

Cambridge University Press

0521614112 - Medical Malpractice and the U.S. Health Care System

Edited by William M. Sage and Rogan Kersh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## Medical Malpractice and the U.S. Health Care System

Medical malpractice lawsuits are common and controversial in the United States. Since early 2002, doctors' insurance premiums for malpractice coverage have soared. As Congress and state governments debate laws intended to stabilize the cost of insurance, doctors continue to blame lawyers and lawyers continue to blame doctors and insurance companies. This book, which is the capstone of three years' comprehensive research funded by The Pew Charitable Trusts, goes well beyond the conventional debate over tort reform and connects medical liability to broader trends and goals in American health policy. Contributions from leading figures in health law and policy marshal the best available information, present new empirical evidence, and offer cutting-edge analysis of potential reforms involving patient safety, liability insurance, and tort litigation.

William M. Sage received his medical and law degrees with honors from Stanford University in 1988 and has been a member of the faculty of Columbia Law School since 1995. In 1993, he headed four working groups of the President's Task Force on Health Care Reform in the Clinton White House. He recently served as principal investigator for the Project on Medical Liability in Pennsylvania. He is also the recipient of an Investigator Award in Health Policy Research from the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation and has published more than sixty articles in legal, health policy, and clinical journals. He is an elected Fellow of the Hastings Center on bioethics and is a member of the editorial board of *Health Affairs*. He is married with two children and lives near New York City.

Rogan Kersh received his B.A. from Wake Forest University and his M.A., M.Phil., and Ph.D. from Yale University. He has taught political science and public administration at Syracuse University since 1996; his extensive political experience includes internships in the U.S. Senate and British Parliament as well as work in the Washington tax-policy office of Coopers & Lybrand and think tanks in Washington and Tokyo. His book *Dreams of a More Perfect Union* was published in 2001, and he is currently completing two books on health policy. He is a board member of the Critical Review Foundation and associate editor of the *Journal of Health Politics, Policy and Law*.

Cambridge University Press

0521614112 - Medical Malpractice and the U.S. Health Care System

Edited by William M. Sage and Rogan Kersh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

# Medical Malpractice and the U.S. Health Care System

*Edited by*

**WILLIAM M. SAGE**

*Columbia University*

**ROGAN KERSH**

*Syracuse University*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
**UNIVERSITY PRESS**

Cambridge University Press

0521614112 - Medical Malpractice and the U.S. Health Care System

Edited by William M. Sage and Rogan Kersh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press

40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521849326](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521849326)

© Cambridge University Press 2006

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006

Printed in the United States of America

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data*

Medical malpractice and the U.S. health care system / edited by William M. Sage, Rogan Kersh.

p. ; cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN-13: 978-0-521-84932-6 (hardback)

ISBN-10: 0-521-84932-2 (hardback)

ISBN-13: 978-0-521-61411-5 (pbk.)

ISBN-10: 0-521-61411-2 (pbk.)

1. Physicians – Malpractice – United States. 2. Insurance, Physicians' liability – United States.

3. Medical care – United States. I. Sage, William M. II. Kersh, Rogan.

KF2905.3.M4393 2006

344.7304'I2I – dc22 2005037931

ISBN-13 978-0-521-84932-6 hardback

ISBN-10 0-521-84932-2 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-61411-5 paperback

ISBN-10 0-521-61411-2 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	<i>page vii</i>
Introduction <i>William M. Sage and Rogan Kersh</i>	I
PART ONE: FRAMING MEDICAL MALPRACTICE AS A HEALTH POLICY ISSUE	
1. The Medical Malpractice System: Structure and Performance <i>Michelle M. Mello and David M. Studdert</i>	11
2. Malpractice Reform as a Health Policy Problem <i>William M. Sage</i>	30
3. Medical Malpractice and the New Politics of Health Care <i>Rogan Kersh</i>	43
PART TWO: THE HEALTH POLICY IMPACT OF MEDICAL MALPRACTICE	
4. Who Pays When Malpractice Premiums Rise? <i>Mark V. Pauly</i>	71
5. The Effects of the U.S. Malpractice System on the Cost and Quality of Care <i>David J. Becker and Daniel P. Kessler</i>	84
6. Liability, Patient Safety, and Defensive Medicine: What Does the Future Hold? <i>Troyen A. Brennan, Michelle M. Mello, and David M. Studdert</i>	93
7. Medical Liability and the Culture of Technology <i>Peter D. Jacobson</i>	115

PART THREE: MALPRACTICE REFORMS THAT SOLVE THE RIGHT PROBLEMS	
8. Promoting Fairness in the Medical Malpractice System <i>Maxwell J. Mehlman</i>	137
9. Caps and the Construction of Damages in Medical Malpractice Cases <i>Catherine M. Sharkey</i>	154
10. Expertise and the Legal Process <i>Catherine T. Struve</i>	173
11. Disclosure and Fair Resolution of Adverse Events <i>Carol B. Liebman and Chris Stern Hyman</i>	191
PART FOUR: IN SEARCH OF A “NEW PARADIGM”	
12. Enterprise Liability in the Twenty-First Century <i>Randall R. Bovbjerg and Robert Berenson</i>	219
13. Private Contractual Alternatives to Malpractice Liability <i>Jennifer Arlen</i>	245
14. Medical Malpractice Insurance Reform: “Enterprise Insurance” and Some Alternatives <i>Tom Baker</i>	267
15. Governments as Insurers in Professional and Hospital Liability Insurance Markets <i>Frank A. Sloan and Charles E. Eesley</i>	291
16. Medicare-Led Malpractice Reform <i>William M. Sage and Eleanor D. Kinney</i>	318
<i>Bibliography</i>	351
<i>Index</i>	389

Cambridge University Press

0521614112 - Medical Malpractice and the U.S. Health Care System

Edited by William M. Sage and Rogan Kersh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Contributors

**Jennifer Arlen** is the Norma Z. Paige Professor of Law at New York University School of Law and is codirector of the NYU Center in Law and Economics. Arlen received her B.A. from Harvard University (*magna cum laude*) and earned both a J.D. (Order of the Coif) and a Ph.D. in economics from New York University. Her main research interests include medical malpractice liability and the use of legal rules to deter corporate wrongdoing. Her recent scholarship on medical malpractice liability includes “Torts, Expertise, and Authority: Liability of Physicians and Managed Care Organizations,” *RAND Journal of Economics* 36 (2005) (with W. Bentley MacLeod), and “Malpractice Liability for Physicians and Managed Care Organizations,” *New York University Law Review* 78 (2003) (with W. Bentley MacLeod).

**Tom Baker** is the Connecticut Mutual Professor and Director of the Insurance Law Center at the University of Connecticut School of Law. His research examines issues of risk and responsibility in the fields of torts and insurance from an interdisciplinary perspective. His recent book, *The Medical Malpractice Myth* (U. Chicago Press, 2005), attacks the misperceptions behind the tort reform movement and proposes an evidence-based approach to medical liability reform. He is the coeditor of *Embracing Risk: The Changing Culture of Insurance and Responsibility* (U. Chicago Press, 2002) and the author of more than twenty articles and essays relating to insurance, risk, and responsibility, as well as a leading insurance law textbook, *Insurance Law and Policy* (Aspen Publishing, 2003).

**David J. Becker** is assistant professor at the University of Alabama–Birmingham’s Department of Health Care Organization and Policy. Prior to his graduate studies, Becker was a researcher at the National Bureau of Economic Research (Stanford, CA; 1997–9) and a health care consultant with The Lewin Group (1996–7). Becker specializes in health, labor, and regulatory economics. His current research interests include the effect of

Cambridge University Press

0521614112 - Medical Malpractice and the U.S. Health Care System

Edited by William M. Sage and Rogan Kersh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

reimbursement policy on treatments and health outcomes, medical malpractice and defensive medicine, Medicare fraud and abuse, and quality reporting initiatives. Becker has recently published in journals including the *Journal of Health Economics* and the *Journal of the American Medical Association*.

**Robert Berenson** is a senior Fellow at the Urban Institute in Washington, D.C. He is an expert in health care policy, particularly Medicare, with experience practicing medicine, serving in senior positions in two Administrations and helping to organize and manage a successful preferred provider organization. Berenson is a board-certified internist who practiced for twelve years in a Washington, D.C., group practice and a Fellow of the American College of Physicians. Berenson is also adjunct professor at the University of North Carolina School of Public Health. For ten years he was medical director of the National Capital PPO, a large rental PPO serving the Washington, D.C., metropolitan area, and he was coauthor, with Walter Zelman, of *The Managed Care Blues and How to Cure Them* (1998). Berenson's current research focuses on modernization of the Medicare program to improve efficiency and the quality of care provided to beneficiaries.

**Randall R. Bovbjerg** is a principal research associate in the Health Policy Center of the Urban Institute in Washington, D.C. In more than thirty years of research, practical, and teaching experience in health policy, one of his specialties has been medical injury, liability, and reform. Bovbjerg has served on the malpractice and quality workgroup of the Clinton Administration's transition team, JCAHO's taskforce on alternatives to tort, and the Patient Safety taskforce of the Federation of State Medical Boards. He and Robert Berenson recently coauthored "Surmounting Myths and Mindsets in Medical Malpractice," an issue brief available on the Institute's Web page [www.urban.org](http://www.urban.org), with more than a hundred of Bovbjerg's other professional publications. Before coming to the Institute, he was a state insurance regulator in Massachusetts.

**Troyen A. Brennan** is chief medical officer of Aetna. Through 2005, he was in academic medicine as professor of medicine at Harvard Medical School, professor of law and public health at Harvard School of Public Health, and chief executive officer of the Brigham and Women's Physician Organization. He is a graduate of Oxford University and of Yale Medical School and Yale Law School. He is past chair of the American Board of Internal Medicine and a member of the Institute of Medicine.

**Charles E. Eesley** is a doctoral student at the MIT Sloan School of Management, specializing in technological innovation and entrepreneurship. He received his B.S. from Duke University in 2002. During the past two years he has worked for Neurocog Trials and as a research assistant at the Duke University Medical Center, focusing on cognition in schizophrenia and neuroimaging studies. He has also worked at Duke's Fuqua School of Business on research related to business strategy and innovation.

Cambridge University Press

0521614112 - Medical Malpractice and the U.S. Health Care System

Edited by William M. Sage and Rogan Kersh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Contributors*

ix

**Chris Stern Hyman** is a health care lawyer and a mediator. In 1998 she formed Medical Mediation Group LLC with Marc Fleisher, J.D., which provides mediation services to resolve disputes in health care. Medical Mediation Group conducts training and mediates medical malpractice lawsuits and other conflicts arising in health care facilities. Hyman has written on state medical boards' pain management policies and on mediation and health care. She received her undergraduate degree from the University of Chicago and her law degree from Brooklyn Law School. Hyman was coprincipal investigator for the Demonstration Mediation and ADR Project of the Project on Medical Liability in Pennsylvania and principal investigator of the New York City Pilot Project for Mediation of Medical Malpractice Claims, funded by a grant to Columbia Law School.

**Peter D. Jacobson** is professor of health law and policy in the Department of Health Management and Policy, University of Michigan School of Public Health, and director of the Center for Law, Ethics, and Health. Before coming to Michigan, Jacobson was a senior behavioral scientist at the RAND Corporation in Santa Monica, California. His current research interests focus on the relationship between law and health care delivery and policy, law and public health systems, public health ethics, and health care safety net services. Jacobson's most recent book is *Law and the Health System*, coauthored with Lawrence O. Gostin (Foundation Press, 2005). He is also a coauthor on the forthcoming book *False Hope vs. Evidence-Based Medicine: The Story of a Failed Treatment for Breast Cancer* (Oxford University Press, 2006). Jacobson is currently writing a book on the history of free clinics.

**Rogan Kersh** is associate professor of political science and public administration at Syracuse University's Maxwell School. He is currently a Fellow at Yale's Rudd Center for Health Policy and Nutrition Politics, where he is completing a book on obesity politics. He has published on health policy in such journals as *Health Affairs*, the *Journal of Health Politics, Policy and Law*, and *Studies in American Political Development*. As a Robert Wood Johnson Scholar in Health Policy, he began a study of health care lobbying that has yielded several articles and will be published in book form in 2007. His extensive political experience includes internships in the U.S. Senate and British Parliament as well as work in the Washington tax policy office of Coopers & Lybrand and think tanks in Washington and Tokyo.

**Daniel P. Kessler** is a professor at the Stanford University Graduate School of Business, a senior Fellow at the Hoover Institution, and a research associate at the National Bureau of Economic Research. He has a J.D. from Stanford Law School and a Ph.D. in economics from MIT. His research interests include antitrust law, law and economics, and health economics. Among his recent publications are, with Mark McClellan, "The Effect of Hospital Ownership on Medical Productivity" (*RAND Journal of*

Cambridge University Press

0521614112 - Medical Malpractice and the U.S. Health Care System

Edited by William M. Sage and Rogan Kersh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

*Economics*) and “Designing Hospital Antitrust Policy to Promote Social Welfare” (*Frontiers in Health Policy Research*). Kessler’s current research focuses on the effects of organizational form in health care on the cost and quality of care.

**Eleanor D. Kinney** is professor of law and codirector of the Center on Law and Health at Indiana University–Indianapolis, where she teaches courses in health law and administrative law. A widely published author and respected lecturer on the subjects of America’s health care system, medical malpractice, health coverage for the poor, and issues in administrative law, Professor Kinney recently published *Protecting American Health Care Consumers* (Duke University Press, 2002) and edited the *Guide to Medicare Coverage Decision-Making and Appeals* (ABA Publishing, 2002). She currently chairs the Patient Safety Subcommittee of the Indiana Commission on Excellence in Health Care, as well as the American Bar Association’s Section on Administrative Law and Regulatory Practice.

**Carol B. Liebman** is a clinical professor at Columbia Law School, where she is director of the school’s Mediation Clinic and teaches negotiation and professional ethics. She has mediated cases involving discrimination, medical malpractice, family issues, public agencies, community disputes, business conflicts, and educational institutions and is a nationally recognized speaker and trainer in conflict resolution. She has designed and presented mediation training for a variety of groups including the Albert Einstein College of Medicine; Association of the Bar of the City of New York; and high school students, parents, and teachers; she has also taught about negotiation and mediation in Vietnam, Israel, China, and Brazil. Liebman is the author with Nancy Dubler of *Bioethics Mediation: A Guide to Shaping Shared Solutions*, published by the United Hospital Fund. She is also a member of New York City’s Civilian Complaint Review Board.

**Maxwell J. Mehlman** is Arthur E. Petersilge Professor of Law and director of the Law-Medicine Center, Case Western Reserve University School of Law, and professor of biomedical ethics at Case Western’s School of Medicine. He received his J.D. from Yale Law School in 1975 and holds bachelors degrees from Reed College and Oxford, which he attended as a Rhodes Scholar. Prior to joining the faculty at CWRU in 1984, Professor Mehlman practiced law with Arnold & Porter in Washington, D.C., where he specialized in federal regulation of health care and medical technology. Professor Mehlman served from 1987 to 1990 as a member of the Committee to Design a Strategy for Quality Review and Assurance in Medicare of the Institute of Medicine National Academy of Sciences. From 1988 to 1994, he served as special counsel to the Special Committee on Medical Malpractice of the New York State Bar. In 1992, he was a consultant on medical malpractice to the American Association of Retired Persons. He recently served as an advisor

Cambridge University Press

0521614112 - Medical Malpractice and the U.S. Health Care System

Edited by William M. Sage and Rogan Kersh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Contributors*

xi

and a researcher on the Project on Medical Liability in Pennsylvania of The Pew Charitable Trusts.

**Michelle M. Mello** conducts empirical research into issues at the intersection of law, ethics, and health policy. She is the author of more than fifty articles and book chapters on the medical malpractice system, medical errors and patient safety, research ethics, mass tort litigation, the obesity epidemic, pharmaceuticals, bioethics, and other topics. Recent projects include an analysis of the efficacy and fairness of leading medical malpractice reforms, a study of legal relationships between academic investigators and industry sponsors of clinical trials, and an analysis of patient safety regulation. Dr. Mello is presently studying ethical issues in the pharmaceutical industry as a Greenwall Faculty Scholar. She teaches courses in Public Health Law and the Ethical Basis of the Practice of Public Health at the Harvard School of Public Health.

**Mark V. Pauly** is Bendheim Professor at the Wharton School of Management, University of Pennsylvania, where he is also professor of Health Care Systems, Business and Public Policy, Insurance and Risk Management, and Economics. Pauly is a widely respected expert on medical economics, health policy, health and other insurance, public finance/public choice, and regulation; among his recent publications are *Health Benefits at Work* (Michigan, 1997) and *Pooling Health Insurance Risks* (AEI Press, 1999, with B. Herring). He has served in an advisory capacity to the National Advisory Council, Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality; Committee on Evaluation of Vaccine Purchase Financing in the U.S., Institute of Medicine/National Academy of Sciences; and the Medicare Technical Advisory Panel. Pauly is currently on the editorial board of *Public Finance Quarterly*, advisory editor of the *Journal of Risk and Uncertainty*, and coeditor of the *International Journal of Health Care Finance and Economics*.

**William M. Sage** received his medical and law degrees with honors from Stanford University in 1988 and has been a member of the faculty of Columbia Law School since 1995. In 1993, he headed four working groups of the President's Task Force on Health Care Reform in the Clinton White House. He recently served as principal investigator for the Project on Medical Liability in Pennsylvania. He is also the recipient of an Investigator Award in Health Policy Research from the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation, and he has published more than sixty articles in legal, health policy, and clinical journals. He is an elected Fellow of the Hastings Center on bioethics and is a member of the editorial board of *Health Affairs*.

**Catherine M. Sharkey** is an associate professor at Columbia Law School. She teaches, researches, and writes in the areas of torts, punitive damages, class actions, remedies, and product liability. Her articles have been published in the *Journal of Empirical Legal Studies*, *Maryland Law Review*, *New York*

Cambridge University Press

0521614112 - Medical Malpractice and the U.S. Health Care System

Edited by William M. Sage and Rogan Kersh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

*University Law Review*, *Texas Law Review*, *UCLA Law Review*, and *Yale Law Journal*. Sharkey received her B.A. in economics, *summa cum laude*, from Yale, her M.Sc. in economics for development, with distinction, from Oxford, where she was a Rhodes Scholar, and her J.D. from Yale Law School, where she was executive editor of the *Yale Law Journal*. She served as a law clerk to the Hon. Guido Calabresi of the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit and to the Hon. David H. Souter of the U.S. Supreme Court.

**Frank A. Sloan** is the J. Alexander McMahon Professor of Health Policy and Management and professor of economics at Duke, where he is also director of the Center for Health Policy, Law, and Management. Sloan did his undergraduate work at Oberlin and received his Ph.D. in economics from Harvard. Before joining the faculty at Duke in July, 1993, he was a research economist at the RAND Corporation and on the faculties of the University of Florida and Vanderbilt University. He was chair of the Department of Economics at Vanderbilt from 1986 to 1989. His current research interests include alcohol use prevention, long-term care, medical malpractice, and cost-effectiveness analyses of medical technologies. Sloan also has a long-standing interest in hospitals, health care financing, and health manpower. He has served on several national advisory public and private groups. He is a member of the Institute of Medicine of the National Academy of Sciences and was recently a member of the Physician Payment Review Commission.

**Catherine T. Struve** is a professor of law at the University of Pennsylvania Law School. In addition to studying procedural reforms in the context of medical liability litigation, she has analyzed similar issues with respect to product liability claims concerning FDA-approved pharmaceuticals. She serves as co-reporter to a task force preparing model jury instructions for use in civil cases within the Third Circuit, and her current research explores the effect of jury procedures and instructions on the functioning of the civil justice system.

**David M. Studdert** is associate professor of law and public health at the Harvard School of Public Health, where he teaches courses in health law and medical ethics. His research focuses on legal and regulatory issues in the health care sector. He holds degrees in law, public health, and health policy. Before joining the public health school faculty, he held positions as a policy analyst at RAND, a policy advisor to the Minister for Health in Victoria, Australia, and a practicing attorney. In 2004, Studdert received the Alice S. Hersh New Investigator Award from AcademyHealth.