

WILLIAM JAMES AND THE METAPHYSICS OF EXPERIENCE

William James is often considered one of America's most original philosophical minds, while also a foundational thinker for the study of religion. Despite this reputation, he is rarely considered a serious philosopher or religious thinker by contemporary standards. In this new interpretation David Lamberth argues that James's major contribution was to develop a metaphysics of experience integrally related to his pluralistic and social religious ideas. Lamberth systematically interprets James's radically empiricist world-view and argues for an early dating (1895) for his development of this metaphysics. He offers a radically empiricist reading of The Varieties of Religious Experience and a close analysis of A Pluralistic *Universe.* Concluding, he connects James's ideas about experience, pluralism, and truth to current debates in philosophy, philosophy of religion, and theology, suggesting James's functional, experiential metaphysics as a conceptual aid in bridging the social and interpretive with the immediate and concrete, avoiding radical relativism and uncritical realism.

David C. Lamberth is Assistant Professor of Theology in the Faculty of Divinity of Harvard University



CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN RELIGION AND CRITICAL THOUGHT 5

Edited by
WAYNE PROUDFOOT, Columbia University
JEFFREY L. STOUT, Princeton University
NICHOLAS WOLTERSTORFF, Yale University

Current events confirm the need to understand religious ideas and institutions critically, yet radical doubts have been raised about how to proceed and about the ideal of critical thought itself. Meanwhile, some prominent scholars have urged that we turn the tables, and view modern society as the object of criticism and a religious tradition as the basis for critique. Cambridge Studies in Religion and Critical Thought is a series of books intended to address the interaction of critical thinking and religious traditions in this context of uncertainty and conflicting claims. It will take up questions such as the following, either by reflecting on them philosophically or by pursuing their ramifications in studies of specific figures and movements: is a coherent critical perspective on religion desirable or even possible? What sort of relationship to religious tradition ought a critic to have? What, if anything, is worth saving from the Enlightenment legacy or from critics of religion like Hume and Feuerbach? The answers offered, while varied, will uniformly constitute distinguished, philosophically informed, and critical analyses of particular religious topics.

Other titles published in the series

- I. Feuerbach and the interpretation of religion VAN A. HARVEY
- 2. John Locke and the ethics of belief NICHOLAS WOLTERSTORFF
- 3. Religion and faction in Hume's moral philosophy JENNIFER A. HERDT
- 4. Freud and the legacy of Moses RICHARD J. BERNSTEIN
- 6. Contingency and fortune in Aquinas's ethics JOHN BOWLIN



WILLIAM JAMES AND THE METAPHYSICS OF EXPERIENCE

DAVID C. LAMBERTH





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge GB2 IRP, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, GB2 2RU, UK http://www.cup.cam.ac.uk 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA http://www.cup.org 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

© David C. Lamberth 1999

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1999

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeset in 11/12.5pt Baskerville No. 2 [GC]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Lamberth, David C.

William James and the metaphysics of experience / David C. Lamberth.

p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in religion and critical thought; 5) Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 0-521-58163 x (hardback)

 James, William, 1842-1910 - Contributions in concept of religious experience.
 Experience (Religion) 1. Title.

II. Series.

B945.J24L27 1999 191–dc21 98–30668 CIP

18BN 0521 58163 x hardback



To my mother and father



Note on the text

Cambridge University Press 052158163X - William James and the Metaphysics of Experience Divid C. Lamberth Frontmatter More information

Contents

Acknowledgments	xii
Introduction	I
I James's radically empiricist Weltanschauung Radical empiricism: a philosophy of pure experience The methodological thesis of radical empiricism The factual thesis of radical empiricism The metaphysical thesis of pure experience The functional account of direct acquaintance The functional account of knowledge about The pragmatic conception of truth The thesis of pluralistic panpsychism Concluding remarks	9 10 14 18 23 31 43 48 57
 From psychology to religion: pure experience and radical empiricism in the 1890s Psychology as a natural science James's shifting interest: from psychology into metaphysics "The knowing of things together": the formal break with dualism Pure experience, the field theory, and the 1895-6 seminar "The Feelings" Pure experience and Richard Avenarius The field theory Concluding remarks 	61 63 71 73 82 83 87 95

ix

xi



X	Contents	
3	The Varieties of Religious Experience: indications of a philosophy adapted to normal religious needs Spiritual visions and bodily limitations:	97
	the composition of <i>Varieties</i>	98
	Remnants of the plan for the philosophical course	106
	Varieties: the basic argument	110
	Method and procedure	III
	Hypothetical beginnings	116
	Descriptions of the life of religion	119
	James's model of religion in act	126
	Varieties and radical empiricism	138
4	Squaring logic and life: making philosophy intimate in	
	A Pluralistic Universe	146
	From Varieties to A Pluralistic Universe	147
	Adequate philosophy: intimacy, foreignness, and	17
	rationality	151
	The arguments against the absolute	162
	The problem of the compounding of consciousness	172
	Pluralistic panpsychism	185
	Superhuman consciousness and the finite God	196
5	Estimations and anticipations	203
	James and truth	205
	Realism or antirealism?	209
	Absolute truth	215
	Anticipations	223
	Philosophy	225
	Philosophy of religion	229
	Theology	235
Se	Select bibliography	
In	Index	



Note on the text

In this book I refer whenever possible to the Harvard University Press edition *The Works of William James*, edited by Frederick Burkhardt, Fredson Bowers, and Ignas Skrupskelis, citing the volumes' presentations of manuscripts as well as references to letters and notes in appendices and the apparatus. When referring to other letters or manuscripts, I cite the most accessible published location of the complete item. In a few cases references are made to manuscripts in the Papers of William James at Harvard's Houghton Library.

The Works edition is arranged topically rather than chronologically, and a great deal of the material presented therein was never prepared for publication by James, much less topically arranged. In order to advance the historical interests of my argument, I have adopted certain additional conventions regarding citations. If an article or work was published by James in the same form and under the same name as it is presented in the Harvard Works edition, I refer to it in my notes by the Works volume title alone. For example, I refer to articles in The Meaning of Truth simply by that title (with a page number), rather than by article name, even though James previously published many of them serially. On the other hand, in the case of uncollected essays, manuscripts, and notes, and in the specific case of all of the essays that Perry collected posthumously in Essays in Radical Empiricism, I refer both to the article (or item) title and to the Works volume. This allows individuals without the Works edition to find many items in other sources (such as the popular Memories and Studies). It also preserves access and perhaps even draws attention to both James's own intellectual history and his authorial considerations about publication.

The first reference to a work in the footnotes includes full publication information. All subsequent references are by author and abbreviated title. Full publication information for all works is included in the select bibliography.



Acknowledgments

This book would not have been written had I not had the exceedingly good fortune of encountering the work of William James in the classrooms of both Richard R. Niebuhr and Hilary Putnam near the beginning of my doctoral work at Harvard University. Not only were the initial interpretations by these two wonderful teachers so stimulating as to inspire me to this extended task, but their direction, suggestions, and careful questions as my graduate advisors contributed greatly to my developing thinking about James. Most importantly, their support, encouragement, and friendship through the years it has taken to bring the project to completion have made the experience truly enjoyable. To each I offer heartfelt thanks.

A number of institutions have supported this project. First and foremost, I would like to thank the Andrew W. Mellon Foundation, whose support allowed me a critical year of work in which to realize the first complete draft. I would also like to thank the Department of Religion and the College of Arts and Sciences at Florida State University, who provided both time for and assistance with my research. The staff of Harvard's Houghton Library were very helpful throughout the project. Material from the William James papers is reproduced by kind permission of Bay James and the Houghton Library, Harvard University (shelf marks bMS Am 1092.1, bMS 1092.9, bMS 1092, and bMS 1092.4). Finally, my thanks to the Harvard Divinity School for support in completing the final typescript.

In addition to Richard Niebuhr and Hilary Putnam, many people have read drafts and offered helpful comments along the way, including Courtney Bickel, Paul J. Croce, Sarah Coakley, Gordon Kaufman, Nancy Levene, Melani McAlister, and Ann Taves. For her sharp editorial eye I would like to thank my research assistant Deborah Whitehead. For work on the index my thanks are due to Lori Pearson and Joel Rasmussen. Francis Schüssler Fiorenza was especially



Acknowledgments

xiii

encouraging and perceptive in his comments, as were Jeffrey Stout, Henry Levinson, and Wayne Proudfoot, all three of whom were essential in bringing this book to publication. Finally, my deepest gratitude goes to my parents, Bonnie Jean and Clements E. Lamberth (1933–93), who supported and encouraged my intellectual curiosity from the very beginning. This book is dedicated to them. I only regret that my father did not live long enough to see this work which gained so much from our experiences together.