America’s Struggle for Same-Sex Marriage

*America’s Struggle for Same-Sex Marriage* chronicles the evolution of the social movement for same-sex marriage in the United States and examines the political controversies surrounding gay people’s quest for access to the civil institution of marriage. The book focuses on the momentous events that began in November 2003, when the Massachusetts Supreme Judicial Court declared unequivocally that the state’s conferral of marriage only on opposite-sex couples violated constitutional principles of respect for individual autonomy and equality under law. The decision both triggered a political backlash of national proportion and prompted officials in San Francisco, Multnomah County (Oregon), Sandoval County (New Mexico), and New Paltz (New York) to issue marriage licenses to same-sex couples. The volume relies on in-depth interviews to provide an insider account of how courts, politicians, and activists maneuver and deal with a cutting-edge social policy issue, as well as real-life narratives about everyday people whom the debate immediately affects.

Daniel R. Pinello was educated at Williams College (B.A.), New York University (J.D.), and Yale University (Ph.D., political science). His scholarship includes *Gay Rights and American Law* (2003), *The Impact of Judicial-Selection Method on State-Supreme-Court Policy: Innovation, Reaction, and Atrophy* (1995), and “Linking Party to Judicial Ideology in American Courts: A Meta-Analysis,” *Justice System Journal* (1999). He is a professor of government at John Jay College of Criminal Justice of the City University of New York and has also taught at Ohio Wesleyan University, the University of New Orleans, and Yale University. Additional information on many of the court decisions discussed in this book may be found at www.danpinello.com, where the author maintains a free casebook on sexual orientation and the law.
AMERICA’S STRUGGLE FOR SAME-SEX MARRIAGE

Daniel R. Pinello
John Jay College of Criminal Justice of the City University of New York
For Lee
Contents

Acknowledgments

Abbreviations

1 Introduction
Craig and Greg
Peg and Spence
Gordon and Jeff
Aftermath
New Mexico as Introduction

2 Overview and Background
Hats
Early Stirrings
The Mastermind
Political Science Themes

3 Massachusetts
Massachusetts before Goodridge
Goodridge
The 2004 Constitutional Convention
The Legislative Debates
Aftermath

4 California
Mayor Newsom
The Winter of Love
Flowers from the Heartland
The Nullification

© Cambridge University Press  www.cambridge.org
CONTENTS

Future Court Action 90
Backlash 93
Proposition 22 and a Future Same-Sex Marriage Ballot Measure 95

5 Oregon 102
Prologue 103
Multnomah County 105
The Defense of Marriage Coalition 114
Measure 36 118
The Measure 36 Campaign 123
Aftermath 129

6 New York 143
The Business of Same-Sex Marriage 148
Public Education 151

7 Conclusion 156
Procreation and Child Rearing 156
Are Civil Unions/Domestic Partnerships/Reciprocal Benefits Adequate? 160
Acceptance or Bigotry? 166
The Roles of Courts and Legislatures 172
Judicial Efficacy 175

Appendix: Methods 195
References 199
Index 203
Acknowledgments

This book would not have been possible without the unstinting generosity of the people who invited me into their homes and offices to conduct the eighty-five in-depth interviews on which the volume is based. They have my special gratitude.

Sundry public officials and interest group representatives generously gave me their time and attention. They were: in Massachusetts, state Senators Jarrett Barrios and Richard T. Moore, state Representatives David Paul Linsky, Liz Malia, Alice Hanlon Peisch, Kathleen M. Teahan, and Philip Travis, Somerville mayor Joseph A. Curtatone, Provincetown town clerk Douglas Johnstone, Mary L. Bonauto of Gay & Lesbian Advocates & Defenders, Tom Breuer and Ronald Crews of the Massachusetts Family Institute, Arline Isaacson of the Massachusetts Gay and Lesbian Political Caucus, and Marty Rouse of MassEquality; in San Francisco, Supervisors Michela Alioto-Pier, Bevan Dufty, and Aaron Peskin, Steve Kawa, Mayor Gavin Newsom’s Chief of Staff, Chief Deputy City Attorney Therese M. Stewart, Deputy City Attorney Sherri Sokeland Kaiser, Kate Kendall of the National Center for Lesbian Rights, and Molly McKay of Equality California; in New Mexico, Sandoval County Clerk Victoria S. Dunlap and her attorney, Paul Livingston; in New York, New Paltz mayor Jason West and Evan Wolfson of Freedom to Marry; and in Oregon, Kelly Clark of the Oregon Defense of Marriage Coalition, Tim Nashif of the Oregon Family Council, Roey Thorpe of Basic Rights Oregon, and Tara Wilkins of the Community of Welcoming Congregations.

Equally essential to the volume were interviews with fifty same-sex couples who married in 2004. (As the introductory
chapter explains, I'm at liberty to divulge only their first names.) In Massachusetts, Brent and Craig, Carol and Michele, Carrie and Danielle, Christine and Marianne, David and Doug, David and Yvan, Deborah and Michelle, Donna and Sabra, Gary and Richard, Heather and Katherine, Jack and Julian, Janine and Rebecca, Joseph and Keith, Joseph and Steven, and Linda and Sharon. In San Francisco, Anne and Simone, Bil and Kent, Craig and Geoff, Diana and Nancy, Gary and John, Gilbert and Richard, Jim and Ron, Jim and Simon, Joe and Marc, Judy and Kelly, and Lance and Sanders. In New Mexico, Barbara and Jaye, Claire and Harriet, Craig and Gregory, Ellen and Tracie, Gordon and Jeff, Peg and Spence, and PJ and Tony. In Oregon, Allen and Bill, Barbara and Deborah, Barbara and Heather, Brian and Douglas, David and Keith, Gabe and Michael, Gary and Rob, Herbert and John, James and Paul, Jennifer and Toni, Jim and Richard, Kalissa and Suzanne, Karleen and Kathy, Kathleen and Laurie, Lauri and Susan, Phillip and Raymond, and Sandra and Teresa.

Without external funding for the book's research, I bore the expense of travel and lodging to conduct interviews. Thus, indispensable help came from assorted good samaritans who provided free or low-cost housing during my trips around the country. In Massachusetts, Lori A. Johnson of Wellesley College acquainted me with George and Nancy Caplan, for whom I house-sat. Likewise, Joseph Stewart of the University of New Mexico found me the Albuquerque home of Christopher and Karin Butler during that couple's travel abroad. Professor Butler's parents, Beth and Chuck Butler, were wonderful hosts for my week in the Land of Enchantment. My fellow Williams College alumna, Sarah Taub, introduced me to Oregonian Brent Bolton, who made room available in his Portland home. Finally, Williams alum D. Christopher Kerby was a gracious host in San Francisco.

The single most important individual providing scholarly aid to the undertaking was Clyde Wilcox, who read the full manuscript. The book profited enormously from his generous and detailed critical commentary.
A precursor of chapter 3 was offered at the October 2004 “Legalizing Homosexuality” conference sponsored by the Sawyer Law and Politics Program of the Maxwell School of Citizenship and Public Affairs at Syracuse University. Keith J. Bybee and Thomas M. Keck were discussants and provided trenchant appraisals. A forerunner of the concluding chapter appeared as a paper at the 2005 Annual Meeting of the American Political Science Association, where discussants Mark A. Kessler and Sharon G. Whitney rendered invaluable critiques. Numerous other friends in academe also provided commentary essential to the project: Ellen Ann Andersen, Scott W. Barclay, Jay Barth, Michael J. Bosia, Susan Burgess, Sean Cahill, Michael Craw, Patrick Egan, Charles W. Gossett, Roger E. Hartley, Mae Kuykendall, Daniel Levin, Nathaniel Persily, Kimberly D. Richman, Ellen D. B. Riggle, Kenneth Sherrill, Glen Staszewski, Susan M. Sterett, Mark Strasser, Barry L. Tadlock, Zak Taylor, and Stephen Wasby.

Ed Parsons at Cambridge University Press shepherded the volume with consummate skill. A better editorial partner would be difficult to imagine. Stephanie Sakson, the production and copy editor, again provided the most sure-handed guidance transforming manuscript into book.


Lee Nissensohn, my domestic partner and – if the law ultimately permits us to marry – future husband, sustained this endeavor in every way. He has been my rock for eleven precious years.
### Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACLU</td>
<td>American Civil Liberties Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AG</td>
<td>Attorney General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>API</td>
<td>Asian Pacific Islander</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRO</td>
<td>Basic Rights Oregon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COBRA</td>
<td>Comprehensive Omnibus Budget Reconciliation Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ConCon</td>
<td>Constitutional Convention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOMA</td>
<td>Defense of Marriage Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FMA</td>
<td>Federal Marriage Amendment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GLAD</td>
<td>Gay &amp; Lesbian Advocates &amp; Defenders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRC</td>
<td>Human Rights Campaign</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lambda</td>
<td>Lambda Legal Defense and Education Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGBT</td>
<td>Lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgendered</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCC</td>
<td>Massachusetts Catholic Conference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MFI</td>
<td>Massachusetts Family Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MGLPC</td>
<td>Massachusetts Gay and Lesbian Political Caucus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCLR</td>
<td>National Center for Lesbian Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGLTF</td>
<td>National Gay and Lesbian Task Force</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCA</td>
<td>Oregon Citizens Alliance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OFC</td>
<td>Oregon Family Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SJC</td>
<td>Massachusetts Supreme Judicial Court</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
America’s Struggle for Same-Sex Marriage