More information

Frameworks for Thinking

This handbook focuses on the thinking processes necessary for learning. It provides descriptions and evaluations of 42 major frameworks including Bloom's taxonomy, de Bono's lateral and parallel thinking tools, Gardner's theory of multiple intelligences and Paul's model of critical thinking. Unique in its comprehensive coverage and interdisciplinary approach, it offers easy-to-grasp summary tables for each major theorist for speedy reference. The discussion of cognitive, emotional and social aspects of thinking and the nature of classification help the reader locate theories within a broader field of knowledge. Key concepts such as critical thinking, self-regulation and metacognition are examined from a range of perspectives. The handbook offers practical advice in the form of choices and recommendations for the use of frameworks in teaching, learning and assessment. A valuable tool for students needing to understand different ways of thinking, it will also be an essential resource for teachers, curriculum developers, researchers and policy-makers.

David Moseley is a former Reader in Applied Psychology at Newcastle University and has produced learning and assessment material for children and adults as well as publishing extensively on education and health.

Vivienne Baumfield is Senior Lecturer in Education at Newcastle University and has worked both in the UK and internationally on teacher training and professional development.

Julian Elliot is Professor of Education at Durham University. He has worked as a teacher and educational psychologist and from 2003–2005 was President of the International Association of Cognitive Education and Psychology.

Maggie Gregson is Senior Lecturer in post-compulsory Education at Sunderland University. Her research includes investigating models of reflection and 'thinking skills' interventions in schools and colleges in North East England.

Steve Higgins is Senior Lecturer at Newcastle University and is Director of the Centre for Learning and Teaching. He has published books on developing thinking and the effective use of ICT in primary schools.

Jennifer Miller is Senior Lecturer at Newcastle University with responsibility for initial teacher education. She has acted as an advisor to local government on the use of ICT and has a special interest in e-learning.

Douglas Newton is an Emeritus Professor of Education at Newcastle University and has published award-winning work on teaching and understanding.

Frameworks for Thinking

A Handbook for Teaching and Learning

David Moseley Vivienne Baumfield Julian Elliott Maggie Gregson Steven Higgins Jennifer Miller Douglas Newton



0521612845 - Frameworks for Thinking: A Handbook for Teaching and Learning David Moseley, Vivienne Baumfield, Julian Elliott, Maggie Gregson, Steven Higgins, Jennifer Miller and Douglas Newton Frontmatter More information

> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521612845

© David Moseley, Vivienne Baumfield, Julian Elliott, Maggie Gregson, Steven Higgins, Jennifer Miller and Douglas Newton 2005

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN-13 978-0-521-84831-2 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-84831-8 hardback ISBN-13 978-0-521-61284-5 paperback ISBN-10 0-521-61284-5 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this book, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

	List of forman	mana in
	List of figures	page ix
	List of tables	X
	Notes on authors	xii
	Foreword	XV
	Acknowledgments	xvii
	Introduction	1
	Selection of frameworks	2
	Description and evaluation of individual frameworks	3
	How to use this handbook	4
	Overview of what follows	5
1	The nature of thinking and thinking skills	8
	Perspectives on thinking	8
	What is thinking?	10
	Psychological perspectives	14
	Sociological perspectives	16
	Philosophical perspectives	18
	Thinking skills in education	23
2	Lists, inventories, groups, taxonomies and frameworks	33
	Bringing order to chaos	33
	Objects of study	34
	Utility	39
	Examples	41
	Conclusion	42

0521612845 - Frameworks for Thinking: A Handbook for Teaching and Learning David Moseley, Vivienne Baumfield, Julian Elliott, Maggie Gregson, Steven Higgins, Jennifer Miller and Douglas Newton Frontmatter More information

vi Contents

3	Frameworks dealing with instructional design	44
	Introduction	44
	Time sequence of the instructional design frameworks	47
	Description and evaluation of the instructional design	
	frameworks	49
	Bloom's taxonomy of educational objectives: cognitive domain	49
	Feuerstein's theory of mediated learning through	
	Instrumental Enrichment	55
	Gagné's eight types of learning and five types of	
	learned capability	62
	Ausubel and Robinson's six hierarchically-ordered categories	67
	Williams' model for developing thinking and feeling processes	71
	Hannah and Michaelis' comprehensive framework for	
	instructional objectives	75
	Stahl and Murphy's domain of cognition taxonomic system	79
	Biggs and Collis' SOLO taxonomy: Structure of the	
	Observed Learning Outcome	85
	Quellmalz's framework of thinking skills	90
	Presseisen's models of essential, complex and metacognitive	
	thinking skills	94
	Merrill's instructional transaction theory	99
	Anderson and Krathwohl's revision of Bloom's taxonomy	
	of educational objectives	102
	Gouge and Yates' ARTS Project taxonomies of arts	
	reasoning and thinking skills	112
	Some issues for further investigation	117
4	Frameworks dealing with productive thinking	119
	Introduction	119
	Time sequence of the productive-thinking frameworks	120
	Description and evaluation of productive-thinking frameworks	122
	Altshuller's TRIZ Theory of Inventive Problem Solving	122
	Allen, Feezel and Kauffie's taxonomy of concepts and	
	critical abilities related to the evaluation of verbal arguments	128
	De Bono's lateral and parallel thinking tools	133
	Halpern's reviews of critical thinking skills and dispositions	140
	Baron's model of the good thinker	148

0521612845 - Frameworks for Thinking: A Handbook for Teaching and Learning David Moseley, Vivienne Baumfield, Julian Elliott, Maggie Gregson, Steven Higgins, Jennifer Miller and Douglas Newton Frontmatter More information

	Content	S
	Ennis' taxonomy of critical thinking dispositions and abilities	15
	Lipman's three modes of thinking and four main varieties	
	of cognitive skill	15
	Paul's model of critical thinking	16
	Jewell's reasoning taxonomy for gifted children	17
	Petty's six-phase model of the creative process	17
	Bailin's intellectual resources for critical thinking	17
	Some issues for further investigation	18
5	Frameworks dealing with cognitive structure and/or	
	development	18
	Introduction	18
	Time sequence of theoretical frameworks of cognitive	
	structure and/or development	18
	Description and evaluation of theoretical frameworks of	
	cognitive structure and/or development	18
	Piaget's stage model of cognitive development	18
	Guilford's Structure of Intellect model	19
	Perry's developmental scheme	20
	Gardner's theory of multiple intelligences	20
	Koplowitz's theory of adult cognitive development	21
	Belenky's 'Women's Ways of Knowing' developmental model	21
	Carroll's three-stratum theory of cognitive abilities	22
	Demetriou's integrated developmental model of the mind	22
	King and Kitchener's model of reflective judgment	23
	Pintrich's general framework for self-regulated learning	23
	Theories of executive function	24
	Some issues for further investigation	24
5	Seven 'all-embracing' frameworks	25
	Introduction	25
	Time sequence of the all-embracing frameworks	25
	Description and evaluation of seven all-embracing frameworks	25
	Romiszowski's analysis of knowledge and skills	25
	Wallace and Adams' 'Thinking Actively in a Social	
	Context' (TASC)	25

0521612845 - Frameworks for Thinking: A Handbook for Teaching and Learning David Moseley, Vivienne Baumfield, Julian Elliott, Maggie Gregson, Steven Higgins, Jennifer Miller and Douglas Newton Frontmatter More information

viii Contents

	Hauenstein's conceptual framework for educational objectives	271
	Vermunt and Verloop's categorisation of learning activities	278
 Marzano's new taxonomy of educational objectives Sternberg's model of abilities as developing expertise Some issues for further investigation 7 Moving from understanding to productive thinking: implications for practice Overview Thinking, learning and teaching How are thinking skills classified? Using thinking skill frameworks Which frameworks are best suited to specific applications? Developing appropriate pedagogies 	282	
	Sternberg's model of abilities as developing expertise	290
	Some issues for further investigation	295
7	Moving from understanding to productive thinking:	
	implications for practice	296
	Overview	296
	Thinking, learning and teaching	296
	How are thinking skills classified?	297
	Using thinking skill frameworks	300
	Which frameworks are best suited to specific applications?	302
	Developing appropriate pedagogies	304
	Other applications of the frameworks and models	306
	In which areas is there extensive or widely	
	accepted knowledge?	308
	In which areas is knowledge very limited or highly contested?	310
	Constructing an integrated framework	312
	Summary	317
	References	319
	Index	349

0521612845 - Frameworks for Thinking: A Handbook for Teaching and Learning David Moseley, Vivienne Baumfield, Julian Elliott, Maggie Gregson, Steven Higgins, Jennifer Miller and Douglas Newton Frontmatter More information

Figures

2.1	Groups within groups within a field	page 36
2.2	A part of a biological taxonomy of organisms	37
2.3	A taxonomy of behavioural disturbances	38
3.1	Williams' model for encouraging thinking and	
	feeling	72
3.2	The comprehensive framework for instructional	
	objectives	76
3.3	Structural changes from Bloom to the Anderson	
	and Krathwohl revision	105
4.1	Classifying a specific problem as an instance of a	
	TRIZ generic problem, using TRIZ tools to identify	
	a generic solution then translating it into a specific	
	solution	123
4.2	Major modes of thinking (with criteria)	159
5.1	Guilford's Structure of Intellect model	196
5.2	Demetriou's general model for the architecture of	
	the developing mind	226
5.3	Demetriou's model of working memory	227
6.1	Romiszowski's skill cycle	254
6.2	The TASC problem-solving model	260
6.3	The basic structure of Marzano's theory-based	
	taxonomy	283
7.1	An integrated model for understanding thinking	
	and learning	314

ix

0521612845 - Frameworks for Thinking: A Handbook for Teaching and Learning David Moseley, Vivienne Baumfield, Julian Elliott, Maggie Gregson, Steven Higgins, Jennifer Miller and Douglas Newton Frontmatter More information

Tables

3.1	Levels of detail in Bloom's taxonomy (cognitive	
	domain)	page 50
3.2	Map of cognitive strengths and weaknesses	59
3.3	The domain of cognition taxonomic system	81
3.4	The SOLO taxonomy levels, with descriptors and	
	criteria	86
3.5	Quellmatz's higher-order thinking strategies and	
	processes	91
3.6	Presseisen's taxonomy of essential thinking skills	95
3.7	Presseisen's model of complex thinking skills	96
3.8	Presseisen's model of metacognitive thinking skills	97
3.9	Taxonomy table with illustrative examples	106
3.10	The common framework used in the ARTS	
	reasoning taxonomies	115
4.1	The CoRT thinking tools	134
4.2	De Bono's six types of thinking	136
4.3	An example of one of the critical thinking skills	
	specified by Halpern	141
4.4	Halpern's categorisation of critical thinking skills	142
4.5	Cognitive strategies (formerly 'elements of critical	
	thinking')	166
4.6	Jewell's reasoning taxonomy for gifted children	171
4.7	Petty's six phases with desirable accompanying	
	mindsets	175
5.1	Koplowitz's stages in adult cognitive development	215

0521612845 - Frameworks for Thinking: A Handbook for Teaching and Learning David Moseley, Vivienne Baumfield, Julian Elliott, Maggie Gregson, Steven Higgins, Jennifer Miller and Douglas Newton Frontmatter More information

	List o		xi
5.2	King and Kitchener's seven-stage model	232	
5.3	Pintrich's phases and areas for self-regulated		
	learning	236	
6.1	Romiszowski's knowledge categories	253	
6.2	Romiszowski's schema of skill categories	255	
6.3	Selected tools for effective thinking, using the TAS	SC	
	framework	261	
6.4	Elaborated descriptions of selected TASC skill are	as 262	
6.5	Hauenstein's abbreviated taxonomy of educations	al	
	objectives	273	
6.6	A categorisation of learning activities	279	
6.7	Marzano's six levels of educational objectives	284	
7.1	Problem-solving with young children	317	
7.2	Meeting key skills objectives	318	

Authors

David Moseley leads and contributes to a number of research projects in the Centre for Learning and Teaching at the University of Newcastle upon Tyne (UK). As Reader in Applied Psychology, he was responsible for the postgraduate training in educational psychology for 21 years and since 1997 has initiated and managed several large-scale projects in educational and health contexts, working with voluntary bodies and public policy and research organisations. His publications include learning and assessment materials for use by children and adults, Open University course units and papers on: informatics; emotional intelligence; literacy and ICT; and constructs of teaching and learning. In 2002 he and his colleagues were funded by the national Learning and Skills Research Centre to evaluate theories of thinking skills – work which led to an ESRC-funded series of seminars and to the present handbook.

Vivienne Baumfield is a Senior Lecturer in Education at the University of Newcastle upon Tyne. Her research focuses on the role of enquiry in pedagogy and professional learning, with a particular interest in the potential of thinking skills interventions to provide stimulus and support for teacher change. As part of her work in the Centre for Learning and Teaching, she has lectured to networks of teachers and researchers interested in thinking skills and professional development in Hong Kong, Singapore, the Netherlands and Peru as well as across the UK. She is also involved in Initial Teacher Education and remains focused on the daily realities of teaching and learning in classrooms.

Notes on authors

xiii

Julian Elliott is a Professor of Education at the University of Durham. Formerly a teacher in mainstream and special schools, he subsequently practised as an educational (school) psychologist before entering higher education. His research and publication interests include: achievement motivation, the treatment of children's disorders, cognitive education and dynamic assessment, and teachers' skills of behaviour management. From 2003–2005 he was President of the International Association for Cognitive Education and Psychology, and is an Affiliate of the Centre for the Psychology of Abilities, Competencies, and Expertise at Yale University.

Maggie Gregson is a Senior Lecturer in post-compulsory Education in the School of Education and Lifelong Learning at the University of Sunderland (UK). Through her research, Maggie has explored models of reflection in relation to the social, cultural and psychological realities of helping student teachers to think critically and creatively about their practice. Her research includes an evaluation of 'thinking skills' interventions in schools and colleges across the North East of England. She is also involved in an evaluation of the impact of post-compulsory educational policy upon teaching, learning and assessment, especially in relation to adult literacy and numeracy.

Steve Higgins is a Senior Lecturer at Newcastle University and is Director of the Centre for Learning and Teaching. His research interests are in the area of developing children's thinking, ICT and mathematics in primary education. He has written a number of books on developing thinking and on the effective use of ICT in primary schools.

Jennifer Miller is a Senior Lecturer at Newcastle University with responsibility for initial teacher education. Educated in the USA and the UK her first degree was in librarianship and information science with further postgraduate study in business management. During her career, she has worked for local government in an advisory capacity supporting the use of ICT to improve teaching and learning. She is currently a member of the Centre for Teaching and Learning with research interests in e-learning and teaching for thinking. Cambridge University Press 0521612845 - Frameworks for Thinking: A Handbook for Teaching and Learning

David Moseley, Vivienne Baumfield, Julian Elliott, Maggie Gregson, Steven Higgins, Jennifer Miller and Douglas Newton Frontmatter

More information

xiv Notes on authors

Douglas Newton is an Emeritus Professor of Education at Newcastle University and a Professorial Fellow at Durham University. His research interests include the nature of understanding and how its thinking processes can be supported. He has published widely and his work has been translated into other languages.

Foreword

I have two reproductions of great art on my desk. One is an inexpensive copy of Auguste Rodin's imponderable masterpiece, the Thinker, hunched over in his familiar pose that portrays 'every man' who is 'lost in thought'. The other 'objet d'art' is an inflatable replica of Edvard Munch's depiction of mental anguish in his renowned painting 'The Scream'. As I think about the task of integrating and classifying the last 50 years of theory and research in critical thinking, these two images come to mind and merge. In my mind's eye, I can see Rodin's inscrutable Thinker contort his face into that of the one depicted in 'The Scream' when the thoughtful, and presumably silent, Thinker is faced with organising and evaluating the literature on thinking skills. Fortunately, for those of us who care about improving how students think, we can all save our voices from the possible harm caused by a shrill scream because of the excellent work toward creating an organising taxonomy of thinking skills presented in Frameworks for Thinking: A Handbook for Teaching and Learning.

David Moseley and his able band of co-authors have boldly sorted through a mountain of literature to create a thinking skills taxonomy, so that we can identify what, when, and how well different methods and theories work to develop students' critical thinking abilities. Although it has always been true that the ability to think critically is necessary for democracies to flourish and for economies to succeed, modern technology now makes it necessary for increasing proportions of the population to develop their critical thinking abilities. In *Frameworks for Thinking: A Handbook for Teaching and Learning*, Moseley et al. provide a categorisation system that allows readers to understand

xv

0521612845 - Frameworks for Thinking: A Handbook for Teaching and Learning David Moseley, Vivienne Baumfield, Julian Elliott, Maggie Gregson, Steven Higgins, Jennifer Miller and Douglas Newton Frontmatter More information

xvi Foreword

essential elements among different ways of thinking about thinking and theories of teaching for thinking. They review the research designed to enhance thinking and identify the variables that promote better thinking—explicit instruction in thinking skills, emphasis on metacognition, good teaching, attention to dispositional aspects, and opportunities to practise across domains with collaborative group work. The authors took on a difficult task and performed a great service for all of us. Everyone who cares about the next generation of learners and thinkers and those who will teach them will find great food for thought in *Frameworks for Thinking*. It is one handbook that many people will keep handy. *Frameworks* is interesting reading for thinkers of all sorts.

Diane F. Halpern, PhD

Professor of Psychology Claremont McKenna College Past-president 2004, American Psychological Association

Acknowledgments

This handbook could not have been produced without the foresight and support of the Learning and Skills Development Agency (LSDA). They funded a large part of the research on which the handbook is based, seeking to provide a sound theoretical basis for post-16 teaching and learning. They hold the copyright of material taken (with permission) from our 2004 report: *Thinking skill frameworks for post-16 learners: an evaluation*.

Thanks are also due to two members of our original team (Mei Lin and Sue Robson) who have not contributed directly to the present volume. The Centre for Learning and Teaching at Newcastle University and the School of Education and Lifelong Learning at Sunderland University have provided support and encouragement throughout.

We are grateful to Diane Halpern, Robert Marzano, Paul Pintrich and Robert Sternberg for providing feedback on early drafts.

xvii