

Cambridge University Press

0521557453 - A Judgment for Solomon: The d'Hauteville Case and Legal Experience in Antebellum America

Michael Grossberg

Index

[More information](#)

Index

- Addicks* cases, 124, 150, 154–5, 160, 161, 193; description of, 69–70
- American Jurist and Law Magazine*, denounces d'Hauteville verdict, 196–7
- Amory, Anna Sears, apprehension about Ellen's marriage, 13–14; on Frederick's visit to Hauteville, 240
- "An Act for the Protection of Minors" (New York), 63; Seward veto, 63–4; *see also*, Seward
- "An Act to secure the fulfillment of certain contracts, and for the relief of Married Women in certain cases" (Rhode Island), 210; legislative debate over repeal, 216–17
- Baltzell, E. Digby, on Pennsylvania legal culture, 73
- Barry* case, 160–1, 203; description of, 59–62; outcome, 262n4
- Barry, John, criticism of d'Hauteville case, 151–2
- Barton, George Washington, 85, background of, 86–7; d'Hauteville verdict, 156–66
- Benjamin, Park (editor), request for information about Ellen's case, 113–14
- best interests of the child doctrine, origins, 55, 231; Pennsylvania rules on, 69; use in d'Hauteville verdict, 163–4
- Binney, Horace, background of, 79–80
- Blackstone, Sir William, 127–8; on marital unity, 39–40
- Boston Courier*, 105
- Boston Post*, 105; denounces d'Hauteville verdict, 178–9; publishes defense of d'Hauteville verdict, 199–200; publishes legal condemnations of d'Hauteville verdict, 198–99
- Breck, Samuel, diary comment on d'Hauteville case, 105–6
- Briggs* case, 61, 159, 178–9; description of, 57–8; *see also* Lemuel Shaw
- Brown, David Paul, on trial strategy, 120–1; warning about trial tactics, 132
- Bruner, Edward M., on the power of new narratives, 168
- Cadwalader, John, analysis of Reed's opening statement, 130; and domestic feminism, 124; background of, 76–7; closing statement, 148–51; construction of argument, 121–7; conversion to maternalism, 123–4; delivery of Ellen's stories, 95–7, 106–12; opening statement, 115–19; presentation of evidence, 138–45;
- Carter, Lief H., on judges, 156
- Cass, Lewis, 58; as d'Hauteville marital counselor, 19–20
- Chandler, Peleg Whitman, attacked by David Sears, 205–8; background, 186–7; critique of d'Hauteville verdict, 187–96
- Chapman, Nathaniel, 209; background, 141–2; testimony, 142
- child custody, American rules of, 54–5; and habeas corpus, 52–3; customary rights of mothers, 51–2; English rules of, 52, 55; defined, 50; double-edged quality, of 165–6; new rules on, 230–1; Pennsylvania rules of, 69–70; role of behavioral judgments in, 159; twentieth-century changes, 237–8; *see also* best interests of the child doctrine, tender years rule
- Clarke, Willis (editor, *Philadelphia Gazette*), receives financial support from David Sears, 208
- Cohen, Daniel, on legal literature, 92–3
- Conrad, Robert T., background of, 87
- court of public opinion, 168–70; press role in, 185–6; role of legal periodicals, 186
- Couvreur, Frederick, as marital negotiator, 25–6, 27–28; final letter to David Sears, 225

Cambridge University Press

0521557453 - A Judgment for Solomon: The d'Hauteville Case and Legal Experience in Antebellum America

Michael Grossberg

Index

[More information](#)

268

De Manneville case, 53, 122, 126, 149

De Rham, Henry C., 29, 209; petition to Rhode Island legislature, 211; withdraws petition, 217

d'Hauteville, Aimée, background of, 5; role in premarital negotiations, 11

d'Hauteville case, as a discourse of legitimacy, 233–4; as a precedent of legal experience, 228–30; legitimates maternal preference, 230

d'Hauteville, Ellen Sears, 5; and motherhood, 51; authenticates Swiss divorce, 224; citizenship claims, 65; charges of marital tyranny, 14–15, 43, 45–6; claims of mental cruelty, 43–4; companionate view of marriage, 24; consequences of verdict on, 166; death, 241; defense prepared for Rhode Island legislature, 213–16; fear of trial, 66; final letter to De Rham, 222; moves back to Boston, 226; moves to New Hampshire, 218; moves to Rhode Island, 210; praise for parents' testimony, 145–6; preference for legislative remedies, 210; reaction to Reed's opening statement, 130–1; sense of honor, 10; sense of shadow of the law, 215–16, 222; visit to Europe, 240

d'Hauteville, Eric Mangus, background of, 5; role in prenuptial negotiations, 9

d'Hauteville, Frederick Sears, birth, 24; death, 241; letter to David Sears, 241; visit to Hauteville, 240

d'Hauteville, Gonzalve, 5; charges against Miriam Sears, 17; consequences of verdict for, 166–7; death, 241; patriarchal rights, 23–4, 117–19; remarries, 225; returns to Europe, 207; sues for divorce, 209; trip to America, 29; view of marriage, 40–1; welcomes Frederick to Hauteville, 240

d'Hauteville marriage, American bargaining, 36–7, 50–1; antenuptial contract, 11; courtship, 7–13; marital problems, 14–25; marital negotiations, 28–29

d'Hauteville trial, closing statements, 146–55; dispute over Gonzalve's evidence, 134–6; end of trial, 225–6; first client stories, 95–100; issuing the writ, 84–5; second client stories, 106–12, 115–19; opening statements, 128–30, 136–8; presentation of evidence for Ellen, 138–45; presentation of evidence for Gonzalve,

Index

131–6; role of medical science, 142; verdict, 157–66

Dilthey, Wilhelm, on experience, 201

discourse of legitimacy, 233; *see also* John Louis Lucaites

divorce, 41; Massachusetts rules on, 42; New York rules on, 42; policies in Vaud, 42–3

Doran, Joseph Michael, background of, 87–8; disagreement over evidence ruling, 135–6

Ex Parte Crouse, 74–5

experience, 201; definition of, x

Farrar, Eliza, testimony, 133–4

Farrell, Betty, on the d'Hauteville case, 232–3

federalism, and divorce, 41–2; role in d'Hauteville case, 37, 67–8, 208, 234

Fischer, David Hackett, on braided narratives, xiii

Fisher, Sidney George, praise for Meredith's closing statement, 153–4

Fox, Richard Wightman, on trials as cultural events, xii

Gallatin, Albert, as Gonzalve's supporter, 84, 128

Gardiner, William Howard, background of, 59; role in depositions, 133–4

gender changes, role in d'Hauteville case, 24–5, 124, 229–30

Gerard, James, 59; advice to Cadwaller, 125–6; role in Barry case, 61

Gray, Francis C., testimony, 143

Greene, Martha A., testimony, 142–3

Grund, Francis, comparison of Boston and Philadelphia, 73–4; on Bostonians, 32

Habermas, Jürgen, on the public sphere, 169

Hariman, Robert, on trials as sources of popular debate, 90

Hauteville, description of, 14

Hildreth, Richard, on the d'Hauteville case, 230

Ingersoll, Joseph R., background of, 81–2; closing statement, 154–5

Jarvis, Russell (*Ledger* editorial writer), defense of mother's rights, 180–5

Jackson, Bernard S., on judicial decisions, 156

judicial patriarchy, 156

Cambridge University Press

0521557453 - A Judgment for Solomon: The d'Hauteville Case and Legal Experience in Antebellum America

Michael Grossberg

Index

[More information](#)

Index

269

- Kent, James, 54, 212; attacked by Jarvis, 183–5; use of instrumentalism, 184
- King, Edward, upholds mental cruelty as ground for divorce, 232
- law, and social dramas, 234; as a vulgar tongue, 229; hegemonic power of, 65–6, 91, 235–6; relative autonomy of, 3, 121–2; role of individuals in legal change, 236–7
- Law Reporter*, 186–7; publishes critique of d'Hauteville verdict, 187–96; *see also* Peleg Whitman Chandler
- legal communities, 82–3
- legal consciousness, gendered sense of law, 45–6
- legal experience, x, xii, 35, 201, 228
- Livingston, Nancy Shippen, 67
- Lucaites, John Louis, on discourse of legitimacy, 233
- Lystra, Karen, on Victorian marriage, 14
- McKeon, John, background of, 59; concern about press, 105
- Mansfield, Lord, on English custody law, 52–3
- marital unity, 39–40, 191–2
- married women, coverture, 39–40; subordinate legal status, 25
- maternalism, 167; in verdict, 163–4
- maternal preference, 231–2, 237–8; as new public narrative of custody law, 180
- Meigs, Charles E., background, 141; testimony, 141
- mental cruelty, Ellen's view of, 43–4; Chandler's views on, 190–1; critique in d'Hauteville verdict, 157–8; lay ideas of, 26–7; legal definition of, 43–5; Lord Stowell on, 44; recognized as ground for divorce, 232; trial claims of, 109
- Meredith, William M., 207; background of, 77–9; closing statement, 152–3
- microhistory, xii–iii
- Miller, Samuel Jr., decision not to reprint all the d'Hauteville letters, 258n85; publication of *Report of the d'Hauteville Case*, 175
- narrative, xiii–iv
- New Hampshire, debate over custody rights legislation, 218–21
- New Hampshire Patriot*, publishes David Sears' attack on Gonzalve, 220–1
- New York American*, denounces d'Hauteville verdict, 181–3
- New York Herald*, denounces d'Hauteville verdict, 176–8
- New York Signal*, endorses d'Hauteville verdict, 179–80
- Norton, Caroline, fight for maternal custody rights, 54
- nostalgia (disease), described, 21; use in trial, 139
- Parker, Samuel D., as Ellen's Boston lawyer, 30
- Pennsylvania, sources of maternalist policies, 70–3; distinctive legal culture, 73–5
- penny press, defined, 92; role in trials, 93–4, 171
- Philadelphia Court of General Sessions, description of, 86
- Philadelphia General Sessions Courtroom, No. 2, description of, 85–6
- Philadelphia, legal community of, 75–6, 82–3
- Philadelphia Gazette*, endorses verdict, 176
- Philadelphia Inquirer*, 92; review of Ellen's second client story, 112–13; review of Gonzalve's second client story, 119
- Philadelphia Public Ledger*, 92, 112; advocates maternal preference, 172; creation of, 93; defense of mothers' rights, 180–5; first story on the trial, 101–4; endorses verdict, 172–4; review of Reed's opening statement, 130
- Providence Journal*, analysis of debate over custody legislation, 217–18
- precedent of legal experience, 227–8, 239
- public narratives, xiv; and legal adequacy, 46–7; of domestic relations law, 40
- Reed, William B., background of, 80–1; delivery of Gonzalve's story, 97–100, 115–19; reliance on Blackstone, 127; opening statement, 128–30; presentation of evidence, 131–6
- responsible mother, as a legal fiction, 164
- Rhode Island, struggle over custody reform, 210–18
- Ritter, Charles, 113; as *Ledger* correspondent, 93; first story on trial,

Cambridge University Press

0521557453 - A Judgment for Solomon: The d’Hauteville Case and Legal Experience in Antebellum America

Michael Grossberg

Index

[More information](#)

270

- Ritter, Charles (*Cont.*)
101–4; *see also Philadelphia Public Ledger*
Rogers v. Rogers, 39–40
- Scott, John Morin, background of, 82; closing statement, 146–8
- Sears, David, 31; advice to Cadwalader, 127; attack on Chandler and Reed, 207–8; background of, 4–5; concern about the press, 113; death, 241; final letters to Couveru, 224–5; letter to Cass, 58–9; letter to Chapman, 209; letter to Perkins, 222–4; letters to European agents about Ellen’s affairs, 208–9; prenuptial negotiations, 8–9; lobbies New Hampshire legislators, 218–19; lobbies Rhode Island legislators, 211–12; publishes attack on Gonzalve in New Hampshire, 220–1; publishes defense of d’Hauteville verdict, 202–7; supports *Philadelphia Gazette*, 208; testimony, 143–4
- Sears, Miriam Mason, background of, 4–5; death, 241; fear of the press, 113; role in d’Hauteville marital problems, 16, 17; testimony, 144–5; vindicated in verdict, 157
- separation, informal separations, 38–9, 41; opposition to, 37–8; Massachusetts rules on, 38; New York rules on 39
- Seward, William, veto of custody act, 63–4
- shadow of the law, bargaining in, 34–5; defined, 2–3; significance for understanding legal change, 238–9

Index

- Shaw, Lemuel, 61; decision in *Briggs* case, 57–8
- Sharwood, George, on professional reputation, 120
- Sprague, Peleg, as Gonzalve’s Boston lawyer, 30
- Story, Joseph, comparison of ministers and lawyers, 198; on American custody law, 54–5
- Stowell, Lord, on marital cruelty, 44
- tender years rule, 231, 236; Ellen’s use of in bargaining, 56–7; Gonzalve’s rejection of, 57; origins, 55–6; Pennsylvania rules on, 69; use in d’Hauteville verdict, 163–4
- Tocqueville, Alexis de, xi, 82; on law as a vulgar tongue, 229; on the shadow of the law, 2
- trials, and the adversarial process, 237–8; and the maintenance of legal authority, 235; as gendered experiences, 100–1; as narrative competitions, 94–5; as popular events, 90–1; as social dramas, xii–iii, 89–90, 234; client stories in, 94; interactive reality of, 91–2; legal significance of, 90; rhetorical significance of, 90, 171; versus appellate decisions, 230–1
- verdicts, as stories, 156–7
- Vevey, description of, 12
- Warren, John C., treatment of Ellen in Paris, 20–1; trial testimony, 139–41
- Webster, Daniel, hired for Ellen’s case, 127
- Williams, Raymond, on experience, x