THE GENDER OF DEATH
A CULTURAL HISTORY IN ART AND LITERATURE

Why is it that in some cultures and times, literature, folklore, and art commonly represent death as a man, in others as a woman? Karl S. Guthke shows that these choices, which often contradict the grammatical gender of the word “death” in the language concerned, are neither arbitrary nor accidental. In earlier centuries, the gender of the figure of death contributed to the interpretation of biblical narrative – in particular, whether original sin was that of Adam or Eve; it related to concepts of the devil and also reflected the importance of the classical figure of Thanatos. More recently, the gender of death as angel, lover, or bride – whether terrifying or welcome – has carried powerful psychological and social connotations. Tracing the gender of representations of death in art and literature from medieval times to the present day, Guthke offers astonishing new insights into the nature and perception of the Western self in its cultural, intellectual, and literary context.

Karl S. Guthke is Kuno Francke Professor of German Art and Culture at Harvard University. He is the author of a wide range of books on German and West European and English literature and culture, among them Modern Tragicomedy (1966), The Last Frontier (1990), B. Traven: The Life Behind the Legends (1991), Last Words (1992), and Trails in No-Man’s Land (1993).
THE GENDER OF DEATH
A CULTURAL HISTORY IN ART AND LITERATURE

KARL S. GUTHKE
To talk at all interestingly about death is inevitably to talk about life.

D. J. Enright  *The Oxford Book of Death*

It is our conception of death which decides our answers to all the questions that life puts to us.

Dag Hammarskjöld  *Markings*
CONTENTS

List of plates ix
Acknowledgments xi

INTRODUCTION 1
Why this book?

1 IMAGINING THE UNIMAGINABLE: DEATH PERSONIFIED 7
   Is Death a woman?

2 THE MIDDLE AGES: THE UNFORTUNATE FALL 38
   The wages of sin – Adam’s sin, or Eve’s?

3 RENAISSANCE AND BAROQUE: THE DEVIL INCARNATE 82
   Death and the Maiden – and the man

4 THE ROMANTIC AGE: “HOW WONDERFUL IS DEATH” 128
   The youth with the downturned torch;
   “The last best friend”; Death in the bridal chamber

5 FROM DECADENCE TO POSTMODERNITY:
   THE STRANGER AT THE MASKED BALL 173
   Angels of death and skeletal coquettes

EPILOGUE 252
Death immortalizing life

Notes 257
Select bibliography 285
Index 290
PLATES

1 Hugo Simberg: Death Listens. Ateneum taidemuseo, Helsinki  2


3 Jean Grandville: *Journey to Eternity*, no. 7. Beinecke Library, Yale University  28

4 Latin Bible (thirteenth century), illustration. From: Alexandre de Laborde, *La Bible moralisée*, vol. iv (Paris: Pour les membres de la société, 1921), ill. no. 599; detail. Houghton Library, Harvard University  47

5 Jean Colombe: Death as Knight on Horseback. Art Resource, New York  52

6 Beatus de Liébana: Commentary on the Apocalypse, illustration. Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin  60

7 Francesco Pesellino: Triumph of Chastity and Death. Isabella Stewart Gardner Museum, Boston  70

8 Fresco, Campo Santo, Pisa. Art Resource, New York 72‒73


10 Hans Baldung, called Grien: Death and Woman. Kunstmuseum Basel  102

11 Niklaus Manuel, called Deutsch: Death and the Maiden. Kunstmuseum Basel  103

12 Niklaus Manuel, called Deutsch: Death and the Canon. Hessisches Landesmuseum Darmstadt  119

13 Hans Holbein the Younger: *Icones mortis*. The Nun. Institut für Geschichte der Medizin, Universität Düsseldorf  121

14 Agostino Veneziano: The Skeletons, copper engraving of Rosso Fiorentino: I squeletti. Institut für Geschichte der Medizin, Universität Düsseldorf  126


16 Philipp Jakob Scheffauer: Genius of Death. Staatsgalerie Stuttgart  145
PLATES


18  J. R. Schellenberg: Frustrated Expectation. Institut für Geschichte der Medizin, Universität Düsseldorf 153

19  Oskar Schwebel: *Der Tod in deutscher Sage und Dichtung* (Berlin: Weile, 1876) title-page vignette 195


21  Jacek Malczewski: Thanatos I. Muzeum Narodowe w Poznaniu 199

22  Gustave Moreau: The Young Man and Death. Harvard University Art Museums 207

23  Félicien Rops: Dancing Death. Institut für Geschichte der Medizin, Universität Düsseldorf 217


26  Klaus Rosanowski: Hairdresser and Death. Institut für Geschichte der Medizin, Universität Düsseldorf 231


30  Gian Lorenzo Bernini: Tomb of Pope Urban VIII. Art Resource, New York 253

The illustrations are published by permission of the copyright holders indicated.
I am indebted to many friends, colleagues, and students, but above all to Frau Eva Schuster, curator of the collection of graphics on the general subject of death and dying housed in the Medizinhistorisches Institut of the University of Düsseldorf. She made several photos available to me without which this book would be incomplete, and conversations with her during my week-long stay in Düsseldorf were eye-opening. My trip to Düsseldorf was made possible through the generosity of the Committee on Research Support and the Center for European Studies at Harvard University. Ms. Doris Sperber, who word-processed the text with her usual efficiency and attention to detail, contributed sound advice and helpful suggestions. I am grateful to Ms. Mary Clare Altenhofen for helping me use the holdings of the Fogg Art Museum at Harvard, and to Professors Joseph Koerner, Eckehard Simon, and Jan Ziolkowski for their critical reading of individual chapters.

The argument was fine-tuned here and there and accommodated to the interests of English-speaking readers by greater reliance on examples from the arts and literatures of the Anglo-Saxon world as well as by occasional modifications of my commentary. Unless indicated otherwise, English renderings of quotations are my own; I have no fear that my translations of poetry will be thought to imply any poetic ambitions. In many cases there is no standard English title of a work of literary or pictorial art originating outside the English-speaking world; this should be no problem, however, as the notes invariably (even when an illustration is provided) refer the reader to illustrations and further discussion, wherever possible in English-language publications, though the German catalogue of the Düsseldorf collection, Eva Schuster’s
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

*Mensch und Tod* (Düsseldorf: Triltsch, 1989), remains the most indispensable handbook in this field. In providing foreign language titles and/or English equivalents, I have been guided by common sense, adding or omitting translations or original titles with a view to what most readers would find necessary or desirable. (So I refer simply to the *Aeneid* on the one hand, and to Malraux’s *Antimémoires*, on the other; in the overwhelming number of cases, both original title and English translation are given.) The period labels of the individual chapters are flags of convenience; thus, for better or probably worse, “The Romantic Age” includes the later eighteenth-century Enlightenment as well as the Classical Revival around 1800.

Speakers of English will take it for granted that the Grim Reaper is male, but, then, they are apparently not expected to be taken aback when, in the *Times Literary Supplement* of August 14, 1998, they come across a poem by Edwin Morgan which quite matter-of-factly casts Death in the role of a ghastly “she.” Or are they?

Interest in the subject of this essay seems esoteric until one discovers that it is universal—which might explain why it has never resulted in a book-length study, or why, perhaps, it shouldn’t be taken to such an extreme. Be this as it may, I was not disconcerted to find out that even British TV culture has been infested by the “bug.” One fine day on ITV (on July 9, 1997 at 8 p.m., to be scholarly about it), Inspector Morse got into a mildly philosophical discussion of death with the usual suspects; one of them, a young woman disappointed in matters of the heart, offered the opinion that Death is a “he” because all things “ugly” are male, while all things beautiful are female. She turned out to be innocent of murder, but not of oversimplification.