

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-58386-2 - Information Flow: The Logic of Distributed Systems

Jon Barwise and Jerry Seligman

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

INFORMATION FLOW

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-58386-2 - Information Flow: The Logic of Distributed Systems

Jon Barwise and Jerry Seligman

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge Tracts in Theoretical Computer Science

Editorial Board

S. Abramsky, Department of Computing Science, Edinburgh University
 P. H. Aczel, Department of Computer Science, University of Manchester
 J. W. de Bakker, Centrum voor Wiskunde en Informatica, Amsterdam
 J. A. Goguen, Programming Research Group, University of Oxford
 Y. Gurevich, Department of Electrical Engineering and Computer Science, University of Michigan
 J. V. Tucker, Department of Mathematics and Computer Science, University College of Swansea

Titles in the series

1. G. Chaitin *Algorithmic Information Theory*
2. L. C. Paulson *Logic and Computation*
3. M. Spivey *Understanding Z*
4. G. Revesz *Lambda Calculus, Combinators and Functional Programming*
5. A. Ramsay *Formal Methods in Artificial Intelligence*
6. S. Vickers *Topology via Logic*
7. J.-Y. Girard, Y. Lafont & P. Taylor *Proofs and Types*
8. J. Clifford *Formal Semantics & Pragmatics for Natural Language Processing*
9. M. Winslett *Updating Logical Database*
10. K. McEvoy & J. V. Tucker (eds) *Theoretical Foundations of VLSI Design*
11. T. H. Tse *A Unifying Framework for Structured Analysis and Design Models*
12. G. Brewka *Nonmonotonic Reasoning*
14. S. G. Hoggar *Mathematics for Computer Graphics*
15. S. Dasgupta *Design Theory and Computer Science*
17. J. C. M. Baeten (ed) *Applications of Process Algebra*
18. J. C. M. Baeten & W. P. Weijland *Process Algebra*
21. D. A. Wolfram *The Clausal Theory of Types*
23. E.-R. Olderog *Nets, Terms and Formulas*
26. P. D. Mosses *Action Semantics*
27. W. H. Hesselink *Programs, Recursion and Unbounded Choice*
28. P. Padawitz *Deductive and Declarative Programming*
29. P. Gärdenfors (ed) *Belief Revision*
30. M. Anthony & N. Biggs *Computational Learning Theory*
31. T. F. Melham *Higher Order Logic and Hardware Verification*
32. R. L. Carpenter *The Logic of Typed Feature Structures*
33. E. G. Manes *Predicate Transformer Semantics*
34. F. Nielson & H. R. Nielson *Two Level Functional Languages*
35. L. Feijs & H. Jonkers *Formal Specification and Design*
36. S. Mauw & G. J. Veltink (eds) *Algebraic Specification of Communication Protocols*
37. V. Stavridou *Formal Methods in Circuit Design*
38. N. Shankar *Metamathematics, Machines and Gödel's Proof*
39. J. B. Pairs *The Uncertain Reasoner's Companion*
40. J. Desel & J. Esparza *Free Choice Petri Nets*
41. J.-J. Ch. Meyer & W. van der Hoek *Epistemic Logic for AI and Computer Science*

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-58386-2 - Information Flow: The Logic of Distributed Systems

Jon Barwise and Jerry Seligman

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

INFORMATION FLOW

The Logic of Distributed Systems

Jon Barwise
Indiana University

Jerry Seligman
National Chung-Cheng University, Taiwan



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-0-521-58386-2 - Information Flow: The Logic of Distributed Systems
 Jon Barwise and Jerry Seligman
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
 Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press
 The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521583862

© Jon Barwise and Jerry Seligman 1997

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
 no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
 permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1997

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Barwise, Jon.
 Information flow: the logic of distributed systems / Jon Barwise,
 Jerry Seligman.
 p. cm. – (Cambridge tracts in theoretical computer science:
 44)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-521-58386-1

1. Electronic data processing – Distributed processing.

I. Seligman, Jerry, 1964–, II. Title. III. Series.

QA76.9.D5B363 1997

003'.54–dc20

96-46111

CIP

ISBN 978-0-521-58386-2 hardback

Transferred to digital printing 2007

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
 accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in
 this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is,
 or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-58386-2 - Information Flow: The Logic of Distributed Systems

Jon Barwise and Jerry Seligman

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

In the same way, the world is not the sum of all the things that are in it. It is the infinitely complex network of connections among them. As in the meanings of words, things take on meaning only in relationship to each other.

The Invention of Solitude

Paul Auster

Contents

Preface	<i>page</i> xi
Part I: Introduction	1
1 Information Flow: A Review	3
1.1 The Worldly Commerce of Information	3
1.2 Regularity in Distributed Systems	7
1.3 Information and Knowledge	10
1.4 The Grammar of Information Flow	12
1.5 Approaches to Information	14
1.6 Summary	24
2 Information Channels: An Overview	26
2.1 Classifications and Infomorphisms	26
2.2 Information Channels	34
2.3 Local Logics	37
2.4 Exceptions	42
2.5 State Spaces	46
3 A Simple Distributed System	50
3.1 The Static Case	54
3.2 The Dynamic Case	62
Part II: Channel Theory	67
4 Classifications and Infomorphisms	69
4.1 Classifications	69

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-58386-2 - Information Flow: The Logic of Distributed Systems

Jon Barwise and Jerry Seligman

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

<i>Contents</i>		vii
4.2	Infomorphisms	72
4.3	Information Channels Defined	75
4.4	Type-Token Duality	78
5	Operations on Classifications	81
5.1	Sums of Classifications	81
5.2	Invariants and Quotients	84
6	Distributed Systems	89
6.1	The Xerox Principle	89
6.2	Distributed Systems to Channels	91
7	Boolean Operations and Classifications	98
7.1	Boolean Operations on Classifications	98
7.2	Boolean Operations in Classifications	100
7.3	Boolean Classifications	100
8	State Spaces	103
8.1	State Spaces and Projections	103
8.2	Projections and Products	105
8.3	Subspaces	107
8.4	Event Classifications	108
8.5	State Spaces from Classifications	110
8.6	Back to Boole	111
8.7	State-Space Systems	114
9	Regular Theories	117
9.1	Theories	117
9.2	Finite Cut and Global Cut	125
9.3	The Theory of a State Space	126
9.4	Theory Interpretations	128
9.5	Representing Regular Theories	129
10	Operations on Theories	132
10.1	Sums of Theories	132
10.2	A Partial Order on Theories	133
10.3	Quotients of Theories	134
10.4	Moving Theories	135
10.5	Families of Theories	136

11	Boolean Operations and Theories	138
	11.1 Boolean Operations on Theories	138
	11.2 Boolean Operations in Theories	141
	11.3 Boolean Inference in State Spaces	147
12	Local Logics	149
	12.1 Local Logics Defined	149
	12.2 Soundness and Completeness	152
	12.3 Logic Infomorphisms	154
	12.4 Operations on Logics	156
	12.5 Boolean Operations and Logics	162
13	Reasoning at a Distance	165
	13.1 Moving Logics	165
	13.2 Images of Logics	166
	13.3 Inverse Images of Logics	167
	13.4 More About Moving Logics	171
14	Representing Local Logics	174
	14.1 Idealization	174
	14.2 Channel Infomorphisms	178
15	Distributed Logics	182
	15.1 Information Systems	182
	15.2 File Copying: An Example	184
	15.3 The Distributed Logic of a Distributed System	189
	15.4 Distributing a Logic Along a Channel	190
	15.5 The Distributed Logic of a State-Space System	191
16	Logics and State Spaces	195
	16.1 Subspaces of State Spaces	195
	16.2 From Local Logics to State Spaces	198
	Part III: Explorations	201
17	Speech Acts	203
	17.1 Truth-Conditional Semantics and Speech Acts	203
	17.2 Austin's Model	204
	17.3 Austin's Four Speech Acts	205

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-58386-2 - Information Flow: The Logic of Distributed Systems

Jon Barwise and Jerry Seligman

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Contents*

ix

18 Vagueness	211
18.1 Height Classifications	212
18.2 Information Flow	215
18.3 An Intensional Logic	216
18.4 The Sorites Paradox	217
19 Commonsense Reasoning	221
19.1 The Dimension of a State Space	223
19.2 Nonmonotonicity	225
19.3 The Frame Problem	233
19.4 Conclusions	233
20 Representation	235
20.1 Modeling Representational Systems	235
20.2 Imperfect Representations	237
20.3 Shimojima's Thesis	238
21 Quantum Logic	243
21.1 The Theory of a Manual	244
21.2 A Comparison with Quantum Logic	248
Answers to Selected Exercises	256
Bibliography	268
Glossary of Notation	270
Index of Definitions	272
Index of Names	274

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-58386-2 - Information Flow: The Logic of Distributed Systems

Jon Barwise and Jerry Seligman

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Preface

Information and talk of information is everywhere nowadays. Computers are thought of as information technology. Each living thing has a structure determined by information encoded in its DNA. Governments and companies spend vast fortunes to acquire information. People go to prison for the illicit use of information. In spite of all this, there is no accepted science of information. What *is* information? How is it possible for one thing to carry information about another? This book proposes answers to these questions.

But why does information matter, why is it so important? An obvious answer motivates the direction our theory takes. Living creatures rely on the regularity of their environment for almost everything they do. Successful perception, locomotion, reasoning, and planning all depend on the existence of a stable relationship between the agents and the world around them, near and far. The importance of regularity underlies the view of agents as information processors. The ability to gather information about parts of the world, often remote in time and space, and to use that information to plan and act successfully, depends on the existence of regularities. If the world were a completely chaotic, unpredictable affair, there would be no information to process.

Still, the place of information in the natural world of biological and physical systems is far from clear. A major problem is the lack of a general theory of regularity. In determining which aspects of the behavior of a system are regular, we typically defer to the scientific discipline suited to the task. For regularities in the movements of birds across large distances, we consult experts in ornithology; but if the movements are of bright lights in the night sky, we'd be better off with an astronomer. Each specialist provides an explanation using a theory or model suited to the specialty.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-58386-2 - Information Flow: The Logic of Distributed Systems

Jon Barwise and Jerry Seligman

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

To whom can we turn for questions about information itself? Can there be a science of information? We think so and propose to lay its foundations in this book. Out of the wide variety of models, theories, and less formal modes of explanation used by specialists, we aim to extract what is essential to understanding the flow of information.

How to Read This Book

This book has several intended audiences, some interested in the big picture but not too concerned about the mathematical details, the other of the opposite sort. Here is a brief outline of the book, followed by indications of which parts various readers will want to read, and in what order.

Introduction to the Theory. The book has three parts. Part I contains a discussion of the motivations for a model of this kind and surveys some related work on information. An overview of our information-channel model is presented, and a simple but detailed example is worked out.

Development of the Theory. The heart of the book is in Part II and consists of a detailed elaboration of the mathematical model described in Part I. Although the basic picture presented in Part I is reasonably simple, there is a lot of mathematical spadework to be done to fill in the details. The mathematical part of the book culminates in a theory of inference and error using “local logics” in Lectures 12–16.

Applications of the Theory. The lectures in Part III explore some ideas for an assortment of applications, namely, applications to speech acts, vagueness, commonsense reasoning (focusing on monotonicity and on the frame problem), representation, and quantum logic. Although there is some truth to the old saw that to a person with a hammer, everything looks like a nail, a wise person with a new tool tests it to see what its strengths and weaknesses are. It is in this spirit that we offer the “explorations” of Part III. We are interested in pounding nails but are equally interested in exploring our new hammer.

We have written the book so that philosophers and others less patient with mathematical detail can read Part I and then have a look through Part III for topics of interest. Mathematicians, logicians, and computer scientists less patient with philosophical issues might prefer to start with Lecture 2, and then turn to Part II, followed perhaps by poking around in Part III. Researchers in artificial intelligence would probably also want to start with Lecture 2 and some of the chapters in Part III, followed by a perusal of Parts I and II.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-58386-2 - Information Flow: The Logic of Distributed Systems

Jon Barwise and Jerry Seligman

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

An index of definitions used in Part II, and a glossary of special notation used in Part II, can be found at the end of the book.

Mathematical Prerequisites. Although some familiarity with modern logic would be helpful in understanding the motivations for some of the topics we cover, the book really only requires familiarity with basic set theory of the sort used in most undergraduate mathematics courses. We review here some more or less standard notational conventions we follow.

If $a = \langle x, y \rangle$ is an ordered pair, then we write $1^{st}(a) = x$ and $2^{nd}(a) = y$. Given a function $f: X \rightarrow Y$, we write $f[X_0] = \{f(x) \mid x \in X_0\}$ (for $X_0 \subseteq X$) and $f^{-1}[Y_0] = \{x \in X \mid f(x) \in Y_0\}$ (for $Y_0 \subseteq Y$). By the range of f we mean $f[X]$. Given functions $f: X \rightarrow Y$ and $g: Y \rightarrow Z$, gf is the function that results from composing them to get the function $gf: X \rightarrow Z$ defined by $gf(x) = g(f(x))$. For any set A , $\text{pow } A$ is its power set, that is, the set of all its subsets. If \mathcal{X} is a set of subsets of A , then

$$\bigcup \mathcal{X} = \{x \in A \mid x \in X \text{ for some } X \in \mathcal{X}\}$$

and

$$\bigcap \mathcal{X} = \{x \in A \mid x \in X \text{ for all } X \in \mathcal{X}\}.$$

If \mathcal{X} is empty, then so is $\bigcup \mathcal{X}$ but $\bigcap \mathcal{X} = A$.

The appearance of many diagrams may suggest that the book uses category theory. This suggestion is both correct and misleading. Category theory arose from the realization that the same kinds of diagrams appear in many branches of mathematics, so it is not surprising that some of these diagrams appear here. We must confess that we have found the basic perspective of category theory to be quite helpful as a guide in developing the theory. And, as it turned out, some of the category-theoretic notions (coproducts and, more generally, colimits) have an important information-theoretic interpretation. In writing this book we have tried to make clear the debt we owe to ideas from category theory, but, at the same time, not presuppose any familiarity with category theory, except in those exercises marked by a †).

In mathematics it is typical practice to call the hard results “theorems” and the easier results “propositions.” Because none of our results are very hard, we use “theorem” to designate the results that are most important to the overall theory we are developing. As a result, some of our theorems are simpler than some of our propositions.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-58386-2 - Information Flow: The Logic of Distributed Systems

Jon Barwise and Jerry Seligman

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xiv

Preface

World Wide Web Site. We have set up a home page for this book, to facilitate the distribution of developments based on the ideas presented here, as well as for any corrections that may need to be made. Its URL is

<http://www.phil.indiana.edu/~barwise/ifpage.html>.

You can also send us e-mail from this page.

Acknowledgments

This book has been in the making for well over a decade. Barwise's attempts at trying to understand information flow date back at least to his book written with John Perry, *Situations and Attitudes*, which appeared in 1983, and include the following papers: Barwise (1986), Barwise (1983), Barwise (1989), Barwise (1991), Barwise and Etchemendy (1990), Barwise, Gabbay, and Hartonas (1996), Barwise (1993), and Barwise and Seligman (1994). Seligman has been working on the same topic since starting his dissertation, which was completed in 1991; see Seligman (1990), Seligman (1991b), Seligman (1991a), and Barwise and Seligman (1994). The theory developed in this book is the product of an intense collaboration between the authors over the past four years. We started working together on the topic during 1992–93, when Seligman was at Indiana University on a postdoctoral fellowship. Two drafts of Parts I and II were written during the academic year 1994–95, when Seligman returned to Indiana University for a year's visit. The explorations in Part III were undertaken by Barwise in 1995–96. During that year, Parts I and II were revised by the two of us, exploiting regularities of the internet to facilitate massive amounts of information flow.

Both authors have previously contributed to the development of situation theory, a programmatic theory of information whose roots go back to *Situations and Attitudes*, discussed at length in Barwise (1989) and further developed in Devlin (1991). Though not presupposing familiarity with situation theory, the present book can be seen as a contribution to that subject by considering those tokens that are situations or events, classified using “infons” as types. Indeed, we consider the notion of a constraint to be the most important notion of situation theory and have tried, in this book, to make this notion less problematic. The task of reconciling the development of the ideas presented here with other details of situation theory remains to be undertaken.

We express our gratitude to Robin Cooper for providing the initial connection between the two of us, to Faber and Faber for permission to use the quotation from Paul Auster's *The Invention of Solitude*, to Indiana University (I.U.) for support of many kinds, to the I.U. Computer Science and Philosophy class

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-58386-2 - Information Flow: The Logic of Distributed Systems

Jon Barwise and Jerry Seligman

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Preface*

xv

that worked through an earlier and much more opaque version during the fall of 1994, to the Situation Theory and Situation Semantics seminar at the Center for the Study of Language and Information (CSLI) for their interest in these topics over the years, to Imperial College for hospitality and support while Barwise wrote a draft of the first two lectures during July of 1995, to the members of the I.U. Program in Pure and Applied Logic for their support over the years, to Michael Dickson and Kenneth Kunen for helpful comments on the quantum logic chapter, to various readers, including Gerry Allwein, Kata Bimbo, Tony Chemero, Diarmuid Crowley, Steve Crowley, Albert Chapman-Leyland, Keith Devlin, Yuko Murakami, and an anonymous referee for helpful comments that have helped us improve the book, to Mary Jane Wilcox for assistance with proofreading, to Lauren Cowles of Cambridge University Press for her help of many kinds, to our families for putting up with us as we wrestled with the ideas that led to the theory, and to the members of the audiences at many talks we have given on this material over the past few years for their interest and questions. Finally, we thank you, the reader, for your attention to our book.

*August 1996*JON BARWISE
JERRY SELIGMAN