Contents

Preface xv

List of abbreviations xvii

1 Introduction
   The significance of self-determination 1
   The approach chosen 2
   The principal postulates of this enquiry 3

PART I
THE HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

2 Self-determination as an international political postulate 11
   The French Revolution 11
   Lenin and Wilson 14
      Lenin 14
      Wilson 19
   The aftermath of the First World War 23
   The Aaland Islands case 27
   Concluding remarks 32
PART II
SELF-DETERMINATION BECOMES AN
INTERNATIONAL LEGAL STANDARD

3 Treaty law 37
The United Nations Charter 37
Political attitudes in the era after the Second World War 44
The 1966 International Covenants on Human Rights 47
Introductory remarks 47
The origin of the Article on self-determination 48
The content of self-determination as laid down in the Covenants 52
Self-determination as a continuing right: expression of popular will 52
Self-determination as a continuing right: freedom from outside interference 55
The right over natural wealth and resources 55
Self-determination of dependent peoples 57
The people referred to in Article 1 59
The practice of the UN Human Rights Committee 62
Concluding comments 65

4 The emergence of customary rules: external self-determination 67
Introductory remarks: two necessary caveats 67
The role of treaty rules in the customary process 67
The role of UN Resolutions in the crystallization of customary rules 69
External self-determination 71
The self-determination of colonial peoples 71
The evolving of general standards 71
The actual implementation of the standards 74
An overview of UN practice with regard to colonial situations 74
To what extent has the United Nations paid regard to the freely expressed will of colonial peoples? 76
Cases where the principle of self-determination was blatantly set aside 79
Three outstanding situations 86
The pronouncements of the International Court of Justice 88
The self-determination of peoples subjected to foreign domination or occupation 90
Economic self-determination 99
Contents

5 The emergence of customary rules: internal self-determination 101
   Introductory remarks 101
   A right of self-determination for the populations of sovereign states? The UN practice 102
   The right to self-determination of racial groups denied equal access to government 108
   The 1970 Declaration on Friendly Relations: its saving clause 109
   The literal and logical construction of the clause 112
   The preparatory work bears out the above interpretation 115
   Does the Declaration enshrine a right of secession for racial and religious groups? 118
   The saving clause of the 1970: Declaration: is it customary law? 120
   General 120
   In particular: the refusal of any right to secession 122
   The modes of exercising internal self-determination 124
   Conclusion: the general principle and the customary rules on self-determination 126
   The different role of the principle and the rules 126
   Self-determination as imposing obligations towards the whole international community as part of jus cogens 133

6 The holders of the right to self-determination and the means of ensuring observance of the right 141
   Introductory remarks 141
   The recipients of the right to self-determination under the UN Covenants: two possible views 141
   The view according to which peoples are only beneficiaries of Article 1 142
   The view according to which peoples are holders of legal rights proper 143
   Means of ensuring respect for the right to self-determination under the Covenants 145
   The recipients of the right to self-determination under customary law 146
   The manner of exercising self-determination under customary law 147
Contents

Enforcement of self-determination by the peoples concerned 150
Enforcement of self-determination by third states 155

7 Comparing customary law and treaty law 159

PART III
THE RIGHT TO SELF-DETERMINATION IN OPERATION

8 The impact of self-determination on traditional international law 165
  Introductory remarks 165
  International legal subjects 165
  Sources of law: the rise of jus cogens 169
  The principle of non-interference in domestic affairs 174
  State responsibility 176
    The changing paradigm of state responsibility 176
    ‘Crimes of States’ in the International Law Commission’s
    Draft Convention on State Responsibility 177
    State responses to gross breaches of the principle of
    self-determination 180
  Territorial sovereignty 185
    Introductory remarks 185
    The validity of existing title over territory 186
    Acquisition of legal title to territorial sovereignty 188
    Cession 189
    Boundaries (uti possidetis v. self-determination) 190
  The use of force 193
    The use of force by the oppressive state 194
    The use of force by the oppressed people 197
    The use of force by third states 199
      Resort to force by the state claiming reversionary rights
      over the territory of a dependent people 199
      Resort to force by other third states 199
    Final remarks 200
  The humanitarian law of armed conflict 201
9 Testing international law – some particularly controversial issues

Introductory remarks 205
Attempts at implementing self-determination: some case studies 206
Gibraltar
  General 206
  Historical background 207
  The position of Spain 208
  The position of the UK 209
  The position of the UN 210
  Some tentative remarks 211
Western Sahara
  Introductory remarks 214
  Historical background 214
  A thumb-nail sketch of the position of the states concerned 217
  Concluding remarks 218
Eritrea
  Introductory remarks 218
  Historical background 219
  The views and claims of Ethiopia 221
  The views and claims of the Eritreans 221
  Concluding remarks 222
East Timor
  Introductory remarks 223
  Historical background 224
  The views of Portugal 225
  The views of Indonesia 225
  Some tentative remarks 226
Palestinian rights
  Introductory remarks 230
  Historical background 232
  The view advanced by the government of Israel 235
  The view advanced by the Palestine Liberation Organization 237
  The position of the United Nations 238
  A few general remarks 240
  The Israel–PLO agreement of 13 September 1993: some tentative observations 243
  The Agreement and self-determination 243
Table of Contents

Contents

The Agreement and the Camp David Accord 245
Concluding remarks 247
Quebec 248
Historical background 248
The positions advanced by the principal political parties in Quebec 251
The view advanced by the federal government 251
Do the Québécois have a legal right to self-determination? 251
Rights versus reality 253
Concluding comments 254

10 The role of self-determination in the recent break up of the Soviet Union and Yugoslavia 257
Introductory remarks 257
The Baltic republics 258
The position of the republics 258
The position advanced by the Soviet Union 261
The rights of the Baltic republics under international law 262
Rights versus reality 263
The other Soviet Republics 264
The crisis in Yugoslavia 268
Concluding remarks 273

PART IV
THE NEW TRENDS EMERGING IN THE WORLD COMMUNITY

11 Attempts at expanding self-determination 277
Introduction 277
The Helsinki Final Act 278
General 278
The 1973 proposals 280
The texts of the four proposals 280
The discussion of the texts 283
Principle VIII of the Helsinki decalogue 284
The novel features of Principle VIII 285
The traditional facets of Principle VIII 288
The Helsinki Principle, the UN instruments and customary international law 290

xii
## Table of Contents

The CSCE follow-up to the Helsinki Final Act 292

The 1976 Algiers Declaration on the Rights of Peoples 296
  The main features of the self-determination provisions 296
  The Algiers Declaration and existing international law 301
  The Algiers Declaration and the Helsinki Final Act 301

The new drive towards the customary recognition of the right to self-determination of the peoples of sovereign states 302

## PART V
GENERAL STOCK-TAKING

12 Recapitulation and conclusion 315
  Merits and failings of the present body of international law 315
    The political principle and its different meanings 315
  What notion of self-determination has been upheld in international law? The present legal regulation of self-determination 317
  The historical and political background of the present international regulation of self-determination 320
  Merits of the present law 323
  The alleged flaws of the law 325
  The real flaws 327
  The co-ordination of self-determination with the other fundamental legal principles of the world community 333
  Emerging normative trends 337
  The existing law on self-determination and the new tribalism 339
  From *lex lata* to *lex ferenda*: a blueprint for action 341
    The starting point 341
      The failings of UN action 341
      The current context of the international community 342
    A plea for a four-pronged strategy 344
      Putting existing international legislation into effect with regard to some outstanding questions 344
      Promoting the crystallization of rules *in statu nascendi* on the internal self-determination of peoples of sovereign states 346
      Developing new rules for the internal self-determination of ethnic groups and minorities 348
      General: the need to rethink self-determination and emphasize its ‘internal’ dimension 348
## Contents

Looking upon minority protection within the framework of internal self-determination: the link between the two concepts 351

The means of achieving self-determination for ethnic groups and minorities: strengthening positive action and participatory rights and granting a wide measure of autonomy 352

Allowing for the exceptional granting of external self-determination to ethnic groups and minorities, subject to international consent and scrutiny 359

A word of caution about the proposed strategy and some alternative solutions 363

**Index of names** 366

**Index of subjects** 372