Modern international law was born from the impulse to “civilize” late nineteenth-century attitudes towards race and society, argues Martti Koskenniemi in this highly readable study of the rise and fall of classical international law. In a work of wide-ranging intellectual scope, Koskenniemi traces the emergence of a liberal sensibility relating to international matters in the late nineteenth century, and its subsequent decline after the Second World War. He combines legal analysis, historical and political critique and semi-biographical studies of key figures (including Hans Kelsen, Hersch Lauterpacht, Carl Schmitt, and Hans Morgenthau); he also considers the role of crucial institutions (such as the Institut de droit international and the League of Nations). His discussion of legal and political realism at American law schools ends in a critique of post-1960 “instrumentalism.” Along with the book’s other chapters, this provides a unique reflection on the possibility of critical international law today.

Martti Koskenniemi is Professor of International Law at the University of Helsinki and member of the Global Law School Faculty at New York University. He was a member of the Finnish Ministry for Foreign Affairs from 1978 to 1995, serving, among other assignments, as head of the International Law Division. He has also served as Finland’s representative at a number of international bodies and meetings, including numerous sessions of the UN General Assembly; he was legal adviser to the Finnish delegation at the UN Security Council in 1989-1990. His main publications are From Apology to Utopia. The Structure of International Legal Argument (1989), International Law Aspects of the European Union (edited, 1997) and State Succession: Codification Tested Against the Facts (co-edited, with Pierre Michel Eisemann, 1999).
Available titles in the series

MARTTI KOSSKINNENI
The Gentle Civilizer of Nations
The Rise and Fall of International Law 1870–1960
0 521 62311 1

ANTONIO CASSASE
Self-Determination of Peoples
A Legal Appraisal
0 521 63752 X

ARTHUR WATTS
International Law and the Antarctic Treaty System
0 521 46311 4

ELIHU LAUTERPACHT
Aspects of the Administration of International Justice
0 521 46312 2

CHRISTOPH H. SCHRUEER
State Immunity
Some Recent Developments
0 521 46319 X

IAN SINCLAIR
The International Law Commission
0 521 46320 3

IGNAZ SEIDL-HOVENELDERS
Corporations in and under International Law
0 521 46324 6
I cannot resist the thought that if we were able to . . . refrain from constant attempts at moral appraisal – if, in other words, instead of making ourselves slaves of the concepts of international law and morality, we would confine these concepts to the unobtrusive, almost feminine, function of the gentle civilizer of national self-interest in which they find their true value – if we were able to do these things . . . then, I think, posterity might look back upon our efforts with fewer and less troubled questions.


To the memory of Vieno Koskenniemi (1897–1989),
the gentlest of civilizers
## Contents

*Preface*  
*List of abbreviations*  
*Introduction*  

1 “The legal conscience of the civilized world”  
   - A manifesto  
   - An old-fashioned tradition  
   - A transitional critic: Kaltenborn von Stachau  
   - An amateur science  
   - A time of danger  
   - A meeting in Ghent, 1873  
   - A romantic profession: Bluntschli  
   - A social conception of law  
   - Method: enlightened inwardness  
   - Towards a culture of human rights: Fiore  
   - Advancing the liberal project  
   - Limits of liberalism  
   - Cultural consciousness  
   - Culture as character  
   - The elusive sensibility  

2 Sovereignty: a gift of civilization: international lawyers and imperialism 1870–1914  
   - Ambivalent attitudes  
   - Informal empire 1815–1870: *hic sunt leones*  
   - The lawyers 1815–1870  
   - The demise of informal empire in Africa  
   - The Berlin Conference 1884–1885
3 International law as philosophy: Germany 1871–1933
1871: law as the science of the legal form 182
1871: law as the science of the legal form
From form to substance: the doctrine of the rational will 188
Between the dangerous and the illusory State 194
Rechtsstaat – domestic and international: Georg Jellinek 198
Rationalism and politics: a difficulty 206
Drawing lines in the profession 209
Public law and the Hague Treaties 210
A pacifist profession? Kohler, Schücking, and the First World War 213
The internationalists: between sociology and formalism 222
1914 228
Getting organized 231
Beyond Versailles: the end of German internationalism 236
Ways of escape – I: Hans Kelsen and liberalism as science 238
Ways of escape – II: Erich Kaufmann and the conservative reaction 249
Break: the end of philosophy 261

4 International law as sociology: French “solidarism” 1871–1950
Internationalism as nationalism: the idea of France 270
From civilists to functionalists 1874–1918: Renault to Pillet 274
Solidarity at the Hague: Léon Bourgeois 284
The theory of solidarism 288
The war of 1914–1918 and solidarity 291
Scientific solidarism: Durkheim and Duguit 297
International solidarity . . . almost: Alvarez and Politis 302
Meanwhile in Paris . . . 309
L’affaire Scelle 316
Solidarity with tradition: Louis Le Fur 317
Contents

The solidarity of fact: Georges Scelle 327
Which solidarity? Whose tradition? The Spanish Civil War 338
The European Union 342
The twilight of the idea of France: between politics and pragmatism 348

5 Lauterpacht: the Victorian tradition in international law 333
Tradition in modernity 333
A complete system 361
Between Zionism and assimilation 369
A political commitment 376
Nuremberg and human rights 388
The birth of pragmatism 399
A Grotian tradition? 406
Coda 411

6 Out of Europe: Carl Schmitt, Hans Morgenthau, and the turn to “international relations” 413
A 1950 retrospective 415
Vision of a new order 418
The ambivalences of a Katechon (restrainer) 422
A discipline transforms itself: Schmitt on Scelle and Lauterpacht 424
Against liberal neutralizations and depoliticizations 426
“Whoever invokes humanity wants to cheat” 432
Schmitt and Morgenthau: the primacy of the political 436
Another retrospective 437
International law and politics: an asymmetrical relationship 440
The formation of a German thinker: between law and desire 445
The guardian of international law: sanctions 455
Schmitt and Morgenthau: the pedigree of anti-formalism 459
From international law to international relations 465
The heritage of realism in American international law 474
Empire’s law 480
A culture of formalism? 494

Epilogue 510

Bibliography 518
Index 558
Preface

The essays in this book are inspired by many sources and reflect various conversations I have had with international lawyers in the course of the past four years or so. The initiator of the idea of the book was Professor Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, who kindly invited me to give the Sir Hersch Lauterpacht Memorial Lectures at the University of Cambridge in 1998, and in that connection pointed out that this privilege also involved a commitment to prepare the lectures for publication. Eli’s hospitality in Cambridge in 1997 and the discussions I had with him also underlie my interpretation of his father’s work in chapter 5. As always, I am indebted to Professor David Kennedy from the Harvard Law School for innumerable conversations and collaborative projects, Dighton weeks and weekends, shorter and longer periods together and in wider company in the Boston area, Helsinki and other places, at various stages of writing of these essays. But the only person to have read the whole of this work, and whose comments and criticisms are reflected on every page, as in everything about its author, is Tiina Astola. This book would not exist without them.

Many other friends and colleagues have been involved. The comments and work of Dr. Outi Korhonen are reflected in the description of the culture of late nineteenth-century internationalists. The account of international lawyers and imperialism (chapter 2) draws on the important work of Professors Antony Anghie and Nathaniel Berman, and from discussions I have had with them over the years. That section owes much to the invitation I received from Dr. Surya Subedi to give the Josephine Onoh Memorial Lecture at the University of Hull in February 1999. I also want to thank the participants in the international legal history project under Professor Michael Stolleis at the Max Planck
Preface

Institute for Legal History in Frankfurt for the debate on persons and problems relating to my German story (chapter 3), among them particularly Dr. Betsy Roehlen, whose work on Bluntschli I have plundered in chapter 1 and Dr. Ingo Hueck whose writings on the institutional aspects of the German inter-war scene underlies sections of chapter 3. I am grateful for a number of French friends and colleagues, too, among them in particular Professors Pierre Michel Eisemann and Charles Leben, who directed me to primary and secondary materials without which I could not have made sense of the French story in chapter 4. I also thank Doyen Vedel for correspondence on Louis Le Fur, Dr. Oliver Diggelmann for a discussion and a copy of his unpublished dissertation on Max Huber and Georges Scelle as well as Professor Geneviève Burdau and Mr. Pierre Bodeau for providing relevant materials or references. Chapter 6 on Carl Schmitt and Hans Morgenthau and the “fall” of international law collects several strands of conversation over the years. Some of it draws on papers and discussions at a conference organized by Dr. Michael Byers in Oxford in 1998, and a continuous debate I have had with Professor Anne-Marie Slaughter about the meaning and direction of her “dual agenda.” David Kennedy’s work underlies much of the description of the American scene. People with whom I have discussed various aspects of the following essays but whose influence cannot be clearly allocated to particular sections include Philip Allott, David Bederman, Thomas M. Franck, Gunther Frankenberg, Benedict Kingsbury, Karen Knop, Jan Klabbers, Mattias Kumm, Susan Marks, Reut Paz, Jarna Petman, and Joseph Weiler. The librarians at the Library of Parliament (Helsinki) were again as helpful as ever. Colleagues at the Erik Castrén Institute of International Law and Human Rights (Helsinki) bore without complaint the additional burden of my absent-mindedness about current matters that needed attention. At home, Aino and Lauri took their father’s excessive book-wormishness with a fine sense of irony. So did my mother, Anna-Maija Koskenniemi. I thank them all.

I could not have written this book without one year’s leave of absence from the University of Helsinki, made possible by a grant received from the Finnish Academy (Suomen Akatemia).

Parts of this book draw on materials that I have published earlier. Chapter 5 on Lauterpacht is essentially the same essay that was published in (1997) 8 European Journal of International Law (pp. 215–263). Chapter 2 contains passages included in ‘International Lawyers and Imperialism’ in Josephine Onoh Memorial Lecture 1999 (University of Hull, 1870-1960)
Chapter 5 is a development of my ‘Carl Schmitt, Hans Morgenthau and the Image of Law in International Relations’, in Michael Byers (ed.), The Role of Law in International Politics (Oxford University Press, 1999) pp. 17–34.

The cases where I have used existing translations of French or German materials can be seen from the notes and the bibliography. The rest of the translations are my own.

Martti Koskenniemi,
Helsinki, January 17, 2001
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AFDI</td>
<td>Annuaire français de droit international</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AJIL</td>
<td>American Journal of International Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annuaire IDI</td>
<td>Annuaire de l’Institut de droit international</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARWP</td>
<td>Archiv für Rechts- und Wirtschaftsphilosophie</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASIL</td>
<td>American Society of International Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BYIL</td>
<td>British Year Book of International Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EJIL</td>
<td>European Journal of International Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICJ</td>
<td>International Court of Justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDI</td>
<td>Institut de droit international</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILA</td>
<td>International Law Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PCIJ</td>
<td>Permanent Court of International Justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RdC</td>
<td>Recueil des cours de l’Académie de droit international</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RDI (Paris)</td>
<td>Revue de droit international</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RDI</td>
<td>Revue de droit international et de législation comparée</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reports</td>
<td>Reports of Judgments, Advisory Opinions and Orders of the International Court of Justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RGDIP</td>
<td>Revue générale de droit international public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZaöRV</td>
<td>Zeitschrift für ausländisches öffentliches Recht und Völkerrecht</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>