This book examines the analytical basis and practical experience of financial reforms in a number of countries, primarily developing countries. A key finding is that financial reforms have led to improved resource allocation – an a priori belief not hitherto tested. This finding is consistent with the argument that efforts in developing countries to maximize efficiency of resource utilization cannot be underestimated in their importance. Three key lessons suggest the importance of managing the reform process rather than adopting a laissez-faire approach: First, more successful reform must take account of information capital; second, initial conditions in finance – balance sheets, human and information capital, and incentive systems – are fundamental in determining how to go about reform; and third, different sequences of reforms can be tolerated and, with certain preconditions, do well.
Financial reform
Financial reform
Theory and experience

Edited by
GERARD CAPRIO, JR.
IZAK ATIYAS
and
JAMES A. HANSON
The World Bank
Contents

List of figures and tables xi
Foreword xiii
Acknowledgments xv
List of contributors xvii

1 Introduction 1
    Gerard Caprio, Jr.
    Notes 8

Part I Reforming finance: Approaches and importance

2 Finance, public policy, and growth 13
    Mark Gertler and Andrew Rose
    2.1 Introduction 13
    2.2 Financial systems under perfect markets 15
    2.3 Financial and real development: An overview 17
    2.4 Financial factors in growth and development:
        Theory 18
    2.5 Problems of developing countries 34
    2.6 Evidence 38
    2.7 Concluding remarks 44
    Notes 45

3 Banking on financial reform? A case of sensitive dependence on initial conditions 49
    Gerard Caprio, Jr.
    3.1 Portfolio choice considerations 50
    3.2 Information capital 55
    3.3 Human capital: Building, managing, and motivating it 59
Contents

3.4 Conclusions
   Notes 62

4 Credit where it is due? A review of the macro and micro evidence on the real effects of financial reform
   Fabio Schiantarelli, Izak Atiyas, Gerard Caprio, Jr., John Harris, and Andrew Weiss
   64
   4.1 What are we comparing and what can we learn from the theory? 65
   4.2 The effects of liberalization: Evidence from aggregate data 70
   4.3 New empirical evidence from firm panel data 75
   4.4 Conclusions
   Notes 80

Part II The reform experiences

5 An overview of financial reform episodes
   Izak Atiyas, Gerard Caprio, Jr., and James A. Hanson
   85
   5.1 Macroeconomic background 85
   5.2 Initial conditions in the financial sector 90
   5.3 Approaches to reform 93
   5.4 Adjustment issues 95
   Notes 102

6 The impact of financial reform: The Turkish experience
   Izak Atiyas and Hasan Ersel
   103
   6.1 A brief history of financial reform in Turkey 103
   6.2 Developments in financial markets 108
   6.3 Developments in corporate finance 123
   6.4 Lessons of the Turkish experience
   Notes 131 136

7 Financial policy reform in New Zealand
   Dimitri Margaritis, with Dean Hyslop and David Rae
   140
   7.1 Introduction 140
   7.2 Initial conditions 141
   7.3 The reforms 149
   7.4 Domestic savings 155
   7.5 The role of monetary aggregates 161
   7.6 Liquidity constraints 166
   7.7 Asset-price volatility 171
### Contents

7.8 The share market crash 173
7.9 Conclusion 176
   Appendix 7.1: Chronology of reforms 178
   Appendix 7.2: Notes 180
8 Korea’s financial reform since the early 1980s 184
   Sang-Woo Nam
   8.1 Introduction 184
   8.2 Legacies of the 1970s: The prereform state 185
   8.3 Economic liberalization in the 1980s 187
   8.4 Effects of financial liberalization 193
   8.5 Main features of the Korean financial reform 209
   8.6 Summary and conclusion 220
   Notes 221
9 An assessment of financial reform in Indonesia, 1983–90 223
   John Chant and Mari Pangestu
   9.1 Economic background to deregulation 223
   9.2 Financial background to banking reform 227
   9.3 The evolution of banking 230
   9.4 The real effects of the financial reform 262
   9.5 Assessment of the reform 270
   Notes 274
10 Financial reform in Malaysia 276
    Zainal Aizam Yusof, Awang Adek Hussin, Ismail Alowi, Lim Chee Sing, and Sukhdave Singh
    10.1 The Malaysian economy: 1970–90 277
    10.2 The financial system 281
    10.3 The nature of liberalization 290
    10.4 Reform, the economy, and the financial system 296
    10.5 The regulatory and supervisory framework of reform 315
    10.6 Lessons from Malaysian financial reform 318
    Notes 320

Part III Liberalizing the capital account and domestic financial reform

11 An open capital account: A brief survey of the issues and the results 323
    James A. Hanson
    11.1 Introduction 323
Contents

11.2 The costs and benefits of capital-account liberalization 324
11.3 Results of open capital accounts 334
11.4 The sequencing and speed of capital- and current-account liberalization 336
11.5 Summary and conclusions 342
   Appendix 11.1: The neoclassical growth model and capital inflows 347
   Notes 354

12 Financial liberalization and the capital account: Chile, 1974–84 357
   Salvador Valdés-Prieto
12.1 Introduction and overview 357
12.2 A brief summary of international finance in Chile before 1974 360
12.3 The disappearance of foreign finance, 1974–6 361
12.4 The boom–bust episode of 1977–82 and capital mobility 365
12.5 After devaluation: Depression and restrictions on capital mobility 399
12.6 Concluding thoughts 406
   Notes 409

Part IV Summary

13 Policy issues in reforming finance: Lessons and strategies 413
   Gerard Caprio, Jr., Izak Atiyas, and James A. Hanson
13.1 Some lessons 417
13.2 Toward a strategy for financial sector reform 427
13.3 Conclusions 436

Bibliography 441
Index 459
Figures and tables

Figures

2.1 The premium for external finance
2.2 The premium for external finance: The case for rationing
2.3 Impact of a rise in borrower net worth
2.4 Market collapse
2.5 The nature of the relationship between credit and income
3.1 Banks’ portfolio choice
3.2 Portfolio choice and interest-rate ceilings
5.1 Chile: Real interest rates, 1940–84
5.2 Quasi-liquid liabilities / GDP, 1960–90
5.3 Gross domestic savings
5.4 Gross domestic investment
7.1 Real trading bank lending rate
7.2 State-dependent pricing: Dynamics of money and output
9.1 Real deposit rates in Indonesia
10.1 Variation in nominal interest rates
10.2 Real interest rates
10.3 Difference between riskless and lending interest rates
10.4 Malaysian commercial banks: The share of lending in the property sector in total new loans
11.1 A neoclassical determination of capital inflows
12.1 Interest arbitrage in Chile with perfect foresight
12.2 Interest arbitrage with LeFort and Ross’s expected devaluation series

page 22
23
29
31
43
52
53
89
97
99
100
144
147
246
299
301
304
308
349
380
382
Figures and tables

12.3 Interest arbitrage with Hernández’s expected devaluation 383

Tables

2.1 Income levels and financial depth 41
5.1 Economies on the eve of reform: Macro indicators 87
5.2 Prereform characteristics of the banking system 91
5.3 Summary of financial reforms 94
6.1 Public sector borrowing requirements 110
6.2 Ratio of bank assets to GNP 113
6.3 Three-bank concentration ratio 114
6.4 Average rate of growth of commercial bank assets, 1986–90 114
6.5 Share of state-owned commercial banks in total assets 115
6.6 Share of securities in total assets 115
6.7 Share of income from credit and securities market orientations in bank earnings 116
6.8 Capital structure in the commercial banking system 117
6.9 Commercial banks’ exposure to nonresidents 117
6.10 Credits as percentage of the GNP 118
6.11 Bank profitability 118
6.12 Profits before taxes / average total assets for commercial banks 120
6.13 Ownership composition of the banking system 120
6.14 Composition of corporate debt I 124
6.15 Composition of corporate debt II 126
6.16 Determinants of corporate indebtedness 130
A.1 Financial deepening 133
A.2 Stocks of financial assets 133
A.3 Primary issues 134
A.4 Yields of financial assets 135
A.5 Secondary market volume 136
7.1 Ratio requirements abolished as of February 11, 1985 145
7.2 New Zealand economy: 1980s at a glance – Annual percentage changes of annual totals or averages 157
7.3 Ratios of money supply (M3) and personal sector credit (PSC) 160
7.4 Cointegration tests: Money, prices, output 163
7.5 Cointegrating vectors 163
7.6 Money and nominal income equations 165
Figures and tables

7.7 Seasonally unadjusted data, 1975:1–1990:3 168
7.8 Seasonally adjusted data, 1975:1–1990:3 170
7.9 Averages and volatilities of stocks, bonds, and the exchange rate 172
8.1 Major macroeconomic trends 188
8.2 Regulated and market interest rates 192
8.3 Average cost of borrowing by manufacturing sector 195
8.4 Trend of financial deepening 196
8.5 Composition of financial savings 197
8.6 Industrial composition of loans by deposit money banks 200
8.7 Financial assistance to 78 restructured firms, 1986–8 206
8.8 Share of NPLs and bank profitability, 1971–89 208
8.9 Level of financial deepening: Korea, Taiwan, and Japan (ratio to nominal GNP) 211
8.10 Selected statistics on Korean, Japanese, and U.S. bank management 212
8.11 Interest rate trends of banks and nonbanks 213
8.12 Newly introduced financial services in the 1980s 215
8.13 Deposit shares in banks and nonbank intermediaries 216
8.14 Ownership structure of financial intermediaries 218
9.1 Share of state banks in the Indonesian banking system 229
9.2 Capital market indicators 236
9.3 Financial reform in Indonesia 237
9.4 Interest rates paid by state and private banks 240
9.5 Average loan rates charged by state and private banks 241
9.6 Spread between loan and deposit rates of state and private banks 244
9.7 Lending by commercial banks, 1981–90 248
9.8 Liquidity credits and bank lending, 1981–90 249
9.9 Number of bank offices in Indonesia 252
9.10 Measures of financial development 254
9.11 Investment and new credit, 1981–90 260
9.12 Sectoral distribution of lending by Indonesian banks 261
9.13 Savings and investment in Indonesia 263
9.14 Share of private investment 264
9.15 Economic indicators, 1970–90 269
10.1 Malaysia: Key macroeconomic indicators 278
10.2 Assets of the financial system 283
Figures and tables

10.3 Priority sector guidelines and achievements of commercial banks 285
10.4 Government loans to corporations and other selected agencies 287
10.5 Finance sector’s holdings of Malaysia government securities 288
10.6 Malaysia: Selected measures of monetization and financial deepening, 1975–90 297
10.7 Commercial banks’ industry structure 306
10.8 Nonperforming loans of the commercial banks 309
10.9 Gross interest margins 311
10.10 Pretax profit / loss 312
10.11 Summary: Statistics of real and financial performance 314
12.1 Capital inflows received by the private sector 372
12.2 Highlights of the Chilean international financial liberalization, 1977–80 373
12.3 Chile: Foreign bank subsidiaries, 1978–83 376
12.4 Capital inflows received by the private sector / nonfinancial private sector 377
12.5 Real ex-post loan rates in pesos 384
12.6 Interest-rate spreads in domestic U.S.$ deposits and loans 386
12.7 Voluntary capital inflows through the official market from June 1982 to 1984 405
Foreword

The reform of financial systems is an area of economics that has led broader swings in economic thought. At times economists – going back to John Stuart Mill – and policymakers have viewed the financial sector as irrelevant, except in times of crises, and hence have tried to repress finance and use it for the convenience of government. More recently, the pendulum has swung back toward Schumpeter, who viewed finance as the key sector for its role in allocating credit efficiently. In the past 20 years the move has been toward financial sector deregulation, in part out of ideology and in part in response to technological change, which has made regulatory arbitrage a popular sport. Among developing countries, initial reform efforts in finance – the Southern Cone experience – had such well-publicized problems that the reform effort lost some momentum.

However, other countries did persevere in attempting to reform their financial systems, not always as dramatically as in the earlier experiments, and in some cases in a less far-reaching manner. But reform they did, making it appropriate to look at these cases and review their successes and failures. While economists always want a bigger cross section and a longer time series, authorities in many countries, including those with very low incomes and the formerly socialist economies, need to know what has worked and what has failed. Thus the present study is without doubt a timely one.

The most notable finding, that financial reforms have led to improved resource allocation, confirms beliefs that had been held but had not previously been as convincingly tested. This finding is consistent with the argument that efforts to maximize the efficiency with which developing countries utilize resources cannot be underestimated in their importance. The three key lessons, that more successful
Foreword

Reform must take account of real sector links, that initial conditions in finance – balance sheets, human and information capital, and incentive systems – are crucial in determining how to go about reform, and that different sequences of reforms can be tolerated and may even do well, with certain preconditions, all suggest the importance of managing the process rather than adopting a laissez-faire approach. This message surely is crucial for countries emerging from a period of significant government intervention in resource allocation.

The study turns up some evidence that banks may need to be sheltered from competition at times of reform. What it does not address directly is whether or not this is more widely true. If governments are providing some type of deposit insurance, and if, judging from the experience of industrial countries, bank supervision alone is not sufficient to prevent large losses, then as I have argued elsewhere (with Jerry Caprio), it may make sense to increase the charter value of bank licenses so that bank management will have greater incentive to police itself.

This volume is part of the World Bank’s ongoing effort to disseminate best practices in various aspects of financial sector reform, and it is hoped that it will be of value to policymakers and to those who study developing countries. Special thanks go to the Korea Development Institute, Bank Negara Malaysia, the Central Bank of Turkey, and the Reserve Bank of New Zealand, both for providing expert researchers and data. In keeping with usual practice, the views expressed should be regarded as personal ones: they do not necessarily reflect the views of any institution.

Lawrence H. Summers
Undersecretary for International Affairs, U.S. Treasury
Formerly, Vice President and Chief Economist, The World Bank
Acknowledgments

The list of people who contributed directly and indirectly to this volume is long indeed. Any partial list must include Alan Gelb, who, through numerous conversations and comments on early outlines, provided invaluable assistance to the thinking through of the research plans underlying this study, while Patrick Honohan and Millard Long contributed at the outset insights and comments without which the resultant product surely would have been less useful. But none of the above have yet seen the final product, and so can only share in any “upside” to this volume. Many colleagues helped both in discussions and in reading and commenting on some or all of the chapters: Yoon Je Cho, Ross Levine, Diana McNaughton, Mary Shirley, and Dimitri Vittas provided much input, both directly and indirectly. Participants at the April 2–3, 1992, Conference on the Impact of Financial Reform and the May 25–28, 1992, seminar on Financial Sector Reforms in Asian and Latin American Countries served as a sounding board for some of the conclusions ventured in Chapter 7. Larry Summers’s penetrating questions also had a notable influence on the tilt of that chapter. Andrew Sheng and I enjoyed/suffered a virtually simultaneous “birthing” process of our manuscripts, and in particular, he helped shelter me from other work demands so that this volume could get out. Notwithstanding his own book and many other demands, he managed to contribute many insights into the reform process. Along with Nancy Birdsall and my aforementioned colleagues, he helped make the intellectual climate in which this book was produced a stimulating one.

Over the course of two years, Bo Wang proved to be an immensely valuable research assistant without whom we would still be working away at the data. Wilai Pitayatonakarn helped type parts of and assem-
Acknowledgments

ble the manuscript, kept the project as close to schedule as possible, and did that and much more in her usual efficient and unfappable way. All of the above offered views that were not always accepted, and they cannot be held responsible for any shortcomings or errors. However, two colleagues who cannot be divorced from all blame but must share any praise are my “coconspirators,” Jim Hanson and Izak Atiyas, who helped with the conceptualization of the project, the drawing together of the summary material, and the editing of the papers. I learned a lot from both and hope that this intellectual trade was not too unbalanced. Last, but certainly not least, Jeanne, Peter, and Marisa contributed much love and support and put up with less attention than was their due, but I am making up for that now.

Gerard Caprio, Jr.
Contributors

Ismail Alowi
Bank Negara Malaysia

Izak Atiyas
The World Bank

John Chant
Boston University

Gerard Caprio, Jr.
The World Bank

Hasan Ersel
Central Bank of Turkey

Mark Gertler
New York University

James A. Hanson
The World Bank

John Harris
Boston University

Awang Adek Hussin
Bank Negara Malaysia

Dean Hyslop
Reserve Bank of New Zealand

Dimitri Margaritis
University of Waikato, New Zealand

and Reserve Bank of New Zealand

Sang-Woo Nam
Korea Development Institute

Mari Pangestu
Centre for Strategic and
International Studies,
Jakarta

Salvador Valdés-Prieto
Pontificia Universidad Católica
de Chile

David Rae
Reserve Bank of New Zealand

Andrew Rose
University of California,
Berkeley

Fabio Schiantarelli
Boston University

Lim Chee Sing
Bank Negara Malaysia

Sukhadave Singh
Bank Negara Malaysia

Andrew Weiss
Simon Fraser University

Zainal Aznam Yusof
Bank Negara Malaysia