

## Index

---

- abortion, 1, 14–52, 81, 196, 204, 207, 211, 216, 238, 239, 261, 299  
   ban, 30  
   criminalisation, 22  
   gradualist approach, 16–17  
   late, 54–66  
   live birth, 54  
   Muslim views, 78  
   registered medical practitioners, 25, 27  
   risk, to the mother, 28, 31  
     of fetal disability, 57  
   Roman Catholic views, 17–52  
   serious handicap, 58  
   three trimester rule, 19  
   under-age, 32–5  
 abortion laws, 25–32  
   attack on, 26–7  
   ‘bad faith’, 29  
   Channel Islands, 29  
   conscience clause, 29  
   in practice, 27–30  
   Northern Ireland, 28  
   reform, 30–2  
 abortionist, 15  
 abortus, living, 54  
 Ackner LJ, 206, 209, 212  
 adoption, 54, 108, 116, 117, 129, 140, 300  
 amniocentesis, 65, 77–8  
 anencephaly, 63, 260  
 ante-natal care  
   principles of 66–79  
   counselling, 67–71  
   investigations, 63–6  
 Arthur, Dr., 254, 258, 295  
 Astill J, 184  
 Auld LJ, 94, 111  
 Australia  
   information disclosure, 69  
   jurisprudence, 4, 167, 213  
   wrongful birth, 82–3  
   wrongful life, 213–24  
   wrongful pregnancy, 108, 125–41, 297  
 Austria, wrongful life, 300  
 Baker J, Scott, 268  
 Balcombe LJ, 19, 50, 263–4, 269  
 benefits rule, 107  
 Bingham, Lord, 77, 118, 167, 168, 169, 172, 173, 176–9, 180, 181, 182, 185, 298  
 birth  
   live, definition, 20, *see also* viability  
   unconvenanted, definition, 4  
 ‘birth actions’, in United States, 80  
 Black, Sir Douglas, 255  
 Blair, J., 118  
 Bolam test, 9, 10–12, 13, 70, 75, 101, 283, 285, 294  
 Brazier, Professor Margaret, 27, 277  
 Bridge, Lord, 69  
 British Medical Association, 292  
 Brooke LJ, 21, 93, 105, 135, 147, 148–9, 154, 155–6, 182, 277, 279  
 Brown J, Simon, 41  
 Brown P, Sir Stephen, 270, 281  
 Browne-Wilkinson, Lord, 11  
 Butler-Sloss, Dame Elizabeth, 34, 83, 111, 248, 249, 250, 265, 278, 279, 282, 283  
 Buxton LJ, 143, 144–5  
 California  
   action against parents, 195  
   birth torts recognised, 5, 199  
 Callinan, J, 134  
 Cameron, Lord, 124, 125, 137  
 Canada  
   fetal/maternal unity, 44  
   wrongful birth, 82  
   wrongful life, 224–31  
   wrongful pregnancy, 107–8  
 Capron, Alexander, 6, 189  
 Cazalet J, 271–2, 279  
 Chadwick LJ, 184–5  
 child, ‘conventional’, 123–4

- child, uncovenanted  
 compensation for, 2–3, 84, 110, 143,  
 145, 149, 152–63, 298  
 in Australia, 128, 139, 140, 141  
 in Canada, 107  
 in the United States, 107  
 meaning, 4, 105  
 disabled child, 6, 7, 53, 126, 136–7, 145,  
 150–2, 188–90 *et seq.*, 300  
 compensation for birth of, 3, 80,  
 84–99, 125, 298  
 in the commonwealth, 82  
 best interests, test of treatment,  
 246–50, 259–60, 262, 265, 268,  
 269, 274, 276–9, 280–1, 282,  
 287–9, 292, 293  
 emotional distress, 81, 85, 92, 153  
 management  
 medical futility, 244, 246, 251  
 professional guidelines, 290–3  
 withdrawal of life support, 244,  
 255, 284–6  
 withholding and withdrawal of  
 treatment, 245, 268, 284–6  
 withholding nutrition, 254, 255  
 substituted judgement, 248, 259, 293  
 child destruction, 20, 22  
 child murder, 242  
 chorionic villus sampling, 65–6  
 Clark J, 146–7, 148  
 Clarke JA, 199  
 Clyde, Lord, 115, 116, 118, 119, 120, 124,  
 138, 145, 150, 151, 170  
 Coleridge LCJ, Lord, 215  
 communication-based negligence *see*  
 information based negligence  
 compensation, 236  
 disabled child, 3, 80, 81, 82, 84–99, 150–63  
 and age of majority, 201, 240  
 healthy child, 96–7, 105–49  
 in the United States, 107  
 no-recovery school, 107, 132–4,  
 139–40, 145, 163  
 compensatory principle, 214–15  
 Conception  
 human inviolability begins at, believers  
 of, 37  
 congenital disability, causes  
 chromosomal, 61  
 translocation defect, 61, 65, 73, 77, 88  
 combined effects, 63  
 environmental, 62  
 drugs, 62  
 haemolytic disease, 62  
 genetic, 196  
 Connell J, 265  
 consent, informed, 67, 76 *see also*  
 information based negligence  
 contraception, 1–2, 35–8  
 compensation, following failure, 2  
 displanting methods, 37–8  
 interceptive methods, 35–7  
 contragestation, 22, 35  
 Cory J, 75  
 Council of Europe  
 protection of of fetus, 48  
 Cox, Dr, 295  
 Crennan J, 220, 223, 224  
 Cullen LJ-C, Lord, 112  
*damnum*, 86, 113, 180–1  
 Deane J, 130  
 delict, 87  
 diminished life, 237–9, 240  
 Diplock, Lord, 68  
 discrimination on the grounds of disability,  
 56, 235  
 Dixon, Clare, 183  
 doctors,  
 abortion, 25, 27, 28, 29–30, 31, 33, 53  
 conscience, 252, 260, 264, 281  
 and abortion, 8–9  
 and clinical judgment, 261  
*see also*, duty of care, information based  
 negligence, medical negligence  
 Donaldson, Lord, 209, 245, 247, 250,  
 260, 262, 263, 266, 274, 277,  
 282, 283  
 Down's syndrome, 61–2, 63–5  
 cases involving, 72–3, 77, 80, 83, 192,  
 194, 203, 233, 253, 254, 300  
 Dunn LJ, 67, 247, 253, 256, 258, 269  
 duty of care, 9, 68–71, 103, 120, 133, 197,  
 209, 219, 220, 229–31  
 to the abortus, 55  
 to the fetus, 79, 206–9, 218, 236  
 to the mother, 54, 68–71, 79, 155,  
 207, 231  
 to the neonate, 229–31  
 Eastham J, 101  
 Elias CJ, 41  
 embryo in vitro, 17, 22  
 Epstein J, 191, 226, 227  
 Ethics  
 principlism, 12  
 European Court of Human Rights, 31,  
 48, 292  
 euthanasia, neonatal, 242, 292–6  
 Ewbank J, 253, 256

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-61624-9 - The Troubled Pregnancy: Legal Wrongs and Rights in Reproduction

J. K. Mason

Index

[More information](#)

## 314 Index

- Farquharson J, 254–5, 256, 257  
 fetal maternal relationship, 43–4  
 fetal rights, 17  
 feticide, 47, 48, 49, 50, 57, 230  
 fetus, 16–23  
   beginning of life, 45, 48  
   French law, 48  
   choice of abortion, 238  
   duty of care to, 79, 207–10, 218, 221,  
     225–6, 236  
   involuntary death of, 41–9  
     transferred malice, 43–4  
   moral status, 17, 18, 30, 40, 43, 299–301  
   protection in Europe, 47  
   unintentional fetal homicide, 47, 48  
   viability, 19–21, 22, 23, 40, 45,  
     46, 50
- Fortin, Jane, 212
- France, wrongful life actions, 231, 232–4
- Fragile-X syndrome, 61
- Fraser, Lord, 34
- Gans J, 227
- Garett J, 106
- genetic disease, 59–61  
   history, 57  
   late-onset, 60  
   multifactorial type, 60
- Gibson LJ, 104
- Gill, Lord, 112
- ‘Gillick-competent’ child, 33–4
- Gillon, 246
- Gleeson CJ, 128–9
- Goff, Lord, 285
- Griffiths LJ, 206, 209, 222, 238
- Groningen Protocol, 293–5
- Gudron J, 70
- Gummow, J, 132–4, 140, 162
- Hale LJ, 98, 137, 138, 139, 147, 149,  
   156–61, 162, 164–5, 166, 170,  
   175, 179, 241, 264
- Hayne J, 129–30
- Henriques J, 80, 92, 95, 124, 162
- Heydon, 130–2
- Hedley J, 252, 260–1, 273–5, 278,  
   280–1, 282
- Hoffmann LJ, 273, 274
- Hollinrake JA, 74
- Holman J, 277, 278, 279, 284, 285–9
- Holmes J, 127, 156
- Hope, Lord, 76, 116, 117, 120, 122, 138,  
   151, 155, 171, 172, 174–5, 178,  
   180, 181, 182
- Hoyana, Laura, 114, 119, 124, 165
- Huntington’s disease, 60
- Hutchison J, 73, 75
- Hutton, Lord, 169, 171–2, 174, 175, 182
- hydrocephalus, 266
- Iacobucci J, 75
- implantation, 35  
   moral significance, 17  
   starting point of meaningful human  
     life, 17
- infanticide, 242
- information based negligence, 68–71, 196,  
   226 *see also* Bolam test  
   causation, 71–7  
   duty of care, 68, 69  
   understanding, 78
- intolerability of continued life, 247, 269,  
   276–9, 296
- inuria*, 86, 113, 180
- Ipp, JA, 214, 216, 224
- Islam, and abortion, 35
- IUD, 35, 37, 38
- Jehovah’s Witnesses, 251
- Jennings J, 226, 227
- Jotkowitz, 295, 296
- Judge LJ, 186–7
- Jupp J, 89, 108–10, 117, 136
- Kennedy J, 105, 142–3
- Kennedy, LJ, 184, 185
- Kerr LJ, 94, 102, 110
- Kirby, 7, 43, 83, 86, 123, 135–7, 140–1,  
   162, 220–2, 223
- Kleinfelter’s syndrome, 58, 61
- Lakin CJ, 72
- Lambert, JA, 74
- Laws LJ, 94, 144
- Lawson J, 206, 237
- Lax J, 134, 219, 224
- Leggatt LJ, 263
- Levenson J, 93, 94
- Longmore, J, 151, 156
- Lorber, John, 244
- Lowry, Lord, 285
- MacFadyen, Lord, 88
- Marnoch, Lord, 89
- Mason P, 214, 216–18, 219, 220
- maternal serum tests, 64
- McCluskey, Lord, 31, 113, 123, 158
- McHugh J, 132–4, 140
- McKenzie, J, 247
- McLachlin J, 75

- Maclean, Alasdair, 71  
 McLean, Professor Sheila, 18, 26  
 medical negligence, 9–13 *et seq.*, 83, 218,  
 232, 235 *see also* information  
   based negligence  
   and abortion, 38–40, 229  
   causation, 12–13, 74, 76–77, 148, 197, 225  
   communication, 12, 68, 104  
   duty of care, 9, 68–71, 103, 124–5, 196, 236  
   immunity, 132–3, 136, 221, 285  
   general standard of care, 10–12  
     legal, 10  
     professional, 10  
   proximity, 147–9, 183  
 Millett, Lord, 116, 117, 120–1, 122, 138,  
 144, 151–2, 168, 169, 170, 172,  
 174, 178, 179  
 minors  
   and abortion, 32  
   consent to treatment, 32  
   medical confidentiality, 32  
   protection of, 262  
 miscarriage, 15, 36, 65, 78  
 Morison, Lord, 89, 98–9  
 Morland J, 78  
 morning after pill, 35  
 Morris, Anne, 233, 234, 239  
 mothers  
   disabled, 163–6  
   status of, 24  
 Munby J, 36, 37  
 muscular dystrophy, 87  
 Mustill, Lord, 43, 245, 299  
  
 negligent injury, 189  
 neonaticide, 57, 242, 295  
 Netherlands, 236, 293–5  
 neural tube defects, 62, 64–65, 260  
   cases, 54, 96–7  
 New South Wales, 86, 117, 125, 127, 141,  
 213, 216, 222, 297  
 New Zealand, 118, 213, 289  
 Newman J, 80, 90–1, 95, 115, 120, 124  
 Nicholl J, 152  
 Nicholls Lord, 73, 169, 174, 176, 177, 178  
 Nimmo Smith, Lord, 87–8, 89  
 non-treatment decisions, 251, 255 *see also*  
   child disabled, withdrawal and  
   withholding treatment  
 Northern Ireland, 28  
 Nourse LJ, 102  
  
 O'Connor, Justice, 20  
 Ognall J, 111  
 Oliver, Lord, 125  
  
 Pain J, Peter, 2, 102, 105, 109  
 Park J, 115, 142  
 partial birth, 23  
 patients  
   autonomy, 24, 71, 79, 86, 140  
   breach of, 77, 86, 100, 157, 179, 241  
   and choice, 12, 179  
   decision, 12  
   ‘reasonable’, 69, 73–5, 77  
 Pearson J, 239  
 personhood, 243  
 Pollock J, 221  
 pre-conception tort, 196–9, 224  
   causation, 197  
 pregnancy  
   unconvented, 4, 84, 105, 160  
   unwanted, 1, 2–3, 4, 132  
 Priaulx, Nicolette, 177, 179, 180, 309  
 Priestly JA, 116  
 privacy, women’s right to, 18, 20  
 Prosser, Lord, 89  
 Purchas LJ, 102, 111  
  
 Queensland, 127, 141, 297  
  
 reasonable woman, 73–5  
 risk  
   abortion laws, 25–32  
   and tort law, 154  
 Roman Catholicism, 17–52, 246  
 Royal College of Paediatrics and Child  
   Health, 290–1  
 Rubella (German measles), 62, 213–16  
   cases, 91–3, 202, 205–10, 213–16, 232–4  
 Ryan J, 197  
  
 Saintier, Severine, 234, 235, 239  
 sanctity of life, 140, 204, 242–4, 245, 263,  
 289, 292  
 Scarman, Lord, 29, 34, 101  
 Schneiderman, L.J., 246  
 Scotland, 22, 84, 113, 204, 212, 235  
 Scott, Lord, 169, 174, 178, 180, 182  
 Sharpe J, 227  
 Silber J, 34  
 Simon J, 78  
 Singer, S., 119, 121, 180  
 Skipp J, 228, 229–31  
 Slade LJ, 102, 110  
 Slynn, Lord, 113, 118, 119–20, 122, 123,  
 138, 150, 151, 155, 181  
 Smith LJ, Stuart, 72, 101  
 social security  
   France, 233–4  
 Sopinka J, 75

## 316 Index

- South Australia, 141
- South Dakota  
 abortion in, 30, 37
- Spigelman CJ, 44, 215–16, 223
- spina bifida, 64, 160, 244, 294
- spinal muscular atrophy, cases, 263, 284
- standard of care  
 professional, 69–70, 77  
 reasonable patient, 69, 73–5, 77  
 in the USA, 69  
 subjective standard, 69
- Stephenson LJ, 205, 206–9, 210, 212, 218–19, 237
- sterilisation  
 already pregnant, 104, 143  
 breach of duty, 104–5  
 duty of care to partner, 103–4  
 natural failure, 100, *see also* tubal occlusion and vasectomy  
 negligent, 100–5  
 non-voluntary, 100  
 voluntary, 100  
 reversibility, 101–2
- Steyn, Lord, 67, 76, 115, 116, 117, 118, 121, 122, 125, 138, 145, 150, 151, 167, 168, 169, 170, 171, 173, 174, 178, 179, 182
- Strasser, Mark, 5
- Stretton, Dean, 130, 216
- Substituted judgement test, *see* disabled child
- syphilis, cases, 198
- Tasker, Robert C., 244
- Tay-Sachs disease  
 cases, 82, 194
- Taylor LJ, 269, 270, 274, 276
- Templeman LJ, 188, 209, 228, 247, 257–8, 269, 276
- thalidomide, 210
- Thomas J, Swinton, 91
- Thorpe LJ, 246, 248, 250, 279, 282, 287
- Toulson J, 86, 91, 96–7, 98, 115, 124, 125
- tubal ligation and occlusion, 101  
 cases, 103, 125, 126–37, 153, 164
- Twaddle JA, 225
- ultrasonography, 64
- United Kingdom  
 attitudes to abortion, 14, 18  
 ‘*Bolam*’ test, 70  
 child murder, 242  
 wrongful life, 204–13, 224  
 wrongful pregnancy, 108–25
- United States  
 ‘partial birth’ terminations, 23  
 privacy, 35  
 substituted judgement, 248  
 wrongful birth, 80–2  
 wrongful pregnancy, 106–7  
 recovery following, 107, 137
- varicella (chicken-pox), 62
- vasectomy, 100–1, 102  
 cases, 103, 106, 112–13, 125
- ventilation, artificial, 268, 270, 273, 281, 282–3, 284, 285, 288
- vitalism (absolutism), 243, 247, 268–9, 273
- Waite J, 262, 264
- Walker LJ, Robert, 137, 158, 164, 166, 170, 171
- Waller LJ, 110, 154, 161, 162, 163, 166, 171, 174, 182
- Ward J, 267
- Warnock Committee, 17
- Weir, Tony, 141, 231
- Williams, Glanville, 56
- women’s rights, 50  
 medicalisation of, 29
- Wood JA, 74
- Woods J, 198, 200
- Woolf, Lord, 70, 71
- Wright J, 37
- wrongful birth, 4, 6–7, 122, 172, 216  
 Australia, 69, 82–3  
 Canada, 82  
 causation, 71  
 compensation, 84–97  
 Europe, 233, 234  
 lack of conceptual difference  
 between wrongful, birth, life, pregnancy, 96, 133, 217–18, 219, 239  
 negligence, headings, 85  
 normal neonate, 86  
 UK, 75, 83–97  
 USA, 107, 199  
 wrongful conception, 6, 115, 145  
 wrongful life, 5, 7–8, 121, 189, *see also* preconception tort  
 abortion, effect on, 211  
 Australasia, 213–24  
 Canada, 224–31  
 causation, 207, 217, 221, 225, 227–8, 231, 235, 236–7, 238  
 compensation, 192–5, 201–2, 235, 236  
 beyond age of majority, 201, 240

- lack of conceptual difference between
  - wrongful, birth, life, pregnancy, 210, 217–18, 219, 298
- public policy, 209
- refusal of, 216
- United Kingdom, 199, 204–13
- United States, 191–204
  - acceptance, 194–6
- wrongful pregnancy, 4, 6, 172, 301
  - and abortion, 109, 116, 117–19, 142–143, 157, 300
  - and adoption, 116, 117–19, 127, 300
  - Australia, 125–41
    - benefits rule, 107
    - rejection, 123, 137
  - Canada, 106, 107–8
  - costs of maintaining a child, 139, 164, 175, 183
    - disabled child, 145, 147, 150–2, 158
    - healthy child, 2, 114, 118
  - ‘conventional award’, 177, 183
  - ‘deemed equilibrium’, 158, 165
  - disabled mother, 163–6
  - duty of care, 113, 172
  - history of
    - in the UK, 108–25
    - in the US, 106–7
  - injury to the mother, 113
  - invasion of autonomy, 156, 179–80, 180–1, 185
  - lack of conceptual difference between
    - wrongful birth, life, pregnancy, 96, 217–18, 219
  - legal policy, 135, 179
  - liability, 105, 119, 138, 150, 159–61, 172, 183
  - mother’s claim, 103, 105, 112, 114, 143, 177
  - New Zealand case, 116, 118
  - novus actus interveniens*, 110, 115–17, 160
  - public policy, 109, 110, 117–19, 129, 130, 134, 136, 140

Zuber J, 82