports,
for above	355
states parties	compliance
homogeneity, 27 n14; inclusion of east	economic recession and, 354–5
European states, effect, 27 n14	Governmental Committee, nature of
sensitivity, margin of appreciation	membership, 348
and, 27 n14	warnings in case of failure to provide
	information necessary to judge, 34
UN Conventions, primacy, 455–6	European Trade Union Federation, 353
European Court of Human Rights CAT and, 146	Governmental Committee
chambers, 488 decisions	See also Committee of Independent
	Experts (CIE) above
domestic courts and, 45, 232–3,	advantages of, 348, 355–6
280–1, 283–5, 299; limiting effect	nature of membership, 348, 355
on independent development of	role, 354–5; advice to Committee of
human rights norms, 232–3	Ministers on action to be taken,
HCR and, 40	355; —, examination of CIE's
ICCPCR and, 259–60, 261–2	conclusions on compliance, 355
implementation, 26 n13	ILO and, 358
discretionary jurisdiction, 47	interpretation, ILO standards, 355
judges	meetings
election: as appointments procedure,	participation, ILO, 355
412 n19; —, pre-screening proposal,	membership, 347 n2, 355
427; —, shortcomings and	NGOs, limited role, 356



Obligations, international nature	Finland
applicability by domestic courts, 236-7	constitutional review
proceedings	economic, social and cultural rights,
interpretation, 353 n17	236
ratification	exhaustion of domestic remedies and
à la carte basis, 347 n3	230-1
reporting system, 347-60	human rights treaties, by reference to
compliance, 359–60	239
comprehensiveness of review, 352	economic, social and cultural rights
independence of committees from	integration with civil and political
government, 351	legislative provisions, 236
lessons for the UN system, 349;	justiciability, 236
compliance problems in absence of	treaties, effectiveness as 'soft law',
legally binding obligations, 359–60;	237–8
—, frequency and duration of	European Court of Human Rights
meetings, 352 n16; —, length of	decisions, domestic courts and,
cycle, 349; —, method of election	232–3
of membership, 351; —, non-	HRC
confrontational approach, 354;	follow up to decisions, 241-2
—, predominance of written	human rights
proceedings, 353; —, reinforcement	constitutional protection, 238, 239
with complaints/petitions	legislation
procedure, 359; —, special as	HRC decisions as basis for, 241–2
opposed to periodic reports, 349–50;	ombudsman
—, thoroughness of review, 352; —,	'soft' law, application by, 238
working parties/chambers, 352–3	treaties incorporation
reporting record, 348	relevance, application of treaty norms
shortcomings, 359	237
special reports, 349–50	
two/four-yearly cycle, 347	Gender imbalance in international
Secretariat	institutions, 413 n27, 417, 421-2,
contribution to work of CIE, 356	424-5, 437
role, 356	General comments
staffing, 7, 356	See also Concluding observations or
technical assistance	comments; and under individual
prospective new membership, 357-8	committees
European Trade Union Federation	adjudicatory nature, 258
European Social Charter (ESC), 353	divergent interpretations, 395-6
Exhaustion of domestic remedies	measures to resolve, 396
courts' power of constitutional review,	general nature, 22
relevance, 230–1	importance, 52, 126, 261–4
Expulsion	legal effect, 52, 247–8
CAT (Convention Against Torture)	origin and development, 257
Committee and, 146	procedure, 3, 18
ECHR and, 233	publication, 51, 173
•	role, 156
Fair trial	implementation of treaty obligations,
See also Due process requirement	126
Peru, 177–8	interpretation of treaty, 395
	* '



shortcomings and recommendations for	ICESCR Committee, 293-6, 300-1
reform	alternative report, Constitutional
comprehensive approach, 354	Affairs Panel of the Legislative
concluding comments or observations	Council, 294
compared, 395	concluding observations, 301
consistency of approach, 395, 396,	country rapporteur, role, 294-5
400, 452	government response, 295-6
enhanced role for Secretariat, 469	municipal courts
formulation, 52–3	concluding comments and views,
gender perspective, 192–3	application, 303
greater use, 173	NGOs
subject matter	CAT hearings, 297
interpretation of treaty provisions, 18,	CERD hearings, 297–8, 301–2
21, 22, 262	CRC hearings, 299
procedural issues, 22	follow-up, 302–3
Genocide Convention	following transfer of Hong Kong to
ratification	China, 314–15
USA, 319	HRC hearings, 291-2, 296
Germany	ICESCR, 293-6
treaties, incorporation	participation and dissemination of
application of treaty norms, 237	reports, 306
Glen Cove Roundtable, 100, 475	usefulness of participation in
	reporting process, 304
Hong Kong	racial discrimination, 298 n46, 301-2
CAT hearings (1995), 297	reporting obligations
CERD Committee	alternative reports, 294
alternative report, Home Affairs Panel	China, 300, 312–13
of the Legislative Council, 297–8,	effectiveness and value, 303-15; long-
301	term nature, 306-8
concluding observations	following transfer to China:
follow-up, 302–3	procedure, 313–15; —,
CRC Committee, 299	responsibility, 300, 312-13
economic, social and cultural rights	national human rights institutions
integration with civil and political,	and, 208, 305
292–3	publicity, 290-2, 302 n68, 306-7:
HRC, 296, 300-1	government's failure to publish
request for supplementary report, 296,	report, 291 n19, 302 n68
300	reports examined between November
human rights	1994 and March 1997, 289
international monitoring, importance,	HRC (Human Rights Committee)
289	achievements
legislation, 288	establishment of its mandate as norm
Human Rights Commission	18
NGO training, 294	applicable law
human rights treaties, extension to,	opinions of: municipal courts, 40; —
287-8	other international organs, 40
ICCPR	concluding observations, 21, 22, 50-2
incorporation, 292	See also general comments below
reporting obligation, China, 300	consensus, 51



Index

legal effect, 50-1 mixed quality, 42 political effect, 51-2 replacement in case of death, 417 n44 publication in HRC Annual Report, 51 requirements, 21; expert character, 21; views distinguished, 51 —, geographical diversity, failure to confidentiality, 29 achieve, 416-17; --, independence of government, 21, 28; ---, nationals acceptance of petitioner's account, 35 of nominating state, 412; ---, difficulty of determining, 35-6 recognised competence in the field of human rights, 21, 28, 420; ---, develop civil and political rights, 19 regional group system, 415 n38; ---, persuade states to end systematic 'usefulness . . . of persons having abuses, 19 legal experience', 21, 28 follow up to decisions, 241-2 term of office, 28 general comments turnover, 28 See also concluding observations above NGOs and development, 52 critical and informed approach to states general nature, 22 parties' reporting, 180-1, 183-4 legal effect, 52 evidence from, procedure for potential value, 52, 261-4 handling, 176-9 purpose, 22 Hong Kong, 290-2, 296 shortcomings and recommendations Peruvian amnesty law, 176-9 for reform, 52-3; enhanced role for obligations Secretariat, 469 examination of communications 'in subject matter: interpretation of light of all written information provisions of ICCPR, 18, 21, 22; ---, available to it', 23, 28 procedural issues, 22 orders views distinguished, 52 status, 24 Hong Kong (1995), 296 proceedings human rights movement, communications, 23, 29-30; privacy, marginalization, 19 22, 29 individual complaints. See consensus, 22 Communications and individual hearing within reasonable time, petitions absence of provision, 6 n6 judicial or quasi-judicial body, 2 n2, 22, oral, 23, 29 29-30, 31-49 private: decision on concluding legal approach to consideration of observations, 22; ---, examination of communications, 29-30 communications, 22, 29 recommendation for enhancement of public discussion of states parties' legal role, 48-9 reports, 22 jurisdiction reform. See reform below See also Communications and remedies. See Communications and individual petitions (ICCPR individual petitions (ICCPR Optional Protocol), admissibility **Optional Protocol**) discretionary, recommendation for, 46 reports special: accession to ICCPR, relevance, membership employment by governments, 28 441; —, Bosnia and Herzegovina, known human rights activists, 428 n74 441; —, Chair's right to request limited expertise on any given issue, between sessions, 166; —, former 181 Yugoslavia, 187, 441



role	lack of resources, 482
challenge of, 27	limited nature, 20
concluding observations. See	linking of admissibility and merits, 33
concluding observations above	46, 489
consideration of: communications, 21,	panels, 33
22-4; See also Optional Protocol	prospects of success, 49 n37
(ICCPR); —, complaint, 16; —,	tailored/thematic reports, 87 n20
implementation of treaty regime,	working methods, 464-5
20-1; —, periodic reports, 18,	status
21–2, 217 n43	advent of states with no remedies to
development of Covenant, 39, 41, 262	exhaust, effect, 34
development of process, 30	constitutional/cassation courts
exposition of Covenant, 39, 41–2, 53	compared, 31, 41
facilitation of dialogue, 18, 41, 46,	independence of state system, 28, 31
52–3	judicial or quasi-judicial. See judicial
fact-finding, 35-6	or quasi-judicial body above
follow-up on implementation of	technical assistance, recommendations
views, 30 n21	for, 220
'forward views' to state party and	urgent matters, 164–5
individual concerned, 2 n2, 23,	USA report (1995), 322–4
217 n43	views, 2 n2, 16
general comments. See general	compliance: annual reports on
comments above	delinquent states, 37; —, other
ICCPR and protocols, limitation to	institutions compared, 37–8; —,
matters covered by, 20–1, 31	sanctions, 37; —, statistics, 30 n22;
integral approach to human rights	—, support from General Assembly
issues, 40	or Security Council, 37
interaction, 21, 50–3	deterrence theory and, 36–8
judicial review, 41	dissenting/concurring views, 29; value
justice in individual case, 32–6, 41	44
limited nature, 24–5, 31	drafting, 29; recommendations for
as part of broader international	improvement, 42–5
system, 21	follow up, 30 n20; fact-finding visits,
recognition by states parties, 30 n22,	163
50	legal effect, 23, 29; binding force, 30,
under: ICCPR, 21; —, Optional	37
Protocol (ICCPR), 16, 21	municipal courts and, 38, 257–68
'views'. See views below	publicity for, 36, 38
sanctions	status, normative and institutional
communications, 37	legitimacy, 30, 39
views, 37	workload
separate opinions, 29	factors likely to lead to increase, 34
shortcomings and recommendations for	measures to reduce, 45–8
reform	modest level, 33
See also role, recommendations above;	
Communications and individual	supply and demand, non-correlation,
	33–6; fact-finding problems, 35; —,
petitions (ICCPR Optional Protocol), admissibility	mandatory jurisdiction and, 32, 34, 45–8; —, screening process,
development of legal role, 48–9	absence, 34–5
acveropinent of legal role, 40-7	ausciice, 54-5



Human rights	Human Rights Commission see CHR
See also Economic, social and cultural	(Commission on Human Rights)
rights; International law; Rule of	Human Rights Committee see HRC
law; Treaties	
compliance	ICCPR (International Covenant on Civil
See also Communications and	and Political Rights)
petitions; Reporting obligations	See also HRC (Human Rights
(UN system); Treaties; Treaty	Committee)
implementation and compliance	aliens
methods, interrelationship, 333,	applicability to, 251
345-6	fingerprinting, 260–1
constitutional protection, 238–9	American Convention on Human Rights
definition	distinguished, 35
mandate of national human rights	drafting, 17
commissions and, 210; by reference	enforcement. See HRC
to international agreements,	European Convention on Human Rights
relevance, 210-11, 275	(1950) distinguished, 35
development, HRC and, 39	juridical nature of process, 29
importance of national role for	extraterritorial scope, 179-80
protection of, 285–6	general comments. See HRC
information technology and. See	illegitimacy, 261–4
Information technology	interpretation
informed public debate, absence, 48-9	aids and ECHR, 259-60, 261-2
institutions. See Institutions (national);	Body of Principles for the Protection
Institutions (regional systems);	of All Persons under Any Form of
Institutions (UN system); and	Detention or Imprisonment (1988),
individual committees	385; 'subsequent practice', whether,
integrated approach, need for, 346	250
international norms, importance,	responsibility: HRC, 42; —, municipal
327–8	courts, 42
law enforcement agencies and, 221–2	obligations of states parties
legislation	compliance with views of HRC, 30
sources, 206	'necessary steps to give effect to'
plurality of organs and treaties, 245	rights under Covenant, 24
value, 243	reporting obligations. See below
preventive measures	'to ensure effective remedies' and their
role of committees, 73–4	enforcement, 24
primacy of norms	Optional Protocol
rule of law and, 232, 240	See also Optional Protocol (ICCPR)
self-executing treaties and, 235	proposed Third Optional Protocol,
private sphere abuses	shortcomings, 387–8
NGOs' contribution to identification	political compromise, 24–5
of, 193	reporting obligations
problems in	China in respect of Hong Kong, 300
compliance, 37–8	effectiveness, periodic reports, 164
determining, 26	measures taken to give effect to rights,
violations	21
amnesty in respect of, legality, 285	progress in enjoyment of rights, 21
obligations of successor state, 285	special reports, 164-5, 166, 296, 300



reservations	membership
compatibility with object and purpose	predominance of lawyers, 419
of the Covenant, 322	requirements, 412–13; competence in
'cruel, inhuman or degrading	the field of human rights, 420
punishment', 320–1; objections to,	NGOs and, 133–4
321–2	alternative reports, 119–22, 132–4, 190
death penalty, 10, 320-2; objections	circulation of NGO reports as official
to, 10, 321–2	UN documents, 190
US, 318–19, 321–2, 322–4	critical and informed approach to
withdrawal	states parties' reporting, 119–20,
North Korea, 10	294–6
requirements, agreement of all states	information about potential
parties, 10 n16	violations, 137–8
Iceland	involvement in preparation and
European Court of Human Rights	dissemination of states parties'
decisions and domestic courts,	reports, 191 n29, 294
232–3	reports
ICESCR (International Covenant on	alternative reports, 119–22, 132–4,
Economic, Social and Cultural	190, 294
Rights)	effectiveness as monitoring device,
communications, absence of provision,	129–33
74	resources, inadequacy, 133
implementation	role
See also ICESCR Committee, role	determination of violations of
ICESCR Committee's role, 135–42	Covenant, 135
obligations	encouragement of: implementation of
ICESCR Committee's role in	legislation, 137; —, new legislation,
enforcing, 135	136; —, NGOs' involvement in
ratifications	national policy-making, 138-9; —,
USA, 326–7	repeal of legislation, 136–7
reporting obligations	limited nature, 129–30
implementation of treaty obligations,	specific recommendations for
substitute for, 131	fulfilment of treaty obligations,
reservations, 252	139–40
technical assistance, 218 n44	Secretariat
violations	size, 133
determination of, 135	shortcomings and recommendations for
NGOs' role in identifying, 137–8	reform
ICESCR Committee	concluding observations, identification
concluding observations	of treaty violations, 144
Hong Kong, 301	follow-up action, 143-4
judicial nature, 134	guidelines for recommended
usefulness, 144	legislation, 136
country rapporteur, role, 294–5	technical assistance
Hong Kong	recognition of need for human rights
1994, 293–6	framework, 223
1996, 300–1	recommendations for, 220; UNHCHR
as judicial or quasi-judicial body,	Technical Assistance Programme
134	and, 223
	·· ·· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·



More information

Index

ICJ see International Court of Justice basis Decisions, binding force constitutional, 204 domestic courts, 256 statutory, 204 Illegitimacy decentralisation and democratisation of ICCPR, 261-4 human rights standards, 202, 203 ILO (International Labour Organisation) definition, 202 ESC and, 355 countries in which established, 202-3 overlap with treaty bodies, 474 independence of government, 204-7 reports and conventions government motivation, 204-5 customary international law, 254 power to initiate investigations, domestic courts and, 251-6, 281-2 importance, 214-15 India resources, 204-5, 205, 478-9 Human Rights Commission deficiencies, 207 n11, 208 n15 advisory (government policy and government motivation, 205 practice), 204, 207 n12 independence of government, 206-7 dissemination of information, role: educational, 207 n11, 213; ---, 207 n12, 212 monitoring implementation of and economic, social and cultural rights, compliance with treaty obligations, 207 n11, 212 educational, 204, 207 n11, 207 n12, 213 human rights legislation increasing recognition, 207-8; sources, 206, 210 International Coordinating racial discrimination Committee of National Human caste system, 77 Rights Institutions, 207–8; Principles Individual claims against states Relating to the Status of National See also Communications and Institutions ('Paris Principles') individual petitions (1993), 207; World Conference on against own state, 15-16 Human Rights (Vienna, 1993), 207 development of right, 15-16 investigation and resolution of treaty enforcement of decision, 16 violations, 204, 213-15 non-self-executing treaties, 320 monitoring implementation of and Indonesia compliance with treaty obligations, 202, 207 n11, 209 nn16 and 17, Human Rights Institution 211-12, 216 government motivation, 205-6 independence of government, ombudsman's role distinguished, 203 204 - 5states parties' reports: follow-up on mandate, 205, 211-12 treaty body recommendations, 208; resources, 205 —, preparation, 208 Information technology, 7, 71, 108 training programmes, 213 cooperation with academic institutions, shortcomings and recommendations for reform, 207 n11 recommendations for increased use, alternative reports, 217 142-3, 466, 469, 493-4 coordination, 208 UNHCR web sit, 94, 108, 142-3, 493 database of institutions, 216 **Institutions (national)** elections to treaty bodies: judicial See also Institutions (regional systems); review committee, 432-5; ---, NGOs' role, 431-2 Institutions (UN system); NGOs guidelines for contribution, 478 alternative dispute resolution, 214,

increased educational effort, 217

215



Index

involvement in preparation and lack of: binding authority, 427 n70; dissemination of reports, 216-17 -, operational basis, 194, 217 treaty bodies and, 208-27 measure, 508-9 participation in meetings: CERD, judicial nature. See Judicial or quasi-216 n42; ---, CHR, 208 n14 judicial body recommendations and general membership comments as vehicle for promotion constraints on effectiveness: See also of national institutions, 209 Shortcomings and shortcomings and recommendations recommendations for reform of UN system; absences from for reform, engagement of national institutions in dialogue, 215-16 meetings, 61; --, continuity of treaty bodies' lack of interest, 208-9 membership, 68; —, employment Institutions (regional systems) by governments, 28, 188, 197, 221, See also European Convention on 351; —, inadequacy of information, Human Rights (ECHR); 108, 181; --, lack of expertise, 80, Institutions (national); 181, 188-9, 225-6; —, male Institutions (UN system); Interdominance, 225; --, mixed quality, **American Commission on Human** 42, 423 n62; —, multiplicity of Rights (IACHR) commitments, 71, 74-5, 189, consolidation, 2-3 464-5, 470; —, numbers, 125; —, political support, 26 n13, 27 n14 prevalence of diplomats, lawyers reporting obligations, limited role, 334, and foreign policy specialists, 58-9, 225-6, 418-19; ---, rivalry, 100; ---, specialisation, 91, 92; -, term of Institutions (UN system) See also Institutions (national); office, 28; --, turnover, 28 Institutions (regional systems); diversity: disciplinary expertise, International organisations; domination of lawyers, 417-20; ---, Shortcomings and disciplinary expertise, objections recommendations for reform of to, 425; —, election constraints, 412-13; —, social experience, 413 UN system; and individual committees equality, 57 contribution to development of human gender imbalance, 413 n27, 417, 437 rights, 53 horse-trading over election, 188-9, 'dialogue' 427 - 8effectiveness, 360, 512 independence and NGOs' role, 106 quality, 131-2, 151-4 increasing encouragement of, 217 pro-state bias, 132 regional group system, 415-16 replacement in case of death, 417 n44 See also Diversity; and membership, requirements, 21; competence in the requirements below field covered by the Convention, consolidation, implications, 404-6, 436 420; —, diversity, 411-22; —, disciplinary expertise, 417-22 diversity. See above;—, 'equitable experience, 405 geographical distribution expertise, 404-5 and . . . representation of the effect on treaty bodies of inaction or different forms of civilisation as well ineffective action, 453 as of the principal legal systems', 57, effectiveness 80, 225, 413-17; ---, expert See also Emergency situations character, 21, 188-9; ---, by offering legal basis, 179, 184 'honourable, faithful, impartial, and



conscientious' discharge of duties,	friendly settlement of communications
57; —, inconsistency in application,	and individual petitions: articles
415; —, independence of	48–9, 339–40; —, articles 50–1,
government, 21, 28, 57, 189; —,	340-1
limitations on numbers from any	IACHR request for article 42 reports,
one state, 412–13; —, nationality of	338
nominating state, 41; —,	possibility of greater use of article 43
'usefulness of persons having	power to request reports on
legal experience', 21, 28, 414	implementation of Convention, 337
states' interest in maintaining strong	shortcomings and recommendations for
presence, 428–9	reform
national system	development of jurisprudence, 337,
partnership with, 114–15	345–6
NGOs and. See NGOs	follow-up procedures, 345
non-treaty bodies	Inter-American Court of Human Rights
effectiveness, 193–5	See also American Convention on
political independence, 514–15	Human Rights (ACHR); Inter-
rapid development, 3	American Commission of Human
resources. See Resources	Rights (IACHR)
status	enforcement of obligation to ensure
independence of state system, 28	Convention is given effect in
validity of underlying assumptions, 502	domestic law, 336–7
views	facts
binding nature, 247–8	difficulty of determining, 36
workload, measures to control, 64–5	political support, 27 n14
Inter-American Commission of Human	shortcomings and recommendations for
Rights (IACHR)	reform
See also American Convention on	development of jurisprudence, 337,
Human Rights (ACHR); Inter-	345-6
American Court of Human Rights	follow-up procedures, 345
development, 20 n5	International Coordinating Committee of
economic, social and cultural rights,	National Human Rights
references in Annual Reports, 339	Institutions, 207–8
enforcement of obligation to ensure	International Court of Justice (ICJ)
Convention is given effect in	decisions, binding force in domestic
domestic law, 336-7	courts, 256
Amnesty Laws cases, 336	elections to
fact-finding visits, 342-3	NGOs' role, 431–2
applicability, OAS membership, 342	International Criminal Court
effectiveness, 346	judges
failure to cooperate as breach of	election, 9 n13
Convention, 343	Statute, rejections, 317 n1
reporting obligations and, 343	US and, 317 n1, 323 n19
reports, effect of publicity, 343	International Labour Organisation (ILO)
HRC (Human Rights Committee)	see ILO (International Labour
distinguished, 35	Organisation)
OAS and, 342	International law
reporting obligations	See also Customary international law;
fact-finding visits, 343	Treaties



domestic courts, role, 231–9	Standard Minimum Rules for the
monist/dualist divide, relevance,	Treatment of Prisoners (1957), 250
231–2, 275–6	265, 282
sources, ECHR decisions, 232-3,	treaties. See Treaties
277	International Law Commission
impact on national law	elections
See also primacy below	NGOs' role, 432
as aid to interpretation of. See	International organisations
Legislation, interpretation	See also ILO (International Labour
Japan, 245–68	Organisation); Institutions
Namibia, 270, 279–80	(regional systems); Institutions
South Africa, 269–76, 281–5	(UN system); and individual
Zimbabwe, 270, 277–9	committees
implementation	acts
See also domestic courts, role above;	comments, general comments and
Treaty implementation and	views, 258–60
compliance	source of international law,
act of state doctrine, 233–4	246–68; aid to interpretation,
lex posterior derogat legi priori, 234–5	250;—, norm-creating and
political question doctrine, 233–4	adjudicatory acts distinguished,
variation in interpretation and	247–8
standards, 233	International tribunals, decisions
obligation to observe, 247	binding nature, 247–8
primacy, 246–7, 266–7, 282–3 reflective of states' interests and	International Women's Rights Action
behaviour, 26	Watch (IWRAW), 105 Israel
,	NGOs, 185–7
sources	
acts of NGOs, 250	racial discrimination, 77
decision of the ICJ relating to the	torture
interpretation of a convention, 256	CAT request for special report, 185–7
	I
decisions of international bodies.	Jamaica
See International organisations,	communications and individual petition
decisions	(ICCPR Optional Protocol), 32 n26
declarations and resolutions: Body of	34
Principles for the Protection of All	death penalty, 34 n32
Persons under Any Form of	Optional Protocol (ICCPR)
Detention or Imprisonment (1988)	
250, 265; —, Declaration on the	to handle individual complaints
Rights of Disabled Persons (1971),	sufficiently quickly, 488
249–50; —, Declaration on the	Japan
Rights of Disabled Persons (1975),	aliens
249–50; —, ILO/UNESCO	compensation for war damage, HRC
Recommendation Concerning the	view, 264–5
Status of Teachers (1966), 250; —,	fingerprinting and ICCPR, 260-1
UNGA resolutions, 247; —,	customary international law
Universal Declaration of Human	ILO reports and conventions, 254
Rights, 238, 248-9, 282-3	status, 246-7; part of domestic law,
'soft' law, OSCE documents, 238	265-6



More information

Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 249	ICESCR/ICCPR and, 249 Peace Treaty (1951) and, 248
ICCPR	Judicial independence
aliens, applicability to, 251	southern Africa, 276–7
interpretation	Judicial or quasi-judicial body
aids	See also individual committees
ECHR, 259–60, 260–1	determining features
ICESCR	binding nature of jurisdiction, 2 n2
reservations, 252	nature of process, 2 n2
ICJ decisions	nomenclature, 2 n2
binding force in domestic courts, 256	regional systems, 2–3
ILO reports and conventions	rule of law and, 31
domestic courts and, 251–6	Judicial review. See Constitutional review
international law	Justiciability
obligation to observe, 247	economic, social and cultural rights, 236–7
primacy, 246–7, 266–7	human rights, 270, 271
sources: acts of NGOs, 250; decisions	Human rights, 270, 271
of international bodies, 247–8;	Latvia
declarations and resolutions,	human rights
248–51	constitutional protection, 238
international organisations	Human Rights Commission
acts as source of international law, 250	mandate, 212, 214 n38
legislation	treaties, incorporation
amendment: HRC decisions as basis	constitutional provision, 238
for, 261–4	Legality principle. See Rule of law
NGOs	Legislation
acts as source of international law, 250	amendment
strike, right to, 251–5	HRC decisions as basis for, 241–2,
Dreyer Report, 252	261–4
public employees, 253–5	Legislation, interpretation
treaties, status	See also Constitutional review
constitutional provision, 246	aids
treaty interpretation	ECHR decisions, 277–9, 283–5
aids	foreign law, 274
comments, general comments and	HRC decisions, 284
views of treaty bodies in case of	human rights treaties, 281, 283-5
non-ratification, 259–68	international human rights norms,
non-binding acts of international	280, 281
organisations, 251	international law, 274, 277
subsequent practice	non-binding international
Body of Principles for the	instruments, 266–8, 279; Universal
Protection of All Persons	Declaration of Human Rights, 283
under Any Form of Detention	treaties, 266–8, 280–1
or Imprisonment (1988),	guidelines
whether, 250	lex posterior derogat legi priori
ILO reports and conventions, 256	human rights treaties and, 234–5
Universal Declaration of Human Rights	presumptions
binding nature, 248–9	consistency with international law,
customary international law, 249	274, 277



Liberia	corporal punishment, 279–80
Human Rights Commission	customary international law
government motivation, 205 n5	part of domestic law, 271, 276
Lithuania	economic, social and cultural rights
human rights	constitutional provision, 236
constitutional protection, 238	human rights treaties
international law	participation in, 271
domestic courts, role, 231-2	international law
sources of 'soft' law, Universal	impact on national law, 270, 279-80
Declaration of Human Rights, 238	part of the law of, 271
	legislation, interpretation
Margin of appreciation	aids: international human rights
limiting role, 233, 239 n38	norms, 280, 281; —, treaties, 280-1
state sensitivity, response to, 27 n14	National law and practice
Mexico	effect of UN system on, 11, 241-2,
Human Rights Commission, role, 204 n4	261-4, 447, 508-9
Migrant Workers' Convention Committee	Netherlands
establishment, 3	treaties, incorporation
membership	application of treaty norms, 237
requirements, 413 n28	New Zealand
Minority rights	Human Rights Commission
communications and individual petitions	mandate, 212, 214 n38
(ICCPR Optional Protocol) and, 26	judicial or quasi-judicial body
Montreal Protocol on Substances that	determining features: binding nature
Deplete the Ozone Layer	of jurisdiction, 2 n2; —, nature of
financial and technical assistance, 373	process, 2 n2; —, nomenclature,
Implementation Committee	2 n2
membership, 364 n10, 372	law of
implementation and compliance	Legal Service Act 1991, 2 n2
non-compliance procedure,	NGOs (non-governmental organisations)
371-2; Russian Federation, 372	See also Institutions (national); under
political pressure, 373-4	individual committees
reporting obligations	acts of
compliance, 361, 373	source of international law, whether,
Technological and Economic Assessment	250
Panels (TEAPs), 364 n10	coalition at national level, 120-1, 177
Municipal courts	environmental treaties and, 366, 371,
concluding comments and views,	374-6, 377-8
application, 38, 303	ESC and, 356
decisions	evidence from
HRC's use of, 40	admissibility, 59
ECHR decisions and, 45	procedure for handling, 176-82
interpretation of ICCPR, 42	transfer of burden of proof, 186-7
	good practice
Namibia	alternative reports, 119–22,
Bill of Rights	132-4, 176-9, 181-2, 190, 478
international conventions, influence,	attendance at press conferences,
270	190-1
justiciability, 270	separate NGO briefing, 191



Index

circulation of NGO reports as official UN documents, 190 participation in pre-sessional working group meetings, 190 Hong Kong, 290-3 following transfer of Hong Kong to China, 314–15 ICI elections, 431–2 ILA elections, 432 involvement in UN system, 3, 9, 175-98 usefulness to NGOs, 193-5, 304 usefulness to UN, 177, 304, 478-9 national policy making and, 138-9, 140 - 2participation in work of committees dangers: imbalance, 309; —, loss of focus, 309-10 duplication of effort, 310, 478: rigidity of response, 310-11 effect on independence of experts, 106 Norway governments' concerns, 309-11 reporting obligations, usefulness, 181, 242 - 3role development of, 289-90 encouragement to national NGOs to participate in UN proceedings, 181 - 2general recommendations/comments, identification of: abuses in the private sector, 193; —, violation of treaty obligations, 137-8 treaties implementation of treaty obligations, self-executing requirements, 235 118-22: critical and informed approach to states parties' reporting, 119-20, 294-6, 298, 304; —, follow-up to committees' recommendations, 121-2, 163, 182, 302 - 3involvement in preparation and dissemination of states parties' reports, 191 n29, 294, 306, 478 publicity, 182-4, 190-1, 514 shortcomings and recommendations for reform continuous involvement with treaty bodies, 197-8

coordination, 478-9 guidelines for contribution, 108, 479 inclusion in government delegations, 191 n29 involvement in: gender issues, 192-3; —, preparation and dissemination of states parties' reports, 191-2 timeliness, 194 n38 South Africa pre-1994 role, 281-3 training of, 478–9 Bosnia and Herzegovina, 456 Hong Kong, 294 USA, 328-9 validity of information, 509-12 western bias, 434-5 North Korea withdrawal from ICCPR, 10 Northern Ireland CAT and, 182-4 constitutional review and exhaustion of domestic remedies, 230-1 economic, social and cultural rights treaties, effectiveness as 'soft law', 237 - 8European Court of Human Rights decisions domestic courts and, 232-3 human rights constitutional protection, 238-9 international law domestic courts, role, 231-2

Ombudsman

human rights institutions distinguished, 'soft' law, application by, 238

Optional Protocol (ICCPR)

accession to, 16-17 communications. See Communications

and individual petitions (ICCPR **Optional Protocol**)

denunciation

HRC's failure to handle individual complaints sufficiently quickly, 488



drafting 17	proce releases 513 14
drafting, 17	press releases, 513–14
avoidance of adjudication style	decline in quality, 514 n33
language, 22	Destable and a design
political compromise, 22, 24–5	Racial discrimination
ICCPR, relationship with, 23	change in conception, 58, 75–8
purposes, 17–18	definition
remedies, 23, 29	ethnicity, 75–8
views. See UN Human Rights	ILO Convention Concerning
Committee	Discrimination in respect of
withdrawal, 10	Employment and Occupation, 76
	direct/indirect discrimination
Papua New Guinea	distinguished, 77–8
Human Rights Commission	in
mandate, 212, 214 n38	Bangladesh, 77
Peru	Burundi, 77
amnesty laws, 176–9	Hong Kong, 298 n46, 301-2
fair trial, 177–8	India and caste system, 77
NGOs, 176-9	Israel, 77
Philippines	political motivation and, 77-8
Human Rights Commission	Regional group system
Human Rights Instruments	shortcomings, 415–17
Monitoring Division, 211	Regional systems
limitations, 211 n27	complaints procedures, 2–3
role, 211	development of standards, method, 2
training programmes, 213	institutions
Poland	consolidation, 2–3
Ombudsman, role, 204 n4	judicial/quasi-judicial character, 2–3
Political question doctrine, 233-4	preference for, 34 n32
Preventive measures	Remedies
role of committees, 73–4	Optional Protocol (ICCPR), 23, 29
Publication	Reporting obligations (UN system), 1–3
general comments and concluding	See also American Convention on
observations, 173	Human Rights (ACHR);
in Annual Report, 51	Communications and individual
reports	petitions; Environmental treaties;
in own country, 113, 114–15, 116	Inter-American Commission of
Publicity and transparency	Human Rights (IACHR); and
concluding observations, availability on	under individual committees and
Internet, 514	treaties
importance, 290-2, 302 n68, 306-7, 322,	adversarial nature of proceedings, 57, 304
378	basis
language of documentation, 513	treaty, 334
level of interest, 505–9	China, 300, 312–13
measure, 506, 507–9	country rapporteur, role, 60, 90, 92–6,
media, 506–8	123-4, 294-5, 467, 468
NGOs, 506	cycle
need for, 449–50, 451, 453	emergency situations, 440, 441–2
NGOs' contribution, 121–2, 181–2,	importance, 71, 125, 242–3
183–4, 184 (2), 514	length, relevance, 349
, - \ //-	0 ,



More information

Index

treaty amendment required for compliance: country visits, 468, change, 74 509-12; —, follow-up, 161-3, delay between submission and 168-9, 172, 468, 512-15; —, consideration by committee, 3-5 penalties, 373; --, political pressure effectiveness and value, 50, 129-33, 334 on delinquent states, 373-4; ---, in countries well-disposed to precise deadlines, 372-3 implementation of human rights country profiles to be replaced by obligations, 242 alternative reports or use of country emergency situations. See Emergency data available to UN, 490 publicity, 378, 468 situations Hong Kong, 303-15 reporting cycles: consolidation of long-term nature, 306-8 reporting obligations, 71, 84-5, 86-7, 196, 243, 388, 497-8; ---, NGO doubts, 308 periodic reporting, 164, 242-3 coordination, 243; --, frequency of vehicle for examining compliance reports, 349-50; --, tailored/ NGOs' role, 181, 349 thematic reports, 71, 87–8; —, guidelines, 114 variation depending on capacity to implementation of treaty obligations, meet, 374 substitute for, 131, 365 review process: ad hoc teams to relieve interlocuteurs, 440, 442-3 pressure on standing committees, involvement of federal, state and local 378; —, comprehensive approach, authorities, 322 378; —, flexibility, 377-8; —, national human rights institutions and, non-confrontational approach, 208, 305 NGOs and, 80, 181, 191-2, 242-3, working methods: advance notice of 287-315 questions to reporting states, 70; —, novelty, 58 analysis prepared by country rapporteur, 467-8; --, clearer objectives and functions, 131 n4, 334-5, guidelines for drafting reports, 93, overdue reports, 4, 5 Table 1.2, 60, 84, 173; —, improvement in quality of debates, 172 148 - 9measures to deal with, 4, 66-7, 110, special rapporteurs' role, 443-4 125, 148-9, 372-4 specialised agencies, 80, 118, 474-5 time needed to process, 6 n1 state responsibility, 442-3 states' capacity to meet, 73-4, 226-7, publicity Hong Kong, 290-2, 302 n68, 306-7 373, 374, 376-7, 520 USA, 322 states' misunderstanding of implications, reports periodic/special distinguished, 333 US Senate funding prohibition, 323 states parties, 333 variation between treaties, 73-4 supervisory organs, 333-4 Resources shortcomings and recommendations for Climate Change Convention, 376 countermeasures administrative support: enhanced role Fellowships in Human Rights, 477 for Secretariat, 173, 467, 470-1; —, information technology. See financial and technical assistance, Information technology 373, 524-5 interns/junior professional officers Commission on Human Rights (JPOs), 467–8, 469, 471, 476–7, Resolution 1995/92, 71 486 - 7



NGOs' contribution, 177, 434 n81, 478–9	rights of individuals and public authorities distinguished, 239–40
private funding, 476	Russian Federation
specialised agencies, cooperation with,	NGOs, 181–2
474–5	, .
states parties' apathy, 10-11, 479	Self-determination
voluntary funding, 9, 474, 484; Plans	communications and individual
of Action, 484–6	petitions (ICCPR Optional
funding arrangements, 472-4, 482-4	Protocol) and, 25
dedicated budget, desirability, 474	Shortcomings and recommendations for
direct funding by states parties, 474;	reform of UN system, 522-5
special projects, 474	See also Institutions (UN system),
implications of recommended changes to	membership, constraints on
system, 9, 100, 465, 466, 468,	effectiveness; Reporting obligation
469–72, 491–2	(UN system); and individual
increase in	committees
for implementation of CRC, 473-4	ad hoc structure, 19, 40
World Conference on Human Rights	administrative support, 81-2, 83-4,
(Vienna) (1993), 473	107-8, 125, 160-1, 173, 198, 463-4
institutions (national), 204-5, 205	465, 470–1
lack, 5, 107-8, 132-3, 194, 226-7, 461-79	See also Resources
cancellation of sessions, 7, 462, 482,	admissibility
483-4	enhanced Secretariat role, 493
cooperation funds, 7	linking of admissibility and merits, 33
documentation restrictions, 7, 462,	46, 489
482	stricter admissibility criteria, 46–7,
emergency situations, 453–4	489, 492
failure to respond to increased	complaints/petitions procedure, 359
workload, 481–2	compliance
information available to committee	See also Reporting obligations (UN
membership, 181, 222	system); Treaty implementation
secretariat/personnel, 7, 132–3, 154,	and compliance
356-7, 465, 470-1;	follow-up, 224, 240–2, 463–5, 512–15
overspecialisation, 7, 494–5; —,	international court or monitoring
short-term recruitment, 7	body, 240–2, 472
translation delays, 7, 71, 462, 490	legally binding obligations, need for,
requirements, 462–5 technical assistance recommendations,	359-60
implications, 471	sanctions, 37, 371, 373; economic
Rule of law	sanctions, 521 comprehensive approach, 352, 378, 394,
administrative discretion	401
international norms and ('rule of	consistency
instruction'), 239	proceedings, 452
apartheid as violation of, 282	treaty reservations, 401
application of treaty norms in absence of	consolidation, 403–6, 436, 465
incorporation	diversity, risk to, 404–6; See also
human rights, primacy, 232	diversity above
requirements	resource implications, 465, 466,
independent judicial system, 31	470



constraints	meetings
limited political support, 27-8, 37	duration, 187, 352 n16
resources. See Resources	place, 198
states parties' reluctance, 10-11, 19-20	NGOs. See NGOs
continuous need for reform, 110–11	professionalisation, 195-8
coordination, 3, 75, 98-104, 192	appointment of members on full-time
consolidation distinguished, 243	basis, 189
diversity and, 435–6	creation of permanent unified treaty
HRC's role, 40	body, 197–8
means: incorporation of CEDAW into	independence of governments, 197,
same structure, 83–4, 107–8, 467,	351
470; —, joint working groups, 197,	transfer of responsibilities to
466; —, participation in one	professional staff, 75, 131–2, 463–4
another's meetings, 466; —,	proliferation of distinct institutions, 3
partnership of committee bodies	Renewing the United Nations: A
under consolidating umbrella, 406,	Programme for Reform, 195–6
425–6; —, thematic working	reporting obligations. See Reporting
groups, 466–7	obligations (UN system)
of concluding observations or	resources. See Resources
comments, 394, 400	translation and interpretation
of general recommendations/	languages to be confined to UN
comments, 97–8, 396, 401	official or working languages, 490
of information, 400–1	proceedings without interpretation or
of regional and UN systems, 456, 497	translation, 492
of reservations to treaties, 398–9	working methods, 464–5
of technical assistance agencies, 223–5	avoidance of duplication, 491
of treaty bodies and Secretariat, 471–2	drafting groups, 491
UNHCHR, role, 405–6	increased opportunity for dialogue
electoral process, 9, 422–37	and consultation, 187–8, 189–90,
EPG. See Eminent Persons Group	217
(EPG)	intersessional authority, 451, 492–3
judicial review committee, 432–3	intersessional work
location, 435	limitations, 5, 70
NGOs' role, 434–5	majority voting, 488–9
UNHCHR role, 433–4	performance norms, 75
improved publicity, 449–50, 451, 453	prioritisation of work, 116;
inclusion of experts in government	concentration on states willing but
delegations, 226	lacking the resources to improve,
information	226–7
better, 71, 181, 222	working groups/chambers, 352–3,
better management, 394	488, 491–2; resource implications,
coordinated approach, 400–1	491–2
information technology. See	written proceedings, 353
Information technology	workload, 33–6, 45–8, 84–93, 110, 149
mandates	emergency situations, effect, 453,
observance, 59, 62–3, 85, 97, 393–4,	459–60
401, 450	factors likely to lead to increase,
overlapping, 465	85–6
marginalisation, 175–6, 198	measures to control, 84–93, 110



South Africa	Specialised agencies
amnesty legislation	CEDAW and, 80, 103-4
legality, 285	CRC and, 118, 119, 475
Constitution	overlapping responsibilities, 474-5
Draft Constitution (1996), 272-3	State responsibility
Interim Constitution (1993), 272-3	non-compliance procedures and, 372
customary international law	reporting obligations and, 442-3
status, part of domestic law, 275-6	State succession
death penalty, 283-4	responsibility to prosecute violations of
economic, social and cultural rights	human rights law by predecessor,
integration with civil and political	285
legislative provisions, 273	Strike, right to, 251–5, 267–8
Human Rights Commission	ICESCR, 252
mandate, 212, 214 n38, 274-5;	ILO, 252
omission of reference to	public employees, 253-5
international human rights law,	Sweden
relevance, 275	European Court of Human Rights
human rights treaties	decisions
participation in, 276	domestic courts and, 232-3
ILO (International Labour Organisation)	human rights
reports and conventions and domestic	constitutional protection, 238–9
courts, 281–2	international law
international law, 273-6	domestic courts, role, 231-2
domestic courts, role, and relevance of	treaty implementation
monist/dualist divide, 275-6	'transformation', need for, 237
impact on national law, 269-76,	
281–5	Technical assistance, 520-1
legislation, interpretation	bodies offering
aids: ECHR decisions, 283-5; —,	CERD, 458
foreign law, 274; —, human rights	Climate Change Convention, 373, 376
treaties, 281, 283–5; —,	ESC, 357–8
international law, 274; —, non-	ILO, 218, 220
binding international instruments,	Montreal Protocol Multilateral Fund
274	(MLF), 373
presumptions, consistency with	role of treaty bodies, 456
international law, 274	UN Office for Drug Control and
NGOs	Crime Prevention, 220
pre-1994 role, 281–3	UNDP, 218
rule of law	UNESCO, 220
apartheid as violation of, 282	UNHCHR Technical Cooperation
treaties	Programme, 218, 220
need for incorporation, 275-6	UNHCR, 220
UN Charter	UNICEF, 218, 218 n46, 220, 224
domestic courts and, 276, 281	World Bank, 218
Special reports	Bosnia and Herzegovina, 456
CAT, 164, 165–6, 169–70, 185–7	CAT, 220
CEDAW, 187	categories
HRC, 166, 187	data collection and analysis, 219
value, 187	educational curricula, 219



More information

Index

establishment of national monitoring, environmental. See Environmental coordinating and investigatory treaties institutions, 219 human rights treaties legislative review and incorporation compromise nature, 384-5 of treaties into national legislation, increasing participation, 481 US record, 317-29 organisation of public awareness implementation. See Treaty campaigns, 219 implementation and compliance preparation of reports, 219, 357, 373 incorporation professional training programmes, See also self-executing above 219, 456 constitutional provision, 238-9 reform of judiciary and administration definition, 229-30 of justice systems, 219; law need for, 271, 275-6 enforcement agencies, 221-2 relevance, 210-11; aid to translation and dissemination of interpretation of domestic law, international instruments, 219 266-8; —, application of treaty human rights, relevance to, 218 norms, 230, 236-7; ---, exhaustion of domestic remedies, bench mark, lessons from the environmental treaties, 373, 524-5 230-1; —, increased awareness of resource implications, 471 international law, 230 shortcomings and recommendations for status as ordinary law, consequences, reform 234-5: lex posterior derogat legi ESC practice, 357-8 priori, 234-5 interpretation. See Concluding follow-up, 224 human rights framework, need for, observations or comments, divergent interpretations 2.24 - 5inadequacy of information, 221, 222; non-correspondence with states' misunderstanding of causes of interests and behaviour, 26 human rights problems, 221-2 obligations inadequate specificity or to give effect to protected rights, 213 recommendations, 220-1 to provide effective remedy for inappropriate timing, 446 violations, 213 lack of coordination between treaty overlapping provisions, problems posed bodies and technical assistance by, 383-401, 497 agencies, 223-5 See also Concluding observations or specificity, need for, 220-1 comments, divergent treaty provision for, 218 n44 interpretations differences of interpretation, 384 See also CAT (Torture Convention) discrepancies between obligations, 384; binding and non-binding texts, jurisdiction, 325-6 **Treaties** 385; —, reflection of circumstances See also Treaty implementation and at time of drafting, 384-5 compliance; Treaty interpretation measures to avoid, 400-1; participation amendment of existing bodies in drafting of new difficulties, 74 instruments, 386-8, 400 effectiveness measures to redress, consolidation of adequacy of documentation, 87 reporting obligations, 388 by conferring legal basis, 179 related provisions, 388 democratic accountability and, 183-4 reporting obligations, 384



Index

reservations, effect, 384, 397-9; international obligations, 320 See also reservations below monitoring procedures reporting requirement, effect on African Charter, 276 establishment of treaty norms, expert participation, importance, 364 international court or monitoring reservations body, need for, 240-2 See also under individual treaties Montreal Protocol on Substances that differing practice: general/specific Deplete the Ozone Layer, 364 n10 conventions, 397; --, new/original recommendation for establishment of national institution, 323 parties, 397 HRC General Comment No. 24, 69, national human rights institutions' role, 318-19, 323, 398 202, 207 n11, 209 n16, 211-12, 216, inconsistency, 396-7; committees' willingness and ability to explore investigation and resolution of rationale for reservation, 398; —, violations, 213-15 exchange of information, need for, NGOs' role, 118-22, 163, 182-4, 190-1 397-8; —, failure to make same reporting obligations. See Reporting reservation to related provisions in obligations (UN system) different conventions, 397-9; —, responsibility for, 240 reservation to subsequent protocol, national role, 201-27, 229-43, 285-6, 399; -, responsibility for, 401 466 USA, 318-29 treaty bodies, 258-9 role in standard setting, 48 sanctions for non-compliance, 373 self-executing states parties' apathy, 10-11 economic, social and economic rights, 'transformation', need for, 237 UN and regional systems distinguished, 235 - 7human rights conventions, exclusion, 268, 319-20 judicial/non-judicial role, 2-3 non-self-executing: distinguished, 235, single/multiple supervisory body, 1-3 240; —, effect of provision, 320 n6; state reporting obligations/individual -, individual's right of action and, or state-to-state complaints 320 procedures, 1-3 requirements, 235 US record, 317-29 Vienna Convention on Consular See also United States of America (USA) Relations, 318 Treaty interpretation See also Concluding observations or status constitutional provision, 246 comments, divergent Treaty bodies. See Institutions (UN interpretations; Treaties; Treaty system) and individual committees implementation and compliance Treaty implementation and compliance See also Environmental treaties; Treaties; comments, general comments and Treaty interpretation; and views of treaty bodies, 258-68; in individual committees and treaties case of non-acceptance of consistency, 232-3 jurisdiction, 259 inclusiveness versus integrity, 8, 10, non-binding acts of international 68-9, 72, 518-25 organisations, 251 individual's right of action subsequent practice: Body of non-self-executing treaty, 320 Principles for the Protection of All



Persons under Any Form of Detention or Imprisonment (1988), whether, 250; —, ILO reports and conventions, 256 consistency measures to achieve, 98, 241 guidelines right to refer to more favourable or clearer provisions in other international instruments, 386 Trinidad and Tobago death penalty, 10 n17 withdrawal from ICCPR Optional Protocol (ICCPR), 10 n17	UNHCHR (UN High Commissioner for Human Rights) diversity, role in maintaining, 405–6 criteria, establishment, 424–6, 437 Eminent Persons Group (EPG), 423–4, 426 resources, 483 restructuring of Office, 472, 495, 496 Technical Cooperation Programme shortcomings, 223–4; gender perspective, 223; —, integration of economic, social and cultural rights, 223–4 UNICEF
	technical assistance
UN Charter	human rights approach, 218 n46
domestic courts and, 276, 281	United Kingdom
UN General Assembly (UNGA)	legislation, interpretation
resolutions	aids, non-binding international
binding nature, 247	instruments, 266–7
support for reform of monitoring	NGOs
process, 66, 69	alternative reports, 119–22 coalition at national level, 120–1
UN High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR)	
, ,	follow-up to CRC Committee's work,
establishment (1994), 3	121–2
UN system	Northern Ireland, CAT and, 182–4
complaints procedures 'communications' distinguished,	United States of America (USA)
22	CAT (Torture Convention)
==	jurisdiction: acts committed by
decline, 3 cooperation between willing parties as	non-nationals abroad, 325; —, extension to acts committed within
basis, 7–8	country, 326; —, implementing
environmental bodies distinguished, 8	legislation, need for, 325
institutions. See Institutions (UN	non-refoulement, 325
system)	reservations, 324–6
national law and practice, effect on, 11,	CRC
241–2, 261–4, 447, 508–9	Parental Rights and Responsibilities
NGOs. See NGOs	Act 1995 and, 327 n29
reporting obligations. See Reporting	popular distrust, 318, 326–7
obligations (UN system)	'cruel, inhuman or degrading
treaty regime	punishment'
participation, 3, 4 Table 1.1	ICCPR reservation, 320–1; objections
rapid development, 3	to, 321–2
US distrust, 317–18	death penalty
UNDP	ICCPR reservation, 10, 320–2;
human rights approach	objections to, 10, 321–2
'Sustainable Human Development',	National Coalition to Abolish the
219 n46	Death Penalty, 328



Index

economic, social and cultural rights definition and USA dissent, 327 human rights international norms, importance, 327-8; National Association for the Advancement of Colored People Legal Defense Fund, 328; ---, National Coalition to Abolish the Death Penalty, 328 Lawyers' Committee for Human Rights, 321, 325, 326 **ICCPR** extraterritorial scope, 179-80 reservations, 318-19, 322-4; compatibility with object and purpose of the Covenant, 322; -, 'cruel, inhuman or degrading punishment', 320-1; —, death penalty, 10, 320-2 International Criminal Court objections to, 317 n1, 323 n19 NGOs, 328-9 UN reporting obligations funding prohibition, 323 undertaking to: involve federal, state and local authorities, 322; ---, publicise, 322 Supreme Court discretionary jurisdiction, 47 jurisdiction, 325-6 treaties human rights, US record, 317-29: Uruguay pressure for effective implementation and monitoring, 328 - 9ratification of Genocide Convention, reservations: HRC General Comment No. 24, 318-19; —, ICCPR, 318 - 19Reservations, Understandings and Declarations (RUDs), 319-22: consistency with Constitution, need for, 320; -, implementation by states except where a federal matter, 320; --, no change to US law or practice where below international standards, 320 Consequences, 101, 102-3

self-executing: human rights conventions, exclusion, 268, 319-20; --, non-self-executing provision, 320; Vienna Convention on Consular Relations, 318 undertaking to review, 322 treaty implementation and compliance Executive Order 13 (Implementation of Human Rights Treaties), 318, 323-4; requirement to respect and implement human rights treaty obligations, 324 individual's right of action, 320 Inter-Agency Working group on Human Rights treaties, 324: mandate, 324 n21 international obligations, 320 recommendation for establishment of institution to monitor, 323 Vienna Convention on Consular Relations; Breard, 318 distrust, 317-18 Universal Declaration of Human Rights binding nature, 248-9 See also 'soft' law status below customary international law, 238, 249 ICESCR/ICCPR and, 249 legislation, interpretation aid to, 283 'soft' law status, 238 Urgent matters. See Emergency situations communications and individual petitions (ICCPR Optional Protocol), 32 n26, Voluntary funding, 9, 474, 484-6 See also CEDAW (Convention for the Elimination of Discrimination against Women); Institutions (UN system), membership inattention to gender issues, 192-3, 223 NGOs' role, 192-3 Special Rapporteur for Violence against Women, its Causes and



More information

Cambridge University Press 0521645743 - The Future of UN Human Rights Treaty Monitoring Edited by Philip Alston and James Crawford Index

Index

unified UN programme for their advancement, 83, 98 monitoring of progress, 100, 105 Words and phrases 'any administrative tribunal or judicial authority', 2 n2 'birth', 261-4 'descent', 77 Drittwirkung, 240 'hearing within reasonable time', 6 n6 'incorporation', 230-1 lex posterior derogat legi priori, 234-5 'multilateral consultative process to resolve questions regarding implementation', 371 'rule of instruction', 239 'systematic practice', 169 n85 'well-founded indications that torture is being systematically practised',

Yugoslavia, former

145-6

See also Bosnia and Herzegovina; Emergency situations

CHR

Expert on Internally Displaced Persons, 444 Special Rapporteur on the Human Rights Situation, 443–4

Special Rapporteur on Summary Executions, 444 special reports CEDAW, 442

HRC, 187, 441, 446

Zaire

CEDAW's request for special report,

Zimbabwe

corporal punishment, 277-8 customary international law part of domestic law, 271, 276 death row, 278-9 Declaration of Rights international conventions, influence, justiciability, 270 human rights treaties participation in, 270 international law impact on national law, 270, 277-9 legislation, interpretation aids: ECHR decisions, 277-9; ---, non-binding international instruments, 279 treaties incorporation, need for, 271