

The Historical Performance of Music: An Introduction

This book offers students and performers a concise overview of historical performance, taking into account the many significant developments that have taken place in the discipline, particularly in the last decade. It addresses practical matters rather than philosophical issues, and guides readers towards further investigation and interpretation of the evidence provided, not only in the various early instrumental and vocal treatises, but also in examples from the mainstream repertory. Designed as a parent volume for the series Cambridge Handbooks to the Historical Performance of Music, it provides an historical basis for artistic decision-making which has as its goal the re-creation of performances as close as possible to the composer's original conception. It relates many of the issues discussed to four major works composed c. 1700-c. 1900, the core period which forms the principal (though not exclusive) focus for the whole project.

Colin Lawson is one of Europe's leading period clarinettists. As principal clarinet of The English Concert, The Hanover Band and the London Classical Players, he has recorded extensively and toured worldwide. An avid researcher into performance practice and the history of the clarinet, he is editor of *The Cambridge Companion to the Clarinet* and author of *Mozart: Clarinet Concerto* and *Brahms: Clarinet Quintet* in the series Cambridge Music Handbooks. He currently holds the Chair of Performance Studies at Goldsmiths College in the University of London.

ROBIN STOWELL is a Professor of Music at Cardiff University. He is a professional violinist and baroque violinist as well as a music editor and author. He has written extensively about stringed instruments and about the conventions of performing early music. He is author of *Violin Technique and Performance Practice in the Late Eighteenth and Early Nineteenth Centuries* and a Cambridge Music Handbook on Beethoven's Violin Concerto. He is also editor of *Performing Beethoven* and two Cambridge Companions (to the violin and to the cello).



Cambridge Handbooks to the Historical Performance of Music

GENERAL EDITORS Colin Lawson and Robin Stowell

During the last three decades historical performance has become part of mainstream musical life. However, there is as yet no one source from which performers and students can find an overview of the significant issues or glean practical information pertinent to a particular instrument. This series of handbooks guides the modern performer towards the investigation and interpretation of evidence found both in early performance treatises and in the mainstream repertory. Books on individual instruments contain chapters on historical background, equipment, technique and musical style and are illustrated by case studies of significant works in the repertoire. An introductory book provides a more general survey of issues common to all areas of historical performance and will also inform a wide range of students and music lovers.

Forthcoming titles

JOHN HUMPHRIES The Early Horn: A Practical Introduction
COLIN LAWSON The Early Clarinet: A Practical Introduction
DAVID ROWLAND Early Keyboard Instruments: A Practical Introduction
ROBIN STOWELL The Early Violin and Viola: A Practical Introduction
RACHEL BROWN The Early Flute: A Practical Introduction



The Historical Performance of Music: An Introduction

Colin Lawson

Goldsmiths College, University of London

and

ROBIN STOWELL

Cardiff University





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York NY 10011-4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13,28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa
http://www.cambridge.org

© Cambridge University Press 1999

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1999 Reprinted 2000, 2002, 2003

Typeset in 10.25/14 Adobe Minion in QuarkXPress™ [se]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress cataloguing in publication data Lawson, Colin (Colin James)

The Historical Performance of Music: An Introduction / Colin Lawson & Robin Stowell.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

 $ISBN\ 0\ 521\ 62193\ 3\ (hardback) - ISBN\ 0\ 521\ 62738\ 9\ (paperback)$

1. Performance practice (Music) – 18th century. 2. Performance practice (Music) – 19th century. I. Stowell, Robin. II. Title.

ML457.L39 1999

781.4'3'09-dc21 98-42731 CIP

ISBN 0 521 62193 3 hardback ISBN 0 521 62738 9 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2004



Contents

List of figures ix Preface xi

1 Music as history 1

Introduction 1

The nature and development of historical awareness 3

Influential reworkings of Bach and Handel 4

Historical considerations 6

The pioneers: individuals and institutions 8

The role of musical expression 9

Arguments pro and con 11

Post-war philosophies 12

Period Mozart and beyond 13

The current scene 15

2 The application of primary sources 17

Surviving instruments 18

Iconographical sources 19

Historical archives 21

Literary sources 21

Practical treatises – uses and limitations 22

Practical treatises – a summary 25

Theoretical treatises 27

The importance of communication 28

The role of editions 33

Musical taste 39

3 Changes in musical style 42

National idioms 42

Articulation 47

vii



viii CONTENTS

Melodic inflection 53 Accentuation 55

Tempo 58

Rhythmic alteration 64

Ornamentation 67

Extempore embellishment 70

Improvisation 75

Continuo accompaniment 79

4 Conditions and practices 83

Introduction 83

Pitch 84

Temperament 87

Vocal practices 89

Venues and programmes 92

Orchestral constitution and placement 93

Direction 97

Nineteenth-century changes 98

5 Case studies in ensemble music 99

J. S. Bach: St Matthew Passion BWV 244 99

W. A. Mozart: Serenade for 13 instruments K361 109

Berlioz: Episode de la vie d'un Artiste, Symphonie Fantastique en cinq

parties Op. 14 124

Brahms: Symphony No. 2 in D major Op. 73 137

6 The continuing debate 151

Introduction 151

The social position of historical music 151

A snapshot from 1983 153

Authenticity and Early Music 154

The 1990s 156

The future? 160

Notes 161

Select bibliography 199

Index 209



Figures

4.1	Seating plan, Turin Theatre Orchestra, c. 1790	page 95
4.2	Seating plan, Salomon's concerts at the Hanover Square Ro London, 1791–4 (reconstruction by Simon McVeigh)	oms, 96
5.1	Seating plan at the Société des Concerts, Paris, c. 1828	134
5.2	Seating plan at the Société des Concerts, Paris, 1840	135
5.3	Henschel's seating plan approved by Brahms	141

ix



Preface

During the course of little more than a generation historical performance has become part of mainstream musical life in many parts of the world. A number of years have passed since it was subjected to formal scrutiny by Nicholas Kenyon and others in his symposium *Authenticity and Early Music* (Oxford, 1988) and Howard Mayer Brown, Stanley Sadie and their colleagues in *Performance Practice* (London, 1989). The numerous important developments since then have yet to be evaluated thoroughly in print, hence the conception of this volume, which offers a concise, newly considered overview of historical performance. It aims to address largely practical matters rather than theoretical or philosophical issues and to guide readers towards further investigation and interpretation of the evidence provided not only in the various instrumental treatises, but also in examples from the mainstream repertory.

The Historical Performance of Music: An Introduction has been devised to complement the Cambridge Handbooks to the Historical Performance of Music, a series of short volumes on early music performance which are specific to particular instruments. These handbooks present and interpret evidence from significant primary sources on matters such as technique, style and expression, and (like the present volume) offer suggestions for further reading and study. They also offer guidance on other issues pertinent to the instrument under consideration, including repertory and organology, as well as advice regarding the acquisition of appropriate instruments and accessories. The present volume, however, deals with the more general, large-scale practical issues that need to be addressed in connection with the preparation and execution of performances which are historically informed, yet at the same time individual and vivid. As in each handbook, this volume attempts to put many of the issues discussed into practice by relating them to selected major works c. 1700-c. 1900, the core period which forms the principal (though not exclusive) focus for all these publications.

xi



xii PREFACE

Throughout the presentation is descriptive rather than prescriptive, as performing early music involves much more than simply following rules defined in treatises. Appropriately searching questions need to be asked and guidance given as to how and where suitable answers may be sought. Each case study thus demonstrates the application of the technical, interpretative and other principles discussed in different performing situations and in different musical genres. This provides an historical basis for artistic decision-making which has as its goal the re-creation of a performance as close as possible to the composer's original conception.

We have written for all those who are interested in historical performance, whether as professional performers, students, enthusiastic concert-goers, discriminating arm-chair listeners or 'modern' players who seek advice as to those matters of style, approach and general technique that combine to make up a well-grounded, period interpretation. The balance between historical accuracy and practical expediency in early music has varied wildly over the years from one individual and/or ensemble to the next; curiously, however, the general public has remained blissfully unaware of the detail of these variations. Thus, it is hoped that this book will stimulate its readers to contemplate what makes historical performance different, to study the ways and means in which a stylish interpretation may be established and to use them as the historical foundations for artistic decisions in their own performances.

We do not claim that our inevitably broad and summary view of performance practices c. 1700-c. 1900 incorporates all the answers. But we hope that we have been successful in disseminating important information on various significant issues within the discipline, corrected some misconceptions, shed some light on some grey areas, encouraged further reading on many subjects by way of the copious endnotes and select bibliography, and demonstrated that theoretical data must be interpreted with discrimination and caution in formulating an historically informed performance. Above all, we hope that we have emphasised sufficiently not only that period performance comprises – of necessity – a mixture of factual knowledge and educated guesswork but also that close observance of theorists' rules is no substitute for artistry, taste and musical intelligence in bringing a performance to life; for then, as now, performers have been admired for what they as individuals brought to the music, and it is with them that the final responsibility for convincing historical performance must rest.



PREFACE XIII

Together we bring to this volume a great deal of experience of professional performance on period instruments. We would like to take this opportunity of acknowledging the influence and inspiration of friends, colleagues and students in many walks of life who have assisted us in the study and practical realisation of historical performance. Among those who have been most influential have been scholars such as Peter le Huray and Peter Williams, directors and performers such as Roy Goodman, Christopher Hogwood, Sigiswald Kuijken, Sir Charles Mackerras, Sir Roger Norrington, Trevor Pinnock and Jaap Schröder, as well as several instrument makers and a number of postgraduate students. Notwithstanding the fact that we have been willing and grateful recipients of so much advice and guidance, we hold ourselves responsible for the overall content of the text, whose scope has been constrained by the space available. Indeed, several topics outlined here will be explored more fully within the specialist handbooks themselves.

We must also acknowledge the invaluable help of Penny Souster and her team at Cambridge University Press, particularly our painstaking copyeditor Lucy Carolan; finally, thanks are also due to the Department of Music at Cardiff University for granting one of us a most timely period of study leave.