# THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO OCKHAM

Each volume of this series of companions to major philosophers contains specially commissioned essays by an international team of scholars, together with a substantial bibliography, and will serve as a reference work for students and nonspecialists. One aim of the series is to dispel the intimidation such readers often feel when faced with the work of a difficult and challenging thinker.

The Franciscan William of Ockham (c. 1288–1347) was an English medieval philosopher, theologian, and political theorist. Along with Thomas Aquinas and John Duns Scotus, he is regarded as one of the three main figures in medieval philosophy after around 1150. Ockham is important not only in the history of philosophy and theology but also in the development of early modern science and of modern notions of property rights and church-state relations.

This volume offers a full discussion of all significant aspects of Ockham's thought: logic, philosophy of language, metaphysics and natural philosophy, epistemology, ethics, action theory, political thought, and theology. It is the first study of Ockham in any language to make full use of the new critical editions of his works and to consider recent discoveries concerning his life, education, and influences.

New readers will find this the most convenient and accessible guide to Ockham currently available. Advanced students and specialists will find a conspectus of recent developments in the interpretation of Ockham.

Paul Vincent Spade is Professor of Philosophy at Indiana University.

#### CAMBRIDGE COMPANIONS TO PHILOSOPHY

OTHER VOLUMES IN THE SERIES OF CAMBRIDGE COMPANIONS:

AQUINAS Edited by NORMAN KRETZMANN and ELEONORE STUMP (published) BACON Edited by MARKKU PELTONEN (published) BERKELEY Edited by KENNETH WINKLER DESCARTES Edited by JOHN COTTINGHAM (published) EARLY GREEK PHILOSOPHY Edited by A. A. LONG FICHTE Edited by GUENTER ZOELLER FOUCAULT Edited by GARY GUTTING (published) FREGE Edited by TOM RICKETTS FREUD Edited by JEROME NEU (published) GALILEO Edited by PETER MACHAMER (published) HABERMAS Edited by STEPHEN K. WHITE (published) HEGEL Edited by FREDERICK BEISER (published) HEIDEGGER Edited by CHARLES GUIGNON (published) HOBBES Edited by TOM SORELL (published) HUME Edited by DAVID FATE NORTON (published) HUSSERL Edited by BARRY SMITH and DAVID WOODRUFF SMITH (published) WILLIAM JAMES Edited by RUTH ANNA PUTNAM (published) KANT Edited by PAUL GUYER (published) KIERKEGAARD Edited by ALASTAIR HANNAY and GORDON MARINO (published) LEIBNIZ Edited by NICHOLAS JOLLEY (published) LOCKE Edited by VERE CHAPPELL (published) MALEBRANCHE Edited by STEPHEN NADLER MARX Edited by TERRELL CARVER (published) MILL Edited by JOHN SKORUPSKI NIETZSCHE Edited by BERND MAGNUS and KATHLEEN HIGGINS (published) PEIRCE Edited by CHRISTOPHER HOOKWAY PLATO Edited by RICHARD KRAUT (published) PLOTINUS Edited by LLOYD P. GERSON (published) QUINE Edited by ROGER GIBSON RAWLS Edited by SAMUEL FREEMAN ROUSSEAU Edited by PATRICK RILEY RUSSELL Edited by NICHOLAS GRIFFIN SARTRE Edited by CHRISTINA HOWELLS (published) SPINOZA Edited by DON GARRETT (published) WITTGENSTEIN Edited by HANS SLUGA and DAVID STERN (published)

# The Cambridge Companion to **OCKHAM**

Edited by

Paul Vincent Spade Indiana University



> PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK www.cup.cam.ac.uk 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA www.cup.org 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain

© Cambridge University Press 1999

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1999

Typeface Trump Medieval 10/13 pt. System LATEX 2<sub>E</sub> [TB]

A catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

The Cambridge companion to Ockham / edited by Paul Vincent Spade. p. cm. Includes bibliographical references (p. ) and index. ISBN 0-521-58244-X I. William, of Ockham, ca. 1285-ca. 1349. 2. Philosophy, Medieval. I. Spade, Paul Vincent. B765.O34C36 1999 I89'.4 – DC21 98-38076 CIP

ISBN 0 521 58244 x hardback ISBN 0 521 58790 5 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2004

In Memory of Gedeon Gál

#### CONTENTS

	Contributors	page x1
	Abbreviations and Method of Citation	XV
	Introduction PAUL VINCENT SPADE	I
I	The Academic and Intellectual Worlds of Ockham WILLIAM J. COURTENAY	17
2	Some Aspects of Ockham's Logic CALVIN G. NORMORE	31
3	Semantics and Mental Language CLAUDE PANACCIO	53
4	Is There Synonymy in Ockham's Mental Language? DAVID CHALMERS	76
5	Ockham's Nominalist Metaphysics: Some Main Themes PAUL VINCENT SPADE	100
6	Ockham's Semantics and Ontology of the Categories GYULA KLIMA	118
7	Ockham's Philosophy of Nature ANDRÉ GODDU	143
8	The Mechanisms of Cognition: Ockham on Mediating Species	
	ELEONORE STUMP	168

Cambridge University Press
0521587905 - The Cambridge Companion to Ockham
Edited by Paul Vincent Spade
Frontmatter
Moreinformation

х	CONTENTS

9	Ockham's Misunderstood Theory of Intuitive and Abstractive Cognition ELIZABETH KARGER	204
10	Ockham's Ethical Theory PETER KING	227
II	Ockham on Will, Nature, and Morality MARILYN MCCORD ADAMS	245
12	Natural Law and Moral Omnipotence A. S. MCGRADE	273
13	The Political Writings JOHN KILCULLEN	302
14	Ockham on Faith and Reason ALFRED J. FREDDOSO	326
15	Ockham's Repudiation of Pelagianism REGA WOOD	350
	Bibliography Citations of Works Attributed to Ockham Index	375 397 403

#### CONTRIBUTORS

MARILYN MCCORD ADAMS is professor of historical theology at the Yale Divinity School and of religious studies at Yale University. She is cotranslator of *William Ockham: Predestination, God's Foreknowledge, and Future Contingents* and author of the study *William Ockham* as well as of other publications on Ockham, medieval philosophy, and philosophy of religion.

DAVID CHALMERS is professor of philosophy and associate director of the Center for Consciousness Studies at the University of Arizona and a former member of the Philosophy Board, Humanities Division, at the University of California, Santa Cruz. He is author of *The Conscious Mind: In Search of a Fundamental Theory* and of other publications in the philosophy of consciousness.

WILLIAM J. COURTENAY is Charles Homer Haskins professor of history at the University of Wisconsin, Madison. His publications on medieval intellectual history include *Adam Wodeham: An Introduction to His Life and Thought* and *Schools and Scholars on Fourteenth-Century England*.

ALFRED J. FREDDOSO is professor of philosophy at the University of Notre Dame. He is cotranslator of *Ockham's Theory of Propositions: Part II of the Summa logicae* and of *William of Ockham: Quodlibetal Questions* as well as author of papers on medieval philosophy and philosophy of religion.

ANDRÉ GODDU is associate professor of philosophy at Stonehill College, where he has also served as director of the Program in History and Philosophy of Science. He is author of *The Physics of William of Ockham* and other writings in the history and philosophy of science.

# xii Contributors

ELIZABETH KARGER is affiliated with the Centre Nationale de la Recherche Scientifique in Paris. She is author of "Mental Sentences According to Burley and to the Early Ockham" and other articles on Ockham's metaphysics, logic, and semantics as well as on late medieval philosophy.

JOHN KILCULLEN is professor in the School of History, Philosophy, and Politics at Macquarie University. He is translator of Ockham's *A Short Discourse on Tyrannical Government* and *A Letter to the Friars Minor*, coeditor and translator of Ockham's *Dialogue*, and author of other publications in the history of political thought.

PETER KING is associate professor of philosophy at the Ohio State University. He is translator of *John Buridan's Logic: The Treatise* on Supposition, The Treatise on Consequences and of Augustine: Against the Academicians and The Teacher and author of other publications on medieval philosophy.

GYULA KLIMA is a member of the Institute of Philosophy, Budapest; and has been a member of the Departments of Philosophy at Yale University and the University of Notre Dame. He is author of *Ars Artium: Essays in Philosophical Semantics, Medieval and Modern* and other publications in medieval metaphysics and semantics.

A. S. MCGRADE is professor emeritus of philosophy at the University of Connecticut. His publications include *The Political Thought* of *William of Ockham* and other writings on Ockham.

CALVIN G. NORMORE is professor of philosophy at the University of Toronto and the University of California, Los Angeles. His publications include "Ockham on Mental Language" and Chapter 18 ("Future Contingents") in *The Cambridge History of Later Medieval Philosophy*.

CLAUDE PANACCIO is professor of philosophy at the Université du Québec à Troi-Rivières. His publications include *Les mots, les concepts et les choses: La sémantique de Guillaume d'Occam et le nominalisme d'aujourdhui* and other writings on Ockham and medieval philosophy.

PAUL VINCENT SPADE is professor of philosophy at Indiana University. He is translator of *Five Texts on the Mediaeval Problem of* 

# Contributors

*Universals* and of *Peter Abelard: Ethical Writings* and author of other publications on medieval philosophy, logic, and semantics.

ELEONORE STUMP is Robert J. Henle professor of philosophy at Saint Louis University. She is coeditor of *The Cambridge Companion to Aquinas* and author of several books and articles in medieval philosophy and philosophy of religion, including *Dialectic and Its Place in the Development of Medieval Logic*.

REGA WOOD is senior research scholar in the Department of Philosophy, Yale University, and adjunct professor of the Yale Divinity School. She is coeditor of two volumes of Ockham's *Opera theologica*, principal editor of Adam Wodeham's *Lectura secunda in I Sententiarum*, translator of Ockham's *De connexione virtutum* (under the title *Ockham on the Virtues*), and author of other publications on medieval philosophy and theology.

#### ABBREVIATIONS AND METHOD OF CITATION

Primary sources are cited in as abbreviated a form as will allow readers to locate passages readily in the Latin texts and English translations. In many instances, references are only by standard internal divisions. Where a more precise location is needed, page numbers in the Latin editions are included in parentheses. (For the critical editions of Ockham, the series and volume numbers are omitted in such references. They are listed in Section II of the Introduction.) References to translations are normally given only when references to the Latin are not enough. (For a list of translations keyed to the editions, see the Introduction, Section II.) A dagger (†) in a reference to the Latin indicates that, although the question or section referred to has been translated in part, the particular passage being cited is not translated. Other references in the notes are in abbreviated form, by author and date. For full publication information, see the Bibliography.

'Resp.' in a reference refers to an author's response to a question, and 'ad' to the reply to an objection.

The following abbreviations refer to individual writings and collections cited in the chapter notes. (For the political writings, the abbreviations conform to the list in OPol IV.xiii–xviii.) Numbers in parentheses following the abbreviations refer to items listed in the Introduction, Section II.

#### OCKHAM'S WRITINGS

OPh = Opera philosophica, in Ockham 1967–88. OPol = Opera politica, in Ockham 1956–97. OTh = Opera theologica, in Ockham 1967–88.

Cambridge University Press
0521587905 - The Cambridge Companion to Ockham
Edited by Paul Vincent Spade
Frontmatter
Moreinformation

### xvi Abbreviations and Method of Citation

(The editors' introduction to volumes of OPh and OTh have page numbers marked by asterisks.)

*Act. virt.* = *Utrum voluntas possit habere actum virtuosum respectu alicuius obiecti respectu cuius est error in intellectu.* (19)

AP = An princeps pro suo succursu, scilicet guerrae, possit recipere bona ecclesiarum, etiam invito papa. (40) Cited by chapter.

*Brev.* = *Breviloquium.* (47) Cited by book and chapter.

*Brev. Phys. = Brevis summa libri Phyiscorum.* (30) Cited by book and chapter.

 $CB = Tractatus \ contra \ Benedictum.$  (45) Cited by book and chapter.

*Centil.* = *Centiloquium* (spurious). (37) Cited by thesis.

Connex. = De connexione virtutum. (18) Cited by article and line. De fine = De causalitate finis. (5)

*Dial.* = *Dialogus.* (49) Cited by part, book, and chapter. Part III is divided into two tracts, cited as III-1 and III-2, and then into books and chapters.

*Epist.* = *Epistola ad fratres minores.* (43)

Expos.  $Elench. = Expositio \ super \ libros \ Elenchorum. (28)$ 

Expos. Perih. = Expositio in librum Perihermenias Aristotelis. (26)

*Expos. Phys. = Expositio in libros Physicorum Aristotelis.* (29) Cited by book, chapter, and section.

Expos.Praed. = Expositio in librum Praedicamentorum Aristotelis. (25) Cited by chapter and section.

IPP = De imperatorum et pontificum potestate. (48)

*OND* = *Opus nonaginta dierum.* (42) Cited by chapter and, where necessary, line numbers. Line numbers restart with each chapter.

 $OQ = Octo \ quaestiones \ de \ potestate \ papae.$  (39) Cited by question, chapter and, where appropriate, line numbers.

*Phil. nat.* = *Summula philosophiae naturalis.* (31) Cited by book and chapter.

*Praedest.* = *Tractatus de praedestinatione et de praescientia dei respectu futurorum contingentium.* (27) Cited by question.

*Proom. et Porph. = Expositio in libros artis logicae, prooemium et expositio in librum Porphyrii de Praedicabilibus.* (24)

Qq. Phys. = Quaestiones in libros Physicorum Aristotelis. (32) Cited by question.

Quant. = Tractatus de quantitate. (21)

# Abbreviations and Method of Citation xvii

 $Quodl. = Quodlibeta \ septem.$  (20) Cited by quodlibet and question.

Sent. = In libros Sententiarum. (I) The abbreviation 'Sent.' is used here for both the Scriptum (on Book I) and the Reportatio (on Books II–IV). References are to book and then, for the Scriptum, to the Prologue or distinction and question numbers; for the Reportatio, to book and question. When a distinction in the Scriptum has a single question, the question number is sometimes omitted in references.

 $SL = Summa \ logicae. (23)$  Cited by part and chapter number. Part III has four subparts, III-1 through III-4.

OTHER

PL = Migne 1844-64.

SCG = Thomas Aquinas, *Summa contra gentiles*. Cited by book and chapter.

Sch. = Anselm 1946–61 (= Schmitt edition). Cited by volume and page.

ST = Thomas Aquinas, *Summa theologiae*. Cited by part, question, and article. IaIIae = first part of the second part; IIaIIae = second part of the second part.