As a material link between body and culture, self and other, the voice has been endlessly fascinating to artists and critics. Yet it is the voices of women that have inspired the greatest fascination, as well as the deepest ambivalence, because the female voice signifies sexual otherness as well as a source of sexual and cultural power. *Embodied Voices* explores cultural manifestations of female vocality in light of current theories of subjectivity, the body, and sexual difference. The fourteen essays collected here examine a wide spectrum of discourses, including myth, literature, music, film, psychoanalysis, and critical theory. Though diverse in their critical approaches, the essays are united in their attempt to articulate the compelling yet problematic intersections of gender, voice, and embodiment as they have shaped the textual representation of women, and women’s self-expression in performance.
New perspectives in music history and criticism

Embodied voices
New perspectives in music history and criticism

GENERAL EDITORS
JEFFREY KALLBERG AND ANTHONY NEWCOMB

This new series explores the conceptual frameworks that shape or have shaped the ways in which we understand music and its history, and seeks to elaborate structures of explanation, interpretation, commentary, and criticism which make music intelligible and which provide a basis for argument about judgments of value. The intellectual scope of the series will be broad. Some investigations will treat, for example, historiographical topics – ideas of music history, the nature of historical change, or problems of periodization. Others will apply cross-disciplinary methods to the criticism of music, such as those involving literature, history, anthropology, linguistics, philosophy, psychoanalysis or gender studies. There will also be studies which consider music in its relation to society, culture, and politics. Overall, the series hopes to create a greater presence of music in the ongoing discourse among the human sciences.
Embodied voices

Representing female vocality in western culture

EDITED BY
LESLIE C. DUNN
AND NANCY A. JONES
To our husbands
and to Cora and Leo
CONTENTS

List of illustrations \hspace{1cm} \textit{page} xi
Notes on contributors \hspace{1cm} \textit{xii}
Acknowledgments \hspace{1cm} \textit{xv}
Introduction \hspace{1cm} 1

PART I
\textit{Vocality, textuality, and the silencing of the female voice}

1 The Gorgon and the nightingale: the voice of female lament and Findar’s twelfth \textit{Pythian Ode}
CHARLES SEGAL \hspace{1cm} 17

2 Music and the maternal voice in \textit{Purgatorio} XIX
NANCY A. JONES \hspace{1cm} 35

3 Ophelia’s songs in \textit{Hamlet}: music, madness, and the feminine
LESLIE C. DUNN \hspace{1cm} 50

4 Wordsworth and Romantic voice: the poet’s song and the prostitute’s cry
SARAH WEBSTER GOODWIN \hspace{1cm} 65

PART II
\textit{Anxieties of audition}

5 “No women are indeed”: the boy actor as vocal seductress in late sixteenth- and early seventeenth-century English drama
LINDA PHYLLIS AUSTERN \hspace{1cm} 83

6 Deriding the voice of Jeanette MacDonald: notes on psychoanalysis and the American film musical
EDWARD BARON TURK \hspace{1cm} 103

7 Adorno and the Sirens: tele-phono-graphic bodies
BARBARA ENGH \hspace{1cm} 120
Contents

PART III
Women artists: vocality and cultural authority

8 The diva doesn’t die: George Eliot’s Armgard
REBECCA A. POPE 139

9 Rewriting Ophelia: fluidity, madness, and voice in
Louise Colet’s La Servante
JANET BEIZER 152

10 Staring the camera down: direct address and
women’s voices
AMY LAWRENCE 166

11 The voice of lament: female vocality and performative
efficacy in the Finnish-Karelian itkuvirsi
ELIZABETH TOLBERT 179

PART IV
Maternal voices

12 The lyrical dimensions of spirituality: music, voice,
and language in the novels of Toni Morrison
KARLA F. C. HOLLOWAY 197

13 Red hot mamas: Bessie Smith, Sophie Tucker, and
the ethnic maternal voice in American popular song
PETER ANTELYES 212

14 Maternalism and the material girl
NANCY J. VICKERS 230

Index 247
ILLUSTRATIONS


1.2 Gorgon Pediment, Corfu. Detail. 25

1.3 Perseus decapitating the Gorgon with the aid of Athena. Metope from Temple C, Selinus (Selinunte), Sicily. Palermo, National Museum. Middle of sixth century BC. 27

6.1 Maurice Chevalier with Jeanette MacDonald in Love Me Tonight. Paramount Pictures, 1932. 107

6.2 Nelson Eddy with Jeanette MacDonald in Rose Marie. MGM Pictures, 1936. 108

MUSIC EXAMPLES

5.1 Imperia’s Song from Blurt, Master-Constable by Thomas Dekker (London, 1602). Reproduced from Thomas Ravenscroft, A Briefe Discourse of the True (but Neglected) Use of Charact’ring the Degrees (London, 1614). 95

5.2 Desdemona’s “Willow Song” from Shakespeare’s Othello (Act IV, scene iii). Reproduced from Frederick W. Sternfeld, Music in Shakespearean Tragedy (London, 1963). 101

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

Peter Antelyes is Associate Professor of English at Vassar College, where he also teaches in the American Culture program. He is author of Tales of Adventurous Enterprise: Washington Irving and the Poetics of Western Expansion (New York: Columbia University Press, 1990). His current research focuses on ethnicity in American literature, music, and art.


Janet Beizer is Professor of French at the University of Virginia. Her essay on Louise Colet is part of her book, Ventriloquized Bodies: Narratives of Hysteria in Nineteenth-Century France (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1994), which details the process whereby hysteria’s multiple symptoms become a dictionary of figures from which the writer can profitably draw in a period privileging impersonal or objective styles of narration. She has also published Family Plots: Balzac’s Narrative Generations (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1986).

Leslie C. Dunn is Associate Professor of English at Vassar College. She has published essays on English Renaissance lyric poetry and music, and on women’s song in Shakespeare. Her current project is a book-length study of music, gender, and representation in early modern England.

Barbara Engh is a doctoral candidate in cultural studies and comparative literature at the University of Minnesota. Her work engages questions of music and “the musical” in various critical and theoretical discourses.
Notes on contributors


Sarah Webster Goodwin is Associate Professor of English at Skidmore College in Saratoga Springs, New York. She is author of Kitch and Culture: The Dance of Death in Nineteenth-Century Literature and Graphic Arts (New York: Garland Press, 1988), and co-editor of Death and Representation (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1993) and Feminism, Utopia, and Narrative (Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press, 1990). Her articles on nineteenth-century fiction and poetry have appeared in Novel, Tulsa Studies in Women’s Literature, and elsewhere.

Karla F. C. Holloway is Professor of English at Duke University. Her teaching, research, and publications focus on the intersections between linguistics, literary theory, and cultural studies. She is co-author of New Dimensions of Spirituality (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1987), and author of The Character of the Word: The Texts of Zora Neale Hurston (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1987), and Moorings and Metaphors (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1992). She is currently working on a book-length study, Codes of Conduct: Ethics and Ethnicity in Literature.

Nancy A. Jones has taught French and Comparative Literature at Hobart and William Smith Colleges, in Geneva, New York, Baruch College-City University of New York, and Harvard University. She was a Visiting Scholar in Romance Languages at Duke University and the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill for the year 1993/94, and is currently a fellow of the Mary I. Bunting Institute of Radcliffe College. She is the author of studies of gender and voice in medieval narrative and lyric poetry, and is writing a book on women, embroidery, and romance in thirteenth-century France.

Amy Lawrence is Assistant Professor of Film Studies at Dartmouth College in Hanover, New Hampshire. She is the author of Echo and Narcissus: Women’s Voices in Classical Hollywood Cinema (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1991), a study of the way women’s voices have been represented in films from the silent era to 1962. Her work has also appeared in Wide Angle, Film Quarterly, and Quarterly Review of Film and Video.

Rebecca A. Pope teaches courses in nineteenth-century British literature, popular fiction, the theory of gender and sexuality, and the cultural
Notes on contributors

representation of AIDS at Georgetown University. She has published works on British and American Gothic and detective fiction, AIDS in popular fiction, and feminist collaborative scholarship. Her essay in this volume is an early draft of a chapter of a book she is writing with Susan J. Leonardi on fictional and historical divas (To Have a Voice: The Politics of the Diva, New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, forthcoming).

Charles Segal is Professor of Greek and Latin at Harvard University, a Fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences, and President of the American Philological Association for 1993/94. He was a fellow at the National Humanities Center for 1993/94. His recent books include Orpheus: The Myth of the Poet (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1989), Lucretius on Death and Anxiety (Princeton University Press, 1990), Oedipus Tyrannus: Tragic Heroism and the Limits of Knowledge (New York: Twayne Publishers, 1993), and Euripides and the Poetics of Sorrow (Durham: Duke University Press, 1993).

Elizabeth Tolbert is a professor of musicology at the Peabody Institute of the Johns Hopkins University. She has published articles on lament traditions and is at work on a book entitled Dislocated Voices: Music, Memory, and Gender.

Edward Baron Turk, who is Professor of French and Film Studies at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology, studied piano at the Juilliard School in New York City. He is author, most recently, of Child of Paradise: Marcel Carné and the Golden Age of French Cinema (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1990), which won a prize from the Theatre Library Association in 1990. He is currently at work on the biography of Jeanette MacDonald.

Nancy J. Vickers is Professor of Comparative Literature at the University of Southern California. She has written on the works of Dante, Petrarch, and Shakespeare, as well as on the poetic and plastic production of the court of Francis I. Her work in lyric has led to an interest in the relationship of technology and genre, and she is currently at work on a book on music video.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The idea for this book grew out of a 1990 Modern Language Association session entitled “Feminine Figures of Song.” We are grateful to the Lyrica Society for Word–Music Relations, whose sponsorship of that session provided the first audience for our explorations of female vocality. We have also benefited from lively exchanges with members of the Vassar College Women’s Studies Program, the Gender and Music Group at Harvard University, and participants in the Feminist Theory and Music Conference at the University of Minnesota.

The editors of the New Perspectives in Music History and Criticism series, Jeffrey Kallberg and Anthony Newcomb, were early supporters of a project which might at first have seemed an unlikely candidate for a music series; their enthusiastic engagement with our own perspectives on music was a model for the kind of interdisciplinary dialogue we have tried to foster in the collection itself. We would also like to thank our anonymous reader at Cambridge University Press, whose detailed comments on an early version of the manuscript helped us to refine our conception of the book as a whole and improved many of the individual essays. We thank Penny Souster, our editor at Cambridge University Press, for patiently guiding us through the publication process. We are extremely grateful to our copy-editor, Helen Southall, for a meticulous assistance that helped us to produce a more elegant book.

For intellectual and practical help, we thank Richard Leppert, Susan McClary, Sarah Webster Goodwin, Nancy J. Vickers, Peter Antelyes, and Charles Segal. We also received valuable advice in the early stages of this project from Kaja Silverman, Henry Louis Gates, Jr., Sally McConnell-Ginet, and Ann Morrison.

Our research assistants, Jong Kim at Vassar and Hugh Eakin at Harvard, proved invaluable at several crucial stages in the long process of developing fourteen disparate essays into a collective conversation. Special thanks are due to Vassar’s Ford Scholar Program, which provided funding for a summer research assistantship.

We are grateful to the following journals and presses for permission to reprint material that originally appeared in their publications:

"The diva doesn’t die: George Eliot’s Armgart" by Rebecca A. Pope, is reprinted from Criticism 32, 4 (1990), by permission of the Wayne State University Press.

xv
Acknowledgments

“Deriding the voice of Jeanette MacDonald: notes on psychoanalysis and the American film musical” by Edward Baron Turk, is reprinted from Camera Obscura 25 (1992), by permission of Indiana University Press.


The photographs of the three Gorgon figures which appear in Charles Segal’s essay were provided by Art Resource, New York. The stills from Love Me Tonight and Rose Marie which accompany Edward Turk’s essay are reproduced by courtesy of Paramount Studios and MGM Studios respectively. They were provided by the Film Stills Archive of the Museum of Modern Art.

The musical transcription of the “Willow Song” in Linda Phyllis Austern’s essay is reproduced from Music in Shakespearean Tragedy by Frederick W. Sternfeld (London, 1963), by courtesy of Routledge and Kegan Paul.

The lyrics of “You’ve Got to See Mama Ev’ry Night,” words and music by Billy Rose and Con Conrad, copyright © 1923 (Renewed 1931) c/o EMI FEIST CATALOG INC., which appear in Peter Antelyes’s essay, are reprinted by permission of CPP Belwin, Inc.

The lyrics of “Like a Prayer,” words and music by Madonna Ciccone and Patrick Leonard, and “Promise to Try,” words and music by Madonna Ciccone and Patrick Leonard, which appear in the essay by Nancy J. Vickers, are reprinted by permission of Warner-Chappell Music, Inc.:”

“LIKE A PRAYER”
(Madonna Ciccone, Patrick Leonard)
© 1989 WB MUSIC CORP., BLEU DISQUE MUSIC CO., INC., WEBO GIRL PUBLISHING, INC. & JOHNNY YUMA MUSIC
All rights on behalf of BLEU DISQUE MUSIC CO., INC. & WEBO GIRL PUBLISHING, INC., administered by WB MUSIC CORP.
All rights on behalf of JOHNNY YUMA MUSIC for the world,

xvi
Acknowledgments

excluding the US and Canada, administered by WARNER-TAMERLANE PUBLISHING CORP.
All Rights Reserved. Used by Permission.

“PROMISE TO TRY”
(Madonna Ciccone, Patrick Leonard)
© 1989 WB MUSIC CORP., BLEU DISQUE MUSIC CO., INC., WEBO GIRL PUBLISHING, INC. & JOHNNY YUMA MUSIC
All rights on behalf of BLEU DISQUE MUSIC CO., INC. & WEBO GIRL PUBLISHING, INC. administered by WB MUSIC CORP. All rights on behalf of JOHNNY YUMA MUSIC for the World, excluding the US and Canada, administered by WARNER-TAMERLANE PUBLISHING CORP.
All Rights Reserved. Used by Permission.

Finally, we would like to thank our contributors, who collectively embodied the voices of this book. Working with them has been an intellectual adventure and a genuine pleasure.