

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-58121-9 - Politics and Uncertainty: Theory, Models and Applications

Claudio Cioffi-Revilla

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Uncertainty is an ever-present and ineradicable aspect of politics. It affects all important issues of governance and policy, in both domestic and international contexts. Rather than treating the uncertainty of politics as a mystery, this book provides an original and direct treatment of political uncertainty as a scientifically knowable phenomenon with well-defined principles and substantive properties. Specific applications of this new theory of political uncertainty are demonstrated in diverse areas of politics, examining such questions as when and how wars break out, when and how governments collapse, and when and how political cooperation emerges. The author shows how probability and mathematical modeling can play a central role in understanding such complex and fundamental issues.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-58121-9 - Politics and Uncertainty: Theory, Models and Applications

Claudio Cioffi-Revilla

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-58121-9 - Politics and Uncertainty: Theory, Models and Applications

Claudio Cioffi-Revilla

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Politics and Uncertainty

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-58121-9 - Politics and Uncertainty: Theory, Models and Applications
Claudio Cioffi-Revilla
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-58121-9 - Politics and Uncertainty: Theory, Models and Applications

Claudio Cioffi-Revilla

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Politics and Uncertainty

Theory, Models and Applications

Claudio Cioffi-Revilla



Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-58121-9 - Politics and Uncertainty: Theory, Models and Applications

Claudio Cioffi-Revilla

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521581219

© Claudio Cioffi-Revilla 1998

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1998

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Cioffi-Revilla, Claudio A., 1951-

Politics and uncertainty: theory, models and applications/Claudio Cioffi-Revilla.
p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0 521 58121 4. - ISBN 0 521 58915 0 (pbk)

1. Political science. 2. Political science - Methodology.

3. Uncertainty. I. Title.

JA71.C496 1998

320-dc21 97-23646 CIP

ISBN 978-0-521-58121-9 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-58915-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-58121-9 - Politics and Uncertainty: Theory, Models and Applications
Claudio Cioffi-Revilla
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Ad memoriam patris mei

That randomness and probability are real phenomena, and therefore are not to be accounted for by our ignorance of true causes, is a proposition that I defend from a variety of perspectives.

Patrick Suppes, *Probabilistic Metaphysics*

One way of theory building is to collect empirical facts and assume that they will somehow speak for themselves, that an obvious classificatory scheme will emerge from their gross and conspicuous aspects. More often it turns out that either the facts by themselves do not suggest an obvious classificatory scheme, or if they do, that the obvious scheme is not very good. A better way is to develop on intellectual grounds what might be a good scheme, try it out and see what happens when empirical data are used.

Karl W. Deutsch, *Integration and the Social System*

The approach we have chosen and the concepts we are using can accommodate a great many theories. Within this framework many apparently unrelated theories and generalizations can be related and their usefulness enhanced.

Gabriel A. Almond and G. Bingham Powell, Jr., *Comparative Politics*

Contents

<i>List of figures</i>	<i>page</i> x
<i>List of tables</i>	xii
<i>Preface</i>	xiii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xix
 Part I Foundations	
1 Introduction	3
 Part II Macropolitics	
2 Behavior of political variables	43
3 General macropolitical principles	84
4 Special macropolitical principles	106
 Part III Micropolitics	
5 Occurrence of political events	137
6 General micropolitical principles	156
7 Special micropolitical principles	208
 Part IV Conclusions	
8 Synthesis	271
<i>Appendix 1: glossary</i>	289
<i>Appendix 2: notation</i>	293
<i>Appendix 3: proofs</i>	296
<i>Appendix 4: methods</i>	301
<i>References</i>	306
<i>Index</i>	333
	 ix

Figures

1.1 General and contextual areas of politics	<i>page 4</i>
1.2 Theoretical framework	24
1.3 Typology of political uncertainty by analytical and theoretical levels	28
2.1 Coalitions as an example of multidimensional, observable, and measurable forms of political behavior	45
2.2 Warfare as a multidimensional, observable, and measurable form of political behavior	46
2.3 Values of an empirical cumulative relative frequency function $\hat{\Phi}(y)$ and estimated values of probability density measured by the slope between consecutive observed cumulative values	56
2.4 Empirical cumulative frequency histogram of general world war onset	58
2.5 Kaplan–Meier estimate of probability density of general world war onset	60
2.6 Different forms of uncertainty specified by the probability functions of a political variable Y	61
2.7 Special values (mean and median) in the onset of general world war	66
2.8 Empirical hazard rate of general world war onset (K–M estimate)	80
3.1 Causal effect of hazard forces (independent variables X) acting on individuals and groups producing political behavior (dependent variables Y)	89
3.2 Distributions principle of political behavior	94
3.3 Moments principle of political behavior	96
3.4 Expectation principle of political behavior	97
3.5 Modal principle of political behavior	100
3.6 Probabilistic causality of political behavior	101
4.1 Qualitatively different forms of hazard force in model III	118
4.2 Graph of hazard force $H(y, \alpha)$ in model III	119

List of figures	xi
4.3 Graphs of hazard force $H(y, \alpha)$ and political behavior in model III	122
4.4 Hazard force and equilibrium of political behavior	123
6.1 Sequential logic of government policy	159
6.2 Sequential logic of international conflict	160
6.3 Venn diagram for a political event \mathbb{Y} caused by equivalent operations on a sample space Ω	180
6.4 Deterrence probability for a two-out-of-three strategic triad	202
6.5 Voting in the UN Security Council	203
7.1 Event tree for a conjunctive–disjunctive political event	212
7.2 Event tree for a disjunctive–conjunctive political event	213
7.3 Event tree for deterrence working	218
7.4 Event tree for coalition formation	221
7.5 Event tree for the opportunity–willingness framework	222
7.6 Event tree for occurrence of collective action	225
7.7 Event tree for polity disintegration in a Lasswell–Kaplan system	234
7.8 Reconstructed event tree for polity disintegration in a Lasswell–Kaplan system	237
7.9 Conditional political causality with embedded sequential causality	239
7.10 Sequential political causality with embedded conditional causality	240
7.11 Experimental function for objective and subjective probability values	243
7.12 Kinematic political occurrence by conjunction	248
7.13 Kinematic political occurrence by disjunction	251
7.14 Rise and fall in the probability of causal events	257
7.15 Rise and fall in the probability of a political event	259
7.16 Onset of turbulence in world politics during and after the Cold War	264
A4.1 Event tree for the occurrence of a political event	305

Tables

1.1 Mechanisms of political choice	<i>page</i> 17
1.2 Theoretical framework and causal relations	25
2.1 Taxonomy of political behavior	52
2.2 Onset of general world war, 1495–1939	57
2.3 Empirical cumulative distribution of general world war onset T	58
2.4 Measurement of (Kaplan–Meier) empirical density distribution of general world war onset	59
2.5 Measuring the hazard rate (martial force) of general world war onset	80
2.6 Historical special values of onset T of general world war	81
4.1 Taxonomy of hazard forces	109
4.2 Progressive problemshifts through successive macro models and empirical methods	111
4.3 Model I estimates (MLEs) of hazard force k (level of anarchy) for war onset T in the international system, 1500–1965	114
4.4 Linear hazard force model estimates (MLEs) for large war onset, model II: $H(t) = \phi + \rho t$	118
4.5 Nonlinear hazard force model estimates (MLEs) for large war onset, model III: $\ln H(t) = \ln \kappa + \alpha \ln t$	120
4.6 Multicausal hazard force model estimates (MLEs) for large war onset force, model IV: $H(t) = a + b/t + ce^t$	125
5.1 Political events, elemental events (sample points), and sample space	143
6.1 Sequential logic of political events	162
6.2 International conflicts, 1495–1988	168
6.3 Conditional logic of political events	176
7.1 Taxonomy of political events	211
7.2 Semantic equivalents for estimating the subjective probability of political events	244

Preface

This book is about uncertainty in politics, about the defining role that this real-world feature plays in political life, and about how political theory is to understand uncertainty in a systematic way that produces new knowledge. Although most readers will not deny the pervasiveness and significance of uncertainty in politics – particularly in this turbulent age of post-Cold War politics – paradoxically, political uncertainty has been traditionally viewed in ways that normally eschew inquiry. That is, either as an unsolvable mystery to be avoided except by the most fearless minds, as if the proposition “political uncertainty = unknowable” were true by definition, or as a statistical nuisance that is best treated as “measurement error” or an “error term” in quantitative models. Few have looked at political uncertainty in order to understand its character. As I argue in this book, however, political uncertainty is a defining quality of politics that cannot be ignored, either by theory or by public policy. Political uncertainty is also mostly a qualitative phenomenon with a well-defined character; only secondarily is it quantitative, and as such it should be directly addressed by contemporary political science using the appropriate tools of inquiry.

The main contribution of this book is to present a theory of political uncertainty applicable to understanding the diverse domains of political life, both domestic and international. I use specific instances of political phenomena related to coalitions, government policy, deterrence, collective action, conflict, and others as running examples to illustrate the broader theory and its potential scope. However, the applications I present are meant only to assist in the interpretation of the theory; they are not meant as in-depth analyses because those would require separate treatment. The theory addresses one of the central dual puzzles in politics: the aggregate behavior of political variables and the individual occurrence of political events, both of which are phenomena that occur with uncertainty. My theory has two branches, a macroscopic part for the explanation of aggregate political behavior in terms of well-defined forces, and a microscopic part for the explanation of individual political events in terms of their

xiv Preface

occurrence structure. Unified principles provide linkages between the two levels of analysis. The theory attempts to advance the standards of contemporary political science in the areas of deductive formalization and empirical validity. I give greater emphasis to the former goal because my chief interest in this book is in theoretical development, an area that in spite of recent advances is still less well established in political science. Empirical methods are now more familiar in scholarship and in teaching.

On the deductive side, the theory is constructed in the traditional deductivist tradition, by defining concepts, postulating a set of axioms and assumptions, and, most important, deriving results that account for observed phenomena. I call the main theoretical results principles because formally these are either theorems or corollaries; but they are propositions about politics, not mathematical propositions as such (or they would be called theorems). Whereas theorems, lemmas, and corollaries are content-free statements (formal propositions), scientific principles are to do with substantive properties of the real world (a distinction that is often neglected). General principles explain the larger patterns of uncertainty in political behavior and events; special principles explain more specific aspects.

On the empirical side, the two levels of the theory differ in terms of the appropriate evidence and technical procedures used for drawing valid inferences. The macroscopic part of the theory uses predominantly quantitative empirical methods, such as maximum likelihood estimation, survival analysis, and other nonlinear data analysis approaches discussed in chapter 4. By contrast, the microscopic part of the theory uses predominantly qualitative case-oriented methods similar to those used in the empirical application of decision models or game-theoretic models to historical material. I illustrate how both types of methods are used to evaluate the theory, and I also hope that this will help discredit some enduring but false distinctions between qualitative and quantitative approaches, as if these were always mutually exclusive in scientific investigation.

From a methodological perspective I view my main contribution in the area of theoretical methodology as the development and application of appropriate formal tools for constructing political theory. My emphasis on appropriate tools is important because many of the mathematical models available today were developed with other sciences and a different set of questions in mind. Fortunately, many different theoretical tools exist because mathematics today covers diverse formal languages, some of which have been directly inspired by social phenomena (parts of probability theory, decisional calculus, game theory, graph theory). Theoretical methods will attract greater interest in political science, now that empirical methods are better known and established, because only they can directly

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-58121-9 - Politics and Uncertainty: Theory, Models and Applications

Claudio Cioffi-Revilla

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Preface

xv

assist the scholar in the construction – not just in the testing – of viable theories. What is known as political methodology – including those procedures that are ordinarily taught in “methods courses” – should therefore cover tools for theoretic progress at least as much as tools for checking the empirics; otherwise, there will be little to test empirically, and what there will be will not be adequately systematized to benefit the accumulation of scientific knowledge.

This book is addressed to several scholarly communities, mainly academic but also some in policy areas. The book will be of primary interest to political scientists who wish to develop a better understanding of the nature of uncertainty as it operates in various areas of politics. I demonstrate how political uncertainty is uniformly affected by the same principles. Thus, political scientists who study conflict – domestic or international – will find through this theory much in common with those who study coalitions, policy processes, and collective action – areas where I demonstrate the existence of comparable patterns of political uncertainty that are governed by the same laws.

Another audience consists of social scientists and other academic scholars working in allied disciplines who also study politics from perspectives that differ from those of the political scientist, but who nonetheless acknowledge and wish to develop a better understanding of uncertainty in political life. This broader community includes political sociologists, economists, historians, political anthropologists, and archeologists – scholars who acknowledge uncertainty in the origins and historical evolution of political systems in various civilizations. These allied disciplines may use this theory for comparative purposes, exploring the application of principles across a wider range of time and space than is normal in contemporary political science.

A third community consists of philosophers, epistemologists, and other scholars who share an interest in the advancement of formal political theory, particularly an interest in the role played by *fortuna* in influencing the lives, fortunes, and governance of a collectivity. Members of this community may also be interested in my use of probabilistic causality – as opposed to the older deterministic causality used by more traditional political theories – as a newer and more effective epistemic basis for constructing the theory of political uncertainty presented in this book. While I was writing I also frequently had in mind students of politics in all the above disciplines, particularly those who may feel motivated to develop a better understanding of contemporary approaches to political uncertainty based on rigorous and systematic methods. As a university teacher, I am particularly concerned that students develop early on in their investigation of politics a disciplined and truthful understanding of uncertainty in

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-58121-9 - Politics and Uncertainty: Theory, Models and Applications

Claudio Cioffi-Revilla

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xvi Preface

political life, not the more popular misconceptions of political uncertainty as unknowable or haphazard randomness. Pundits in the public arena make their living from political uncertainty; scholars make their living attempting to decipher it.

Finally, the book should be of interest to the more analytically inclined policy analysts who may wish to consider the implications of these principles of political uncertainty for their own areas of policy concerns. Logically, significant areas of public policy – from local government to national security – are endemically affected by political uncertainty, so improvements in our basic understanding of political uncertainty cannot be ignored without risk. As the best engineers know, there is nothing more practical than good theory.

The background needed to read this book is not advanced, but nonetheless may pose a challenge to some readers who share a substantive interest in the subject matter. Most readers will agree with the premise that political uncertainty is not an easily tractable topic. What some find difficult to accept is the obvious conclusion that to analyze politics with uncertainty but without tools that are sufficiently powerful is to require something impossible. There is no wholly satisfactory solution to this dilemma, only a trade-off compromise between how much can be explained about political uncertainty and how much formal power to apply in the investigation; not everything in life can be easily grasped. The approach I have chosen relies mostly on logic, sets, and elementary probability notions, with a minimum of basic calculus (a powerful analytical tool that is widely used in most scientific disciplines, including “softer sciences” such as biology and economics, but still largely underutilized in political theory). However, I have attempted to provide informal interpretations along the way, and the careful reader will note that there are only a few passages in which the precision of the mathematical language simply cannot be replaced by plain English (which was not invented to construct scientific theories, let alone to understand the world of uncertainty). Other analytical tools are reviewed or developed as needed either in the text or in appendix 4.

In terms of formal analysis, I have aimed to strike at a middle range, between basic mathematics (algebra, linear equations), which can contribute little to a theory of political uncertainty, and higher mathematics (advanced calculus, measure theory, stochastic differential equations, topology), which is not well known in political science. I believe this middle range contains many powerful tools that are presently underutilized or neglected in the construction of political theory. I hope to show – primarily through the principles of the theory presented in this book – how mathematical methods can produce new insights that are as true as those

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-58121-9 - Politics and Uncertainty: Theory, Models and Applications

Claudio Cioffi-Revilla

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Preface

xvii

derived by more conventional empirical methods (what I call Kline's thesis, discussed in chapter 3).

My recommendation to any reader interested in the subject matter of political uncertainty but who becomes frustrated by the formalism that I use is to plunge ahead anyway – as Claude Shannon (1951) demonstrated in a famous theorem from information theory, the human mind is capable of acquiring a considerable amount of knowledge even when the stream of signals contains gaps and noise. At the same time, I also hope that those who labor at sharpening their theoretical tools and revel in the sight of a beautiful nonlinear equation with an aesthetically pleasing form will find some new insights or applications, particularly concerning those aspects of political uncertainty that can be understood only through the medium of mathematics. These readers may also require a higher level of formalization, something that should be pursued elsewhere in the specialized journals but that I have tried to avoid in this book.

As I explain in greater detail in chapter 1, the book consists of four parts, along with a set of supporting appendices. Each part corresponds to a basic element of the theory. The first part – foundations – contains an introductory chapter in which I present the topic of political uncertainty in a disciplinary light, examining its place in political theory, the way in which it has historically been addressed, and the axioms I propose to use as foundations for the theory presented in subsequent chapters. The next two parts – the two main theoretical branches, called macropolitics and micropolitics for reasons I detail in chapter 1 – each contain three parallel chapters, dedicated to the basic concepts, the general principles, and the more specific results (special principles) in each branch of the theory. The chapters within each part of the theory are strictly sequential, but the two parts are less so. I chose to present the macroscopic part of the theory first because the microscopic part investigates in greater detail what lies within the “black box” of political behavior, so to speak, and so it seemed more natural to deal first with aggregate political behavior (macro level) and only later with the more specific individual events that compose it (micro level). However, readers with a greater interest in individual political events – particularly those political occurrences that are viewed as one-of-a-kind, as many historians think – may wish to read part III immediately after chapter 1. The fourth part contains a single chapter which synthesizes the macroscopic and microscopic analysis of political uncertainty by providing a unified treatment and explaining the linkages across levels of analysis.

I had not looked forward to writing appendices, but in a book of this nature they turn out to solve a number of common problems. Appendix 1 can be used as a dictionary reference to clarify the meaning of some new terms that are necessary in constructing a political theory in largely

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-58121-9 - Politics and Uncertainty: Theory, Models and Applications

Claudio Cioffi-Revilla

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xviii Preface

unexplored conceptual territory. Appendix 2 explains and summarizes the formal notation used throughout the book; it also helps to identify the key concepts, as any system of notation should. I confess to not being entirely satisfied with the present state of notation, and I suspect that some more creative work along these lines will be necessary to provide the analysis of political uncertainty with a theoretically efficient set of analytical signs – at present an unappreciated need in political theory. Appendix 3 contains the proofs of theorems and corollaries, which I did not include in the text in order to maintain the flow of ideas. I do feel that something is lost by not showing how I first arrived at the main propositions (as opposed to their subsequent proof), but I also realize that moving the technical proofs to the appendix increases the readability of the book. Appendix 4 contains a summary of some formal tools that are useful in the task of theoretical construction – some of the middle-range tools that I referred to earlier. Its main purpose is to highlight some ideas from theoretical methods, not to provide any sort of formal training.

Acknowledgments

This book required a number of years to acquire scope and coherence. During this time I have received numerous valuable comments and advice from many patient colleagues. I thank my first mentors, Umberto Gori and Glenn H. Snyder, for their support in pursuit of formal political theory, and also Alessandro Bruschi, Paul Diesing, and James A. Stimson for showing me how exciting science can be done in the investigation of politics. Also, all graduates of the Facoltà di Scienze Politiche e Sociali “Cesare Alfieri,” my alma mater at the University of Florence, owe our gratitude to the esteemed Italian political theoretician, Giovanni Sartori, the modern founder of the Florentine school. I never met the late John V. Gillespie, one of the greatest but least acknowledged American political scientists, who provided me an inspiring epistemological bridge in my journey from Florence to America.

At the risk of unintentionally forgetting someone, I am very pleased to thank the following colleagues for their comments and advice on various parts of this project: Hayward Alker Jr., Pierre Allan, Fulvio Attinà, †Edward E. Azar, Frank Beer, Steve Brams, Stuart Bremer, Dagobert Brito, Eric Browne, Ron Brunner, †Franco Alberto Casadio, Steve Chan, Harold Chestnut, Maurizio Cotta, Luciano Daboni, Raymond Dacey, †Karl Deutsch, Paul H. Diehl, Lawrence Dodd, Richard Engelbrecht-Wiggans, Donald P. Green, Joseph Grieco, Seif Hussein, Michael Intrilligator, Patrick James, Cal Jillson, Paul Johnson, Roger Kanet, William Keech, Edward Kolodziej, Peter Kopacek, Michael Krassa, Jacek Kugler, Jim Kuklinski, Martin Landau, Russell Leng, Jack S. Levy, Mark Lichbach, Alejandro Lorca Corrons, Urs Luterbacher, Duncan MacRae, Harvey Mansfield, Zeev Maoz, Patrick McGowan, Dwaine Mefford, Manus I. Midlarsky, Alex Mintz, Andrew Moravcsik, James Morrow, †Benjamin Most, Stuart Nagel, †Alan Newcombe, Barry O'Neill, Lin Ostrom, Carlo Pelanda, Brian Pollins, Steve Portnoy, George Rabinowitz, Anatol Rapoport, †William H. Riker, Zvee Ritz, Phil Schrodtt, Paul W. Schroeder, Ian Shapiro, Herbert Simon, J. David Singer, Randy Siverson, Duncan Snidal, Erik Solem, Harvey Starr, Walter Stone, Vicky B. Sullivan, Charles S.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-58121-9 - Politics and Uncertainty: Theory, Models and Applications

Claudio Cioffi-Revilla

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xx Acknowledgments

Taber, William R. Thompson, Marcello Torrigiani, Luigi Vannucci, Koos Van Wyk, John Vasquez, Michael D. Ward, John A. Williamson, and †Avner Yaniv.

I am particularly indebted to the following colleagues who read versions of the entire manuscript and offered many valuable comments: G. Robert Boynton, Harold Guetzkow, Walter Isard, D. Marc Kilgour, Bruce M. Russett, Michael Nicholson, Richard L. Merritt, Robert G. Muncaster, and Dina A. Zinnes.

Many former students provided me with the challenge of explaining my theory in more understandable terms, for which I shall always be grateful. At the University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill: Jim Dixon, Mark Gasiorowski, Don Haynes, Ed Heyman, Craig Murphy, Doug Nelson, Emilio Rodriguez, Jesse Dent, Abdulmonem Al Mashat, and Abdullah Al Sultan. At the University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign: Gretchen Hower, Pierangelo Isernia, David Jones, Kelly Kadera, S. Chun Lee, Paul Pudaite, and Charles Taber. At the University of Colorado, Boulder: Clay Bowen, Susan Grubb, Mike Kanner, Sean Kelly, David Lai, Todd Landmann, Mohan Penubarti, and Henrik Sommer.

The National Science Foundation and the Merriam Lab of the University of Illinois provided initial support for this project, followed by support from the Center for International Relations of the University of Colorado.

John Haslam at Cambridge University Press has excelled in his capacity as editor, by managing a truly exemplar review and production process. I am also grateful to Sandy Rush and Hilary Scannell, for their careful editing.

Finally, no happily married scholar can write a book like this without the relentless support of spouse and family. My greatest gratitude goes to my wife Jean, who sacrificed a great deal over many years so that I could write this book, to my brother Alfred for his cheerful humor, and to my parents for their loving trust. I dedicate this book to my father, who taught me more than I could possibly teach in any book.