Disseminating Darwinism

This innovative collection of original essays focuses on the ways in which geography, gender, race, and religion influenced the reception of Darwinism in the English-speaking world of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Although studies of Darwin and Darwinism have increased dramatically in the past few decades, the way in which various groups and regions responded to Darwinism remains relatively unexplored. Little is known about the role of locale in affecting responses to evolutionary theories. The contributions to this volume collectively illustrate the importance of local social, physical, and religious arrangements, while showing that neither distance from Darwin’s home at Down nor size of community greatly influenced how various regions responded to Darwinism. Essays spanning the world from Great Britain and North America to Australia and New Zealand explore the various meanings of Darwinism in these widely separated locales, while other chapters focus on the difference race, religion, and gender made in the debates over evolution.

Ronald L. Numbers is the Hilldale and William Coleman Professor of the History of Science and Medicine at the University of Wisconsin, Madison, a fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences, the former president of the American Society of Church History, and the president of the History of Science Society. He is author or editor of over twenty books, including The Creationists (Alfred A. Knopf, 1992) and Darwinism Comes to America (Harvard University Press, 1998), and is currently writing a history of science in America for Cambridge University Press. Having formerly served as the editor of Isis, the journal of the History of Science Society, he is now coediting (with David C. Lindberg) an eight-volume Cambridge History of Science.

John Stenhouse is Senior Lecturer in History at the University of Otago, New Zealand. He is coeditor of Science and Theology: Questions at the Interface (T. & T. Clark, 1994). Professor Stenhouse has also been published in numerous journals, including Journal of the History of Biology, New Zealand Journal of History, Journal of Religious History, Metascience, and Pacifica: Australian Theological Studies.
CONTENTS

List of contributors vii Acknowledgments xi

Introduction (Ronald L. Numbers and John Stenhouse) 1


2. Darwin down under: science, religion, and evolution in Australia Barry W. Butcher 39

3. Darwinism in New Zealand, 1859–1900 John Stenhouse 61


5. Darwinism in the American South Ronald L. Numbers and Lester D. Stephens 123

6. Darwinism, American Protestant thinkers, and the puzzle of motivation Jon H. Roberts 145

7. Exposing Darwin’s “hidden agenda”: Roman Catholic responses to evolution, 1875–1925 R. Scott Appleby 173

8. American Jewish responses to Darwin and evolutionary theory, 1860–1890 Marc Swetlitz 209


10. “The irrepressible woman question”: women’s responses to evolutionary ideology Sally Gregory Kohlstedt and Mark R. Jorgensen 267

Index 295
CONTRIBUTORS


BARRY W. BUTCHER is lecturer in the social studies of science at Deakin University in Geelong, Australia. In 1992 he completed his Ph.D. at the University of Melbourne, where he wrote his dissertation on “Darwinism and Australia, 1836–1914.” He is the author of several articles on the reception of Darwinism in Australia, including “Darwinism, Social Darwinism, and the Australian Aborigines: A Reevaluation,” in *Darwin’s Laboratory: Evolutionary Theory and Natural History in the Pacific*, ed. Roy MacLeod and Philip F. Rehbock (1994), pp. 371–94. He is currently working on an oral history of Australian science.

MARK R. JORGENSEN is a Ph.D. candidate in the Department of Sociology at the University of Minnesota, where he is completing a dissertation on the role of patent rivalry and litigation in stimulating or inhibiting inventive activity in American industry, and an M.A. candidate in the Program in the History of Science and Technology. Other research interests include the evolution of market structure in the history of computing; the social construction of environmental catastrophism; and risk, ethics, and responsibility in the automobile industry.

SALLY GREGORY KOHLSTEDT is professor of the history of science and director of the Center for Advanced Feminist Studies at the University of Minnesota.
Contributors


RONALD L. NUMBERS is Hilldale and William Coleman professor of the history of science and medicine at the University of Wisconsin, Madison, and one-time William Evans visiting fellow in religious studies at the University of Otago in Dunedin, New Zealand. He is the author or editor of over twenty books, including *The Creationists* (1992) and *Darwinism Comes to America* (1998). He is currently writing a history of science in America for Cambridge University Press and coediting, with David C. Lindberg, the eight-volume *Cambridge History of Science*. He is a fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences, the president of the American Society of Church History, and the president-elect of the History of Science Society.


JOHN STENHOUSE is senior lecturer in history at the University of Otago in Dunedin, New Zealand, and a former fellow in the Institute for Research in the Humanities at the University of Wisconsin, Madison (1996). He has written a number of articles on the history of evolution in New Zealand, including “The Darwinian Enlightenment and New Zealand Politics,” in *Darwin’s Laboratory: Evolutionary Theory and Natural History in the Pacific*, ed. Roy MacLeod and Philip
Contributors ix


LESTER D. STEPHENS is professor emeritus of history at the University of Georgia. His many publications include *Joseph LeConte: Gentle Prophet of Evolution* (1982), *Ancient Animals and Other Wondrous Things: The Story of Francis Simmons Holmes, Paleontologist and Curator of the Charleston Museum* (1988), and *Science, Race, and Religion in the American South: John Bachman and the Charleston Circle of Naturalists* (1999). For over a decade he edited the History of American Science and Technology Series published by the University of Alabama Press, and in the early 1990s he served on the executive committee of the History of Science Society.

MARC SWETLITZ earned an M.A. degree in Jewish studies from the Jewish Theological Seminary in New York City (1984) and a Ph.D. degree in the history of science from the University of Chicago (1991), where he wrote his dissertation on “Julian Huxley, George Gaylord Simpson, and the Idea of Progress in 20th-Century Evolutionary Biology.” He subsequently held postdoctoral fellowships in the history of science at the University of Minnesota, Brandeis University, and the University of Oklahoma before joining Arthur Andersen and Co. in St. Charles, Illinois, where he is an instructional design manager in the Center for Professional Education. His publications include “Responses of American Reform Rabbis to Evolutionary Theory, 1864–1888,” in *The Interaction of Scientific and Judaic Cultures in Modern Times*, ed. Yakov Rabkin and Ira Robinson (1995), pp. 103–25.

SUZANNE E. ZELLER is associate professor of history at Wilfrid Laurier University in Waterloo, Ontario, Canada. She is the author of *Inventing Canada: Early Victorian Science and the Idea of a Transcontinental Nation* (1987), *Land of Promise, Promised Land: The Culture of Victorian Science in Canada* (1996), and various articles on the history of Canadian science. With T. H. Levere she is writing on “Science in Canada” for the *Cambridge History of Science* volume on *Modern Science in National and International Context*. Her research interests focus on the history of culture and ideas in colonial societies, especially Victorian science and environmental history.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

With one exception, the papers in this volume were first presented at a conference on “Responding to Darwin: New Perspectives on the Darwinian Revolution,” held in Dunedin, New Zealand, 12–15 May 1994. (David N. Livingstone, who unfortunately could not attend the conference, has graciously permitted us to include his essay in the published proceedings.) This conference was made possible largely through the generosity of the Division of International Programs of the National Science Foundation (represented by Dr. Charles Wallace). Additional support came from the Royal Society of New Zealand (represented by Mrs. Sue Usher), the Alexander Turnbull Library Endowment Trust in Wellington, the Hocken Library and the Division of Humanities at the University of Otago, Knox College in Dunedin, the Departments of History and Religious Studies at the University of Otago, and the Department of the History of Medicine at the University of Wisconsin, Madison. To all these institutions we are most grateful.

We wish to thank, in addition to the contributors to this volume, the following conference participants: Ruth Barton, University of Auckland; Keith R. Benson, University of Washington; Barbara Brookes, University of Otago; Mark Francis, Canterbury University; Chris Gousmett, Dunedin, New Zealand; Pamela M. Henson, Smithsonian Institution; John Angus Laurent, Griffith University; Peter J. Lineham, Massey University; Roy M. MacLeod, University of Sydney; Peter Matheson, The Theological Hall, Knox College; James R. Moore, The Open University; John Omer-Cooper, University of Otago; Gordon S. Parsonson, University of Otago; Gary Tee, University of Auckland; Stephen P. Weldon, University of Wisconsin, Madison; and Janice E. Wilson, University of Otago. Their critiques and comments, as well as those of two anonymous referees, have significantly improved this volume.