

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-56315-4 - The History of Linguistics in Europe from Plato to 1600

Vivien Law

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The History of Linguistics in Europe

Authoritative and wide-ranging, this book examines the history of western linguistics over a 2,000-year timespan, from its origins in ancient Greece up to the crucial moment of change in the Renaissance that laid the foundations of modern linguistics.

Some of today's burning questions about language date back a long way: in 400 BC Plato was asking how words relate to reality, and medieval philosophers put forward one hypothesis after another to explain the interaction of language and mind. Other questions go back just a few generations, such as our interest in the mechanisms of language change, or in the social factors that shape the way we speak. Vivien Law explores how ideas about language over the centuries have changed to reflect changing modes of thinking. A survey chapter brings the coverage of the book up to the present day.

Classified bibliographies and chapters on research resources and the qualities the historian of linguistics needs to develop provide the reader with the tools to go further.

The late VIVIEN LAW was Reader in the History of Linguistic Thought at the University of Cambridge, and Fellow of Trinity College. Her books include *The Insular Latin Grammarians* (1982), *History of Linguistic Thought in the Early Middle Ages* (1993), *Wisdom, Authority and Grammar in the Seventh Century* (1995) and *Grammar and Grammarians in the Early Middle Ages* (1997).

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-56315-4 - The History of Linguistics in Europe from Plato to 1600
Vivien Law
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-56315-4 - The History of Linguistics in Europe from Plato to 1600

Vivien Law

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Vivien Law

The History of Linguistics in Europe From Plato to 1600



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-56315-4 - The History of Linguistics in Europe from Plato to 1600

Vivien Law

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,
Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521563154

© Cambridge University Press 2003

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2003

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data

Law, Vivien.

The history of linguistics in Europe from Plato to 1600 / Vivien Law.

p. cm.

ISBN 0 521 56315 1 – ISBN 0 521 56532 4 (pbk)

I. Linguistics – Europe – History. I. Title. II. Series.

P81.E9 L39 2002

410'.94–dc21 2002017400

ISBN 978-0-521-56315-4 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-56532-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in
this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is,
or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel
timetables, and other factual information given in this work is correct at
the time of first printing but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee
the accuracy of such information thereafter.

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-56315-4 - The History of Linguistics in Europe from Plato to 1600
Vivien Law
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

To my parents
and to the memory of Bobby Robins,
who waited a long time for this book

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-56315-4 - The History of Linguistics in Europe from Plato to 1600
Vivien Law
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Contents

List of illustrations	page x
List of maps	xii
List of boxes	xiii
Preface	xv
1 Getting ready to study the history of linguistics	I
1.1 What does this book cover?	I
1.2 Getting ready	I
1.3 What is the history of linguistics?	2
1.4 What background knowledge do you need in order to study the history of linguistics?	2
1.5 What do historians of linguistics do?	4
1.6 Why study the history of linguistics?	7
1.7 Being aware of language and doing linguistics: are they the same?	8
Further reading	II
2 Greek philosophy and the origins of western linguistics	13
2.1 Introduction	13
2.2 Before the Greeks: the world-view of the ancient Near East	13
2.3 The Greek discovery of the independent human intellect	15
2.4 Plato: language as a route to reality	17
2.5 Aristotle: language in use	23
Further reading	33
3 Towards a discipline of grammar: the transition from philosophy	38
3.1 The Stoics	38
3.2 Varro: linguistic analysis from first principles	42
Further reading	49

viii	Contents	
4	From literacy to grammar: describing language structure in the ancient world	52
4.1	From literacy to grammar	52
4.2	The Hellenistic world and the scholarship of Alexandria	52
4.3	The first grammars in the West	55
4.4	Grammar in the Roman world	58
4.5	Quintilian and the ideal education	60
4.6	Donatus and the <i>Schulgrammatik</i> genre	65
4.7	After Donatus: the commentators	81
4.8	<i>Regulae</i> grammars: foreigners and form	83
4.9	Integrating meaning and form	86
4.10	Priscian	86
	Further reading	91
5	Christianity and language	94
5.1	The arrival of Christianity	94
5.2	The Bible on language	99
5.3	Medieval priorities: focus on the spiritual	108
5.4	Form or meaning? Which branch of linguistics?	109
	Further reading	110
6	The early Middle Ages	112
6.1	Linguistic thought in the Middle Ages	112
6.2	Language as a pointer to higher things: medieval <i>littera</i> theory and correlative thinking	115
6.3	The language policy of the Church: a push towards linguistic materialism?	124
6.4	The linguistic conversion: creating descriptive grammars of Latin	125
6.5	Developing an awareness of word structure: morphological metalanguage and visual representation	131
	Further reading	136
7	The Carolingian Renaissance	139
7.1	The notion of ‘renaissance’	139
7.2	The Carolingian Renaissance	140
7.3	The rediscovery of Priscian’s <i>Institutiones grammaticae</i>	143
7.4	Linking grammar with the laws of thought: the Carolingian discovery of Aristotelian logic	147
	Further reading	155
8	Scholasticism: linking language and reality	158
8.1	Universities and universals	158
8.2	Aristotle’s <i>Physics</i> : from motion to phonetics and syntax	165

ix	Contents	
	8.3 Aristotle's <i>Metaphysics</i> : distinguishing the essential from the arbitrary	171
	8.4 Practical grammar	179
	8.5 A new development: making the invisible visible	182
	Further reading	185
9	Medieval vernacular grammars	190
	9.1 What is a vernacular grammar?	190
	9.2 Why write a vernacular grammar?	192
	9.3 Vernacular grammar in England	193
	9.4 Reforming the orthography: the Old Icelandic <i>First Grammatical Treatise</i>	199
	9.5 Thinking about the vernacular: the Occitan <i>Leys d'Amors</i>	201
	Further reading	204
10	The Renaissance: discovery of the outer world	210
	10.1 Turning-points in the history of linguistics	210
	10.2 Focus on the material world: training the faculty of observation	212
	10.3 The scientific mentality: collectors and dissectors	220
	10.4 The rediscovery of Classical Latin	223
	10.5 Latin: a language like any other?	230
	10.6 Ennobling the vernaculars	232
	10.7 New ways of thinking about linguistic form: Christians meet Hebrew	241
	Further reading	250
11	A brief overview of linguistics since 1600	258
	11.1 Introduction	258
	11.2 Looking back: main themes	258
	11.3 The process continues: observation and linguistics after 1600	260
	11.4 Linguistics in the twentieth century	272
12	Becoming a historian of linguistics	276
	12.1 Going further	276
	12.2 Cultivating the faculties a historian needs	276
	12.3 Ethics and the historian of linguistics: the impact of your work	279
	12.4 Ethics in working methods	281
	Research resources in the history of linguistics	284
	Notes	290
	Index	299

Illustrations

1	Raphael, <i>The School of Athens</i> (1508), Vatican	page 23
2	A Greek youth sits reading a papyrus roll (ca 470 BC), vase painting	68
3	Image from a twelfth-century copy of Martianus Capella's allegory. Florence, Biblioteca Mediceo-Laurenziana, Cod. S. Marco 190, f. 15v	103
4	Diagram of the human being as the microcosm. (Regensburg, ca 1150). Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Clm 13002	123
5	Hereford Cathedral Library (Photo: Clive Friend, Woodmansterne)	129
6	Extract from an early medieval copy of the <i>Ars Ambianensis</i> . St Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, 877 (Switzerland, s. ix in.), p. 178 (278)	133
7	Transcription of <i>haec porticus</i> from the Bobbio manuscript. Naples, Biblioteca Nazionale, lat. 1 (Bobbio, s. vii), f. 28vb	134
8	Transcription of <i>haec uirtus</i> from the Corbie manuscript. Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, lat. 13025 (Corbie, s. ix in.), f. 41vb	135
9	Transcription of <i>haec cogitatio</i> from the Corbie manuscript. Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, lat. 13025 (Corbie, s. ix in.), f. 41va	135
10	Paradigms from the <i>Ars Bonifacii</i> copied out in a fine Caroline minuscule hand. Vatican City, Bibliotheca Apostolica Vaticana, Vat. Pal. Lat. 1746 (Lorsch, s. ix ¹), f. 169v	141
11	Sculpture of Grammatica, one of the Seven Liberal Arts. Chartres cathedral, west portal	160
12	Representation of grammar, from Gregorius Reisch's <i>Margarita philosophica nova</i> 'New pearl of philosophy', published in Strasbourg in 1515.	161
13	Diagram from the margin of a twelfth-century English copy of Priscian's <i>Institutiones grammaticae</i> setting out the implicit structure of Priscian's discussion of pronouns (Cambridge University Library, Ii. 2. 1, f. 134r)	182
14	Diagram showing the divisions of the noun according to Priscian which was added in the twelfth century to a copy of the <i>Institutiones grammaticae</i> . Leiden, Universiteitsbibliotheek, BPL 91 (s. xii ¹), f. 85r	183

xi	List of illustrations	
15	Paradigm from a deluxe grammar ca 1487. Reproduced from <i>Die ‘Seligenstädter Lateinpädagogik’</i> , ed. M. Asztalos et al. (Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell International 1989), vol. 2	184
16	The opening of a Middle English syntactic treatise from Trinity College, O.5.4 (s. xv), f. 4v	198
17	Luca della Robbia’s portrayal of Grammar on the bell tower of the Duomo in Florence (1437)	212
18	Artists drawing from life to prepare the illustrations for a book on plants, Leonhard Fuchs’s <i>De historia stirpium</i> (Basel, 1542)	213
19	Scene from a French manuscript, ca 1300. Montpellier, Bibliothèque de la Faculté de Médecine, MS 196 (French, s. xiii ex)	216
20	Sandro Botticelli, <i>Annunciation</i> (Photo: Alinari Picture Collection)	217
21	The title page of Claude Duret’s <i>Thresor</i> . Cambridge University Library	221
22	Cutaway diagram showing the organs of the vocal tract from Aquapendente’s <i>De locutione</i> (1603). Cambridge University Library	224
23	The opening of Chrysoloras’s <i>Erotemata</i> , his beginners’ grammar of Greek in question-and-answer form (printed at Ferrara in 1509)	226
24	The beginning of William Bullokar’s discussion of the verb, including his list of modal auxiliaries, reproduced in his reformed orthography from the facsimile of his <i>Pamphlet for Grammar</i> (1586) published by J. R. Turner (Leeds: The University of Leeds School of English 1980)	240
25	Diagram from Agathius Guidacerius’s <i>Grammatica hebraicae linguae</i> (Rome, 1514?). Cambridge University Library	244
26	Lucas van Valckenborch, <i>The Tower of Babel</i> (1594). Musée du Louvre, Paris	262

Maps

1	Major centres of learning in Europe in Antiquity	page 84
2	Major centres of learning in Europe in the early Middle Ages	113
3	Major centres of learning in Europe in the later Middle Ages	159
4	Major centres of learning in Europe after the Renaissance	211
5	Early European grammars of non-European languages	222

Boxes

2.1	Language learning in the ancient Near East	page 14
2.2	Prometheus and the gift of fire	16
2.3	Nature vs convention	21
2.4	Neoplatonism	27
2.5	Early use of metalinguistic terms	30
3.1	What is a Golden Age?	39
3.2	Can we trust our sources? Diogenes Laertius on Stoic grammar	40
3.3	Pythagoras and the Pythagoreans	42
4.1	Alexander the Great, the Hellenistic world and their Byzantine heirs	53
4.2	Who wrote the <i>Tekhnē grammatikē</i> ?	56
4.3	The parts of speech (word classes)	59
4.4	Terminology 1: <i>littera</i>	61
4.5	Ancient education	63
4.6	Studying under the rhetoricians: the <i>ars rhetorica</i>	64
4.7	Latin grammars wholly or partly of the <i>Schulgrammatik</i> genre	66
4.8	The ancient book	67
4.9	The virtues and vices of speech	69
4.10	Latin inflectional morphology	77
4.11	Late Latin commentators on Donatus's grammars	81
4.12	The changing Latin language	82
4.13	<i>Regulae</i> grammars	85
4.14	Apollonius Dyscolus	89
4.15	Becoming aware of transitivity	90
5.1	The Bible	95
5.2	The Church and its members	97
5.3	The Fathers of the Church	98
5.4	Interpreting the Bible: the techniques of exegesis	99
5.5	St Augustine (354–430)	100
5.6	The Seven Liberal Arts	101
5.7	Augustine's early theory of the sign	102

xiv	List of boxes	
6.1	The Church and culture	114
6.2	The Venerable Bede: interpreting the figurative language of the Scriptures	116
6.3	The first linguistic parody	120
6.4	Macrocosm and microcosm	122
6.5	Memory and learning	127
6.6	What price grammar?	128
6.7	Terminology 2: describing the parts of a word	132
7.1	Text and manuscript	142
7.2	What's happened to all the medieval manuscripts?	144
7.3	Alcuin of York (ca 735–804)	146
7.4	Learning by asking: the parsing grammar	148
7.5	The transmission of Aristotle's writings	149
7.6	Early theories of the sign	151
8.1	From the parts to the Arts	162
8.2	Distinguishing between signification and reference	163
8.3	The twelfth-century rediscovery of Aristotle	164
8.4	Applying Aristotle's four causes to grammar	165
8.5	The first use of <i>subject</i> and <i>predicate</i>	168
8.6	Anonymous, pseudonymous – or female?	170
8.7	The Modists	174
8.8	The <i>modi significandi</i>	176
9.1	Why 'First' <i>Grammatical Treatise</i> ?	200
10.1	Opening windows onto the world	214
10.2	Observation and the artist: Claude Lorrain (1600–82)	215
10.3	Becoming aware of non-verbal communication: an explorer describes a sign-language encounter	218
10.4	Early European grammars of non-European languages	219
10.5	How did the West learn Greek?	225
10.6	Linguists and printing	228
10.7	The first grammars of the vernacular	234
10.8	From Donatus's <i>Ars minor</i> to Kennedy's <i>Shorter Latin Primer</i> : the <i>Shorte Introduction of Grammar</i> by Lily and Colet	238
10.9	Grammar in the Arab world	242
10.10	Medieval grammarians of Hebrew	246
10.11	How did Jewish scholars explain the notion of root?	249
10.12	Terminology 3: root and affix	250
12.1	What do you see?	277

Preface

‘You’re writing a textbook on the history of linguistics? That’s impossible: only a team can do it now.’ That was the reaction of a French colleague when, back in 1990, I told her I was writing this book. On a practical level she was right. As the German scholar Peter Schmitter pointed out a year later,¹ the history of linguistics was then growing faster than any other subdiscipline of linguistics. Even in the late 1980s, over five hundred publications were appearing annually in the history of linguistics, more than twice as many as in syntax, semantics or phonetics, its nearest competitors. No one person can claim to have read all the literature, or even a large percentage of it, much less all the primary literature – all the writings which touch upon language, whether by philosophers, theologians, grammarians, psychologists, anatomists, educationalists or indeed linguists – from every era and every corner of Europe. We are necessarily specialists. All the same, however, most historians of linguistics have to teach. When we pluck up the courage to do so, we overcome our private panic at the torrent of secondary literature and the daunting jungle of sources, in order to guide our students to the overviews from which they can get some sense of the overall shape of the subject. Naturally we linger in our own favourite spots, hurrying past those of our colleagues with scarcely a glance. What we lose by being selective, though, we gain by becoming alive to the grand themes and recurring patterns of the 2,500 years of European intellectual history. This sense of perspective (albeit a personal one) is what disappears between the cracks in a multi-authored history, for the writers of the separate chapters are inevitably sensitive to some issues and themes and blind to others. Continuity is hard to maintain, no matter how rigorous the editor. The panoramic view enforced by teaching gives such sweeping themes a chance to emerge. Not that meticulous detailed research doesn’t have a place, though: without it the generalisations would lose their authority.

So, far more than is the case with a research monograph, I must acknowledge my debt to the (usually) responsive students and colleagues who, wittingly or unwittingly, have helped to shape this book since I started to teach a course in the history of linguistics in 1981, and far more directly since 1989, when Peter Matthews suggested that I write this textbook. More particularly, the comments since 1996 of undergraduates on drafts of several chapters have helped to illuminate a number of obscurities.

Andrew Wolpert's 'Spirit of English' classes at Emerson College, East Grinstead, where I taught for two week-long blocks in 1997 and 1998, responded very differently (but no less helpfully), challenging me to explain *why* these issues mattered – something which exam-conscious Cambridge students are more prepared to take on trust. Several people have generously commented on drafts of portions of the book – Ildi Halstead, Andrew Linn, Peter Matthews, Judith Olszowy-Schlanger, R. H. Robins, Irène Rosier, Nick Shackleton and Chris Stray. Ildi, as well as spotting several infelicities of one sort or another, pointed out parallels with present-day linguistics which, by and large, I'm afraid I've left the reader to supply. Bobby Robins threw himself with gusto into the challenge of improving 'the book that is to replace me', as he put it (time will tell!). Indeed, his and Ildi's delighted response, and that of several other advance readers (not least the anonymous American reader for the publisher), is what has kept me – a researcher rather than a textbook-writer by temperament – going, for the going has been hard. Even though such recondite points as precisely which planets were in conjunction in the third week of December 1991 could (thanks in this case to Adam Perkins at the Cambridge University Library) be checked, in very many other cases the line between the verifiable (and verified) fact and the commonplace taken over from other writers had to be drawn far earlier than this pedantic perfectionist finds acceptable. Writing the history of European linguistic thought is a task of no less magnitude than a history of European literature would be. Many people have helped to make it possible: my students, who, ever since I gave my first lectures, in 1976, gently taught me to favour accessibility over erudition; fellow historians of linguistics, whose warm regard and measured judgements in encounters at conferences and over e-mail has supported me more than I can tell; the staff at the Cambridge University Library, a magnificent working environment without which this book, and the two and a half decades of research on which it is based, would have been, if not impossible, at least very much more difficult; and, last but not least, the tolerant staff at Heffers, Cambridge, who never uttered a word of complaint on seeing their bookshop used as a bibliographical resource. Many individuals have helped with points ranging from checking a reference to supplying me with relevant offprints or lending books too obscure for even the Cambridge University Library; among them are Anders Ahlqvist, Wolfram Ax, Mildred Budny, Henry Chadwick, David Cram, András Cser, Gillian Evans, Russell Evans, Suzanne Evans, Karin Margareta Fredborg, Jonathan Harrison, Louis Holtz, Ann Hutchison, Jee Yeon Jang, Simon Keynes, Tony Klijnsmit, Anneli Luhtala, John Marenbon, Ann Matonis, Brian Merrilees, Christos Nifadopoulos, Nicholas Orme, Marina Passalacqua, Fabrizio Raschellà, Irène Rosier, Vivian Salmon, John Saunders, Marion Saunders, Peter Schmitter, Pierre Swiggers, Kees Versteegh, Alfons Wouters. My thanks to them and to the numerous others who have helped and supported me, directly or indirectly, in the twelve years that this book has taken to write. The staff at the libraries whose materials have contributed directly to this book deserve thanks – the St John's College Library and the Wren Library, Trinity College, Cambridge; the British Library, London; the Bodleian Library, Oxford; Worcester Cathedral Library; the Bibliotheek der Rijksuniversiteit, Leiden; the Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Munich; the Stiftsbibliothek, St Gallen; the Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris; the

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-56315-4 - The History of Linguistics in Europe from Plato to 1600
Vivien Law
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

xvii Preface

Bibliothèque Nationale et Universitaire, Strasbourg; the Biblioteca Nazionale, Naples; the Arxiu de la Corona d’Aragò, Barcelona. Despite all the efforts of these people and institutions mistakes will no doubt remain: my fault rather than theirs. What I wanted above all was to write a book that would at once be readable and stimulate *you* to think about the implications of thinking about language. Thinking about thinking is, after all, one of the most human things we can do.