William James is often considered one of America’s most original philosophical minds, while also a foundational thinker for the study of religion. Despite this reputation, he is rarely considered a serious philosopher or religious thinker by contemporary standards. In this new interpretation David Lamberth argues that James’s major contribution was to develop a metaphysics of experience integrally related to his pluralistic and social religious ideas. Lamberth systematically interprets James’s radically empiricist world-view and argues for an early dating (1895) for his development of this metaphysics. He offers a radically empiricist reading of *The Varieties of Religious Experience* and a close analysis of *A Pluralistic Universe*. Concluding, he connects James’s ideas about experience, pluralism, and truth to current debates in philosophy, philosophy of religion, and theology, suggesting James’s functional, experiential metaphysics as a conceptual aid in bridging the social and interpretive with the immediate and concrete, avoiding radical relativism and uncritical realism.

David C. Lamberth is Assistant Professor of Theology in the Faculty of Divinity of Harvard University
Current events confirm the need to understand religious ideas and institutions critically, yet radical doubts have been raised about how to proceed and about the ideal of critical thought itself. Meanwhile, some prominent scholars have urged that we turn the tables, and view modern society as the object of criticism and a religious tradition as the basis for critique. Cambridge Studies in Religion and Critical Thought is a series of books intended to address the interaction of critical thinking and religious traditions in this context of uncertainty and conflicting claims. It will take up questions such as the following, either by reflecting on them philosophically or by pursuing their ramifications in studies of specific figures and movements: is a coherent critical perspective on religion desirable or even possible? What sort of relationship to religious tradition ought a critic to have? What, if anything, is worth saving from the Enlightenment legacy or from critics of religion like Hume and Feuerbach? The answers offered, while varied, will uniformly constitute distinguished, philosophically informed, and critical analyses of particular religious topics.

Other titles published in the series
1. Feuerbach and the interpretation of religion
   VAN A. HARVEY
2. John Locke and the ethics of belief
   NICHOLAS WOLTERSTORFF
3. Religion and faction in Hume’s moral philosophy
   JENNIFER A. HERDT
4. Freud and the legacy of Moses
   RICHARD J. BERNSTEIN
5. Contingency and fortune in Aquinas’s ethics
   JOHN BOWLIN
WILLIAM JAMES AND THE METAPHYSICS OF EXPERIENCE

DAVID C. LAMBERTH
To my mother and father
# Contents

*Note on the text* xi  
*Acknowledgments* xii

## Introduction

1. James’s radically empiricist *Weltanschauung* 9  
   - Radical empiricism: a philosophy of pure experience 10  
     - The methodological thesis of radical empiricism 14  
     - The factual thesis of radical empiricism 18  
     - The metaphysical thesis of pure experience 23  
     - The functional account of direct acquaintance 31  
     - The functional account of knowledge about 43  
     - The pragmatic conception of truth 48  
     - The thesis of pluralistic panpsychism 57  
   - Concluding remarks 59

2. From psychology to religion: pure experience and radical empiricism in the 1890s 61  
   - Psychology as a natural science 63  
   - James’s shifting interest: from psychology into metaphysics 71  
   - “The knowing of things together”: the formal break with dualism 73  
   - Pure experience, the field theory, and the 1895–6 seminar “The Feelings” 82  
   - Pure experience and Richard Avenarius 83  
   - The field theory 87  
   - Concluding remarks 95
x

Contents

3 The Varieties of Religious Experience: indications of a philosophy adapted to normal religious needs 97
   Spiritual visions and bodily limitations: the composition of Varieties 98
   Remnants of the plan for the philosophical course 106
   Varieties: the basic argument 110
   Method and procedure 111
   Hypothetical beginnings 116
   Descriptions of the life of religion 119
   James’s model of religion in act 126
   Varieties and radical empiricism 138

4 Squaring logic and life: making philosophy intimate in A Pluralistic Universe 146
   From Varieties to A Pluralistic Universe 147
   Adequate philosophy: intimacy, foreignness, and rationality 151
   The arguments against the absolute 162
   The problem of the compounding of consciousness 172
   Pluralistic panpsychism 185
   Superhuman consciousness and the finite God 196

5 Estimations and anticipations 203
   James and truth 205
   Realism or antirealism? 209
   Absolute truth 215
   Anticipations 223
   Philosophy 225
   Philosophy of religion 229
   Theology 235

Select bibliography 242
Index 248
In this book I refer whenever possible to the Harvard University Press edition The Works of William James, edited by Frederick Burkhardt, Fredson Bowers, and Ignas Skrupskelis, citing the volumes’ presentations of manuscripts as well as references to letters and notes in appendices and the apparatus. When referring to other letters or manuscripts, I cite the most accessible published location of the complete item. In a few cases references are made to manuscripts in the Papers of William James at Harvard’s Houghton Library.

The Works edition is arranged topically rather than chronologically, and a great deal of the material presented therein was never prepared for publication by James, much less topically arranged. In order to advance the historical interests of my argument, I have adopted certain additional conventions regarding citations. If an article or work was published by James in the same form and under the same name as it is presented in the Harvard Works edition, I refer to it in my notes by the Works volume title alone. For example, I refer to articles in The Meaning of Truth simply by that title (with a page number), rather than by article name, even though James previously published many of them serially. On the other hand, in the case of uncollected essays, manuscripts, and notes, and in the specific case of all of the essays that Perry collected posthumously in Essays in Radical Empiricism, I refer both to the article (or item) title and to the Works volume. This allows individuals without the Works edition to find many items in other sources (such as the popular Memories and Studies). It also preserves access and perhaps even draws attention to both James’s own intellectual history and his authorial considerations about publication.

The first reference to a work in the footnotes includes full publication information. All subsequent references are by author and abbreviated title. Full publication information for all works is included in the select bibliography.
Acknowledgments

This book would not have been written had I not had the exceedingly good fortune of encountering the work of William James in the classrooms of both Richard R. Niebuhr and Hilary Putnam near the beginning of my doctoral work at Harvard University. Not only were the initial interpretations by these two wonderful teachers so stimulating as to inspire me to this extended task, but their direction, suggestions, and careful questions as my graduate advisors contributed greatly to my developing thinking about James. Most importantly, their support, encouragement, and friendship through the years it has taken to bring the project to completion have made the experience truly enjoyable. To each I offer heartfelt thanks.

A number of institutions have supported this project. First and foremost, I would like to thank the Andrew W. Mellon Foundation, whose support allowed me a critical year of work in which to realize the first complete draft. I would also like to thank the Department of Religion and the College of Arts and Sciences at Florida State University, who provided both time for and assistance with my research. The staff of Harvard’s Houghton Library were very helpful throughout the project. Material from the William James papers is reproduced by kind permission of Bay James and the Houghton Library, Harvard University (shelf marks bMS Am 1092.1, bMS 1092.9, bMS 1092, and bMS 1092.4). Finally, my thanks to the Harvard Divinity School for support in completing the final typescript.

In addition to Richard Niebuhr and Hilary Putnam, many people have read drafts and offered helpful comments along the way, including Courtney Bickel, Paul J. Croce, Sarah Coakley, Gordon Kaufman, Nancy Levene, Melani McAlister, and Ann Taves. For her sharp editorial eye I would like to thank my research assistant Deborah Whitehead. For work on the index my thanks are due to Lori Pearson and Joel Rasmussen. Francis Schüssler Fiorenza was especially

© Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org
encouraging and perceptive in his comments, as were Jeffrey Stout, Henry Levinson, and Wayne Proudfoot, all three of whom were essential in bringing this book to publication. Finally, my deepest gratitude goes to my parents, Bonnie Jean and Clements E. Lamberth (1933–93), who supported and encouraged my intellectual curiosity from the very beginning. This book is dedicated to them. I only regret that my father did not live long enough to see this work which gained so much from our experiences together.